



# FLORIDA MAN BUYS STATE

KOCH IMPACTS IN  THE SUNSHINE STATE



BRIDGE  
PROJECT



## FLORIDA MAN BUYS STATE: KOCH IMPACTS IN THE SUNSHINE STATE

Through their decades in business and politics, Charles and David Koch have honed their methods for rigging the system in their favor, both through their national operations and activities. Their history in Florida is indicative of this overall multifaceted strategy, which includes lobbying and raising funds for politicians, using their advocacy network to sway public policy, and leveraging financial donations to universities to buy professors who promote their worldview. Time and time again, the Koch brothers' self-interested actions proved to be beneficial to their bottom line at the expense of hardworking Floridians. Since our first Florida report, the Kochs' influence has only grown. The Koch network has expanded their political spending, mobilizing a seven figure spending effort behind Marco Rubio as they fight to protect his senate seat. They have also expanded their ground game as they prepare to exert their influence on the 2016 elections.

A cornerstone of the Kochs' Florida strategy is cultivating and maintaining relationships with high-profile politicians who are sympathetic to their message and willing to carry out their policy goals. Chief among the Kochs' Florida puppet politicians is Senator Marco Rubio. Marco Rubio is one of only a handful of Senators to receive a lifetime rating of A+ from the Kochs signature advocacy group Americans for Prosperity. The Kochs have even personally detailed how they line up with Rubio on most issues and have expressly thanked him for his leadership. Naturally, Rubio was a Koch network favorite for the 2016 presidential race and he likewise gushed that he had "tremendous admiration" for the Kochs and "would love to win [their] support." But as Donald Trump dashed Senator Rubio's presidential dreams, the Kochs were quick to rally seven-figure support for his ultimate senate reelection bid.

Similarly, Florida Governor Rick Scott can boast of strong ties with the Koch network. In 2011, Gov. Scott attended a secret invitation-only Koch meeting outside of Vail, Colorado and, in 2013, spoke at the same summit in Orlando as Sen. Rubio. Americans for Prosperity organized rallies to support Gov. Scott's agenda during his term and used their intensive field operations in Florida to boost his reelection campaign in 2014. After securing Scott's reelection, Americans for Prosperity's support has remained strong; their Florida Director Chris Hudson even recently asserted that Scott would be a wise vice presidential pick.

To fully furnish their policy agenda in the Sunshine State, the Kochs have backed their puppet candidates with an extensive organization of their astroturf advocacy organizations. Americans for Prosperity along with Concerned Veterans for America, Generation Opportunity and LIBRE have a combined 16 Florida field offices and 165 field staffers. Their presence in Florida is so large that it rivals the state's Republican Party. Though this network alone is baffling, the Koch's Florida policy agenda has also been lent additional support from the Koch's senior front group, the 60 Plus Association, and the Koch-funded James Madison Institute.

Using their vast resources, the Kochs have attempted to push a selfish policy agenda harmful to Floridians. For example, AFP and 60 Plus supported Rep. Paul Ryan's budget that proposed voucherizing Medicare, a plan particularly impactful to Florida. A 2012 Kaiser Family Foundation study of Ryan's budget found that in Florida "at least nine in 10 beneficiaries...would face higher premiums in their current plan." If undermining seniors' healthcare was not bad enough, Generation Opportunity has begun an extensive campaign against Social Security, a system 1 in 5 Floridians depend on that keeps over 1 million Floridians out of poverty. Meanwhile, Americans for Prosperity celebrated sabotaging health care for all Floridians as they blocked Medicaid expansion, keeping over 1 million Floridians from accessing healthcare. Finally, not leaving out a single age group, Americans for Prosperity and the James Madison Institute have "thrown their considerable weight behind" school voucherization and privatization efforts.

The Koch Brothers are so singularly dedicated to their bottom line that AFP and 60 Plus even drew the ire of other conservative groups by opposing a proposed ballot initiative with broad support that would open Florida up to the solar industry, a move that would threaten Koch's oil and gas operations. Conservatives for Energy Freedom co-founder Debby Dooley criticized AFP and 60 Plus's efforts, labeling them a "campaign of deception" and saying, "You don't throw your principles out the window to benefit your corporate benefactors."

To round out their outsized influence in Florida, the Koch brothers have infiltrated higher education as a part of a "fully integrated" strategy to promote their "free market" visions. Though attempting to sell these donations as pure charity, Koch academic grants do not come without strings attached. The Koch Foundation has donated over \$7 million to Florida schools

and have mandated that their funding “go towards hiring professors, building economic research centers that promote capitalism or supporting research about libertarian politics.” Perhaps no case of Koch academic funding is more infamous than Florida State University, where, in exchange for a \$6.5 million dollar donation, the Kochs were able to secure a direct role in the hiring and firing of faculty and in shaping the curriculum of the university’s economics department.

The Koch brothers have used their vast fortune to advance their own self-interest in the Sunshine State. From polluting the environment, to attacking Social Security and Medicare, to undermining public universities, everything they do is about making more money for themselves. Without proper checks and balances on the Koch network, they’ll continue to assert their oversized influence in Florida and across the country.

## Contents

<b>Florida Man Buys State: Koch Impacts In The Sunshine State .....</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Koch Industries In Florida.....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Georgia-Pacific .....</b>	<b>6</b>
Georgia-Pacific In Florida: Facilities Overview .....	6
Georgia-Pacific Palatka's Pollution And Multiple Violations Of The Clean Air & Clean Water Acts.....	6
Georgia-Pacific Foley Cellulose's Pipeline Dispute .....	11
Georgia-Pacific Plants And Pollution In Nearby Florida Schools .....	13
Transparent Efforts To Save Face With The Community While Simultaneously Push Their Corporate Agenda .....	17
Safety Violations.....	18
Georgia-Pacific's Florida Economic Impacts And Worker Layoffs .....	19
<b>Molex .....</b>	<b>24</b>
OSHA Violations.....	25
<b>Flint Hills Resources .....</b>	<b>25</b>
Price Gouging Complaints After Hurricane Katrina .....	25
<b>Koch Industries Nitrogen Interests.....</b>	<b>26</b>
Koch Industries Had A Stake In Fertilizers & Nitrogen.....	26
The Kochs Advanced Their Fertilizer Interests Through The Fertilizer Institute .....	29
The Fertilizer Institute Opposed The EPA Implementation Of The Numeric Nutrient Standards In Florida .....	29
The Fertilizer Institute Contributed To Marco Rubio's Senate Campaigns.....	31
Rubio Opposed EPA Implementation Of Numeric Nutrient Standards.....	31
<b>Koch Lobbyists In Florida.....</b>	<b>33</b>
Fearington and Smith.....	33
Fearington and Smith Merged With Southern Strategy Group.....	33
<b>David Koch &amp; Palm Beach .....</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>David Koch Was The Richest Palm Beach Resident.....</b>	<b>34</b>
David Koch Potentially Helped Pay To Build Public Bathrooms To Keep The Town From Providing Accessible Parking Near His Home.....	34
David Koch Received A Tax Exemption To Expand His Mansion.....	37
David Koch Hosted A Republican Governor Association Fundraiser At His Palm BEach Mansion .....	38
<b>David Koch's Mansion Was Near Donald Trump's And The Two Were "Personally Friendly" .....</b>	<b>39</b>
Donald Trump Utilized Florida Koch Network Leaders.....	39
<b>Koch Network In Florida.....</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>Americans For Prosperity-Florida .....</b>	<b>39</b>
AFP-Florida Launched In 2009.....	39
Americans For Prosperity Was Founded By The Koch Brothers .....	39
AFP's "Single Largest Field Operation" Was In Florida .....	40
AFP-Florida Leadership & Operatives .....	41
AFP Had A "Pervasive Presence" At The 2012 Republican National Convention In Tampa .....	43
AFP's Agenda Worked Against Floridians Interests.....	44
<b>LIBRE Initiative .....</b>	<b>45</b>

LIBRE Was Cited As A Textbook Example Of Astroturfing Almost Entirely Funded By The Koch Brothers .....	45
The LIBRE Initiative Had Its Largest Operation In Florida .....	45
LIBRE Worked In Florida To Establish Assimilating Latinos As “Long Term Conservatives” .....	47
LIBRE Had Success Attacking Democratic Politicians In Florida And Is Prepared To Continue This Effort In 2016 .....	48
LIBRE’s Agenda Was Bad For Florida’s Latino Community .....	49
<b>Concerned Veterans For America .....</b>	<b>50</b>
Concerned Veterans For America Was Created By The Koch Brothers .....	50
CVA-Florida Leadership And Operatives .....	50
CVA Focused On Florida In Their 2016 Election Efforts .....	50
CVA’s Agenda Works Against Florida’s Veterans .....	52
<b>Generation Opportunity .....</b>	<b>52</b>
Generation Opportunity Is The Koch Brothers’ Youth Outreach Operation .....	52
Gen-Opp Florida Leadership .....	52
GenOpp’s Agenda Was Bad For Floridians .....	54
<b>ALEC And The State Policy Network .....</b>	<b>54</b>
The Koch Brothers Have A “Decades-Long Connections” With ALEC .....	54
ALEC Launched The Madison Group In 1986, Which Was Renamed to The State Policy Network In 1992 .....	56
ALEC and SPN Were Sister Organizations That Coordinated Extensively Behind Closed Doors Despite Claims of Independence .....	56
The James Madison Institute Had Deep Ties to The Madison Group and State Policy Network .....	57
<b>James Madison Institute .....</b>	<b>58</b>
Koch Connected Groups Donated Over \$1.58 Million To The James Madison Institute .....	58
JMI Leadership .....	59
James Madison Institute’s Ties to Koch-Funded Florida State University .....	65
<b>Citizens For A Sound Economy - Florida .....</b>	<b>66</b>
Background .....	66
Multiple Citizens For A Sound Economy Staffers Were Registered Lobbyists .....	73
<b>Koch Attempts To Influence Florida Universities And Colleges .....</b>	<b>74</b>
The Kochs Use University Donations As A Part Of A “Fully Integrated” Political Strategy .....	74
The Charles Koch Foundation Donated Over \$7 Million To Florida Universities & Colleges .....	75
<b>The Kochs Have Worked To Bolster Their Selfish Policy Interests At The Expense Of Floridians .....</b>	<b>84</b>
<b>The Koch Agenda To Privatize Medicare .....</b>	<b>84</b>
The Koch Network Supported Ryan Budgets that Would Voucherize Medicare .....	84
<b>Privatizing Social Security .....</b>	<b>86</b>
Generation Opportunity Campaigned To End Social Security .....	86
The James Madison Institute Referred To Social Security As A “Bankrupt” “Ponzi Scheme” & Advocated For Privatization .....	89
Floridians Depend On Social Security .....	90
<b>The Koch-Backed Campaign Against Florida’s Medicaid Expansion .....</b>	<b>90</b>
AFP Said They “Won A Crucial Victory” In Quashing Medicaid Expansion In Florida .....	90
AFP’s Efforts Were Also Backed By Several Koch Groups .....	94

Florida’s Medicaid Expansion Would Have Provided Insurance To 1.1 Million Floridians & Delivered Substantial Economic & Health Benefits .....	95
<b>Koch Efforts To Privatize Florida Education .....</b>	<b>96</b>
Koch Groups Pushed For School Voucherization & Privatization .....	96
<b>The Kochs’ Campaign Against Florida’s Environment.....</b>	<b>98</b>
The Kochs Selfishly Fought Solar Energy In Florida.....	98
Koch Groups Railed Against The EPA Clean Power Plan .....	104
CSE-Florida’s Anti-Environmentalism And Global Warming Denial .....	107
<b>Tort Reform .....</b>	<b>108</b>
Citizens For A Sound Economy-Florida Earmarked \$460,000 For Tort Reform In 1998 .....	108
CSE’s Long Support For Tort Reform In Florida .....	110
Koch-Sponsored American Tort Reform Association Backed Multiple Tort Reform Projects.....	113
Koch-Tied James Madison Institute Supported Tort Reform, Provided Academic Support For Goals Of ATRA And FJRI.....	114
<b>The Koch’s Multi-Million Dollar Campaign To Buy Florida Lawmakers .....</b>	<b>117</b>
<b>With Their Eyes On Political Impact, The Kochs Established A Ground Network In Florida That Rivals The State’s Republican Party .....</b>	<b>117</b>
The Kochs Rapid Expansion Into Florida And Other Swing States Suggested They Are Focused On Political Impact .	117
<b>Marco Rubio .....</b>	<b>118</b>
Marco Rubio And The Koch Brothers Have “Nothing But Nice Things To Say” About Each Other.....	118
The Koch Network Was Heavily Invested In Marco Rubio’s 2016 Presidential Run .....	119
The Kochs Devoted Millions To Support Marco Rubio’s Senate Bids.....	120
Koch Connected Groups Spent Millions Against Rubio’s Opponent Patrick Murphy.....	122
Rubio Received Strong Support From AFP.....	123
Marco Rubio Attended Koch Events.....	124
Revolving Door Between The Koch Network And Rubio’s Staff.....	126
Rubio Consistently Fought For The Kochs’ Policy Agenda .....	127
<b>The Kochs Spent Over \$3.4 Million On Florida Congressional Races Since 2010 .....</b>	<b>133</b>
Koch Industries PAC Directly Contributed At LEast \$231,000 To Florida Congressional Races Since the 2010 Cycle ..	133
Koch Groups Have Spent Over \$3 Million On Florida Congressional Races Since 2010.....	135
<b>Rick Scott.....</b>	<b>136</b>
Koch Financial Support For Rick Scott.....	136
AFP Mobilized Support For Rick Scott & His Policy Agenda .....	136
Rick Scott Attended High Profile Koch Events.....	138
<b>Attorney General Pam Bondi.....</b>	<b>140</b>
Koch Industries Contributed \$6,000 To Attorney General Pam Bondi’s 2014 Race .....	140
<b>Florida Legislature.....</b>	<b>140</b>
The Kochs Spent Over \$100,000 On Florida State House & Senate Races Since 2012.....	140
<b>Florida Republican Party.....</b>	<b>143</b>
The Kochs Donated At Least \$290,000 To The Florida Republican Party Since 2012.....	143

# KOCH INDUSTRIES IN FLORIDA

## Georgia-Pacific

### GEORGIA-PACIFIC IN FLORIDA: FACILITIES OVERVIEW

**Georgia-Pacific Had An Idled Southern Pine Sawmill Plant In Cross City, Florida.** According to a state fact sheet from Georgia-Pacific, GP Facilities in Florida included Cross City Southern Pine Sawmill (Idled), producing Dimensional Lumber. [Georgia-Pacific State Fact Sheet, [4/16](#)]

**Georgia-Pacific Had An Idled Softwood Plywood Plant In Hawthorne, Florida.** According to a state fact sheet from Georgia-Pacific, GP Facilities in Florida included Hawthorne Softwood Plywood (Idled), producing Plytanium Plywood and Sturd-I-Floor. [Georgia-Pacific State Fact Sheet, [4/16](#)]

**Georgia-Pacific Had An Oriented Strand Board Plant In Hosford, Florida.** According to a state fact sheet from Georgia-Pacific, GP Facilities in Florida included Hosford Oriented Strand Board, producing Oriented Strand Board. [Georgia-Pacific State Fact Sheet, [4/16](#)]

**Georgia-Pacific Had A Pulp & Paper Mill In Palatka, Florida.** According to a state fact sheet from Georgia-Pacific, GP Facilities in Florida included Palatka Pulp & Paper, producing Consumer Tissue, Kraft paper and Linerboard. [Georgia-Pacific State Fact Sheet, [4/16](#)]

**Georgia-Pacific Had A Chip Mill In Palatka, Florida.** According to a state fact sheet from Georgia-Pacific, GP Facilities in Florida included Palatka Chip Mill, producing Chips. [Georgia-Pacific State Fact Sheet, [4/16](#)]

### GEORGIA-PACIFIC PALATKA'S POLLUTION AND MULTIPLE VIOLATIONS OF THE CLEAN AIR & CLEAN WATER ACTS

#### Georgia-Pacific's Runoff Caused Algal Blooms

**Runoff From The GP Paper Mill Added Phosphorus And Nitrogen, Nutrients That Caused Algal Blooms, To The St. Johns River.** According to the Florida Independent, "These algal blooms, though typical, generally occur on a much more limited scale, and not this early in the summer. Jimmy Orth, of St. Johns Riverkeeper, says that these recent cases are simply astounding. [...] Orth views the problem as one indicative of river neglect. 'Our river is sick, and these fish deaths are a symptom,' he says. 'It's hard to point the finger at any one industry when there are numerous culprits, but the root problem is the amount of excessive nutrients — namely, phosphorus and nitrogen — in the water, which come from runoff.' That runoff comes from residential fertilizers, community waste-water and large corporations like Georgia-Pacific, one of the single-largest contributors of nutrients to the river. GP's Palatka-based pulp and paper mill sits on nearly 6,000 acres of Rice Creek, a tributary of the St. Johns, and contributes both phosphorus and nitrogen to the river. And, coincidentally enough, a large algal bloom was recently spotted in the creek." [Florida Independent, [6/8/10](#)]

**The St. Johns River Experienced A Large Algae Bloom In Spring 2013.** According to the Florida Times-Union, "The work announced Thursday is meant to shrink levels of nitrogen and phosphorus in the river, cutting off nourishment for algae blooms that can choke downstream areas including Jacksonville during summer months. A large bloom that developed this spring near Toco in St. Johns County added urgency to the effort." [Florida Times-Union, 5/31/13]

**Columnist Ron Littlepage: "In The St. Johns River Near Toco...An Algal Bloom Covered 10 Square Miles Of The River From Bank To Bank At The End Of April."** According to an opinion by columnist Ron Littlepage for the Florida Times-Union, "Last Thursday morning, we were at the scene of a crime. It was there in the St. Johns River near Toco that an algal bloom covered 10 square miles of the river from bank to bank at the end of April." [Ron Littlepage – Florida Times-Union, 6/2/13]

**Littlepage: the Green Monster, A “Massive” Algal Bloom That Turned “Much Of The St. Johns River Into A Green, Goopy, Stinky Mess In 2005” Reappeared In 2009.** According to an opinion by columnist Ron Littlepage in the Florida-Times Union, “If you're not familiar with the Green Monster, it's best to hope that you don't get a first-hand introduction. That's the name attached to a massive algal bloom that turned much of the St. Johns River into a green, goopy, stinky mess in 2005. It reappeared in 2009.” [Ron Littlepage – Florida Times-Union, 6/14/13]

**Large Fish Kills Were Reported In The St. Johns River Because Of Algal Blooms.** According to the Florida Independent, “Reports of a vast number of redbird deaths in the St. Johns River have Jacksonville residents, and many more throughout Florida, worried. The river is host to hundreds of species of birds, fish and other wildlife and, at 310 miles long, it flows through 12 of Florida's 67 counties. Since May 25, the Florida Fish and Wildlife Commission has received at least 49 reports of dead fish in the river. Catalina Brown, a scientist with the FFWC, says the deaths cannot be attributed to the recent gulf oil spill, but are instead the result of a recent rise in algal blooms — blooms perhaps exacerbated by local industry runoff. Algal blooms almost always lead to fish kills. Not only do algae release toxins, but they use up copious amounts of oxygen when they die. They also cut off sunlight needed for underwater plant life to flourish.” [Florida Independent, [6/8/10](#)]

### **Georgia-Pacific's Palatka Pipeline**

*Georgia-Pacific's Proposed Pipeline Would Direct 28 Million Gallons Of Wastewater Into The St. John's River Every Day*

**Georgia-Pacific's Proposed Pipeline Carried Waste Away From The Palatka Paper Mill Into The St. Johns River.** According to News4jax.com, “A proposed pipeline that will carry waste away from a Palatka paper mill into the St. Johns River has been given the green light. The Secretary of the Florida Department of Environmental Protection made the announcement Thursday. It's been a battle between Georgia-Pacific and environmentalists for years. The DEP says the environmental community has been actively involved in the permit negotiations and is on board with this measure.” [News4jax.com, [10/4/12](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific's Wastewater Discharge Pipeline Carried A \$30 Million Price Tag.** According to the Jacksonville Business Journal, “Georgia-Pacific is confident it will be allowed to build a \$30 million pipeline to discharge its plant's wastewater directly into the St. Johns River, but opponents have one last shot at blocking the project.” [Jacksonville Business Journal, 2/11/11]

**Ronald Littlepage: Georgia-Pacific's Paper Mill In Putnam County Planned A Pipeline That Would Dump 28 Million Gallons Of Wastewater Into The St. Johns River Every Day.** According to an opinion by columnist Ronald Littlepage for the Florida Times-Union, “That's the kind of job Florida has been doing in ensuring the health of our rivers and streams. This is a particularly critical time for the St. Johns River. Not only are environmental protections being weakened, the Georgia-Pacific paper mill in Putnam County is moving inexorably ahead with plans to build a 4-mile pipeline to dump its polluted effluent into the heart of the St. Johns. After polluting Rice Creek for more than 60 years, Georgia-Pacific wants to move its pollution to the river rather than taking the necessary steps to further clean its wastewater. A recent study conducted at the request of the St. Johns Riverkeeper provided the evidence that shows the mill could meet the water quality standards needed to keep discharging into Rice Creek and that the alternative would be cheaper than the \$40 million pipeline. Still, Georgia-Pacific is proceeding with building the pipeline, which would put up to 28 million gallons of wastewater into the middle of the river daily. The mill is part of the empire owned by the billionaire Koch brothers, who have been poisoning our politics with their anti-government agenda and who now want to poison our river.” [Florida Times-Union - Ronald L. Littlepage, 5/5/11]

*Northeast Florida Residents Protested Against The Pipeline*

**St. Johns Riverkeeper Led A Protest Against Georgia-Pacific's Proposed Pipeline, Which Redirected Waste From Their Paper Mill Directly Into The St. Johns River.** According to the Jacksonville Business Journal, “About 50 people gathered outside the Florida Department of Environmental Protection district office in Downtown Jacksonville Thursday with signs and a glass of clean water to protest the construction of a pipeline that would dump millions of gallons of wastewater into the St. Johns River. The proposed pipeline would redirect waste from the Georgia-Pacific paper mill from Rice Creek into the river. The department has yet to give final approval to the project, and some people are anxious to get the proposal off the table. St. Johns Riverkeeper Neil Armingeon said the turnout at the protest showed that people from all over Northeast Florida care about the issue and want to find an alternative solution to the pipeline. ‘We're not against Georgia-Pacific,’



Armington said, 'but we're not going to sit idly by and let them pollute the hell out of the river.'" [Jacksonville Business Journal, 6/9/11]

**St. Johns Riverkeeper Issued A Study To Demonstrate That The Proposed Pipeline Only Moved Wastewater Discharge And Pollution From One Place To Another.** According to the Jacksonville Business Journal, "A St. Johns Riverkeeper-commissioned study released Feb. 9 found that the Palatka paper company's past commissioned study was faulty in determining that the pipeline was the only way it could meet state water quality standards. Riverkeeper Neil Armington hopes the new study, conducted by Greenovative Design and Engineering, will persuade the state Department of Environmental Protection to reject the four-mile pipeline. The multiyear fight, which has spurred public relations campaigns from both sides, reflects the larger issue of how the region balances manufacturing with health concerns over the river. Environmental improvements made by local manufacturers, including Anheuser-Busch InBev NV and Gerdau Ameristeel Corp., have paralleled the community's increased interest in cleaning up the river. Likewise, Georgia-Pacific has spent \$200 million to solve its wastewater problem. 'We think there are enough questions that this review raises that we don't think GP should move forward until these issues are addressed,' Armington said. He said moving the wastewater discharge point from the current site at Rice Creek to directly into the St. Johns River only moved the pollution from one place to another. The DEP hasn't set a date for when it will announce its decision on the planned pipeline." [Jacksonville Business Journal, 2/11/11]

### *Georgia-Pacific's Rice Creek Pollution*

**"Numerous Contaminants Are Present In Rice Creek Sediments, Many At Levels That Exceed Probable Effects Levels (PELs)."** According to the Evaluation of Georgia-Pacific Palatka Effluent Improvement and Effluent Impact Studies by L. B. Sonnenberg, Ph.D., "Numerous contaminants are present in Rice Creek sediments, many at levels that exceed Probable Effects Levels (PELs)." [L. B. Sonnenberg, Ph.D., "Evaluation of Georgia-Pacific Palatka Effluent Improvement and Effluent Impact Studies," [6/16/11](#)]

- **PELs Described A Chemical Concentration That Was Likely To Cause An Adverse Effect When Accidentally Ingested.** According to an EPA Ecological Risk Assessment Glossary of Terms, "PEL/Probable Effects Level: A chemical concentration in some item (dose) prey that is ingested by an organism, which is likely to cause an adverse effect. The ingested item is usually food, but can be soil, sediment, or surface water that is incidentally (accidentally) ingested." [EPA Ecological Risk Assessment – Glossary of Terms, Accessed [9/8/15](#)]

**While The Exact Origin Of Sediment Pollution In Rice Creek Was Unknown, The Georgia-Pacific Mill Was "A Potentially Significant Source Given The History Of Chemical Use By The Pulp And Paper Industry And The Presence Of Legacy Compounds In Their Effluents."** According to the Evaluation of Georgia-Pacific Palatka Effluent Improvement and Effluent Impact Studies by L. B. Sonnenberg, Ph.D., "Rice Creek sediments are heavily contaminated (see Appendix B for additional information). The origins are unknown, but the mill is a potentially significant source given the history of chemical use by the pulp and paper industry and the presence of legacy compounds in their effluents. If the compounds are present in G-P effluents, their fate and effects when transported to different environments is unknown" [L. B. Sonnenberg, Ph.D., "Evaluation of Georgia-Pacific Palatka Effluent Improvement and Effluent Impact Studies," [6/16/11](#)]

- **Paper Mills Produced "Dark, Oxygen-Poor" Waste With Dioxin Which Could "Wreak Havoc In Natural Systems." Scientists Found Fish Downstream From Paper Mills Which Were Changing Sex.** According to the St. Petersburg Times, "Florida pulp and paper industry officials say the only feasible way to deal with pollution is to dilute it in large water bodies. Dark, oxygen-poor paper mill waste can snuff out marine life. It can also carry dioxin, which can wreak havoc in natural systems. Downstream from some Florida paper mills, scientists have found fish that are changing sex, but no one is sure what is causing the phenomenon." [St. Petersburg Times, 1/15/99]

**Gainesville Sun: "The Georgia Pacific Plant Has Been Discharging Into Rice Creek... For More Than 50 Years."** According to the Gainesville Sun, "The Georgia Pacific plant has been discharging into Rice Creek, a tributary of the St. John's River 40 miles east of Gainesville, for more than 50 years. A 1997 EPA study of bluegill fish tissue taken from Rice Creek found an average dioxin level of 2.8 parts per trillion, exceeding the agency's acceptable upper limit of 1.2 parts per trillion." [Gainesville Sun, [7/20/02](#)]

- **Koch Industries Acquired Georgia-Pacific For \$13 Billion In November Of 2005.** According to The Street, "Paper products giant Georgia-Pacific Corp., the maker of Brawny paper towels and Angel Soft tissue, has agreed to

be acquired for more than \$13 billion by Koch Industries Inc., the nation's second-biggest private company." [The Street, [11/13/05](#)]

**Rice Creek Had Notably Elevated Levels Of Several Pesticides, Chlorophenols, And Phthalates.** According to the Evaluation of Georgia-Pacific Palatka Effluent Improvement and Effluent Impact Studies by L. B. Sonnenberg, Ph.D., "Rice Creek is notable in the sediment survey also because of elevated levels of several pesticides including total chlordane, total DDT, endosulfan, dieldrin, heptachlors, methoxychlor, lindane, kepone, and hexachlorohexanes. Chlorophenols and phthalates in Rice Creek sediments are also extremely high." [L. B. Sonnenberg, Ph.D., "Evaluation of Georgia-Pacific Palatka Effluent Improvement and Effluent Impact Studies," [6/16/11](#)]

- **"Whether These Compounds Are Present In The G-P Effluents Today Is Unknown, But Historic Use Of Biocides And Other Persistent, Bioaccumulative, And Toxic Compounds By The Pulp And Paper Industry Was Widespread."** According to the Evaluation of Georgia-Pacific Palatka Effluent Improvement and Effluent Impact Studies by L. B. Sonnenberg, Ph.D., "Whether these compounds are present in the G-P effluents today is unknown, but historic use of biocides and other persistent, bioaccumulative, and toxic compounds by the pulp and paper industry was widespread." [L. B. Sonnenberg, Ph.D., "Evaluation of Georgia-Pacific Palatka Effluent Improvement and Effluent Impact Studies," [6/16/11](#)]
- **"If Historically Produced Dioxins Are Present In The Wastewater Treatment Ponds, It Is Possible That Other Recalcitrant Contaminants Are Also Present."** According to the Evaluation of Georgia-Pacific Palatka Effluent Improvement and Effluent Impact Studies by L. B. Sonnenberg, Ph.D., "If historically produced dioxins are present in the wastewater treatment ponds, it is possible that other recalcitrant contaminants are also present." [L. B. Sonnenberg, Ph.D., "Evaluation of Georgia-Pacific Palatka Effluent Improvement and Effluent Impact Studies," [6/16/11](#)]

## Clean Water Act Violations

**2015: The Georgia-Pacific Palatka Plant Was Found In Non-Compliance With The Clean Water Act 10 Of 12 Quarters.** According to the EPA's detailed facility report on the Georgia-Pacific plant in Palatka, Florida, the plant has been non-compliant with the Clean Water Act in 10 of the last 12 quarters. [EPA, Accessed [2/15/15](#)]

### *Violation Of The Clean Water Act's Regulation On Settleable Solids*

**In 2013, Georgia-Pacific's Palatka Facility Was Cited For A Serious Violation Regarding Settleable Solid Amounts That Exceeded Non-Monthly Limits By 1,200% Under The Clean Water Act.** According to the EPA Detailed Facility Report for the Georgia Pacific Consumer Operations LLC facility in Palatka, the facility was in serious non-compliance for settleable solid "effluent violations of non-monthly average limits" for the second quarter of 2013. Levels of settleable solids were recorded at 1,200% over regulatory limits. [EPA Detailed Facility Report, Accessed [9/8/15](#); EPA Detailed Facility Report Data Dictionary, Accessed [9/8/15](#)]

- **The EPA Defined Settleable Solids As "The Volume Or Dry Weight Of Settleable Solids In A Given Volume Of Water Obtained When A Well-Mixed Sample Is Allowed To Stand Quiescent For A Given Period Of Time."** According to the EPA Substance Registry Services, "Substance Details - Settleable solids [...] Definition The volume or dry weight of settleable solids in a given volume of water obtained when a well-mixed sample is allowed to stand quiescent for a given period of time." [EPA Substance Registry Services, Accessed [9/9/15](#)]

### *Violation Of The Clean Water Act's Regulation On Fecal Coliform Pollution*

**Between January And June Of 2015, Georgia-Pacific's Palatka Facility Was Found In Noncompliance With The Clean Water Act Due To "Coliform, Fecal General" Levels.** According to the EPA Detailed Facility Report for the Georgia Pacific Consumer Operations LLC facility in Palatka, Florida, the facility was in violation of the Clean Water Act due to above regulation levels of "Coliform, Fecal General" pollutants. Between January and March of 2015, facility 003 had levels at "2400%" over non-monthly regulations. The violation was labeled "V(NonRNCV)" which meant "the facility has effluent, compliance schedule, permit schedule, or single-event violations in the current quarter, however, is not in considered to be in RNC or SNC [Significant Non-compliance/Reportable Non-compliance Status]." Between April and June of 2015, facility 003

had levels recorded at “99999%” for both monthly and non-monthly regulations. Being the most recent quarter of reporting, the information was a draft that has not been fully quality assured. According to the EPA Detailed Facility Report Data Dictionary, “Until the next QNCR becomes official, these data are considered draft, have not been fully quality assured, and are subject to change.” [EPA Detailed Facility Report, Accessed [9/8/15](#); EPA Detailed Facility Report Data Dictionary, Accessed [9/8/15](#)]

**Environmental Protection Agency: “Fecal Coliform Bacteria Are A Kind Of Coliform Associated With Human Or Animal Wastes.”** According to the EPA, “Coliforms are bacteria that live in the intestines of warm-blooded animals (humans, pets, farm animals, and wildlife). Fecal coliform bacteria are a kind of coliform associated with human or animal wastes.” [EPA, Accessed [9/8/15](#)]

- **EPA: “E. Coli Is Part Of The Group Of Fecal Coliforms.”** According to the EPA, “Escherichia coli (E. coli) is part of the group of fecal coliforms.” [EPA, Accessed [9/8/15](#)]
- **EPA: Coliforms “Indicate The Presence Of Other Disease-Causing Bacteria, Such As Those That Cause Typhoid, Dysentery, Hepatitis A, And Cholera.”** According to the EPA, In themselves, coliforms generally do not pose a danger to people or animals, but they indicate the presence of other disease-causing bacteria, such as those that cause typhoid, dysentery, hepatitis A, and cholera. Both coliforms and disease-causing bacteria live in water. But unlike coliforms, disease-causing bacteria generally do not survive long enough in the water, outside the body of animals, to be detected. Sampling and testing for the presence of disease-causing bacteria is therefore difficult; instead, scientists and public health officials consider the presence of coliforms an indicator of disease bacteria in recreational, drinking and flood waters. [EPA, Accessed [9/8/15](#)]

**In 2012, Georgia-Pacific’s Palatka Facility Was Found In Noncompliance With The Clean Water Act Due To “Coliform, Fecal General” Levels.** According to the EPA Detailed Facility Report for the Georgia Pacific Consumer Operations LLC facility in Palatka, Florida, the facility was in violation of the Clean Water Act due to above regulation levels of “Coliform, Fecal General” pollutants. Between July and September of 2015, facility 001 had levels at “25%” over non-monthly regulations. The violation was labeled “V(NonRNCV)” which meant “the facility has effluent, compliance schedule, permit schedule, or single-event violations in the current quarter, however, is not in considered to be in RNC or SNC [Significant Non-compliance/Reportable Non-compliance Status].” [EPA Detailed Facility Report, Accessed [9/8/15](#); EPA Detailed Facility Report Data Dictionary, Accessed [9/8/15](#)]

#### *Violation Of The Clean Water Act’s Regulation On Dissolved Oxygen*

**In 2013, Georgia-Pacific’s Palatka Facility Was Cited For A Violation Of The Clean Water Act Regarding Dissolved Oxygen Amounts That Exceeded Regulated Levels By 2,147,483,650%.** According to the EPA Detailed Facility Report for the Georgia Pacific Consumer Operations LLC facility in Palatka, the facility was in noncompliance for dissolved oxygen “effluent violations of non-monthly average limits” for the third quarter of 2013. The violation was labeled “V(NonRNCV)” which meant “the facility has effluent, compliance schedule, permit schedule, or single-event violations in the current quarter, however, is not in considered to be in RNC or SNC [Significant Non-compliance/Reportable Non-compliance Status].” Dissolved Oxygen levels were recorded at 2147483650% above regulatory limits. [EPA Detailed Facility Report, Accessed [9/8/15](#); EPA Detailed Facility Report Data Dictionary, Accessed [9/8/15](#)]

#### *Georgia-Pacific’s Wastewater Had Illegal Levels Of “Cancer-Causing Chemical Dioxin”*

**2011: Dioxin Levels In Georgia-Pacific’s Wastewater Were Higher Than Those Allowed By Law.** According to the Jacksonville Business Journal, “At issue is the amount of dioxin in Georgia-Pacific’s wastewater and the method of testing for it. The federal and state-approved testing is not sensitive enough to detect the level of dioxin allowed by law. An unapproved method of testing has detected more than is allowed by law, said Herschel Vinyard, secretary of the Department of Environmental Protection.” [Jacksonville Business Journal, 10/28/11]

**2009: Wastewater From GP’s Putnam County Paper Mill Was Found To Carry “Far More” Of The Cancer-Causing Chemical Dioxin “Than Federal Standards Allow.”** According to the Florida Times-Union, “Wastewater from Georgia-Pacific’s paper mill in Putnam County carries far more of a cancer-causing chemical than federal standards allow in the creek where it empties, a new federal report shows. The findings are the first evidence of a continuing dioxin problem involving the

mill since manufacturing processes were changed several years ago to eliminate the toxic chemical from the company's waste. Tests that found the chemical can't show whether it's new or a residue that sat for years in holding ponds where wastewater lingers before flowing into Rice Creek, a small waterway that joins the St. Johns River.” [Florida Times-Union via LexisNexis, 2/24/09]

- **Florida Times-Union: “The Discovery Has Led The State To Ask Georgia-Pacific To Review Its Operations And Could Put Into Question Plans For The Mill To Build A Pipeline To Carry Wastewater To The River.”** According to the Florida Times-Union, “The discovery has led the state to ask Georgia-Pacific to review its operations and could put into question plans for the mill to build a pipeline to carry wastewater to the river. The pipeline was allowed because the state accepted that environmental controls at the plant were working as well as possible. ‘This report kind of throws some uncertainty on the optimization’ of one part of those controls, said Melissa Long, a water program administrator at the Florida Department of Environmental Protection in Jacksonville.” [Florida Times-Union via LexisNexis, 2/24/09]

**St. Johns Riverkeeper Was Concerned That Liquid Waste Could Contain Cancer-Causing Toxins.** According to News4Jax.com, “While the St. Johns Riverkeeper is worried that the liquid waste might contain cancer-causing toxins, DEP Secretary Herschel Vinyard says it’s restrictive. ‘Its a big win for Jacksonville, it’s a big for the river,’ Vinyard said. ‘My technical staff informed me earlier that this is the most restrictive and comprehensive wastewater permit ever issued by the department. It’s a real win.’ Georgia-Pacific is owned by Koch Industries, the controversial company owned by billionaire brothers Charles and David Koch. Both men are well-known as being opposed to environmental and business regulations.” [News4Jax.com, [10/4/12](#)]

- **St. Johns Riverkeeper Was A Citizen-Based Advocacy Group Focused On Maintaining The St. Johns River Clean And Healthy For Communities.** According to the St. Johns Riverkeeper website, “The St. Johns Riverkeeper mission is to work on behalf of the community for clean and healthy waters in the St. Johns River, its tributaries and its wetlands, through citizen-based advocacy. We are a privately-funded, independent and trusted voice for the St. Johns River and the public to whom it belongs.” [St. Johns Riverkeeper Website, Accessed [8/12/14](#)]

## **Clean Air Act Violations**

### *Violation Of The Clean Air Act’s Regulation On Total Hazardous Air Pollutants (HAPS)*

**In 2013, Georgia-Pacific’s Palatka Facility Was Flagged For High Priority Violations Of The Clean Air Act’s Regulations On Total Hazardous Air Pollutants (HAPS).** According to the EPA Detailed Facility Report for the Georgia Pacific Consumer Operations LLC facility in Palatka, the facility was flagged in for a high priority violation over total hazardous air pollutants (HAPS) in the fourth quarter of 2013. [EPA Detailed Facility Report, Accessed [9/8/15](#); EPA Detailed Facility Report Data Dictionary, Accessed [9/8/15](#)]

### *Violation Of The Clean Air Act’s Regulation On Sulfide Emissions*

**For Two Quarters Of 2013, Georgia-Pacific’s Palatka Facility Was Flagged For High Priority Violations Of The Clean Air Act’s Regulations Of Sulfide Emissions.** According to the EPA Detailed Facility Report for the Georgia Pacific Consumer Operations LLC facility in Palatka, the facility was flagged in for a high priority violation over sulfide emissions in the third and fourth quarters of 2013. [EPA Detailed Facility Report, Accessed [9/8/15](#); EPA Detailed Facility Report Data Dictionary, Accessed [9/8/15](#)]

## **GEORGIA-PACIFIC FOLEY CELLULOSE’S PIPELINE DISPUTE**

### **Georgia-Pacific Foley Cellulose’s New Pipeline Would Direct Wastewater To The Gulf Of Mexico**

**The Georgia-Pacific Pipeline Would Run 15 Miles From The Mill To About One And A Half Miles From The Gulf Of Mexico.** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “Scott Mixon, public affairs manager for Georgia-Pacific, said the 5-foot-wide iron pipe would run underground about 15 miles. It would start at the mill and end roughly one and a half miles from the Gulf. The project would be completed by March 2021.” [Tallahassee Democrat, [8/10/16](#)]



## **Georgia-Pacific Unsuccessfully Attempted To Garner Support For The Foley Cellulose Pipeline**

**A Day After Running A Full Page Ad In The Tallahassee Democrat, Georgia-Pacific Lost A County Commissioners Vote On A Resolution Opposing The Foley Cellulose Pipeline.** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “Wakulla County commissioners — in a nod to environmental advocates — unanimously approved two resolutions Monday night aimed at cleaning Florida’s waters. Residents crowded in the commission chamber erupted into applause when the commission passed a resolution opposing a pipeline that would spill waste from the Foley Cellulose paper mill closer to the Gulf of Mexico. [...] The vote came a day after Georgia-Pacific, the Koch Industries subsidiary that owns the plant, ran a full-page advertisement in the Sunday Tallahassee Democrat.” [Tallahassee Democrat, [8/15/16](#)]

- **The Ad Was An Open Letter From The Plant’s Vice President And General Manager Who Said That The Pipeline’s Opponents Misrepresented The Company.** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “The ad was an open letter to the community from Lee Davis, the plant’s vice president and general manager, who said pipeline opponents have presented inaccuracies and misrepresentations about the company. Davis said the plant and its more than 500 workers are committed to striking a balance between operating the facility and protecting waterways. The company, he said, invested nearly \$120 million to improve water quality in the Fenholloway.” [Tallahassee Democrat, [8/15/16](#)]

**In 2016, Georgia-Pacific Said That It Would Invest \$70 To \$100 Million Over The Next Five Years To Benefit The Fenholloway River And The Gulf.** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “Georgia-Pacific, which bought the mill in August 2013, is acting in accordance with a Florida Department of Environmental Protection administrative order that says building a pipeline is the only way to restore Fenholloway to a river for recreation, fish and wildlife. The mill, the company said, will invest another \$70 million to \$100 million over the next five years to benefit the river and the Gulf.” [Tallahassee Democrat, [8/15/16](#)]

### *Georgia-Pacific’s Plans Threatened The Gulf’s Seafood And Tourism Industries*

**Florida Clean Water Network Director Linda Young: Pushing The Effluent Closer To The Shore Was Worse For The Gulf.** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “Linda Young, director of the Florida Clean Water Network, said pushing the effluent closer to the shore is worse for the Gulf. Currently, effluent is released directly from the plant and travels down the river, losing sediment along the way and posing less risk to the Gulf.” [Tallahassee Democrat, [8/10/16](#)]

**Leon County Commission Chairman Bill Proctor: The Georgia-Pacific Pipeline Threatened Coastal Community’s Seafood Industry And Tourism.** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “[Leon County Commission Chairman Bill] Proctor accuses Georgia-Pacific, which is owned by Koch Industries, of not being ‘a good corporate neighbor.’ The pipeline, he said, threatens coastline communities, especially the seafood industry in Wakulla, which he said directly impacts Leon County’s economy and residents. He said visitors to Wakulla County stay in Leon County hotels, plus many Leon County residents own investment properties along the Gulf.” [Tallahassee Democrat, [8/10/16](#)]

### *Wakulla County Residents Believed The Georgia-Pacific Pipeline Threatened Their Health And Safety*

**Wakulla County Commissioner Howard Kessler On The Proposed Georgia-Pacific Pipeline To The Gulf: “As A Physician, I Am Concerned With The Health And Safety Of The Citizens; These Toxic Mixtures Cause Harm To Not Only Human Beings But To The Life That Is In The River And What Adjoins The River.”** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “Big Bend county commissioners are waging war against a planned pipeline that would deliver 40 million gallons of wastewater per day from the Foley Cellulose paper mill in Taylor County directly to the Gulf of Mexico. Leon County Commission Chairman Bill Proctor and Wakulla County Commissioner Howard Kessler stood on the steps of the Federal Courthouse on Adams Street on Tuesday and warned about the environmental impacts the pipeline would have on the Gulf. ‘As a physician, I am concerned with the health and safety of the citizens,’ Kessler said. ‘These toxic mixtures cause harm to not only human beings but to the life that is in the river and what adjoins the river.’ Kessler, Proctor and environmentalists claim the project will degrade Gulf waters, deteriorate sea life and impact tourism in surrounding counties. Their goal is simple, urge local and federal leaders to keep the company from constructing the pipeline by blocking approval of a U.S. Army Corps of Engineers permit needed to build in federal waters.” [Tallahassee Democrat, [8/10/16](#)]

**Proctor: “None Of Us Should Have To Take The Chance Of Glowing In The Dark After Eating A Mullet Dinner Because Of Georgia-Pacific’s Special Added Seasoning To The Gulf Waters.”** According to the Tallahassee Democrat,

“None of us should have to take the chance of glowing in the dark after eating a mullet dinner because of Georgia-Pacific’s special added seasoning to the Gulf waters,’ Proctor wrote to elected leaders from across the region. ‘This for-profit corporation wants to shirk its responsibilities at the expense of our health and wealth. We must stand our ground and not let this happen.’” [Tallahassee Democrat, [8/10/16](#)]

**Wakulla County Fisherman John Taylor On Georgia-Pacific’s Proposed Pipeline To The Gulf: “We’re Already Struggling As It Is And We Don’t Want No Toxins Messing Our Fish, Our Oysters And Our Shrimp Up. I Don’t Want This Messed Up.”** According to The Tallahassee Democrat, “The Atlanta-based company, working off an administrative order from the Florida Department of Environmental Protection, is planning a 15-mile pipeline that would transfer the 40 million gallons of wastewater it expels each day to a location a mile and a half from the Gulf. Since 1954, the mill has dumped the effluent directly into the Fenholloway River, which leads to the Gulf. [...] For some like Wakulla County fisherman John Taylor, the pipeline is simply a big concern for him and other anglers. ‘We’re already struggling as it is and we don’t want no toxins messing our fish, our oysters and our shrimp up,’ he said. ‘I don’t want this messed up.’” [Tallahassee Democrat, [8/11/16](#)]

**Leon County Commission Chairman Bill Proctor: “Georgia-Pacific Is One Of The Worst Polluters In The State Of Florida. They Have A Track Record That Is Long And Very Clear -- That They Do Not Care About The Environment.”** According to WTXL, “The commissioners are also calling for an immediate shutdown of the Foley plant and requesting a comprehensive marine impact study. ‘Georgia-Pacific is one of the worst polluters in the state of Florida,’ [Leon County Commission Chairman Bill] Proctor said. ‘They have a track record that is long and very clear -- that they do not care about the environment.’” [WTXL, [8/10/16](#)]

## GEORGIA-PACIFIC PLANTS AND POLLUTION IN NEARBY FLORIDA SCHOOLS

### Ochwilla

**Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka And Georgia-Pacific Hawthorne Plywood Were Both Listed Among Facilities “Most Responsible For Toxics Outside” Ochwilla Elementary School.** According to a special report by USA Today, Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka in Palatka, Florida and Georgia-Pacific Hawthorne Plywood in Hawthorne, Florida were “polluters most responsible for toxics outside” Ochwilla Elementary School in Hawthorne, Florida. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

**Ochwilla Elementary School Was In The 39th Percentile In The Country For Exposure To Cancer-Causing Toxics And Toxic Chemicals.** According to a special report by USA Today, Ochwilla Elementary School ranked in the 39<sup>th</sup> percentile for exposure to cancer-causing chemicals and other toxic chemicals. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific Hawthorne Plywood Produced Manganese And Manganese Compounds.** According to a special report by USA Today, “Toxic chemicals emitted by” Georgia-Pacific Hawthorne Plywood included “manganese and manganese compounds.” [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]
- **Manganese and Manganese Compounds Represented 7% Of The Overall Toxicity At Ochwilla Elementary School.** According to a special report by USA Today, “Manganese and manganese compounds” represented “7% of overall toxicity” at Ochwilla Elementary School. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]
- **Symptoms Of Exposure To Manganese Included “Mental And Emotional Disturbances And Slow And Clumsy Body Movements – A Disease Of The Brain Called Manganism. Children Are More Vulnerable To Such Exposure Than Adults.”** According to a special report by USA Today, “Manganese is used to produce pesticides, batteries, and other industrial products. Although trace elements are found in food and are considered essential for good health, overexposure for long periods can cause mental and emotional disturbances and slow and clumsy body movements – a disease of the brain called manganism. Children are more vulnerable to such exposure than adults.” [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific Corp Palatka Produced Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, And Ammonia.** “Toxic chemicals emitted by” Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka included “Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, [and] Ammonia.” [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]
- **Chlorine Dioxide Represented 8% Of Overall Toxicity At Ochwilla Elementary School And Hydrochloric Acid Represented 3%.** According to a special report by USA Today, “Chlorine dioxide” represented “8% of overall toxicity” and “Hydrochloric acid” represented “3% of overall toxicity” at Ochwilla Elementary School. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

### **C.H. Price**

**Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka Was Listed Among Facilities “Most Responsible For Toxics Outside” C.H. Price Middle School.** According to a special report by USA Today, Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka in Palatka, Florida was one of the “polluters most responsible for toxics outside” C.H. Price Middle School in Interlachen, Florida. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

**C.H. Price Middle School Was In The 31st Percentile In The Country For Exposure To Cancer-Causing Toxics And Toxic Chemicals.** According to a special report by USA Today, C.H. Price Middle School ranked in the 31<sup>st</sup> percentile for exposure to cancer-causing chemicals and other toxic chemicals. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific Corp Palatka Produced Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, And Ammonia.** “Toxic chemicals emitted by” Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka included “Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, [and] Ammonia.” [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]
- **Chlorine Dioxide Represented 10% Of Overall Toxicity At C.H. Price Middle School.** According to a special report by USA Today, “Chlorine dioxide” represented “10% of overall toxicity” at C.H. Price Middle School. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

### **Browning-Pearce**

**Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka Was Listed Among Facilities “Most Responsible For Toxics Outside” Browning-Pearce Elementary School.** According to a special report by USA Today, Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka in Palatka, Florida was one of the “polluters most responsible for toxics outside” Browning-Pearce Elementary School in San Mateo, Florida. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

**Browning-Pearce Elementary School Was In The 24th Percentile In The Country For Exposure To Cancer-Causing Toxics And Toxic Chemicals.** According to a special report by USA Today, Browning-Pearce Elementary School ranked in the 24<sup>th</sup> percentile for exposure to cancer-causing chemicals and other toxic chemicals. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific Corp Palatka Produced Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, And Ammonia.** “Toxic chemicals emitted by” Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka included “Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, [and] Ammonia.” [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]
- **Chlorine Dioxide Represented 11% Of Overall Toxicity At Browning-Pearce Elementary School.** According to a special report by USA Today, “Chlorine dioxide” represented “11% of overall toxicity” at Browning-Pearce Elementary School. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

### **James A. Long**

**Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka Was Listed Among Facilities “Most Responsible For Toxics Outside” James A. Long Elementary School.** According to a special report by USA Today, Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka in Palatka, Florida is one of the “polluters most responsible for toxics outside” James A. Long Elementary School in Palatka, Florida. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

**James A. Long Elementary School Was In The 6th Percentile In The Country For Exposure To Cancer-Causing Toxins And Toxic Chemicals.** According to a special report by USA Today, James A. Long Elementary School ranked in the 6<sup>th</sup> percentile for exposure to cancer-causing chemicals and other toxic chemicals. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific Corp Palatka Produced Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, And Ammonia.** “Toxic chemicals emitted by” Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka included “Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, [and] Ammonia.” [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]
- **Chlorine Dioxide Represents 12% Of Overall Toxicity At James A. Long Elementary School.** According to a special report by USA Today, “Chlorine dioxide” represented “12% of overall toxicity” at James A. Long Elementary School. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

### Robert H. Jenkins

**Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka Listed Among Facilities “Most Responsible For Toxics Outside” Robert H. Jenkins Junior Middle School.** According to a special report by USA Today, Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka in Palatka, Florida was one of the “polluters most responsible for toxics outside” Robert H. Jenkins Junior Middle School in Palatka, Florida. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

**Robert H. Jenkins Junior Middle School Was In The 6th Percentile In The Country For Exposure To Cancer-Causing Toxins And Toxic Chemicals.** According to a special report by USA Today, Robert H. Jenkins Junior Middle School ranked in the 6<sup>th</sup> percentile for exposure to cancer-causing chemicals and other toxic chemicals. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific Corp Palatka Produced Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, And Ammonia.** “Toxic chemicals emitted by” Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka included “Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, [and] Ammonia.” [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]
- **Chlorine Dioxide Represented 12% Of Overall Toxicity At Robert H. Jenkins Junior Middle School.** According to a special report by USA Today, “Chlorine dioxide” represented “12% of overall toxicity” at Robert H. Jenkins Junior Middle School. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

### Mellon

**Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka Was Listed Among Facilities “Most Responsible For Toxics Outside” Mellon Elementary School.** According to a special report by USA Today, Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka in Palatka, Florida was one of the “polluters most responsible for toxics outside” Mellon Elementary School in Palatka, Florida. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

**Mellon Elementary School Was In The 11th Percentile In The Country For Exposure To Cancer-Causing Toxins And Toxic Chemicals.** According to a special report by USA Today, Mellon Elementary School ranked in the 11<sup>th</sup> percentile for exposure to cancer-causing chemicals and other toxic chemicals. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific Corp Palatka Produced Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, And Ammonia.** “Toxic chemicals emitted by” Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka included “Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde,



Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, [and] Ammonia.” [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

- **Chlorine Dioxide Represented 16% Of Overall Toxicity At Mellon Elementary School.** According to a special report by USA Today, “Chlorine dioxide” represented “16% of overall toxicity” at Mellon Elementary School. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

## Palatka High

**Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka Was Listed Among Facilities “Most Responsible For Toxics Outside” Palatka High School.** According to a special report by USA Today, Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka in Palatka, Florida was one of the “polluters most responsible for toxics outside” Palatka High School in Palatka, Florida. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

**Palatka High School Was In The 11th Percentile In The Country For Exposure To Cancer-Causing Toxics And Toxic Chemicals.** According to a special report by USA Today, Palatka High School ranked in the 11<sup>th</sup> percentile for exposure to cancer-causing chemicals and other toxic chemicals. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific Corp Palatka Produced Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, And Ammonia.** “Toxic chemicals emitted by” Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka included “Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, [and] Ammonia.” [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]
- **Chlorine Dioxide Represented 16% Of Overall Toxicity At Palatka High School.** According to a special report by USA Today, “Chlorine dioxide” represented “16% of overall toxicity” at Palatka High School. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

## Central Academy

**Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka Was Listed Among Facilities “Most Responsible For Toxics Outside” Central Academy.** According to a special report by USA Today, Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka in Palatka, Florida was one of the “polluters most responsible for toxics outside” Central Academy in Palatka, Florida. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

**Central Academy Was In The 11th Percentile In The Country For Exposure To Cancer-Causing Toxics And Toxic Chemicals.** According to a special report by USA Today, Central Academy ranked in the 11<sup>th</sup> percentile for exposure to cancer-causing chemicals and other toxic chemicals. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific Corp Palatka Produced Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, And Ammonia.** “Toxic chemicals emitted by” Georgia-Pacific Corp. Palatka included “Chlorine Dioxide, Acetaldehyde, Formaldehyde, Hydrochloric Acid, [and] Ammonia.” [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]
- **Chlorine Dioxide Represented 13% Of Overall Toxicity At Central Academy.** According to a special report by USA Today, “Chlorine dioxide” represented “13% of overall toxicity” at Central Academy. [USA Today Special Report: The Smokestack Effect: Toxic Air And America’s Schools, Viewed [12/18/14](#)]

## **TRANSPARENT EFFORTS TO SAVE FACE WITH THE COMMUNITY WHILE SIMULTANEOUSLY PUSH THEIR CORPORATE AGENDA**

**Georgia-Pacific Opened St. Johns River Center: Adventures In A Wetlands Ecosystem In Palatka, Florida, Which Was “Geared Toward Students.”** According to a web post from Georgia – Pacific, “Georgia-Pacific’s pulp and paper operation in Palatka, Florida, helped develop the St. Johns River Center: Adventures in a Wetlands Ecosystem.. Geared toward students, the center is a fun, interactive space for learning about the ecology of the St. Johns River and the wetlands area, and its connection to the history, culture and industry of Palatka.” [GP.com, [7/15/15](#)]

**St Johns River Centre “Was Created Through A Cooperation Between The City Of Palatka And Georgia- Pacific Palatka Pulp And Paper Operations.”** According to News4Jax, “It was created through a cooperation between the City of Palatka and Georgia- Pacific Palatka Pulp and Paper Operations.” [News4Jax.com, [7/10/15](#)]

- **Georgia-Pacific Paid For The St. Johns River Center.** According to WJCT, “The new center is located on the St. Johns River in the heart of downtown Palatka. It was paid for by Georgia-Pacific, a pulp and paper subsidiary of Koch Industries.” [WJCT, [8/17/15](#)]

### **Scientists Noted Georgia-Pacific Had Control Over The Curriculum, Which Aimed Teach The Benefits Of Manufacturing Alongside Wetlands And Refused To Discuss Global Warming**

**The St. Johns River Center Opened To Educate Children About “The Environmental Importance Of The River And Its Connection To History And Culture Of Northeast Florida.”** According to WJCT, “A new environmental education facility opened to the public in Palatka last month, inviting school groups to learn about wetlands and wildlife. [...] The St. Johns River Center has exhibits about the environmental importance of the river and its connection to history and culture of Northeast Florida. City of Palatka spokeswoman Mandi Tucker says the center’s main purpose is educating children.” [WJCT, [8/17/15](#)]

**Some Scientists Questioned Whether Georgia-Pacific Had “Too Much Influence” Over The Center’s Curriculum.** According to WJCT, “Some scientists who helped develop the center are questioning whether the manufacturer Georgia-Pacific had too much influence over its curriculum.” [WJCT, [8/17/15](#)]

- **Some Scientists On The Advisory Board Disagreed With The Curriculum But Were Unable To Contribute To It.** According to WJCT, “But some scientists on the advisory board didn’t see eye-to-eye with Georgia-Pacific while vetting the curriculum back in 2013. Lauren Watkins, who worked for the Florida Department of Environmental Protection at the time, says she resigned as a St. Johns River center advisor after Georgia-Pacific presented an outline of the curriculum at its first meeting. ‘I was under the assumption that we would be integral in the development of the curriculum,’ Watkins said, ‘and we really thought we were going to be able to contribute to the content, and when we realized that the content was not only already in motion, if not already completed, it was also inflexible.’” [WJCT, [8/17/15](#)]

**Florida Department Of Environmental Protection Employee Lauren Watkins: Georgia-Pacific “Refused” To Include Threats From Climate Change And Sea Level Rise In The Curriculum.** According to WJCT, “Lauren Watkins, who worked for the Florida Department of Environmental Protection at the time, says she resigned as a St. Johns River center advisor after Georgia-Pacific presented an outline of the curriculum at its first meeting. [...] Watkins says Georgia-Pacific refused to include key pieces like threats from climate change and sea-level rise.” [WJCT, [8/17/15](#)]

**Florida Atlantic University Researcher Robert Virnstein: The Curriculum Called “For Teachers To Discuss The Benefits Of Manufacturing Alongside Units On Wetlands And Rivers.”** According to WJCT, “Another former advisor, Florida Atlantic University researcher Robert Virnstein, says the written curriculum calls for teachers to discuss the benefits of manufacturing alongside units on wetlands and rivers. Virnstein said, ‘I guess in terms of the impact of manufacturing, I mean — it’s as if they can coexist or do coexist — but not all is well.’” [WJCT, [8/17/15](#)]

## **SAFETY VIOLATIONS**

### **OSHA Cited And Fined Georgia-Pacific \$9,750 For Workplace Safety Violations O**

**In 2012, Georgia-Pacific Wood Products’ Hosford, FL Facility Was Fined \$4,250 By The Occupational Safety & Health Administration (OSHA) For A Serious Violation Involving “Respiratory Protection” And “Air Contaminants.”** According to the Occupational Safety & Health Administration, Georgia Pacific Wood Products’ facility at 12995 Ne State Road 65, Hosford, FL 32334 was fined \$4,250 by the Occupational Safety & Health Administration on June 6<sup>th</sup>, 2012. The serious violation cited the following: 19100134 D01 III, “Do not wear your respirator into atmospheres containing contaminants for which your respirator is not designed to protect against;” 19100134 E01, “The employer shall provide a medical evaluation to determine the employee’s ability to use a respirator, before the employee is fit tested or required to use the respirator in the workplace;” 19100134 F02, “The employer shall ensure that an employee using a tight-fitting facepiece respirator is fit tested prior to initial use of the respirator, whenever a different respirator facepiece (size, style, model or make) is used, and at least annually thereafter;” 19101000 C, “An employee’s exposure to any substance listed in Table Z-3 [Mineral Dusts], in any 8-hour work shift of a 40-hour work week, shall not exceed the 8-hour time weighted

average limit given for that substance in the table;” and 19101000 E “administrative or engineering controls must first be determined and implemented whenever feasible. When such controls are not feasible to achieve full compliance, protective equipment or any other protective measures shall be used to keep the exposure of employees to air contaminants within the limits prescribed in this section. Any equipment and/or technical measures used for this purpose must be approved for each particular use by a competent industrial hygienist or other technically qualified person. Whenever respirators are used, their use shall comply with 1910.134.” [Occupational Safety & Health Administration, 6/6/12, Accessed [8/22/16](#)]

- **The Violation Was Ultimately Settled For \$2,550.** According to the Occupational Safety & Health Administration, an informal settlement of \$2,550 was reached on June 25<sup>th</sup>, 2012. [Occupational Safety & Health Administration, 6/25/12, Accessed [8/22/16](#)]

**In 2011, Georgia-Pacific In Palatka, FL Was Fined \$5,500 By The Occupational Safety & Health Administration (OSHA) For Violating Reporting Requirements For Fatalities, Injuries And Illness.** According to the Occupational Safety & Health Administration, Georgia Pacific Corporation at 215 County Road 216, Palatka, FL 32178 was fined \$5,500 by the Occupational Safety & Health Administration on January 10<sup>th</sup>, 2011. The violation cited standard 19040039 A, which pertained to reporting requirements for fatalities, injuries and illness information to the Government. [Occupational Safety & Health Administration, 1/13/11, Accessed [8/23/16](#)]

## GEORGIA-PACIFIC’S FLORIDA ECONOMIC IMPACTS AND WORKER LAYOFFS

### Georgia-Pacific Shuttered A Plywood Plant In Hawthorne, Laid Off 400 Workers; Plant Remained Closed

**Georgia-Pacific Closed A Sawmill In Hawthorne, Florida.** According to The Gainesville Sun, “An Austrian lumber company plans to build a \$130 million sawmill near Live Oak employing 350 people, a project touted as a shot in the arm to the local economy while also raising concerns about its impact on the timber supply and competing sawmills as well as its cost to taxpayers. [...] Bryan Olmert, president of Loncala in High Springs, said the mill will be good for forest landowners and encourage them to start planting trees again after other sawmills closed in the region in recent years, including the Georgia-Pacific plywood mill in Hawthorne.” [Gainesville Sun, 5/24/13]

**2011: Georgia-Pacific Closed Its Plywood Plant In Hawthorne, Florida, And Laid Off 400 Workers In A Town Of 1,400 Residents.** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “For nearly three decades, this rural community in north central Florida was home to a bustling mill that was the principal employer for its 1,400 residents. Then, in November 2011, the recession-induced collapse of the housing market forced Georgia-Pacific to close its plywood plant. All 400 employees were sent scrambling to find work weeks before the holidays. And the mill that once produced the sawdust-covered staples of the state’s housing market stood idle, cutting off the lifeblood of the local economy. ‘The mill was a boost to the entire town the schools, churches, local businesses,’ said Pastor Joe Williams. ‘All of a sudden, all that disappeared.’ Now, after two years the mill stands shuttered. Many of its employees have found other jobs but at lower wages, and local community leaders, who had hoped to get help from the state, say they are on their own. ‘We’ve tried to sell ourselves to [the state Department of Economic Opportunity],’ said Hawthorne Mayor Matthew Surrency, but the effort has yielded little return. The story of Hawthorne is not one Gov. Rick Scott talks about on his public relations roadshow as the state’s ‘jobs’ governor. It is a tale of the tens of thousands of private sector jobs lost in Florida since Scott took office in January 2011.” [Tampa Bay Times, 12/8/13]

- **The Plant Had Been Open Since 1982.** According to the Florida Times-Union, “Georgia-Pacific will stop production at its plywood plant in Hawthorne later this fall, putting 400 people out of work. Spokeswoman Trish Bowles attributed the action to the slowdown in home building. It will continue to operate through Nov. 7. Bowles described it as an ‘indefinite curtailment’ rather than a closure, leaving room for the plant to reopen. Severance packages are still unclear, she said. The plant, about midway between Gainesville and Palatka, has been open since 1982, converting pine logs to plywood that it sold under the names Plytanium and Sturd-I-Floor. Georgia-Pacific has four other plants in Florida: a chip mill and a paper mill in Palatka, a lumber mill in Cross City and an oriented strand board mill in Palatka.” [Florida Times-Union, 9/10/11]

*400 Floridians Lost Their Jobs*



**Georgia-Pacific's Hawthorne Plywood Plant Closure Put 400 Floridians Out Of Work.** According to the Florida Times-Union, "Georgia-Pacific will stop production at its plywood plant in Hawthorne later this fall, putting 400 people out of work. Spokeswoman Trish Bowles attributed the action to the slowdown in home building. It will continue to operate through Nov. 7. Bowles described it as an 'indefinite curtailment' rather than a closure, leaving room for the plant to reopen. Severance packages are still unclear, she said. The plant, about midway between Gainesville and Palatka, has been open since 1982, converting pine logs to plywood that it sold under the names Plytanium and Sturd-I-Floor. Georgia-Pacific has four other plants in Florida: a chip mill and a paper mill in Palatka, a lumber mill in Cross City and an oriented strand board mill in Palatka." [Florida Times-Union, 9/10/11]

**Georgia-Pacific Paid Severance To Nearly 400 Hawthorne Mill Employees.** According to the Gainesville Sun, "The former employees had been in limbo after GP and the United Steelworkers union agreed to consider the shutdown an indefinite curtailment and not a permanent closure, meaning they would be eligible to return if the housing market improved and the plant reopened. The decision to pay severance was 'to keep the employees from having to wait around,' GP spokeswoman Trish Bowles said. Salaried employees were considered separated from the company Wednesday, Bowles said. She did not know the terms of their severance. The United Steelworkers negotiated a severance for the 358 collective-bargaining employees on Friday, staff representative Frank Bragg said. Former employees will be paid 20 hours' worth of wages for each year they worked up to 15 years, and 40 hours' wages for each year of service over 15. The payments likely will come around Christmas, he said. Wages paid during the 60-day required notification period before the official closure on Nov. 7 will be deducted from the severance pay, Bragg said. That means some employees who worked right up until Nov. 7 probably will receive no severance pay. 'It's not extremely lucrative, but it's in line with what GP typically does in these situations,' he said." [Gainesville Sun, 12/12/11]

### *Damaging Impact On The Local Community*

**Businesses And About 1,600 Residents In Surrounding Counties Expected To Be Hit By The Hawthorne Mill Plant Closure.** According to the Bradenton Herald, "Tammy Scott said the holidays will be hard if her husband, Mike, can't find work. He lost his job as a forklift operator three weeks ago when Georgia-Pacific stopped operations at its Hawthorne plywood mill, citing slow home construction. The Hawthorne woman said they have three older children -- two still at home -- and can't pay all the bills from her job in an insurance office. 'If something doesn't come along quick, there's not going to be much of a Thanksgiving and certainly not a Christmas,' she said. About 400 employees and their families were left to look for work when the mill went dark. Some have already found new jobs. While the mill is in a rural area in Putnam County over the Alachua County line, nearby Hawthorne in Alachua County, with 1,600 residents, may feel it the most, with businesses already reporting slower sales. Businesses that supported the mill such as loggers also expect to take a hit." [Bradenton Herald, 11/13/11]

**Georgia-Pacific Said The Mill Could Possibly Reopen After Home Construction Rebounded.** According to the Bradenton Herald, "GP announced in September that it would close the mill Nov. 7, but almost all the 400 employees were sent home in mid-October when production stopped, said GP spokeswoman Trish Bowles. The company initially said the mill would close indefinitely, but left the door open to possibly reopening when home construction rebounds. After meetings with the employee union, the company agreed last month that the shutdown was a curtailment and not a closure and to see if it is feasible to reopen early next year, said Frank Bragg, staff representative for United Steelworkers International. That means the job losses are technically layoffs, 'thus no severance at this point,' he said." [Bradenton Herald, 11/13/11]

- **2014: Hawthorne Plant Listed as "Idled" On Georgia-Pacific Website.** [GP, Accessed [8/14/14](#)]

**The Mill's Closure Was "Devastating" To The Area's Timber Market.** According to the Bradenton Herald, "Bryan Olmert said the mill's continued closure would be devastating to the area timber market. Olmert is president of Loncala in High Springs, which buys timber and has 45,000 acres of its own timberland. He said his company took 10 to 20 tons of pine a year to the GP mill, one of the only Florida buyers of trees bigger than 20 inches in diameter and therefore more valuable. 'That mill bought most of the big wood in North Florida,' Olmert said. He said his operation is diverse enough that he doesn't expect Loncala to lose any of its 25 employees or 10 to 12 contract employees, but that there probably will be fewer logging crews around." [Bradenton Herald, 11/13/11]

**The Hawthorne Mill Bought Large Timber From North Florida Businesses.** According to the Bradenton Herald, "Bryan Olmert said the mill's continued closure would be devastating to the area timber market. Olmert is president of

Loncala in High Springs, which buys timber and has 45,000 acres of its own timberland. He said his company took 10 to 20 tons of pine a year to the GP mill, one of the only Florida buyers of trees bigger than 20 inches in diameter and therefore more valuable. ‘That mill bought most of the big wood in North Florida,’ Olmert said. He said his operation is diverse enough that he doesn’t expect Loncala to lose any of its 25 employees or 10 to 12 contract employees, but that there probably will be fewer logging crews around.” [Bradenton Herald, 11/13/11]

**Hawthorne Businesses Saw An Immediate Decrease In The Local Economy.** According to the Bradenton Herald, “Within Hawthorne, business already slowed by the economy has gotten slower at Dianne’s Old Time Barbeque on U.S. 301, said assistant manager Heather Horner. ‘As far as the locals, there’s definitely a change in who’s coming in every day,’ she said. ‘They used to call in breakfast in the early morning. You just don’t get that.’” [Bradenton Herald, 11/13/11]

**Hawthorne’s Ace Hardware Store Lost Half Its Business After The Georgia-Pacific Plant Closed And Most Of Its Laid Off Employees Could Not Find Similar Wages And Benefits.** According to The Miami Herald, “In Hawthorne, it’s been two years since the paper mill closed. Rumors abound that the plant will reopen, but Georgia-Pacific says it has no immediate plans to start up operations. The Ace Hardware in downtown Hawthorne saw its business drop by half, said owner Robert Bristow. Dianne’s Old Time Barbeque laid off half its waitresses and the cashier as the lunchtime crowd virtually disappeared. Local timber companies lost their only customer. And for the laid off employees who found new jobs, most could not replace the wages and benefits offered by Georgia Pacific ‘Me and my family, we didn’t cry -- we did what we had to do,’ said Troy Browning, 32, who sorted plywood at the mill since age 19. He found a job washing buses in Gainesville -- and his hourly wage dipped from \$14.63 to \$8.” [Miami Herald, 12/8/13]

**Hawthorne Real Estate Was Also Expected To Be Hit Due To Former Employees Relocating In Order To Find New Jobs.** According to the Bradenton Herald, “Hawthorne Realtor Heather Surrency of Watson Realty Corp. said she expects that some former employees will relocate for new jobs, leaving behind some rentals and possibly foreclosed homes if they’re not able to sell. Surrency started a Facebook group ‘Keep G.P. in Hawthorne’ that was up to 1,272 members by Thursday.” [Bradenton Herald, 11/13/11]

#### *Long-Term Workers Applied To Other Georgia-Pacific Plants, Treated Like Outsiders*

**Robert Jenkins Worked At The Hawthorne Plant For 16 Years Before Being Laid Off: “They Pulled The Rug Out From Under Us.”** According to the Florida Times-Union, “Robert Jenkins worked at the Hawthorne site for 16 years. He separated good pieces of wood from bad. He’s since applied for an opening at Georgia-Pacific’s paper mill in Palatka, but he feels betrayed. The father of a teenage son said he had to apply for the positions like someone who hasn’t worked for the company. ‘They pulled the rug out from under us,’ said Jenkins, 37. ‘They really treated us as outsiders.’ Most workers were laid off from the Hawthorne plant by late October, Bowles said. A handful will stay to maintain equipment. Paychecks continued through early to mid-November. The company offered career fairs. ‘It was sad,’ said Bowles, based in Palatka” [Florida Times-Union, 11/24/11]

**Jenkins Applied To Work At GP’s Paper Mill In Palatka, But Felt “Betrayed” When He Was Treated Like He Was New To The Company: “They Really Treated Us As Outsiders.”** According to the Florida Times-Union, “Robert Jenkins worked at the Hawthorne site for 16 years. He separated good pieces of wood from bad. He’s since applied for an opening at Georgia-Pacific’s paper mill in Palatka, but he feels betrayed. The father of a teenage son said he had to apply for the positions like someone who hasn’t worked for the company. ‘They pulled the rug out from under us,’ said Jenkins, 37. ‘They really treated us as outsiders.’ Most workers were laid off from the Hawthorne plant by late October, Bowles said. A handful will stay to maintain equipment. Paychecks continued through early to mid-November. The company offered career fairs. ‘It was sad,’ said Bowles, based in Palatka” [Florida Times-Union, 11/24/11]

**Former Hawthorne Employees Found It Difficult To Find Jobs Nearly One Year Later.** According to Gainesville Sun, “Other nowhere-everywhere communities have not been as fortunate. Nearly a year ago, the 1,600 residents of Hawthorne were dealt a difficult economic blow when the largest private employer, Georgia-Pacific, shut down its plywood plant. About 400 jobs in and around Hawthorne were lost. Many still are struggling to find equivalent employment, state officials say.” [Gainesville Sun, 9/16/12]

#### **Georgia-Pacific Plant In Palatka Saw Layoffs, Suspensions, And Severances After Koch Acquired Company**

*Koch Considered Offering Severance Packages to 1,000 of 1,200 Employees at Palatka Plant Within 6 Months of Acquiring Georgia-Pacific*

**2005: Georgia-Pacific's Palatka Plant Had 1,250 Employees; Workers Were "Hopeful That Koch Won't Make Major Changes In The Operations."** According to the Florida Times-Union, "Durango-Georgia was Camden County's largest private employer, and it put more than 900 people out of work when it closed in 2002. Paper mills have long had a major impact on many Northeast Florida and Southeast Georgia communities. So there was some concern last month when Palatka's largest private employer, Georgia-Pacific Corp., announced that it agreed to a buyout by privately-owned Koch Industries. Kansas-based Koch announced last week that it has received tenders last week for 88 percent of Georgia-Pacific's stock, paving the way for completion of the \$21 billion deal. Workers at the 1,250-employee Georgia-Pacific plant in Palatka are hopeful that Koch won't make major changes in the operations, but they have not heard from Koch officials since the deal was announced in November. 'We don't know anything more at this point,' a spokesman for the Palatka mill said last week. Georgia-Pacific employs nearly 500 more people at other facilities in the region." [Florida Times-Union, 12/26/05]

**Georgia-Pacific Considered Offering Severance Packages To About 1,000 Hourly Workers At Its Palatka Paper Mill, Which Employed About 1,200 People.** According to the Florida Times-Union, "Georgia-Pacific is considering offering severance packages to about 1,000 hourly workers at its Palatka paper mill as it tries to trim its head count without resorting to layoffs. The mill has offered its 200 salaried employees buyout packages. [...] The mill, located on 500 acres in Palatka, employs about 1,200. Koch Industries acquired the plant in December when it bought Georgia-Pacific." [Florida Times-Union via LexisNexis, 6/7/06]

- **GP Company Spokesman: "The Employee Cutbacks Are Part Of A 'Rapid Transformation Process' The Mill Is Undergoing To Boost Its Competitiveness."** According to Florida Times-Union via LexisNexis, "The employee cutbacks are part of a 'rapid transformation process' the mill is undergoing to boost its competitiveness, company spokesman Jeremy Alexander said." [Florida Times-Union via LexisNexis, 6/7/06]

*2006: GP Suspended 1008 Workers "With No Advance Notice."*

**Georgia-Pacific's Palatka Sawmill Suspended 108 Workers For "At Least Six Months" With "No Advance Notice About The Closure."** According to the Florida Times-Union, "Frank Hall pulled into the lot of the Palatka-area sawmill where he's worked for the better part of 19 years Thursday, not out of habit but need. He found out Wednesday that his job, and those of 107 other workers, will be suspended for at least six months as the sawmill owned by Georgia-Pacific suspended operation, effective immediately. [...] The workers were given no advance notice about the closure, but will get 60 days pay and benefits, said Georgia-Pacific public affairs manager Jeremy Alexander. No other cutbacks are expected, he said." [Florida Times-Union via LexisNexis, 11/17/06]

- **Georgia-Pacific Public Affairs Manager: The Pause In Production Had To Do With "Overall Market Conditions."** According to the Florida Times-Union, "The pause in production has to do with overall market conditions, [Georgia-Pacific public affairs manager Jeremy] Alexander said. The mill produces one-by-fours and two-by-fours out of southern pine." [Florida Times-Union via LexisNexis, 11/17/06]

*2008: GP Laid Off 50 More Employees, Palatka Was Ranked Number 2 On Forbes Magazine's List Of The Nation's Most Vulnerable Towns And Cities*

**Georgia-Pacific Laid Off 50 Employees At Its Palatka, Florida Pulp And Paper Mill.** According to the Jacksonville Business Journal, "Georgia-Pacific Corp. is laying off 50 employees at its Palatka pulp and paper mill. The layoffs come after the Atlanta-based company halted production indefinitely on one of two machines devoted to producing Kraft paper products like paper bags and cardboard boxes. The mill, which employs about 1,040 people, manufactures Kraft products and consumer paper products. The other machine that produces Kraft products will continue to operate. A separate chip mill plant in Palatka produces pine and hardwood chips for tissue and paper making." [Jacksonville Business Journal via LexisNexis, 12/16/08]

**Palatka, Florida Was Ranked Number 2 On Forbes Magazine's List Of The Nation's Most Vulnerable Towns And Cities.** According to the Florida Times-Union, "What remains of Palatka's economy - a Georgia-Pacific paper mill, a barge port, a Seminole Electric power plant and low-paying retail and service industry jobs - is on shaky footing, according to a national business magazine. Palatka ranked No. 2 earlier this month on Forbes magazine's list of the nation's 'most vulnerable' towns and cities. In the magazine's analysis of 141 towns' economic and education data, the only worse performer was Lancaster, S.C., a struggling manufacturing town about 60 miles north of Columbia, the state's capital." [Florida Times-Union via LexisNexis, 11/2/08]



**The EPA Selected Palatka, FL, Which Was Hit By Two Tropical Storms And “Suffered Economically From The Closing Of Georgia-Pacific Paper Towel Manufacturing Line,” For A \$400,000 Assessment Grant.** According to a press release from the Environmental Protection Agency, “The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) announced today the selection of 243 new grant investments totaling \$54.3 million to 147 communities across the U.S. [...] Among the communities selected for funding, more than thirty percent have been affected by plant closures, forty percent by significant economic disruptions, and forty-two percent by adverse natural disasters. The small City of Palatka, Florida for example, was declared an emergency area following the devastation of two tropical storms, and has also suffered economically from the closing of Georgia-Pacific paper towel manufacturing line and the lay-off of 130 employees from the regional water management company. Being selected for a \$400,000 assessment grant will allow this town of just over 10,000 residents to support their downtown and riverfront redevelopment plans and help restore the local economy.” [EPA Press Release, [5/28/15](#)]

**The City Of Palatka, Florida Was Picked For One Of The EPA’s 243 Brownfield Grant Investments “To Clean Up And Redevelop Contaminated Properties.”** According to the International Business Times, “In a press release dated June 2015, the United States Environmental Protection Agency, or EPA, has announced that it has picked 243 new brownfield grant investments amounting to \$54.3 million to 147 communities to clean up and redevelop contaminated properties.[...] Thirty percent of the communities have been affected by plant closures while 42 percent were struck by natural disasters. An example is the city of Palatka in Florida, which was struck by two tropical storms and was affected by the closing of a Georgia-Pacific paper towel manufacturing line. The closure resulted to 130 employees losing their jobs. To aid the community, EPA has granted the city \$400,000 in remediation grant.” [International Business Times, [7/13/15](#)]

- **Bioremediation Was To Be Used To Clean The Chosen Communities, A Method Which “Uses Live Organisms, Such As Bacteria, To Remove Or Neutralise Contaminants At A Site.”** According to the International Business Times, “Bioremediation will allow these communities to thrive once more, simply because cleaning up has never been environmentally friendly and easy. It is a waste management technique that uses live organisms, such as bacteria, to remove or neutralise contaminants at a site. The microorganisms thrive and eat the hazardous substances as food and transform them into water or a harmless gas, carbon dioxide. This is a better alternative compared to the highly toxic chemical surfactants, and bioremediation does not add to the degradation of the environment at all.” [International Business Times, [7/13/15](#)]

### **Georgia-Pacific Closed Cross City Southern Pine Sawmill In Late 2007, Eliminating About 100 Jobs; Plant Remained Closed**

**GP Facilities In Florida Included An Idled Southern Pine Sawmill Plant In Cross City, Florida.** According to a state fact sheet from Georgia-Pacific, GP Facilities in Florida include Cross City Southern Pine Sawmill (Idled) producing Dimensional Lumber. [Georgia-Pacific State Fact Sheet, [4/16](#)]

- **Gainesville Sun: “GP Closed A Sawmill In Cross City In Late 2007, Eliminating About 100 Jobs, Also Citing Weak Housing Demand. It Remains Closed.”** According to the Gainesville Sun, “GP closed a sawmill in Cross City in late 2007, eliminating about 100 jobs, also citing weak housing demand. It remains closed.” [Gainesville Sun, [9/9/11](#)]

## **Molex**

**Molex Had Two Locations In Florida: One In St Petersburg And The Other In Pinellas Park.** According to Koch Industries’ Florida Factsheet, Molex had two locations in Florida. The first was in St. Petersburg and the other was in Pinellas Park. [Koch Industries Factsheet, Accessed [8/17/16](#)]

## OSHA VIOLATIONS

### Molex's St. Petersburg Facility Was Fined At Least \$6,000 For Workplace Safety Violations

#### **In 2015, Molex's St Petersburg, Florida Facility Was Fined \$5,000 By The Occupational Safety & Health Administration (OSHA) For A Serious Violation Involving The "Guarding Floor And Wall Openings And Holes."**

According to the Occupational Safety & Health Administration, Molex's facility at 2375 72<sup>nd</sup> Street North, Saint Petersburg, FL 33710 was fined \$5,000 by the Occupational Safety & Health Administration on September 9<sup>th</sup>, 2015. The serious violation cited the following: 19100023 C01, "Every open-sided floor or platform 4 feet or more above adjacent floor or ground level shall be guarded by a standard railing (or the equivalent as specified in paragraph (e)(3) of this section) on all open sides except where there is entrance to a ramp, stairway, or fixed ladder." [Occupational Safety & Health Administration, 9/9/15, Accessed 8/23/16]

- **The Violation Was Ultimately Settled For \$3,000.** According to the Occupational Safety & Health Administration, an informal settlement of \$2,550 on September 25<sup>th</sup>, 2015. [Occupational Safety & Health Administration, 9/9/15, Accessed [8/23/16](#)]

**In 2016, Molex's St Petersburg, Florida Facility Was Fined \$1,000 By The Occupational Safety & Health Administration For Violating The Standard Which Involved Reporting Requirements For Hospitalizations, Or Amputations.** According to the Occupational Safety & Health Administration, Molex's facility at 2375 72<sup>nd</sup> Street North, Saint Petersburg, FL 33710 was fined \$1,000 by the Occupational Safety & Health Administration on September 9<sup>th</sup>, 2015. The violation cited pertained to standard 19040039 A02, "Within twenty-four (24) hours after the in-patient hospitalization of one or more employees or an employee's amputation or an employee's loss of an eye, as a result of a work-related incident, you must report the in-patient hospitalization, amputation, or loss of an eye to OSHA." [Occupational Safety & Health Administration, 9/9/15, Accessed 8/23/16]

- **The Violation Was Ultimately Settled For \$600.** According to the Occupational Safety & Health Administration, an informal settlement of \$600 on September 25<sup>th</sup>, 2015. [Occupational Safety & Health Administration, 9/9/15, Accessed [8/23/16](#)]

## Flint Hills Resources

### PRICE GOUGING COMPLAINTS AFTER HURRICANE KATRINA

**Florida Regulators Subpoenaed 19 Oil Companies With State Terminals To Determine If They Were Price Gouging After Hurricane Katrina.** According to the St. Petersburg Times, "As statewide complaints about surging gas prices continued to pour in by the hundreds Tuesday, Florida officials expanded a probe into price gouging and state lawmakers called for a cut in gas taxes. [...] In the price gouging probe, Florida regulators turned their attention further up the supply chain, issuing subpoenas to 19 oil companies with terminals in the state. 'While we've been looking at service stations, we need to look at the companies that supply the fuel to stations to determine whether price gouging is occurring at that level,' said Florida Agriculture and Consumer Services Commissioner Charles Bronson, whose office oversees gas station pricing. The subpoenas seek records on what the companies paid for fuel and what they sold it for. Bronson's office said the information will shed light on whether the businesses were price gouging or merely passing on the increased costs from refineries." [St. Petersburg Times, 9/7/05]

- **In Florida, It Was Illegal To Price Gouge On Gasoline During An Emergency.** According to the St. Petersburg Times, "Under Florida law, it is illegal to charge an exorbitant mark-up for essential items, such as gasoline, during an emergency. Violators face fines up to \$1,000 per violation or up to \$25,000 a day." [St. Petersburg Times, 9/7/05]
- **As Attorney General, Crist Issued Two Subpoenas For Two Oil Distributors In His Price Gouging Investigation.** According to the St. Petersburg Times, "Attorney General Charlie Crist, who has the authority to investigate price gouging, issued subpoenas last week for two petroleum distributors." [St. Petersburg Times, 9/7/05]

- **Flint Hills Resources Was Subpoenaed In A Price Gouging Investigation After Katrina.** According to the St. Petersburg Times, “The oil companies Florida Agriculture and Consumer Services Commissioner Charles Bronson has subpoenaed in his price-gouging investigation: + Transmontaigne Product Services Inc. + Marathon Ashland Petroleum LLC + Murphy Oil USA Inc. + Citgo East Coast Oil Corp. + Apex Oil Co. of Missouri Inc. + Exxon Mobil Corp. + Amerada Hess Corp. + Motiva Enterprises LLC + Flint Hills Resources LP + Valero Marketing and Supply Co. + Placid Refining Co. + Colonial Oil Industries Inc. + Hunt Refining Co. + Premcor Refining Group Inc. + Sunoco Inc. + Chevron USA Inc. + BP Corp. North America Inc. + ConocoPhillips Co. + Citgo Petroleum Corp.” [St. Petersburg Times, 9/7/05]

## **Congress Was Critical Of The FTC Investigation’s Finding Of No Wrongdoing**

**An FTC Investigation Found No Evidence Of Price Gouging.** According to a web post from the San Francisco Gate, “Gas prices soared across the country after Hurricane Katrina in late summer, but federal investigators reported Monday they could find no evidence that oil companies manipulated prices or colluded to take advantage of the situation to increase profits. The Federal Trade Commission also determined in a longer-range finding that during the past 20 years refiners didn't seek to manipulate prices by cutting the number of operating refineries or limiting increases in capacity.” [San Francisco Gate, [5/23/06](#)]

**Senators Were Frustrated By The FTC’s Findings That There Was No Collusion.** According to a web post from the San Francisco Gate, “When the report said its investigation found no evidence that major refiners had colluded to boost prices, it ran counter to the sentiments of many senators who with lead sponsor Sen. Arlen Specter, R-Pa., are pushing legislation to prevent more oil industry mergers.” [San Francisco Gate, [5/23/06](#)]

- **Senator Chuck Schumer: FTC Ignored, “The 800 Pound Gorilla In The Room, Namely That Oil Companies Engage In Price Leadership.”** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “But Sen. Chuck Schumer, D-N.Y., criticized the FTC for ignoring what he said was ‘the 800-pound gorilla in the room, namely that the oil companies engage in price leadership - setting prices higher than what real competition would merit.’ For example, Schumer said retail prices are jacked up quickly, then fall unnaturally slowly.” [Tampa Bay Times, [5/23/06](#)]
- **Senator Diane Feinstein: “It Is Time That Congress Takes A Closer Look At the Mergers And Market Consolidation The Federal Government Has Allowed Over The Last Decade.”** According to a web post from the San Francisco Gate, “Something is wrong. It is time that Congress takes a closer look at the mergers and market consolidation that the federal government has allowed over the last decade. Competition needs to be encouraged,” [Senator Dianne] Feinstein said.” [San Francisco Gate, [5/23/06](#)]

## **Koch Industries Nitrogen Interests**

### **KOCH INDUSTRIES HAD A STAKE IN FERTILIZERS & NITROGEN**

#### **Koch Fertilizer, LLC**

**Koch Fertilizer, LLC Was An Indirect, Wholly Owned Subsidiary Of Koch Industries, Inc.** According to Koch Ag & Energy Solution, “Koch Fertilizer, LLC is an indirect, wholly owned subsidiary of Koch Industries, Inc., one of the largest private companies in America.” [Koch Ag & Energy website [kochagenergy.com/newsroom](http://kochagenergy.com/newsroom), Accessed [8/3/15](#)]

*Koch Fertilizer LLC Described Itself As “One Of The World’s Largest Producers And Marketers Of Fertilizers.”*

#### **Koch Fertilizer LLC Described Itself As “One Of The World’s Largest Producers And Marketers Of Fertilizers.”**

According to Koch Fertilizer, “Koch Fertilizer, LLC, and its affiliates are collectively one of the world’s largest producers and marketers of fertilizers. The company owns or has interests in fertilizer plants in the United States, Canada, and Trinidad and Tobago. Its distribution network covers global demand through state-of-the-art terminals in the U.S., Canada, Mexico, Brazil, Australia, France and the United Kingdom.” [Koch Fertilizer, Accessed [8/5/16](#)]

**Koch Fertilizer's Product Portfolio Included "Ammonia, Urea, UAN, Phosphate, Potash, And Sulfur-Based Products" As Well As A Number Of Nitrogen Based Fertilizer Products.** According to Koch Fertilizer, "Koch Fertilizer's expanded product portfolio includes ammonia, urea, UAN, phosphate, potash, and sulfur-based products, in addition to a variety of high-performance fertilizers including AGROTAIN® nitrogen stabilizer, AGROTAIN® PLUS nitrogen stabilizer, SUPERU™ fertilizer, NITAMIN® Targeted Foliar Nitrogen, blended fertilizers from Bunn Fertiliser Limited, and Koch Advanced Nitrogen® fertilizer." [Koch Fertilizer, Accessed [8/5/16](#)]

*Charles Koch's Son Chase Was The President Of Koch Fertilizer*

**Charles Koch's Son, Chase Koch, Became The President Of Koch Fertilizer In 2013.** According to the Wichita Business Journal, "Koch Industries Inc. on Thursday announced that Koch Fertilizer will change its name to Koch Ag and Energy Solutions and that the new entity will act as the holding company for Koch Fertilizer, Koch Energy Services and Koch Methanol. Chase Koch, son of Koch chairman and CEO Charles Koch, will become the president of Koch Fertilizer." [Wichita Business Journal, [12/5/13](#)]

### **Koch Nitrogen Company, LLC**

**Koch Nitrogen Company, LLC Operated As A Subsidiary Of Koch Fertilizer, LLC.** [Bloomberg Business, Accessed [8/3/15](#)]

**Koch Nitrogen Manufactured And Marketed Fertilizers.** According to Bloomberg Business, "Koch Nitrogen Company, LLC, along with its subsidiaries, manufactures and markets fertilizers. The company offers anhydrous ammonia, urea, urea blends, UAN solutions, ammonium nitrate solutions, ammonium polyphosphate, ammonium thiosulfate, phosphate, potash, sulfur-based products, blended fertilizers, nitrogen stabilizers, and slow-release fertilizers. It offers its products through a distribution network worldwide." [Bloomberg Business, Accessed [8/3/15](#)]

### **The Mosaic Company**

*Koch Was Invested In The Mosaic Company*

**According To A February 2015 FEC Filing, Koch Industries Held 3.17 Million Shares Of The Mosaic Company Valued At \$144.62 Million.** According to Insider Monkey, "In its latest 13F filing, Koch Industries disclosed ownership of 3.17 million shares of Mosaic Co (NYSE:MOS). The stake valued at \$144.62 million at the end of December has been raised by 111% during the last three months of 2014. The holding, which represented 72% of Koch Industries' \$201 million 13F equity portfolio at the end of last year, was initiated over a year ago and has been raised from 1.05 million shares of Mosaic that Koch held initially. In Intrepid Potash, Inc. (NYSE:IPI), Koch's stake contains 2.0 million shares, valued at \$27.76 million, unchanged over the quarter. On the other hand, in Potash Corp./Saskatchewan (USA) (NYSE:POT), the multinational company cut its position by 65% over the quarter to around 735,000 shares, with an aggregate value of \$25.96 million. Overall, the company holds around 98.7% of its 13F portfolio invested in these three fertilizer stocks. It also disclosed less significant positions in Cascade Microtech, Inc. (NASDAQ:CSCD) and Metlife Inc (NYSE:MET)." [Insider Monkey, [2/12/15](#); SEC 13F-HR Filing, [2/11/15](#)]

**Mosaic Produced Fertilizer Made From Phosphorous.** According to the Mosaic Company website, "Phosphorus, one of three primary crop nutrients required for plant growth, is often referred to as 'The Energizer' for its role in converting the sun's energy into food, fuel and fiber. Mosaic's phosphate products, most commonly referred to as diammonium phosphate (DAP) and monommonium phosphate (MAP), are a source of phosphorus and nitrogen and provide vital crop nutrition to the global agricultural community. Mosaic's phosphate products are created by reacting ammonia and phosphoric acid to produce a solid, granulated fertilizer. MAP and DAP can be applied directly to the soil using conventional spreading equipment. To learn more, choose a phosphate product from below." [Mosaic Co, viewed [8/7/15](#)]

*The Headquarters Of Mosaic's Phosphate Operations Was In Florida*

**The Headquarters Of Mosaic's Phosphate Operations Was In Florida.** According to the Mosaic Co., "At Mosaic, we're driven to be the world's leading crop nutrition company. In the U.S., Florida is home to our phosphate operations headquarters and many of our phosphate production facilities. From our mines to our offices, we are committed to being a

great place to work, a responsible corporate citizen, a committed environmental steward, and a respected community partner.”  
[Mosaic Co., Accessed [8/5/16](#)]



# **THE KOCHS ADVANCED THEIR FERTILIZER INTERESTS THROUGH THE FERTILIZER INSTITUTE**

## **Koch Fertilizer LLC Was A Member Of The Fertilizer Institute**

**Koch Fertilizer LLC Was A Member Of The Fertilizer Institute.** [The Fertilizer Institute, Accessed [8/5/16](#)]

## **2009-2014: KochPAC Gave At Least \$20,000 To The Political Action Committee Of The Fertilizer Institute**

**In October Of 2009, KochPAC Gave \$5,000 To The Political Action Committee Of The Fertilizer Institute.** According to a FEC filing, on October 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2009 KochPAC gave \$5,000 to the Political Action Committee of the Fertilizer Institute. [FEC Filing, [10/2/09](#)]

**In October Of 2011, KochPAC Gave \$2,500 To The Political Action Committee Of The Fertilizer Institute.** According to a FEC filing, on October 21<sup>st</sup>, 2011 KochPAC gave \$2,500 to the Political Action Committee of the Fertilizer Institute. [FEC Filing, [10/21/09](#)]

**In February Of 2012, KochPAC Gave \$2,500 To The Political Action Committee Of The Fertilizer Institute.** According to a FEC filing, on February 6<sup>th</sup>, 2012 KochPAC gave \$2,500 to the Political Action Committee of the Fertilizer Institute. [FEC Filing, [2/6/12](#)]

**In February Of 2014, KochPAC Gave \$5,000 To The Political Action Committee Of The Fertilizer Institute.** According to a FEC filing, on February 10<sup>th</sup>, 2014 KochPAC gave \$5,000 to the Political Action Committee of the Fertilizer Institute. [FEC Filing, [2/10/14](#)]

**In January Of 2014, KochPAC Gave \$5,000 To The Political Action Committee Of The Fertilizer Institute.** According to a FEC filing on January 10<sup>th</sup>, 2014 KochPAC gave \$5,000 to the Political Action Committee of the Fertilizer Institute. [FEC Filing, [1/10/14](#)]

## **Chase Koch Gave At Least \$15,000 To The Political Action Committee Of The Fertilizer Institute**

**In February Of 2014, Chase Koch Gave \$5,000 To The Political Action Committee Of The Fertilizer Institute.** According to a FEC filing, on February 12<sup>th</sup>, 2014 C. Chase Koch, President of Koch Fertilizer, gave \$5,000 to the Political Action Committee of the Fertilizer Institute. [FEC Filing, [2/12/14](#)]

**In March Of 2015, Chase Koch Gave \$5,000 To The Political Action Committee Of The Fertilizer Institute.** According to a FEC filing, on March 3<sup>rd</sup> 2015, C. Chase Koch, President of Koch Fertilizer, gave \$5,000 to the Political Action Committee of the Fertilizer Institute. [FEC Filing, [3/3/15](#)]

**In March Of 2016, Chase Koch Gave \$5,000 To The Political Action Committee Of The Fertilizer Institute.** According to a FEC filing, on March 8<sup>th</sup>, 2016 Chase Koch, President of KAS in Wichita, Kansas, gave \$5,000 to the Political Action Committee of the Fertilizer Institute. [FEC Filing, [3/8/16](#)]

# **THE FERTILIZER INSTITUTE OPPOSED THE EPA IMPLEMENTATION OF THE NUMERIC NUTRIENT STANDARDS IN FLORIDA**

**The Fertilizer Institute (TFI) Was Opposed To The EPA's Numeric Nutrient Criteria For Nitrogen And Phosphorus For Waters In Florida.** According to The Fertilizer Institute, "The Fertilizer Institute (TFI) expressed its intense opposition today to the Environmental Protection Agency's (EPA) rule to establish numeric nutrient criteria for nitrogen and phosphorus for waters in the state of Florida. It is estimated that the rule, which was issued this week by EPA's Office of Water in Washington, D.C., will cost U.S. farmers between \$272 million and \$1.1 billion by 2040." [The Fertilizer Institute, [11/16/10](#)]

- **TFI President Ford West: “This Rule Has An Enormous Cost And Little Benefit And We Are Urging EPA To Reconsider This Action We Advocate Smart And Targeted Policies That Address Water Quality Without Placing An Undue Economic Burden On Farmers And The Industries That Support Them.”** According to The Fertilizer Institute, “‘This rule has an enormous cost and little benefit and we are urging EPA to reconsider this action,’ said TFI President Ford West. ‘We advocate smart and targeted policies that address water quality without placing an undue economic burden on farmers and the industries that support them. Such policies can achieve both environmental and food security goals.’” [The Fertilizer Institute, [11/16/10](#)]

**In 2010, TFI Issued A Court Challenge To The EPA’s Florida Nutrient Rule.** According to The Fertilizer Institute, “The Fertilizer Institute (TFI) filed a legal challenge late yesterday to the Environmental Protection Agency’s (EPA) rule to establish numeric nutrient criteria for nitrogen and phosphorus for waters in the state of Florida. The lawsuit (The Fertilizer Institute and White Springs Agricultural Chemicals, Inc. v. United States Environmental Protection Agency) was filed in the United States District Court for the Northern District of Florida Pensacola Division and comes on the heels of a legal challenge also filed yesterday to EPA’s rule by the State of Florida. White Springs Agricultural Chemicals, Inc. has operations in Florida and is a subsidiary of TFI member Potash Corporation of Saskatchewan Inc.” [The Fertilizer Institute, [12/8/10](#)]

*TFI Vice President Of Scientific Programs: “Nutrients Occur Naturally” And Can’t Be Treated Like Traditional Pollutants*

**TFI Vice President Of Scientific Programs Bill Herz: “Nutrients Occur Naturally And In Balanced Concentrations Contribute To Healthy Ecosystems”** According to AgPro, “‘Nutrients occur naturally and in balanced concentrations contribute to healthy ecosystems,’ said TFI Vice President of Scientific Programs Bill Herz.” [AgPro, [3/19/13](#)]

**Herz: “We Have Long Argued That Nutrients Cannot Be Treated Like Traditional Pollutants And Have Consistently Held That Strict Federal NNC Are Not The Best Way To Regulate Them In Waterways.”** According to AgPro, “‘Nutrients occur naturally and in balanced concentrations contribute to healthy ecosystems,’ said TFI Vice President of Scientific Programs Bill Herz. ‘We are extremely pleased with this agreement and the overall efforts of a unified industry and agriculture community. We have long argued that nutrients cannot be treated like traditional pollutants and have consistently held that strict federal NNC are not the best way to regulate them in waterways.’” [AgPro, [3/19/13](#)]

*The Fertilizer Institute Advocated For The Florida Department Of Environmental Protection’s Numeric Nutrient Criteria Over The EPA’s*

**TFI Advocated For The Florida Department Of Environmental Protection’s Numeric Nutrient Criteria Rule Over The EPA’s.** According to The Fertilizer Institute, “The study also supports TFI’s viewpoint that the state of Florida, not EPA, should be responsible for the development and implementation of water quality standards that are science-based while avoiding unnecessary costs to the state’s citizens. TFI strongly believes that the Florida Department of Environmental Protection’s Numeric Nutrient Criteria Rule is the appropriate vehicle for improving water quality in the state. TFI urges EPA Administrator Lisa Jackson to approve the FDEP NNC rule.” [The Fertilizer Institute, [3/9/12](#)]

### **The Number Nutrient Rule Was Designed To Prevent Excess Nitrogen And Phosphorus From Causing Waterway Impairment And Algae Blooms**

**The Numeric Nutrient Standards Were Designed To Prevent Nutrient Over-Enrichment From Materials Such As Nitrogen And Phosphorus In Florida’s Waters.** According to the Florida Department of Environmental Protection, “For many decades Florida has had a narrative nutrient water quality criterion in place to protect Florida’s waters against nutrient over-enrichment. In 2009, the Department initiated rulemaking and, by 2011, adopted what would be the first set of statewide numeric nutrient standards for Florida’s waters. By 2015, almost all of the remaining waters in Florida have numeric nutrient standards. [...] The Florida coastline is separated into estuary and coastal segments. Numeric nutrient criteria are established for all estuary segments, including criteria for total nitrogen, total phosphorus, and chlorophyll a. For open ocean coastal waters, numeric criteria are established for chlorophyll a that are derived from satellite remote sensing techniques.” [Florida Department of Environmental Protection, Accessed [8/5/16](#)]

**EPA: “Clean Water Is Vital For Florida. Excess Nitrogen And Phosphorus, Or ‘Nutrient Pollution,’ Is The Primary Cause Of Water Quality Impairment Throughout The State And Causes Algae Blooms.”** According to the Environmental Protection Agency, “Clean water is vital for Florida. Excess nitrogen and phosphorus, or ‘nutrient pollution,’ is

the primary cause of water quality impairment throughout the state and causes algae blooms— the thick, green mats that can be toxic, deplete oxygen in the water, and completely reduce water clarity. Nutrient pollution threatens human health and the environment, hurts businesses, costs jobs, reduces property values and otherwise impacts the quality of life for all Floridians.” [Environmental Protection Agency, [9/14](#)]

## **THE FERTILIZER INSTITUTE CONTRIBUTED TO MARCO RUBIO’S SENATE CAMPAIGNS**

**In 2016, The Fertilizer Institute Gave At Least \$2,700 To Marco Rubio’s Senate Campaign.** [OpenSecrets, Accessed [8/5/16](#)]

**During The 2010 Election Cycle, The Fertilizer Institute Gave \$1,000 To Marco Rubio’s Senate Campaign.** [OpenSecrets.org, Accessed [8/5/16](#)]

## **RUBIO OPPOSED EPA IMPLEMENTATION OF NUMERIC NUTRIENT STANDARDS**

**Rubio Issued A Press Release Praising The Decision To Allow The Florida Department Of Environmental Protection To Implement The Numeric Nutrient Standards Rather Than The EPA.** According to a Marco Rubio press release, “U.S. Senator Marco Rubio (R-FL) issued the following statement today hailing the agreement between the Florida Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) and the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) to allow oversight of numeric nutrients regulations to be directed by Florida’s authorities instead of Washington-based bureaucrats: ‘For several years, the EPA has been on Florida’s back trying to force their way into regulating our state’s water quality instead of letting the local authorities who know this state best do their jobs. The result has been not only soaring costs but also constant uncertainty for job creators who need greater predictability in knowing what regulations they’ll need to comply with in the coming years and who’s in charge of oversight.’” [Marco Rubio Press Release, [3/15/13](#)]

- **Rubio Claimed That It Was The Result After Significant Lobbying By Him, Governor Rick Scott And The Florida Congressional Delegation.** According to a Marco Rubio press release, “March 2013: The EPA returns state regulatory power to the Florida Department of Environmental Protection after significant lobbying by Rubio, Governor Rick Scott and the entire Florida Congressional delegation.” [Marco Rubio Press Release, [3/15/13](#)]

**In 2011, Rubio Filed Two Amendments Seeking To Defund The EPA’s Efforts To Administer The Clean Water Act In Florida.** According to a Marco Rubio press release, “U.S. Senator Marco Rubio (R-FL) issued the following statement today hailing the agreement between the Florida Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) and the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) to allow oversight of numeric nutrients regulations to be directed by Florida’s authorities instead of Washington-based bureaucrats: [...] A timeline of Rubio’s efforts on this issue follows: [...] March 2011: Rubio files an amendment to the SBIR/STTR Reauthorization Act of 2011 (S. 493) to defund the EPA’s over-reaching rule to take over the regulatory role of the Florida under the Clean Water Act. June 2011: Rubio files an amendment to the Economic Development Revitalization Act of 2011 (S. 782) to defund the EPA’s over-reaching rule to take over the regulatory role of the Florida under the Clean Water Act.” [Marco Rubio Press Release, [3/15/13](#)]

**Rubio Applauded Governor Rick Scott’s Opposition To The EPA’s Numeric Nutrient Regulations In Florida.** According to a Marco Rubio press release, “U.S. Senator Marco Rubio today commended Governor Rick Scott’s filing of a petition with the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) to rescind numeric nutrient regulations in Florida: ‘The EPA’s numeric nutrient regulations for Florida unjustifiably single out our state, place costly regulations on jobs creators, and put us at a competitive disadvantage with other states. In sum, the EPA’s numeric nutrient regulations destroy Florida jobs by raising the costs of doing business without so much as considering the regulatory efforts already in place and currently being pursued by the state. ‘I applaud Governor Scott’s efforts on this issue and those undertaken by the Florida Department of Environmental Protection to strike the appropriate balance to ensure that Florida’s water is as clean as possible without unnecessarily hurting families, businesses and farmers. While I will continue working with my colleagues in Washington to prevent this EPA power grab from ruining Florida’s economy and preventing its expansion into other states, I urge the EPA to honor this petition and work with Florida’s officials to accomplish the dual goals of a vibrant economy and clean environment.’” [Marco Rubio Press Release, [3/25/11](#)]



## Koch Lobbyists In Florida

### FEARINGTON AND SMITH

The Registered Lobbyists For Koch Companies Public Sector, Koch Industries, Flint Hills, And Georgia-Pacific Corporations In Florida Are Mercer Fearington Jr. And James C. (Clark) Smith. [FloridaLobbyist.gov, [1/30/15](#)]

- Alongside Myra Carpenter, Charles Hood, And Foyt Tipton Ralston, Fearington And Smith Also Represented Georgia-Pacific Corporation In 2006. [Floridalobbyist.gov, Accessed [1/30/15](#)]

### Peyton Fearington – Mercer Fearington’s Mother – Worked For Gov. Bush, Exchanged Emails With Bush Occasionally

**Peyton Fearington Served As “One Of The Three Deputy Secretaries For The Department Of Business And Professional Regulation.”** According to an email from Peyton Fearington to a constituent on September 4, 2001, “Dear Mr. Peace-Governor Bush has asked me to respond to your recent email regarding Stevens Bros. Funeral Home. I am one of the three Deputy Secretaries for the Department of Business and Professional Regulation, and directly work with the Division of Professions. There are several cases with Stevens Funeral Home for operating without a license. The Department is working to resolve these cases and gain compliance with licensure requirements. After these cases are resolved, then it is the function of the Board of Funeral Directors and Embalmers to determine whether a license should be issued. The next board meeting is scheduled for November 6-7, 2001 in Orlando, Florida. If I can be of further assistance please do not hesitate to contact me at (850) 921-7271. Thank you, Peyton C. Fearington, Deputy Secretary[.]” [Peyton Fearington Email to Constituent, 9/4/01]

**Gov. Jeb Bush Email To Peyton Fearington: “I Hope You Are Doing Well, Peyton. Long Time, No See.”** According to an email from Gov. Jeb Bush to Peyton Fearington, “i [sic] hope you are doing well, Peyton. Long time, no see. Can you respond to Gerald Kisner? Jeb[.]” [Gov. Jeb Bush Email to Peyton Fearington, 9/1/01]

**Peyton Fearington Email To Jeb Bush: “I Have Decided I Need To Spend My Time At Becoming A Full-Time Grandmother. Mercer Has Caroline, Another On The Way, In About 2 Weeks.”** According to an email from Peyton Fearington to Gov. Jeb Bush on October 31, 2001, “Governor-I wanted to thank you so much for the opportunity to work in your administration and for both Secretary Henderson and Secretary Binkley-Seyer. It has indeed been my honor and pleasure. I have decided that I need to spend my time at becoming a full-time grandmother. Mercer has Caroline, another on the way, in about 2 weeks and my daughter is expecting her first at the end of the month. I will be calling Karen in the next few weeks to offer any assistance in her office. Thank you again and best of luck.” [Peyton Fearington Email to Gov. Jeb Bush, 10/31/01]

- **Gov. Bush’s Response: “Thank You Peyton. I Am Jealous! I Want To Be A Granddaddy!”** According to an email from Gov. Jeb Bush to Peyton Fearington, “Thank you Peyton. I am jealous! I want to be a granddaddy!” [Gov. Jeb Bush Email to Peyton Fearington, 10/31/01]

### Clark Smith

**Clark Smith Was The Son Of Jim Smith, Jeb Bush’s Former Secretary Of State.** According to SaintPetersBlog, “Beside the financial aspects of the deal, it makes sense that Clark Smith is joining the firm where his father hangs his hat. Veteran lobbyist and former Secretary of State Jim Smith joined SSG in 2011 after splitting off from Ballard & Smith, the firm Brian Ballard and he started.” [SaintPetersBlog, [11/2/13](#)]

### FEARINGTON AND SMITH MERGED WITH SOUTHERN STRATEGY GROUP

**Mercer Fearington And Jim And Clark Smith Work For Southern Strategy Group.** [SoStrategy.com/team, Accessed [1/30/15](#)]

**At Least Six Other Members Of Southern Strategy Group Served In Gov. Jeb Bush’s Administration Or Worked For His Campaigns.** According to Southern Strategy Group’s website, Oscar Anderson, Thomas Arnold, Paul Bradshaw, Sarah



Carrol, Chris Dudley, and Deno Hicks all either served under Jeb Bush's administration or worked/volunteered for one of his gubernatorial campaigns:

Oscar Anderson – Jeb Bush's Chief of Staff/Assistant Secretary at the Department of Community Affairs (2003)

Thomas Arnold – Jeb Bush's Medicaid Director (2004-2007)

Paul Bradshaw – "coordinat[ed] issues development for several statewide candidates including Jeb Bush) (founder)

Sarrah Carroll – "managed special events for Governor Jeb Bush in External Affairs."

Chris Dudley – Assistant to the Chief of Staff and Deputy Chief of Staff to Jeb Bush, 1998/2002 Bush Campaigns

Deno Hicks – "served the Bush Administration as a Florida Liaison to the Department of Political Affairs of the White House," Appointed by Jeb Bush to the Florida Greenways and Trails Council (2005) additionally appointed to nominee to the electoral college, delegate to the 08 RNC, member of the 4<sup>th</sup> circuit judicial court nominating commission, appointee to the executive board of the Republican Party of Florida. [SoStrategy.com/team, Accessed [1/30/15](#)]

**SaintPetersBlog: The Path Between Working In Florida's Executive Branch And Lobbying With Southern Strategy Group Is "Well-Worn."** According to SaintPetersBlog, "[Jerry] McDaniel joining SSG follows a well-worn path from the executive branch to Adams Street. Since its founding, Southern Strategy Group has built its practice, in part, on its ability to attract high-ranking former governmental officials eager to capitalize on their expertise and knowledge of the inner-workings of state government. Among SSG's current and former partners who previously held senior public sector positions are Paul Bradshaw, David Rancourt, Jim Smith, John Thrasher and James McFaddin. McDaniel is joining SSG two months after the firm announced it was acquiring Fearington & Smith, a boutique shop whose clients include BP America, Georgia-Pacific and Koch Industries." [SaintPetersBlog, [1/5/14](#)]

## DAVID KOCH & PALM BEACH

### David Koch Was The Richest Palm Beach Resident

**David Koch Was The Richest Full Or Part-Time Resident Of Palm Beach, Florida.** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, "Of the more than 1,000 names on the list are more than two dozen full- and part-time residents of Palm Beach and Manalapan. David Koch, executive vice president of Koch Industries, is the richest on the island, worth \$17.5 billion, according to Forbes. Koch ranks as the 24th wealthiest person on the planet, along with three others: Sergey Brin and Larry Page of Google fame, and his older brother Charles Koch, who doesn't have a place here. William Koch, David's twin and fellow Palm Beacher, also is on the list, but is reported as having a net worth of 'only' \$3 billion. He is ranked at No. 316, along with 26 others, including Hollywood types Steven Spielberg and George Lucas. Besides the Koch brothers, there are 23 other Palm Beachers who are worth at least a billion." [Palm Beach Daily News via LexisNexis, 3/12/10]

### DAVID KOCH POTENTIALLY HELPED PAY TO BUILD PUBLIC BATHROOMS TO KEEP THE TOWN FROM PROVIDING ACCESSIBLE PARKING NEAR HIS HOME

**Prior To The Construction Of The Bathrooms On Midtown Beach, The Town Of Palm Beach Was Required To Provide 25 Public Parking Spaces Within A Quarter Mile Of The Beach.** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, "The addition of public restrooms would reclassify Midtown Beach as 'primary' instead of 'secondary' under state guidelines. That would enable the town to count toward the public parking requirement a surplus of public parking that is in the Midtown area. Because the state has given the town financial aid for beach improvements, it currently requires that 25 parking spaces be made available to the public within a quarter-mile of the 'secondary' Clarke Avenue access to the beach." [Palm Beach Daily News, [5/14/11](#)]

**David Koch Lived On South Ocean Boulevard "Near Where Beach Parking Is Now Designated On Clarke And Barton Avenues."** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, "[James] Green represents the Lauders and Kochs, both of whom live on South Ocean Boulevard near where beach parking is now designated on Clarke and Barton avenues." [Palm Beach Daily News, 3/9/11]

- **David Koch Lived On South Ocean Boulevard And Hired Attorney James Green To Represent Him.** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “Leonard Lauder of Barton Avenue and David Koch of South Ocean Boulevard have hired West Palm Beach attorney James Green who said he’ll discuss a waiver with state Department of Environmental Protection officials at a meeting next week.” [Palm Beach Daily News, [4/12/11](#)]

**Residents Near The Street “Complained That Beachgoers Leave Trash And Change Clothes On The Street And Have Asked That Public Spaces Be Moved.”** According to the Palm Beach Post, “Fifteen of the 25 spaces are in the ocean block of Clarke Avenue, six are on the street’s 200 block, and four are on Barton Avenue. Clarke Avenue residents have complained that beachgoers leave trash and change clothes on the street, and have asked that public spaces be moved. Seabreeze and Seaspray avenue residents had the same complaints when some of their spaces were designated in 2009.” [Palm Beach Daily News, 3/9/11]

**Palm Beach Daily News: “The Parking Has Pitted Neighbor Against Neighbor As Residents Protest Against Having The Spaces On Their Respective Streets.”** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “Currently, all but four of the state-required parking spaces are on Clarke Avenue, where residents have complained about beachgoers leaving trash, changing in public, trespassing, and walking up and down the street. Four spaces are on nearby Barton Avenue. At the same time, the council delayed a controversial decision on whether to build public restrooms at Midtown Beach as a way to legally get around the state requirement. The parking has pitted neighbor against neighbor as residents protest against having the spaces on their respective streets.” [Palm Beach Daily News, [5/14/11](#)]

**Palm Beach Daily News: “Once The Parking Requirement Was Removed, The Town Would Convert Clarke Avenue To Parking By Permit Only...”** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “Once the parking requirement is removed, the town would convert Clarke Avenue to parking by permit only, as Seaspray, Seabreeze and Seaview are now. But the permit solution would be trickier for Barton Avenue, where The Episcopal Church of Bethesda-by-the-Sea relies on 13 public spaces for those who use the church.” [Palm Beach Daily News, [5/14/11](#)]

**Adding Bathrooms To The Beach “Would Qualify It As A Primary Beach, And Then The Clarke Avenue Parking Requirements Would Disappear.”** According to minutes from the Palm City Town Council meeting held on April 12, 2011, “The second option was bathrooms. A bathroom at Mid-Town beach would qualify it as a primary beach, and then the Clarke Avenue parking requirements would disappear. After that meeting there was discussion amongst the residents about paying for the potential bathroom with private funds.” [Palm Beach Town Council Minutes Backup, [10/8/13](#)]

**Another Potential Solution Was To Add Parking On South Ocean Boulevard, But The Town Council Noted It Would “Impact The Ocean Front Homeowners.”** According to minutes from the Palm City Town Council meeting held on April 12, 2011, “South Ocean Boulevard was another option. It would be one-way from Barton Avenue to Royal Palm Way. The consensus was that the parallel parking would go on the eastern most side, which would impact the ocean front homeowners as they are now. We would need a traffic study for this option.” [Palm Beach Town Council Minutes Backup, [10/8/13](#)]

- **David Koch Owned “30,000-Square-Foot Beachfront House, Estimated By Property Tax Authorities To Be Worth \$27 Million.** “According to Forbes, “New York billionaire David Koch was forced to pull down a privacy fence recently erected around his winter property in Palm Beach, Fla. His staff put up the country-style camouflage net after camera crews from a liberal group filmed the 30,000-square-foot beachfront house, estimated by property tax authorities to be worth \$27 million.” [Forbes, [10/28/11](#)]

**Town Of Palm Beach Shore Protection Board Member J. Patterson Cooper Said “He Believed That A Citizen Had Offered To Pay” To Build The Bathrooms.** According to minutes from the Town of Palm Beach’s Shore Protection Board meeting on October 27, 2011, “Board Member [J. Patterson] Cooper said he was in favor of putting bathrooms at the Mid-Town Beach because it was the right thing to do. He said he believed that a citizen had offered to pay for it.” [Town of Palm Beach Shore Protection Board Minutes Backup, [12/6/11](#)]

**The Town Agreed To “Proceed With A Bathroom Study, To Be Conducted At Private Expense... This Study Will Include The Options Of Building A New Restroom Facility And Of Converting The Existing One.”** According to an action report from the Town of Palm Beach Town Council meeting on May 10, 2011, “The Town will also proceed with a bathroom study, to be conducted at private expense and to include maintenance thereof. This study will include the options of

building a new restroom facility and of converting the existing one. The Town will get a refined cost estimate for the study and will obtain the funding before proceeding.” [Palm Beach Town Council Action Report, [10/8/13](#)]

- **The Existing Facility Was Located At The Intersection Of Chilean Avenue And South Ocean Boulevard.** According to a feasibility study conducted by Bridges, Marsh & Associates for the Town of Palm Beach, “The Town of Palm Beach (Town) has been asked to review options for locating new bathroom facilities at the public beach area. This study will address two options: A. Remodeling the existing Town Lifeguard building at Chilean and South Ocean Blvd. to accommodate bathroom facilities. B. Construct a free standing new building at the intersection of Royal Palm Way and South Ocean Blvd. to accommodate bathroom facilities.” [Town of Palm Beach Town Council Meeting Agenda for August 9, 2011, [10/8/13](#)]
- **The Considered New Facility Was To Be Placed At The Intersection Of Royal Palm Way And South Ocean Boulevard.** According to a feasibility study conducted by Bridges, Marsh & Associates for the Town of Palm Beach, “The Town of Palm Beach (Town) has been asked to review options for locating new bathroom facilities at the public beach area. This study will address two options: A. Remodeling the existing Town Lifeguard building at Chilean and South Ocean Blvd. to accommodate bathroom facilities. B. Construct a free standing new building at the intersection of Royal Palm Way and South Ocean Blvd. to accommodate bathroom facilities.” [Town of Palm Beach Town Council Meeting Agenda for August 9, 2011, [10/8/13](#)]
- **The Intersection Of Royal Palm Way And South Ocean Boulevard Was .3 Miles From David Koch’s House, Whereas The Intersection Of Chilean Avenue Was .5 Miles From David Koch’s House.** According to Google Maps, 150 South Ocean Boulevard is .3 miles from South Ocean Boulevard’s intersection with Royal Palm Way. The distance from 150 South Ocean Boulevard to South Ocean Boulevard’s intersection with Chilean Avenue is .5 miles. [Google Maps, Accessed 1/23/15]
- **A City Official Identified A Drawback Of Using The Existing Facility As Reducing The Office Space Of The Ocean Rescue Lifeguard Organization To “One Third The Size Of Their Existing Space.”** According to a memo from Palm Beach Director of Public Works H. Paul Brazil to the Mayor and Town Council on July 26, 2011, “This alternative consists of remodeling the existing Ocean Rescue building at Chilean Avenue and South Ocean Boulevard. The existing hedges between the sidewalk and the building would be removed to accommodate a ramp that will meet the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) requirements. The ladies' room would have two stalls (one ADA) and the men's room would have two urinals and one stall (ADA). Ocean Rescue will be able to maintain office space but it will be approximately one third the size of their existing space. We anticipate having to provide storage for this work group at another Town facility.” [Town of Palm Beach Town Council Meeting Agenda for August 9, 2011, [10/8/13](#)]
- **The Bathrooms Were Constructed Inside Of The Ocean Rescue Facility.** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “The restrooms will occupy the northern two-thirds of the building that has been used as the lifeguard station. The lifeguards will continue to use the remainder of the building and have been given additional space at the Central Fire Station, [DPW H. Paul] Brazil said.” [Palm Beach Daily News, [10/4/12](#)]

**The Palm Beach Town Council Voted To Approve The Construction Of The Bathrooms “Subject To 100% Of The Construction Costs Being Funded Through Community Donations.”** According to the minutes from the Town of Palm Beach’s Town Council meeting on November 8, 2011, “Motion was made by Council Member Pucillo and seconded by Council President Pro Tem Wildrick to approve the construction of public restrooms at Mid-Town Beach, subject to 100% of construction costs being funded through community donations, which must be received within 120 days. On roll call, the motion carried 3-2, with Council Member Diamond and Council President Rosow dissenting.” [Palm Beach Town Council Minutes Backup, [10/8/13](#)]

**Attorney James Green Stated That “The Leonard Lauder And David Koch Families Have Committed To Donate \$25,000 Each To The Construction Of The Restroom.”** According to the minutes from the Town of Palm Beach’s Town Council meeting on November 8, 2011, “Attorney James Green, 222 Lakeview Avenue, West Palm Beach, stated that the Leonard Lauder and David Koch families have committed to donate \$25,000 each for the construction of the restroom.” [Palm Beach Town Council Minutes Backup, [10/8/13](#)]

**The Cost Estimate Was Approximately \$175,000 Dollars.** According to a memo from Palm Beach Director of Public Works H. Paul Brazil to the Mayor and Town Council on July 26, 2011, “The engineer's estimate for this alternative is approximately \$175,000 and does not include an owner's contingency. Additionally, we have not been able to fully investigate retrofitting the existing structure with a self cleaning system, but will do so if this alternative is selected.” [Town of Palm Beach Town Council Meeting Agenda for August 9, 2011, [10/8/13](#)]

**The Community Privately Financed A \$240,000 Budget.** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “Construction of public restrooms at the beach is proceeding slightly ahead of schedule, toward a Nov. 19 completion, and within its \$240,000 budget, Public Works Director Paul Brazil said Wednesday. Mayor Gail Coniglio led a campaign to raise the entire amount through private donations after a divided Town Council approved the restrooms a year ago — with the condition that town funds not be used for pay for them. ‘This has been a community effort, and certainly it will be a long-term betterment not only for the town but the [larger] community,’ Coniglio said.” [Palm Beach Daily News, [10/4/12](#)]

**The Lifeguards Were Given Office Space At The Central Fire Station.** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “The restrooms will occupy the northern two-thirds of the building that has been used as the lifeguard station. The lifeguards will continue to use the remainder of the building and have been given additional space at the Central Fire Station, [DPW H. Paul] Brazil said.” [Palm Beach Daily News, [10/4/12](#)]

- **The Central Fire Station Was Not Located On The Beach.** According to the Town of Palm Beach, the central fire station’s address was 355 South County Road. This was not located on the beach, per Google maps. [Town of Palm Beach and Google Maps, Accessed [1/23/15](#)]

## **DAVID KOCH RECEIVED A TAX EXEMPTION TO EXPAND HIS MANSION**

### **Koch’s Tax Exemption Has Been Called “Rich Man’s Welfare”**

**Palm Beach Councilman Allen Wyett Said The Exemptions Were “Rich Man’s Welfare.”** According to the Palm Beach Post, “‘It's rich man's welfare,’ Councilman Allen Wyett said. ‘The rest of us taxpayers are subsidizing millionaires' welfare.’” [Palm Beach Post, 2/1/02]

**David Koch Received Tax Exemption On A \$12 Million Expansion Of His Home.** According to the Palm Beach Post, “Among the tax exemptions the council approved last month were \$8 million for The Breakers and \$12 million for oil financier David Koch's house.” [Palm Beach Post, 2/1/02]

**Wyett Said That The Koch Tax Break Was As Much As \$48,000.** According to the Palm Beach Post, “‘Voters had in mind preserving the average home, not mega-mansions. Granting a \$48,000 tax break is not what was envisioned by voters,’ Wyett said of Koch's estimated tax reduction.” [Palm Beach Post, 1/9/02]

- **Palm Beach Was Set To Lose As Much As \$104,000 In 2003 In Property Tax Because “The Increased Value Of Landmarked Property Resulting From Restoration Is Exempt For 10 Years.”** According to the Palm beach Post, “‘The town will lose as much as \$104,000 next year in property tax because the increased value of landmarked property resulting from restoration is exempt for 10 years. That exempt value will total \$25.5 million next year.’” [Palm Beach Post, 2/1/02]
- **Palm Beach County Lost About \$126,180 Less In Tax Revenue As Well.** According to the Palm Beach Post, “Palm Beach County will receive about \$126,180 less in taxes as well. The reduction does not apply to school or any other taxes.” [Palm Beach Post, 1/9/02]

**Palm Beach Officials Rewrote Tax Exemptions Governing Landmarked Buildings So That They “Apply Only To Renovations And Not To House Expansions Or Improvements.”** According to the Palm Beach Post, “Town officials will write criteria so that tax exemptions for restoring landmarked buildings apply only to renovations and not to house expansions or improvements.” [Palm Beach Post, 2/1/02]

**David Koch Purchased The House Next-Door And Expanded His Home Because Their Playroom For Their Children Was Too Small**



**David Koch Was Awarded The Ballinger Award In 2008 For The Home Expansion, An Award Given To “Superlative” Renovation And Restoration Projects.** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “The Koch's efforts earned them the 2008 Ballinger Award presented by the Preservation Foundation annually to renovation, preservation and restoration projects deemed superlative for maintaining the historic architectural traditions of the island. The foundation has handed out Ballinger Awards since 1988. In 1991, the previous owners of El Sarmiento were given the award for the restoration of that property.” [Palm Beach Daily News, 12/14/08]

**The Kochs Expanded Their “Grand And Very Formal” Home To Include The Property Next Door Because The Playroom For Their Three Children Under 10 “Was Too Small.”** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “When Julia and David Koch decided to purchase the property neighboring El Sarmiento, the grand and very formal Mizner-designed 1923 Mediterranean Revival house they have lived in since 2001, they foresaw the creation of a ‘magnificent compound.’ ‘We wanted to make a place for the children,’ said Julia Koch, who had created a playroom for the couple's three offspring, all of whom are under 10 years old, from a former guest bedroom at El Sarmiento. ‘It was too small for them, especially when they had friends come over to play.’” [Palm Beach Daily News, 12/14/08]

**They Purchased The House Next Door “To Accommodate The Koch Children’s Needs.”** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “So the original concept for the house next door, a 1925 British Colonial-style residence that had been renovated in 1931 by island architect and leading proponent of the Bermuda style, Howard Major, was to accommodate the Koch children's needs.” [Palm Beach Daily News, 12/14/08]

**“Only A Portion Of The British Colonial-Style House, Five Arches Stretching Across The First Floor Of The East-Facing Façade Of The Residence, Had Been Landmarked.”** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “Only a portion of the British Colonial-style house, five arches stretching across the first floor of the east-facing facade of the residence, had been landmarked, but [architect Thomas] Kirchhoff and the Kochs recognized the character and details of the entire east elevation, the south-facing elevation and an enclosed courtyard, all of which had been created by Major, were significant and worthy of restoration and improvement.” [Palm Beach Daily News, 12/14/08]

**The Kochs Referred To The Second Home As “The ‘Playhouse’,” Which Would Provide “A Setting For The Children To Play.”** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “In the process, it was determined that the ‘playhouse,’ as the Kochs now refer to the second home they acquired, also would serve a number of functions besides as a setting for children to play.” [Palm Beach Daily News, 12/14/08]

**The Koch “Playhouse” Included An “Interior Courtyard,” Which “Was Made Somewhat Smaller, Allowing For A Motorcourt And Garage.”** According to the Palm Beach Daily News, “There is a gracious second-floor apartment for the house manager and his wife, an exercise room, a gallery and family room, and underneath an expansive basement where a mega-generator and all climate and utility equipment for both houses is now located. An interior courtyard was made somewhat smaller, allowing for a motorcourt and garage along the west-facing side of the house.” [Palm Beach Daily News, 12/14/08]

## **DAVID KOCH HOSTED A REPUBLICAN GOVERNOR ASSOCIATION FUNDRAISER AT HIS PALM BEACH MANSION**

**David Koch Was Set To Host A Fundraiser For The Republican Governor’s Association At His Palm Beach Mansion Featuring Scott Walker, Chris Christie, Bobby Jindal, And Potentially Jeb Bush.** According to the Washington Post, “One of the next stops on the 2016 trail: David Koch’s 30,050-square-foot Palm Beach mansion. A group of White House hopefuls, including Wisconsin Gov. Scott Walker, New Jersey Gov. Chris Christie and Louisiana Gov. Bobby Jindal, are scheduled to make a pilgrimage to the oceanfront estate of the billionaire industrialist on Sunday afternoon. The occasion is a lunchtime fundraiser for the Republican Governors Association, of which Koch is a major supporter. The event will also give presidential aspirants face-time with some of the party’s most influential and generous contributors. Former governors Jeb Bush of Florida and Rick Perry of Texas were also invited to the event; Perry aides said he would not be able to attend.” [Washington Post, [3/20/15](#)]

**Donald Trump And Mike Pence Was Set To Attend Koch’s Fundraiser**



**Donald Trump And Mike Pence Were Also Set To Attend The Fundraiser.** According to the Washington Post, “Some of those donors are scheduled be in attendance -- including real estate magnate Donald Trump, who recently announced his own presidential exploratory bid, and his wife. Gov. Mike Pence of Indiana, another longshot 2016 possibility, will also be there, along with Govs. Bill Haslam of Tennessee, Susana Martinez of New Mexico, Rick Scott of Florida, Nikki Haley of South Carolina and Mary Fallin of Oklahoma.” [Washington Post, [3/20/15](#)]

## **David Koch’s Mansion Was Near Donald Trump’s And The Two Were “Personally Friendly”**

**Politico: “Trump Is Personally Friendly With David Koch.”** According to Politico, “Trump is personally friendly with David Koch, according to a source familiar with their interactions, who said “there’s a long relationship with mutual respect and admiration.” The two men own mansions near one another in Palm Beach, Florida, and mingled at a March fundraiser for the Republican Governors Association at Koch’s place.” [Politico, [7/29/15](#)]

- **Politico: David Koch And Trump “Own Mansions Near One Another In Palm Beach” And “Mingled At A March Fundraiser For The Republican Governors Association At Koch’s Place.”** According to Politico, “Trump is personally friendly with David Koch, according to a source familiar with their interactions, who said “there’s a long relationship with mutual respect and admiration.” The two men own mansions near one another in Palm Beach, Florida, and mingled at a March fundraiser for the Republican Governors Association at Koch’s place.” [Politico, [7/29/15](#)]

## **DONALD TRUMP UTILIZED FLORIDA KOCH NETWORK LEADERS**

**Former Koch Industries Lobbyist And Americans For Prosperity State Director Alan Cobb Worked As A Strategic Consultant For Donald Trump.** According to the Kansas City Star, “Alan Cobb is working as a strategic consultant for Donald Trump, the GOP presidential frontrunner. Cobb has experience working for GOP heavyweights. He was a long-time aide to former Kansas Sen. Bob Dole. He’s also a former state director of Americans for Prosperity and a lobbyist for Koch Industries. In 2014, he was involved in the Coalition for a Better Wichita’s successful campaign against the 1-cent citywide sales tax.” [Kansas City Star, [8/31/15](#)]

**Sunshine State News: Former American Commitment Florida Director Karen Giorno Was Hired As Donald Trump’s Florida Director.** According to Sunshine State News, “Businessman Donald Trump named his Florida director on Friday, turning to Karen Giorno to lead his efforts in the Sunshine State as he continues his bid for the Republican presidential nomination. The founder of Kingston Public Affairs, Giorno has ties to Florida, having worked as Gov. Rick Scott’s director of external affairs. Giorno has also served as Florida director of conservative group American Commitment.” [Sunshine State News, [10/2/15](#)]

## **KOCH NETWORK IN FLORIDA**

### **Americans For Prosperity-Florida**

#### **AFP-FLORIDA LAUNCHED IN 2009**

**Americans For Prosperity Launched Their Florida Operations In 2009.** According to the Americans for Prosperity-Florida Facebook page, the organization was founded in 2009. [Americans for Prosperity-Florida – Facebook, Accessed [8/18/16](#)]

#### **AMERICANS FOR PROSPERITY WAS FOUNDED BY THE KOCH BROTHERS**

**Americans For Prosperity’s Founders Were “Billionaire David Koch, And His Brother, Charles Koch.”** According to the Washington Post, “Americans for Prosperity’s increasing involvement in races this cycle has caught the attention of the New Yorker, which earlier this week published a lengthy investigative piece on the organization’s co-founder, billionaire David Koch, and his brother, Charles Koch.” [Washington Post, [8/26/10](#)]

## **AFP’S “SINGLE LARGEST FIELD OPERATION” WAS IN FLORIDA**

**AFP’s “Single Largest Field Operation” Was In Florida, Where The Group Had 10 Offices.** According to the Associated Press, “In many places, the group [AFP] has more trained and paid operatives than the traditional political parties have. Nowhere is this more obvious than Florida, where the group has 10 offices, its single largest field operation.” [Associated Press, [10/12/14](#)]

### **AFP-Florida Employed Over 100 Staffers, Rivaling The Size Of The State’s GOP**

**AFP’s Organization In Florida Rivalled The Size Of The Florida GOP.** According to the New York Times Magazine, “Where does the money go? Americans for Prosperity obviously spends a lot on television, but it also maintains offices in 35 states with 600 paid staff members. The group funds phone banks, big-ticket events and many other details like beer cozies and water bottles. Its biggest chapter is in Florida, where its 50 paid staff members work out of 10 offices and constitute a year-round organization that rivals that of the state Republican Party.” [New York Times Magazine, [10/19/14](#)]

**The Hill: Americans For Prosperity Had About 105 Florida Staffers.** According to a post by The Hill national political reporter Jonathan Swan for The Hill’s Ballot Box blog, “The Koch network has 16 field offices in Florida and 165 field staff, which includes full-time and part-time workers and contractors, according to a source familiar with the operation. About 105 of these Florida staff belong to AFP, and the rest are divided across the other Koch network groups, Concerned Veterans for America, Generation Opportunity and Libre.” [TheHill.com/Blogs/Ballot-Box, [8/17/16](#)]

### **AFP-Florida Had 12 Field Offices Located Throughout Florida**

*AFP-FL Had Locations In Brandon, Deland, Tallahassee, Panama City, Lakeland, Naples, Miami, Boca Raton, Port Saint Lucie, Jacksonville, Orange Park, And Winter Park*

**AFP-Florida Had 12 Field Offices, Located In Brandon, Deland, Tallahassee, Panama City, Lakeland, Naples, Miami, Boca Raton, Port Saint Lucie, Jacksonville, Orange Park, And Winter Park.** According to Americans for Prosperity, “Contact AFP Florida[.] 1089 East Brandon Boulevard Brandon, Florida 33511[.]138 West New York Avenue Suite 6 Deland, Florida 32720 [.]200 West College Avenue Suite 109 & 113 Tallahassee, Florida 32301[.]228 Harrison Avenue Suite 104 Panama City, Florida 32402[.]4680 County Road 540A Lakeland, Florida 33813[.]4949 North Tamiami Trail, Liberty Plaza Suite 206 Naples, Florida 34103[.] 7311 North West 36th Street Miami, Florida 33126[.]7400 North Federal Highway Suite C3 Boca Raton, Florida 33487[.] 763 South West South Macedo Boulevard Port Saint Lucie, Florida 34983[.]3306 Beach Boulevard Jacksonville, Florida 32207[.]1524 Smith St, #103 Orange Park, Florida 32073[.]2250 Lee Rd, Suite 202 Winter Park, Florida 32789[.]” [Americans for Prosperity, Accessed [8/15/16](#)]

### **Americans For Prosperity Was One Of Florida’s Largest Outside Spending Groups**

**Americans For Prosperity Was One Of Florida’s Largest Outside Spending Groups.** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “As part of a look at the \$200 million in outside money that has flooded Florida elections since 2010, we caught up with Americans for Prosperity, the Koch-backed group that has emerged as one of the biggest players.” [Tampa Bay Times, [7/21/16](#)]

### **Florida Served As AFP’s “Testing Ground For Anti-Government Campaigning”**

**New Republic: Florida Served As “Something Of A Testing Ground For Anti-Government Campaigning From” Americans For Prosperity.** According to the New Republic, “It has something to do with the Tea Party’s influence. Both Scott and Rubio rode the Tea Party wave to office in 2010. Billionaires Charles and David Koch have helped to fuel conservative activism in Florida, by spending millions over the years to establish elaborate political operations in the state. As a result, Florida has become something of a testing ground for anti-government campaigning from the Kochs’ primary group, Americans for Prosperity. A New York Times story last March noted that AFP used a special election for a House seat and ‘turned the Florida contest into its personal electoral laboratory to fine-tune get-out-the-vote tools and messaging for future elections as it pursues its overarching goal of convincing Americans that big government is bad government.’ David Jolly,

AFP's candidate of choice, won that election. Like many of his colleagues, Jolly said he doesn't think 'the impact that humans have had on our climate is so dramatic' that it warrants government action." [New Republic, [2/18/15](#)]

**AFP Conducted More Than 400 Door-To-Door Surveys In Boca Raton, Florida To Refine Massive Voter Database.** According to an article from the Independent, "Kathy Birjandi was heading out of the door with her two sons on a sweltering morning when she encountered a politely smiling duo from the conservative advocacy group Americans for Prosperity (AFP) on her porch. "Ma'am, do you have time for a quick survey about the economy?" asked Carlos Muhletaler, a senior field director for AFP. Ninety seconds later, he had logged key details about the 45-year-old mother into an iPad app, including the fact that she considers herself a political moderate and has mixed feelings about the Affordable Care Act. The information gathered by Mr Muhletaler and a dozen AFP volunteers who knocked on more than 400 doors in the coastal city of Boca Raton, Florida, on Tuesday instantly flowed back to the eighth floor of an office building in Arlington, Virginia, where a team of 80 engineers, analysts and data scientists is working to refine a massive voter database." [The Independent, [7/30/15](#)]

## **AFP-FLORIDA LEADERSHIP & OPERATIVES**

### **AFP-FL Director Chris Hudson**

**Chris Hudson Served As Florida State Director Since 2014.** According to an Americans for Prosperity press release, "Americans for Prosperity (AFP), the nation's foremost grassroots advocate for economic freedom, announced leadership changes in the organization's Florida chapter today. Christopher Hudson has been named Florida State Director to replace Slade O'Brien, who has been elevated to a new role within the organization." [Americans for Prosperity, [5/14/14](#)]

**AFP-FL State Director Chris Hudson's Father Was State Rep. Matt Hudson, A Naples Republican Who Chaired The House Health Care Appropriations Subcommittee.** According to the Miami Herald, "[AFP-Florida State Director Chris] Hudson has access to powerful House leaders. His father is state Rep. Matt Hudson, a Naples Republican who chairs the House Health Care Appropriations Subcommittee." [Miami Herald, [1/18/15](#)]

### **Former AFP-FL State Director Slade O'Brien**

**Former Citizens For A Sound Economy-FL Director Slade O'Brien Became Florida Director Of Americans For Prosperity In 2011.** According to the St Petersburg Times Blogs, "Slade O'Brien is the new state director of Americans for Prosperity-Florida, the free-market activism group announced Monday. O'Brien's previous jobs include president of Florida Strategies Group, executive director of Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse, and Florida director of Citizens of a Sound Economy." [St Petersburg Times Blogs, 6/27/11]

**Between February 2014 And May 2014, Slade O'Brien Served As Americans For Prosperity's Southern Regional Director.** According to LinkedIn, Slade O'Brien served as Americans for Prosperity's Southern Regional Director from February 2014 - May 2014. [Slade O'Brien – LinkedIn, Accessed [8/15/16](#)]

**Slade O'Brien Served As Americans For Prosperity's Vice President Of Their Grassroots Education Institute Since June 2014.** According to LinkedIn, Slade O'Brien is currently Americans for Prosperity's Vice President of their Grassroots Education Institute and has been since June 2014. [Slade O'Brien – LinkedIn, Accessed [8/15/16](#)]

### **Former AFP-Florida Manager Of Field Operations Ken Mayo**

**Former AFP Manager Of Field Operations Ken Mayo Was Named Director Of Field Operations For Donald Trump's Campaign In Florida.** According to Florida Politics, "Donald Trump, who continues to dominate in all statewide polls in Florida, said Tuesday that he's adding four more staff people to his growing campaign team in the Sunshine State. Jennifer R. Locetta will be deputy state director, Ken Mayo has been named director of field operations, John Ross Pughe is joining as the southeast regional field director, and Craig Bachler will serve as director of coalitions. [...] Mayo worked for the American Majority in 2011, and for Americans for Prosperity as manager of field operations in Florida in 2012-2013." [Watchdog.org, [11/24/15](#)]

### **AFP-FL Deputy Director Skylar Zander**

**Skylar Zander Was AFP-FL's New Deputy Director, He Previously Served In The Public Defender's Office And As A Legislative Aide In The Florida House Of Representatives.** According to the Tampa Bay Times, "Americans for Prosperity Florida announced today two new hires and three promotions with to [sic] 'winning big legislative battles this year.' [...] Skylar Zander has joined AFP as the new Deputy Director. Previously, he served in the Public Defender's Office of the 4th Judicial Circuit Court, as a Legislative Aide in the Florida House of Representatives, as a Senior Associate at Strategos Group and has worked on a plethora of campaigns. Zander has also served on several boards and committees and in 2013, he was named one of the SaintPetersBlog's top 30 under 30 rising stars in Florida Politics." [Tampa Bay Times, [2/9/15](#)]

## **AFP-FL Policy Analyst Melissa Fausz**

**Melissa Fausz Was An AFP-FL Policy Analyst, She Previously Served As A Special Investigator Retained By The U.S. Office Of Personnel Management.** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “Melissa Fausz comes to AFP with an array of experience as Florida’s very own Policy Analyst. Before joining AFP, Fausz served as a Special Investigator retained by the U.S. Office of Personnel Management – Federal Investigative Services Division and the Department of Justice – Civil Rights Division to conduct civil investigations related to matters of national security. She has conducted investigations for NASA, the IRS, TSA, and the U.S. Armed Forces, among others.” [Tampa Bay Times, [2/9/15](#)]

## **AFP-FL Communications Director Andres Malave**

**Andres Malave Served As Americans For Prosperity’s Florida Communications Director Beginning In February 2015.** According to LinkedIn, Andres Malave was Americans for Prosperity’s Florida Communications Director beginning in February 2015. [Andres Malave – LinkedIn, Accessed [8/15/16](#)]

**Andres Malave Was Previously Americans For Prosperity’s Hispanic Outreach Director.** According to LinkedIn, Andres Malave was Americans for Prosperity’s Hispanic Outreach Director beginning in January 2012. [Andres Malave – LinkedIn, Accessed [8/15/16](#)]

**Between 2009 And 2012, Andres Malave Served As A Legislative Aide To The Florida House Of Representatives.** According to LinkedIn, Andres Malave served as a legislative aide to the Florida House of Representatives from 2009 - 2012. [Andres Malave – LinkedIn, Accessed [8/15/16](#)]

**In 2009 Andres Malave Served As A Regional Director For The Republican National Committee.** According to LinkedIn, Andres Malave served as a regional director for the Republican National Committee. [Andres Malave – LinkedIn, Accessed [8/15/16](#)]

**Between 2008 - 2009 Andres Malave Served As A Field Coordinator For The Republican Party Of Florida.** According to LinkedIn, Andres Malave served as a field coordinator for the Republican party of Florida. [Andres Malave – LinkedIn, Accessed [8/15/16](#)]

## **Grassroots Leadership Training**

**An AFPP’s Grassroots Leadership Academy Training Was Scheduled To Feature Tim Phillips And P.J. O’Rourke.** According to a tweet by AFP Foundation’s Grassroots Leadership Academy, “Join @AFPP\_FL! @GLATraining is coming to Orlando on 10/28 & so are @PJORourke & @TimPhillipsAFP! Sign up now!” [Grassroots Leadership Academy – Twitter, [9/28/15](#)]

## **AFP HAD A “PERVASIVE PRESENCE” AT THE 2012 REPUBLICAN NATIONAL CONVENTION IN TAMPA**

**“Through Huddles With Donors, Discreet Meetings With Fellow Operatives And The Occasional Public Event,” AFP And Other Groups “Maintained A Subtle But Pervasive Presence In Tampa” During The RNC.** According to the Orlando Sentinel, “His meetings this week are just one example of how operatives of top-tier conservative groups are capitalizing on the convention revelry to quietly lay the groundwork for the final months of the campaign. Barred from direct coordination with political campaigns, super PACs and GOP-aligned nonprofit groups have no official role in the proceedings. But through huddles with donors, discreet meetings with fellow operatives and the occasional public event, the groups have maintained a subtle but pervasive presence in Tampa. On Tuesday, strategists from Crossroads, the U.S. Chamber of Commerce and Americans for Prosperity -- three groups that have employed their abundant war chests to become the center of gravity in this election -- gathered at a hotel blocks from the convention site to share political intelligence.” [Orlando Sentinel, 8/30/12]

**AFP, Crossroads, And The U.S. Chamber Of Commerce Met During The Convention “To Share Political Intelligence” And “Quietly Lay The Groundwork For The Final Months” Of The 2012 Presidential Campaign.** According to the Orlando Sentinel, “His meetings this week are just one example of how operatives of top-tier conservative



groups are capitalizing on the convention revelry to quietly lay the groundwork for the final months of the campaign. Barred from direct coordination with political campaigns, super PACs and GOP-aligned nonprofit groups have no official role in the proceedings. But through huddles with donors, discreet meetings with fellow operatives and the occasional public event, the groups have maintained a subtle but pervasive presence in Tampa. On Tuesday, strategists from Crossroads, the U.S. Chamber of Commerce and Americans for Prosperity -- three groups that have employed their abundant war chests to become the center of gravity in this election -- gathered at a hotel blocks from the convention site to share political intelligence.” [Orlando Sentinel, 8/30/12]

**David Koch And Sheldon Adelson Were In Tampa During The Convention; Adelson Attended A Meeting With AFP, Crossroads, And The U.S. Chamber Of Commerce.** According to the Orlando Sentinel, “Among the mega-donors in Tampa are Las Vegas casino magnate Sheldon Adelson and energy executive David Koch. Together, they have committed tens of millions to Republican causes this election season. Adelson participated in the Tuesday confab between Crossroads, the Chamber and Americans for Prosperity, according to a source with knowledge of the meeting. The discussion, which was first reported by the Huffington Post, consisted of sharing polling data and focus group results.” [Orlando Sentinel, 8/30/12]

**David Koch And Art Pope Attended A Celebration Of Their Work – “A Salute To Entrepreneurs.”** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “A Salute to Entrepreneurs: One of the most anticipated hobnob gatherings of the week, this celebration of billionaire industrialist David Koch, one of the founding benefactors of Americans for Prosperity, and Art Pope, AFP’s chairman, will be at 4 p.m. at CAMLS, 124 S Franklin St., in Tampa. Go to [tampareception.eventbrite.com](http://tampareception.eventbrite.com) for invite.” [Tampa Bay Times, 8/30/12]

**David Koch Argued That “The U.S. Debt Service Could Become Unaffordable” At An AFP Event In Tampa.** According to the Tampa Tribune, “Grass-roots movements must spread the message about U.S. fiscal problems and solutions, Kansas billionaire and conservative activist David Koch told an audience of 350 people at an Americans For Prosperity rally Thursday. Koch spoke briefly and quietly during the session at the University of South Florida’s CAMLS building in downtown Tampa before turning the podium over to a handful of speakers with similar, louder messages. Koch eschewed direct criticism of President Obama in measured remarks that stuck to his premise: Government spending has spiraled out of control, which could put the nation in jeopardy. ‘The U.S. debt service could become unaffordable,’ Koch said, urging Americans For Prosperity members to continue their lobbying and informational efforts for conservative fiscal causes.” [Tampa Tribune, 8/31/12]

**The AFP Event Was Attended By “Elected Officials From Maryland To Arizona.”** According to the Tampa Tribune, “Thursday’s Americans For Prosperity gathering drew people from across the country, including elected officials from Maryland to Arizona.” [Tampa Tribune, 8/31/12]

## **AFP’S AGENDA WORKED AGAINST FLORIDIANS INTERESTS**

### **AFP Worked To Limit Floridians’ Access To Solar Energy**

**AFP Backed Consumers For Smart Solar, An Anti-Solar Coalition.** According to an Environment America press release, “The anti-solar coalition Consumers for Smart Solar, backed by AFP, Duke Energy, and others, has now put forward a competing ballot measure in Florida to undermine the rooftop solar amendment and is spreading misinformation about both measures.” [Environment America, [1/8/15](http://www.environmentamerica.org/2012/08/15/1/8/15)]

### **AFP Backed Ryan’s 2012 & 2013 Budgets That Would “Essentially End Medicare”**

**2011: AFP Backed FY 2012 Ryan Budget, Which Replaced Medicare With A Premium Support Plan.** According to AFP’s congressional scorecard for the 112th Congress, AFP took a “yes” position the House vote on House Budget Committee Chairman Paul Ryan’s (R-WI) proposed budget resolution covering fiscal years 2012 to 2021 which included a proposal to replace Medicare with a premium support plan. According to the Congressional Research Service, “Under the new system, Medicare would pay a portion of the beneficiaries’ premiums, i.e., provide ‘premium support.’ The payments would be adjusted for age, health status, and income and would be paid directly by the government to the insurance plan selected by the Medicare beneficiary. In addition, plans with healthier enrollees, would be required to help subsidize plans with less healthy enrollees.” The vote was 2011 House vote 277. [AFP Scorecard for the 112th Congress, [2/1/13](http://www.afp.org/2012/02/13/2/1/13); CRS Report #R41767, [4/13/11](http://www.crs.org/2012/04/13/4/13/11)]

## **2012: AFP Backed FY 2013 Ryan Budget, Which Proposed Raising The Medicare Eligibility Age To 67 By 2034.**

According to AFP's congressional scorecard for the 112th Congress, AFP took a "yes" position on the House vote on House Budget Committee Chairman Paul Ryan's (R-WI) proposed budget resolution covering fiscal years 2013 to 2022 which included a proposal to increase the Medicare eligibility age to 67 by 2034. According to the Congressional Research Service, "The budget proposal would gradually increase the Medicare eligibility age to 67. Beginning in 2023, the age of eligibility for Medicare would increase by two months each year until it reached 67 in 2034." The vote was 2012 House vote 151. [AFP Scorecard for the 112th Congress, [2/1/13](#); CRS Report #R42441, [3/29/12](#)]

## **AFP Celebrated Keeping Floridians From Accessing Health Care**

**AFP President Tim Phillips: "Medicaid Expansion In Florida Was Just Decided. Our Side Won A Crucial Victory—They Did Not Expand Medicaid There."** According to an interview AFP President Tim Phillips gave on Fox News' Power Play with Chris Stirewalt, "STIREWALT: Now across the network, across this organization, we're talking about a number approaching \$1 billion American dollars. Now, there was a time in politics when spending \$1 billion would have been really astronomical, but that would still be like a sixth of the total spend for the 2016 cycle coming through. Your group and other groups as part of this network. That is a tremendous amount of money. Can it be raised and can it be spent and can it be spent fruitfully? PHILLIPS: It is a large amount of money to raise and it is a challenge to raise that, absolutely, so we're working hard to do that. It is important to note that a lot of that money is for issue battles happening right now. Medicaid expansion in Florida was just decided. Our side won a crucial victory—they did not expand Medicaid there." [Fox News – *Power Play with Chris Stirewalt*, [6/15/15](#)]

## **AFP Wants To Privatize And Voucherize Education In Florida**

**Tampa Bay Times: Americans For Prosperity Threw "Considerable Weight" Behind Expanding Florida's "Controversial" School Voucher Program.** According to the Tampa Bay Times, "Nearly 200 schoolchildren greeted Senate President Don Gaetz last month when he visited a Catholic school in Pensacola to get a firsthand look at the impact of Florida's controversial school voucher program. [...] More powerful political forces are at work in Tallahassee. Those forces include the Florida Chamber of Commerce, Americans for Prosperity and influential think tanks like the conservative James Madison Institute and former Gov. Jeb Bush's Foundation for Florida's Future. All have thrown their considerable weight behind the expansion." [Tampa Bay Times, [3/5/16](#)]

## **LIBRE Initiative**

### **LIBRE WAS CITED AS A TEXTBOOK EXAMPLE OF ASTROTURFING ALMOST ENTIRELY FUNDED BY THE KOCH BROTHERS**

**Center For Media And Democracy: The LIBRE Initiative Was "A Textbook Example Of Astroturfing Almost Entirely Funded By The Koch Brothers' Secret Bank Freedom Partners."** According to the Center for Media and Democracy's PR Watch, "Described as a "grassroots organization," the LIBRE Initiative is, in fact, a textbook example of astroturfing almost entirely funded by the Koch brothers' secret bank Freedom Partners. The increased funding is part of a wider strategy to boost the network's front groups, which was unveiled at the biannual donors summit at the Ritz Carlton in the Palm Springs desert on January 25." [Center for Media and Democracy PR Watch, [2/10/15](#)]

**The LIBRE Initiative Received At Least \$9.3 Million From Freedom Partners.** According to its Form 990 filings with the IRS, Freedom Partners Chamber of Commerce gave \$3,112,000 in grant money to the Libre Initiative Trust for the 2011 calendar year from November 2011 through October 2012, \$3,300,000 from November 2012 through October 2013 and \$2,900,000 in the last two months of 2013. [2011 Form 990, CitizenAudit, [10/3/13](#); 2012 Form 990, CitizenAudit, [9/23/14](#); 2013 Form 990, CitizenAudit, [11/21/14](#)]

### **THE LIBRE INITIATIVE HAD ITS LARGEST OPERATION IN FLORIDA**

#### **As Of August 2016, LIBRE Had Nearly 30 Employees And At Least 5 Field Directors In Florida**

**Garza: The LIBRE Initiative Was Formed In June 2011 And “Started Off In Florida And Nevada.”** According to the American Bridge transcript a WNYC interview of LIBRE Initiative executive director Daniel Garza on The Takeaway with host John Hockenberry, “According to the American Bridge transcript a WNYC interview of LIBRE Initiative executive director Daniel Garza on The Takeaway with host John Hockenberry, “[HOCKENBERRY:] You are an organization that came into existence when? [GARZA:] About June of 2011, that’s how long we’ve been around. Started off in Florida and Nevada.” [WNYC, [3/23/16](#)]

### **LIBRE Had Its Biggest Operation In Florida, With Two Full-Time Teams In Orlando And South Florida.**

According to BuzzFeed, “LIBRE has its biggest operation in Florida, with two full-time teams in Orlando and South Florida, made up of 12 staff members. The groups hold one or two events in Orlando and four a week in South Florida. The high volume of events allowing them to beat the drum on issues that matter to them in friendly confines. A recent panel conversation on school choice, for example, featured experts from around Florida — and all of them supported school choice.” [BuzzFeed, [3/12/15](#)]

**According To The New York Times, The LIBRE Initiative Had Nearly 30 Employees In Florida As Of August 2016.** According to The New York Times, “Libre has nearly 30 employees in Florida and has begun appearing regularly with booths at expos held in Florida and in Puerto Rico for new arrivals and those leaving the island — offering would-be migrants help finding jobs or registering their children for school, and hoping to establish them, in the long term, as conservatives.” [New York Times, [8/11/16](#)]

**As Of April 2016, LIBRE Had Five Field Directors In Florida.** According to a research paper by Harvard University PhD candidate Angie Bautista-Chavez and graduate student Sarah James, “Libre also employs three Coalitions Coordinators (Eastern Region, Florida, and Texas) and sixteen Field Directors. The Field Directors are located in Arizona (2), Colorado (1), Florida (5), National (1), Nevada (2), Texas (3), Ohio (1), Virginia (1).” [Angie Bautista-Chavez & Sarah James, [April 2016](#)]

### **LIBRE Had At Least 2 Field Offices In Florida Located In Orlando And Miami**

**The LIBRE Initiative Had A Field Office In Orlando.** According to an event posted by The LIBRE Initiative – Florida on Facebook, “The LIBRE Initiative Orlando Office Grand Opening! Saturday, May 14 at 11:00 AM - 2:00 PM in EDT[.] 5732 S. Semoran Blvd Orlando, FL 32822[.]” [The LIBRE Initiative - Florida – Facebook, Accessed [8/22/16](#)]

**The LIBRE Initiative Had A Field Office In Miami.** According to an event posted by The LIBRE Initiative – Florida on Facebook, “The LIBRE Initiative Grand Opening Ribbon Cutting, Miami office. [...] The LIBRE Initiative Florida, invites you to join us for the Grand Opening Ribbon Cutting of our new Miami office. Food, Drinks & Entertainment. 10121 SW 40ST[.] Miami, FL. 33165.” [The LIBRE Initiative - Florida – Facebook, Accessed [8/22/16](#)]

### **LIBRE-Florida Leadership**

*LIBRE-Florida State Director Cesar Grajales*

**The LIBRE Initiative’s Florida State Director Was Cesar Grajales.** According to Foreign Policy, “César Grajales is the Florida state director for the libertarian Hispanic outreach group Libre Initiative, funded by the conservative billionaire brothers Charles and David Koch. He was born in Colombia, and his family came legally to Miami 15 years ago as political asylees.” [Foreign Policy, [3/14/16](#)]

**Cesar Grajales Previously Served As A Writer For Fox News Latino.** According to the LIBRE Initiative, “His unwavering commitment to the preservation of economic freedom in the United States led him to join LIBRE’s cause from its beginning; first as a volunteer, then as a writer for Fox News Latino on political and economic issues, later as Field Representative and as a Field Director in LIBRE’s office in South Florida and currently as Florida State Director. Grajales has successfully promoted de principles of economic freedom amongst the growing Hispanic community in Florida.” [LIBRE Initiative, Accessed [8/22/16](#)]

*LIBRE-Florida Deputy State Director David Velazquez*

**David Velazquez Was The Deputy Florida State Director At The LIBRE Initiative.** According to the LIBRE Initiative, “David Velazquez is the Deputy Florida State Director at The Libre Initiative.” [LIBRE Initiative, Accessed [8/22/16](#)]

**David Velazquez Founded Life Hope Church In Orlando In 2008 Where Continued To Serve As Pastor.** According to the LIBRE Initiative, “In 2008, David founded Life Hope Church in Orlando, where he continues to serve as Lead Pastor. In the fall of 2012, he worked with The LIBRE Initiative as the Orlando Field Coordinator conducting grassroots efforts and later joined the organization as the North Florida Field Director in October 2013. David lives in Orlando, FL with his wife and two children.” [LIBRE Initiative, Accessed [8/22/16](#)]

## **LIBRE WORKED IN FLORIDA TO ESTABLISH ASSIMILATING LATINOS AS “LONG TERM CONSERVATIVES”**

**According To The New York Times, The LIBRE Initiative Offered To Help Puerto Ricans Who Move To Florida Register Their Children For School And Find Jobs In An Effort To Establish Them As Long Term Conservatives.** According to The New York Times, “Libre has nearly 30 employees in Florida and has begun appearing regularly with booths at expos held in Florida and in Puerto Rico for new arrivals and those leaving the island — offering would-be migrants help finding jobs or registering their children for school, and hoping to establish them, in the long term, as conservatives.” [New York Times, [8/11/16](#)]

- **Garza: On Central Florida Latinos, “Many People Have No Political Affiliation, And We Want To Drive The Conversation As Far As Priorities.”** According to Fox News, “‘There’s an interesting dynamic happening in Central Florida, with the Puerto Rican community that’s different from the rest of the state,’ Garza said. ‘Many people have no political affiliation, and we want to drive the conversation as far as priorities. People who are already there – who have been there for the past 10, 15 years – are barely beginning to develop politically. They remain very much at a crossroads.’” [Fox News, [9/29/15](#)]

**LIBRE Initiative Deputy Director David Velazquez Said LIBRE Began Contacting Puerto Ricans In Central Florida In 2012.** According to Politico, “[LIBRE Initiative Deputy Director David] Velazquez said LIBRE, which now has office in nine states, began knocking on doors in the Puerto Rican communities of Central Florida in 2012. The goal is to introduce Puerto Ricans to conservative values and viewpoints so they hopefully adopt them, Velazquez said.” [Politico, [3/14/16](#)]

## **LIBRE Used Local Pastors To “Penetrate” Communities And Access “Assimilating” Latinos**

**LIBRE Often Used Trusted Members Of A Community To Make Inroads, Such As Local Pastor David Velasquez Of Central Florida.** According to Fox News, “Libre often turns to trusted members of a community to make inroads. In Central Florida, which has seen soaring growth in the Latino population – much of it from Puerto Rico – Libre counts among its ground troops David Velasquez, a local pastor. Velasquez has a broad range of contacts in the Latino community, Garza noted, that cut across socioeconomic lines. There are people who arrive with very little from their native homelands – and some end up homeless – and others who come with Rolex watches and advanced college degrees.” [Fox News, [9/29/15](#)]

- **Garza: David Velasquez “Works In Different Dimensions, That’s What You Have To Do” To “Penetrate A Community.”** According to Fox News, “‘He [David Velasquez] deals a lot with the faith community, and he’s plugged in with colleges, businesses and other groups,’ Garza said. ‘He works in different dimensions, that’s what you have to do’ to penetrate a community.” [Fox News, [9/29/15](#)]
- **Fox News: “It’s Especially Key,” Garza Said, “To Get Latinos While They’re Still Assimilating.”** According to Fox News, “‘It’s especially key, Garza said, to get to Latinos while they’re still assimilating. ‘A lot of folks do not have an ideological foundation,’ he said. ‘It’s important that the conversation begin with them, not only to get them engaged here but inform them about what would create a better society.’ And that includes, Libre tells them, school choice, immigration reform – although LIBRE opposes presidential executive action to achieve it – and a smaller government role in people’s lives. Libre does not support the Affordable Care Act, arguing that makes access to healthcare harder for Latinos.’” [Fox News, [9/29/15](#)]



## **LIBRE Held A “High Volume Of Events” In Florida To “Beat The Drum” On Their Issues And Access Voters**

**“The High Volume Of Events” LIBRE Holds In Florida Allows Them To “Beat The Drum” On Their Issues, Like A “Conversation” On School Choice, Which Featured Experts Who Only Supported School Choice.** According to BuzzFeed, “LIBRE has its biggest operation in Florida, with two full-time teams in Orlando and South Florida, made up of 12 staff members. The groups hold one or two events in Orlando and four a week in South Florida. The high volume of events allowing them to beat the drum on issues that matter to them in friendly confines. A recent panel conversation on school choice, for example, featured experts from around Florida — and all of them supported school choice.” [Buzzfeed, [3/12/15](#)]

**New York Times: The LIBRE Initiative Offered Free Flu Shots And Free Turkeys To A “Largely Hispanic And Mostly Poor” Crowd At The Alpha Omega Megachurch In Miami.** According to the New York Times, “Volunteers for the Libre Initiative distributed free turkeys during an event at the Alpha Omega church in Miami. [...] MIAMI — The crowd that lined up around a megachurch here last week — largely Hispanic and mostly poor — came for the Saturday services, but also for the free flu shots that were being offered in the church, and for the Thanksgiving turkeys being given away just outside. [...] The approach — a free Thanksgiving turkey in exchange for some personal information — captures the mission of Libre, a multimillion-dollar effort financed by the conservative billionaire Kochs and devoted to winning over Hispanics, with the message that economic freedom and smaller-government principles will yield opportunity and prosperity.” [New York Times, [11/25/15](#)]

- **NYT: “Volunteers, Holding Clipboards And Speaking Mainly In Spanish, Collected The Names, Telephone Numbers And Email Addresses Of Everyone Who Showed Up.”** According to the New York Times, “Volunteers, holding clipboards and speaking mainly in Spanish, collected the names, telephone numbers and email addresses of everyone who showed up.” [New York Times, [11/25/15](#)]
- **NYT: LIBRE Volunteers Asked Those Who Received Turkeys Which Party They Are More Likely To Vote For In 2016, And Whether They Think Federal Spending Should Be Increased Or Decreased.** According to the New York Times, “But before they received their turkeys, those in line were asked to answer a few questions: Were they more likely to vote for a Republican or a Democrat in the 2016 presidential election? And did they feel that the government should increase or decrease federal spending in order to improve the economy?” [New York Times, [11/25/15](#)]

## **LIBRE HAD SUCCESS ATTACKING DEMOCRATIC POLITICIANS IN FLORIDA AND IS PREPARED TO CONTINUE THIS EFFORT IN 2016**

### **LIBRE’s Paid Ads “Helped Remove” House Democrat Joe Garcia In 2014**

**LIBRE’s 2014 Campaign Ads “Helped Remove” Democratic Representative Joe Garcia In Florida.** According to CNN, “Libre operated relatively quietly until last year’s mid-term election, when the group’s advocacy arm—called the Libre Initiative—ran paid political ads in English and Spanish in close races around the country. Libre’s campaign helped remove Pete Gallego in Texas, Joe Garcia in Florida and Ron Barber in Arizona—all Democrats.” [CNN, [5/29/15](#)]

**LIBRE Initiative Executive Director Daniel Garza: Latino Voters Would Be Decisive In 50/50 States Like Florida, North Carolina, Virginia, Ohio, Colorado, Nevada, And New Mexico.** According to Opportunity Lives, “‘It has to do with sheer numbers of Latinos who are now eligible to vote,’ [LIBRE Initiative executive director Daniel] Garza explained. Those voters, he said, will be decisive in ‘50/50’ states where Republicans and Democrats will fight hardest for electoral votes next year. ‘For example, Florida. You have this huge percentage of Latino voters. In North Carolina, it’s only 3 percent, but, when it’s a 50/50 state, every vote counts,’ he said. The same is true in Virginia, Ohio, Colorado, Nevada, and New Mexico, which have large or growing Latino populations.” [Opportunity Lives, [11/12/15](#)]

**Garza: Florida, North Carolina, Virginia, Ohio, Colorado, And Nevada Would Be “Key States” To Pursue The Latino Vote For The 2016 Election.** According to an interview with LIBRE Initiative executive director Daniel Garza by Wall Street Journal editorial board member Mary Kissel on the Wall Street Journal’s Opinion Journal, “[GARZA:] Florida is gonna be critical. North Carolina is also gonna be, because of [...] the burgeoning Latino population there. Virginia, Ohio, Colorado, and Nevada are gonna be the key states in the electoral map where there is a significant Latino population, and



they're 50-50 states. And so, if you can control the narrative and drive the conversation, you know, showcase your guy and undermine the other guy, you're gonna do very well, and Latinos will reward you if you connect and you relate with them." [Wall Street Journal, [8/27/15](#), via Nasdaq]

**LIBRE Initiative South Florida Field Director Carlos Pereira Said It Was Important To Become A U.S. Citizen During An Election Year.** According to the American Bridge translation of a EENTU News interview of LIBRE Initiative South Florida field director Carlos Pereira, LIBRE Initiative regional press secretary Soledad Cedro, Florida National University president Dr. Maria Cristina Regueiro, "We are providing this service, called 'Become a Citizen.' [...] I invite everyone to come. This is an election year. It's very important for you all to be citizens in this country. Come! We invite you to come to Florida National University from 10AM to 4PM. Become a citizen with the LIBRE Initiative." [EENTU News, [2/19/16](#)]

## **LIBRE'S AGENDA WAS BAD FOR FLORIDA'S LATINO COMMUNITY**

### **LIBRE Opposed Expanding Medicaid & Medicare Coverage**

**Executive Director Of The LIBRE Initiative Daniel Garza: "Expanding Medicaid Could Ultimately Reduce The Quality Of Healthcare For People In Need In States Like Florida, Where A Large Portion Of The Population Is Hispanic."** According to a press release from the LIBRE Initiative, "Daniel Garza, Executive Director of The LIBRE Initiative, released the following statement: [...] 'Expanding Medicaid could ultimately reduce *[sic]* the quality of Healthcare for people in need in states like Florida, where a large portion of the population is Hispanic. It's time for the administration to reassess its approach to ensure that the well-being and prosperity of every American is the top goal.'" [LIBRE Initiative Press Release, [5/7/15](#)]

**Garza: The Obama Administration Needed To Stop Trying To Coerce States To Expand Medicaid And "Measuring Success By Growing The Number Of People Dependent On Government."** According to a press release from the LIBRE Initiative, "Daniel Garza, Executive Director of The LIBRE Initiative, released the following statement: 'This administration needs to stop measuring success by growing the number of people dependent on government. Coercing states to expand Medicaid, an inefficient and unsustainable program with poor health outcomes, disregards state priorities and prevents them from exploring better and less costly ways to ensure quality healthcare for low-income families. Pushing more Americans into Medicaid puts taxpayers on the hook and appears to be causing a surge in costly emergency room visits nationwide, which ultimately threatens care for the neediest among us.'" [LIBRE Initiative Press Release, [5/6/15](#)]

### **LIBRE Worked To Privatize And Voucherize Education in Florida**

**Wall Street Journal: "In Florida And Texas, LIBRE Has Rallied Latinos Around Promoting Charter Schools."** According to the Wall Street Journal, "In Florida and Texas, Libre has rallied Latinos around promoting charter schools." [Wall Street Journal, [11/25/15](#)]

**LIBRE-Florida Worked "To Bring School Vouchers, Tax-Credit Scholarship Programs, Personal Tax Credits And Deductions, Open Enrollment, Home Schooling, Charter Schools, Magnet Schools, Virtual Schools/Online Schooling, And Blending Learning" To The State.** According to LIBRE-Florida, "Primarily, we look to bring School Vouchers, Tax-Credit Scholarship Programs, Personal Tax Credits and Deductions, Open Enrollment, Home Schooling, Charter Schools, Magnet Schools, Virtual Schools/Online Schooling, and Blending Learning to our state as a growing list of educational options. Now, that's choice! We, the parents, the people, the taxpayers, need to take back our schools, and one of the most foundational ways is to empower *[sic]* ourselves with the right to choose the school of our choice for our children and those future students that will follow." [LIBRE, [6/4/13](#)]

### **LIBRE Opposed The Normalization Of Relations With Cuba**

**LIBRE Executive Director Daniel Garza On Re-Opening Relations With Cuba: "There Cannot Be A Normalization Of Relations With A Regime That Has No Regard For Human Rights."** According to a press release from the LIBRE Initiative, "Daniel Garza, Executive Director for The LIBRE Initiative, released the following statement: 'For decades, refugees have been forced to risk their lives to leave Cuba because of political repression, and dissidents on the island continue to live under fear of retaliation for exercising their freedom of speech. Instead of considering democratic reforms and

individual rights, the dictatorship in Cuba has systematically imprisoned, tortured, and killed its enemies. That is still the reality today. There cannot be a normalization of relations with a regime that has no regard for human rights.” [LIBRE Initiative, [12/17/14](#)]

## Concerned Veterans For America

### CONCERNED VETERANS FOR AMERICA WAS CREATED BY THE KOCH BROTHERS

**Concerned Veterans For America CEO Pete Hegseth Told Attendees Of A Koch Organized Summit That “Concerned Veterans For America Is An Organization This Network Literally Created.”** According to a speech Pete Hegseth gave at a Koch brothers’ summit, “Concerned Veterans for America is an organization this network literally created.” [Pete Hegseth Speech – Koch Brothers’ Summit via YouTube, [6/16/14](#)]

- **Hegseth: “I Thank Charles And David” For Making CVA Possible.** According to a speech Pete Hegseth gave at a Koch brothers’ summit, “I thank Charles and David [...] everyone that puts in the sweat equity that makes this possible.” [Pete Hegseth Speech – Koch Brothers’ Summit via YouTube, [6/16/14](#)]

**Concerned Veterans For America Stated Its Mission Was “To Advocate For Policies That Will Preserve The Freedom And Prosperity That We And Our Families So Proudly Fought And Sacrificed To Defend.”** According to the Concerned Veterans for America’s website, “Simply put, CVA’s mission is to advocate for policies that will preserve the freedom and prosperity that we and our families so proudly fought and sacrificed to defend. The goal of Concerned Veterans for America is to translate the experience, concerns and hopes unique to veterans and their families into a common vision of freedom. We apply this unique perspective to speak out on issues that threaten to cripple not only our economic and national security, but the spirit of opportunity and liberty that all Americans cherish.” [Concerned Veterans for America, Accessed [8/11/16](#)]

### CVA-FLORIDA LEADERSHIP AND OPERATIVES

#### CVA Had At Least 15 Staffers In Florida

**Concerned Veterans For America Had 15 Florida Staffers.** According to Politico, “Concerned Veterans for America, which courts veterans with fiscally conservative messaging, has 15 Florida staffers, while the LIBRE Initiative, which appeals to Latino voters, has nine. Generation Opportunity, a young voter outreach group, has three.” [Politico, [12/30/15](#)]

*CVA-Florida State Director Diego Echeverri*

**CVA Named “Entrepreneur And Public Policy Pro” Diego Echeverri As Its Florida State Director.** According to Saint Peters Blog, “A national veterans group, Concerned Veterans for America, appointed entrepreneur and public policy pro Diego Echeverri as its new Florida State director.” [Saint Peters Blog, [5/11/15](#)]

**Echeverri Previously Served As Coalitions Coordinator For The Romney Campaign, Special Assistant To The Governor Of Florida, And Aide To The Chief Financial Officer Of Florida.** According to Saint Peters Blog, “After leaving the Army, [Diego] Echeverri served as special assistant to the governor of Florida, director of political and economic affairs at the Consulate General of Israel, and as an aide to the chief financial officer of Florida.” [Saint Peters Blog, [5/11/15](#)]

### CVA FOCUSED ON FLORIDA IN THEIR 2016 ELECTION EFFORTS

#### CVA Announced They Would Focus Their Efforts On Florida With Their “Target The Debt” Campaign

**Concerned Veterans For America Launched A “Target The Debt” Campaign Targeting “Four States With Crucial Senate Races This Fall.”** According to Time, “A veterans’ group with ties to the conservative Koch brothers is set to launch on Thursday a national anti-debt campaign, starting in four states with crucial Senate races this fall. Concerned Veterans for

America's "Target the Debt" push aims to raise the public's awareness of the country's spending and its potential threat to the United States' long-term national security. The group will highlight the \$19 trillion in red ink the government is carrying, and urge Americans to reject policies that would grow it." [Time, [4/28/16](#)]

- **Concerned Veterans For America Looked To Focus Their Efforts On Ohio, Pennsylvania, Florida, And Nevada.** According to Time, "The group is organized under the tax code's non-profit rules, which means it can accept unlimited cash without having to disclose its donors. The rules, however, insist that electoral politics cannot be its major focus. To help get around that, this campaign will not explicitly encourage viewers to cast ballots a certain way. But the messages will have a clear eye on the balance of power in the Senate. Just look at the states where the first push will take place: Ohio, where Republican Sen. Rob Portman faces a tough re-election; Pennsylvania, where Republican Sen. Pat Toomey also faces rough odds; Florida, where Republican Sen. Marco Rubio is not seeking a second term; and Nevada, where Democratic Leader Harry Reid is retiring. [Time, [4/28/16](#)]
- **Concerned Veterans For America "Refused To Discuss" The Total Budget For Their "Target The Debt" Campaign.** According to Time, "A veterans' group with ties to the conservative Koch brothers is set to launch on Thursday a national anti-debt campaign, starting in four states with crucial Senate races this fall. Concerned Veterans for America's 'Target the Debt' push aims to raise the public's awareness of the country's spending and its potential threat to the United States' long-term national security. [...] Aides refused to discuss the total budget for this campaign." [Time, [4/28/16](#)]

### **CVA Organized Multiple Florida Town Hall And Tour Events**

**CVA Held A Rally On July 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2015 In Jacksonville, Florida.** According to an article from Jacksonville.com, "The power of numbers was on display as hundreds of local veterans and their families showed up at Maverick's music club at the Jacksonville Landing on Thursday night for a rally of the Concerned Veterans for America's Defend Freedom Tour." [Jacksonville.com, [7/30/15](#)]

**Concerned Veterans For America Hosted A Defend Freedom Tour Event In Orlando, Florida On February 26<sup>th</sup> 2016.** According to Concerned Veterans for America, they will host a Defend Freedom Tour event in Orlando, Florida on Friday, February 26 from 6:00pm to 9:00pm. [Concerned Veterans for America, Accessed [1/25/16](#)]

**Concerned Veterans For America Hosted A Defend Freedom Tour Event In West Palm Beach, Florida On Saturday, February 27<sup>th</sup>, 2016.** According to Concerned Veterans for America, they will host a Defend Freedom Tour event in The Villages, Florida on Saturday, February 27 from 6:00pm to 9:00pm. [Concerned Veterans for America, Accessed [1/25/16](#)]

**Concerned Veterans For America Announced A March 2016 VA Town Hall In Winter Park Florida Featuring CVA's Vice President Of Political And Legislative Action Dan Caldwell, CVA Communications Director Peter Gaytan, And CVA Florida State Director Diego Echeverri.** According to a Concerned Veterans for America press release, "Concerned Veterans for America (CVA) will host 'Our VA: An Awareness Town Hall' Thursday, March 17, from 7:00 p.m. to 8:30 p.m. at the Woman's Club of Winter Park in Winter Park, Fla. Dan Caldwell, CVA's vice president of political and legislative action, CVA Communications Director Peter Gaytan, and CVA Florida State Director Diego Echeverri will join local veterans to talk about the recently released wait list investigation report which found that officials at the Orlando and Daytona Beach VA facilities manipulated wait lists and delayed veterans' access to care. Veterans will be invited to share their experiences dealing with the department, and engage in a discussion about the need for true reform and accountability at the VA and what they can do to get involved." [Concerned Veterans for America, [3/10/16](#)]

**Concerned Veterans For America Announced That They Would Host A Veterans And Military Town Hall With Congressman Ron DeSantis In Tampa, Florida On May 20<sup>th</sup>, 2016.** According to a Concerned Veterans for America press release, "Concerned Veterans for America (CVA) is coming to Tampa for a 'Veterans and Military Town Hall' with Congressman Ron DeSantis Friday, May 20, from 7:00 p.m. to 8:00 p.m. at The Cuban Club of Tampa (2010 N Avenida Republica de Cuba). The event is part of CVA's 'Defend and Reform' Policy Series." [Concerned Veterans for America, [5/9/16](#)]

### **CVA Teamed Up With AFP For Florida Fundraising Events Going Into The 2016 Cycle**

**CVA “Has Been Fundraising Aggressively: Hegseth Has Teamed Up With AFP’s Phillips This Year At Several Intimate Donor Meetings” In Florida.** According to the Huffington Post, “To do all that, the Vets group has been fundraising aggressively: Hegseth has teamed up with AFP’s Phillips this year at several intimate donor meetings held in Florida and other states, according to conservatives familiar with the gatherings. Hegseth also gave a talk explaining his group’s goals to donors and operatives at the network retreat this January.” [Huffington Post, [6/14/15](#)]

## **CVA’S AGENDA WORKS AGAINST FLORIDA’S VETERANS**

### **CVA Pushed To Privatize The VA**

**CNN: CVA Promoted Privatizing The VA.** According to CNN, “Discussing the need for reforms improving access to care at the Department of Veterans Affairs, Sanders said that a group funded by the Koch brothers is promoting the privatization of the agency. An organization called Concerned Veterans for America is sanctioned by the influential conservative siblings, Sanders said. [...] Sanders is correct in describing the group’s Koch lineage and its intent. Our verdict is true.” [CNN, [2/5/16](#)]

**CVA Recommended Converting The Current “VHA Integrated Health Care System” Into A Government-Chartered Non-Profit Corporation.** According to a press release from Concerned Veterans for America, “The Veterans Independence Act would make four key reforms to the delivery of veterans health care: 1. Separate the VHA’s payor and provider functions and convert the current VHA integrated health care system into a government-chartered [sic] nonprofit corporation.” [Concerned Veterans For America Press Release, [2/26/15](#)]

## **Generation Opportunity**

### **GENERATION OPPORTUNITY IS THE KOCH BROTHERS’ YOUTH OUTREACH OPERATION**

**The Atlantic: Generation Opportunity Was “Part Of The Billionaire Koch Brothers-Funded Empire Of Independent Groups Seeking To Influence Public Policy In A More Free-Market Direction.”** According to The Atlantic, “Both Generation Opportunity and Americans for Prosperity are part of the billionaire Koch brothers-funded empire of independent groups seeking to influence public policy in a more free-market direction.” [The Atlantic, [9/19/13](#)]

- **Generation Opportunity Raised “Almost 86 Percent Of Its Funds From Just Two Koch-Linked Nonprofits.”** According to the Center for Responsive Politics, “In the three years for which tax information is available, Generation Opportunity has raised almost 86 percent of its funds from just two Koch-linked nonprofits.” [OpenSecrets.org, [5/13/14](#)]
- **GenOpp Branded Itself As A “Nonprofit Organization Committed To Helping Young People Improve Their Lives.”** According to the Wayback Machine’s archive of the Generation Opportunity website, “Generation Opportunity is a nonprofit organization committed to helping young people improve their lives.” [GenerationOpportunity.org, archived [5/28/15](#)]

### **GEN-OPP FLORIDA LEADERSHIP**

**GenOpp Had A Staff Of Three In Florida.** According to Politico, “In Florida, for example, the Koch network’s core groups employ 77 full-time staffers, including AFP’s field staff of 50. Concerned Veterans for America, which courts veterans with fiscally conservative messaging, has 15 Florida staffers, while the LIBRE Initiative, which appeals to Latino voters, has nine. Generation Opportunity, a young voter outreach group, has three.” [Politico, [12/30/15](#)]

*GenOpp-Florida State Director Andrew Vila*

**Andrew Vila Was The Florida State Director For Generation Opportunity.** According to GenOpp, “Andrew Vila is the Florida State Director for Generation Opportunity.” [GenOpp, Accessed [8/12/16](#)]





**Jeb Morris Has Served As Generation Opportunity's Florida Deputy State Director Since January 2016.** According to LinkedIn, Jeb Morris has served as Generation Opportunity's Florida Deputy State Director since January 2016. [Jeb Morris LinkedIn, Accessed [8/17/16](#)]

**Jeb Morris Previously Served As Americans For Prosperity's Senior Field Director.** According to LinkedIn, Jeb Morris served as Americans for Prosperity's senior field director from March 2015 – January 2016. [Jeb Morris LinkedIn, Accessed [8/17/16](#)]

**Jeb Morris Previously Served As Americans For Prosperity's Field Director Of North East Florida.** According to LinkedIn, Jeb Morris served as Americans for Prosperity's field director of North East Florida from February 2014 – March 2015. [Jeb Morris LinkedIn, Accessed [8/17/16](#)]

### **AFP Partnered With GenOpp To Train Their Volunteers**

**AFPF's Grassroots Leadership Academy Partnered With GenOpp Institute And Campus Leaders In Florida.** According to a tweet by Americans for Prosperity Foundation's Grassroots Leadership Academy network partner project manager Heather Browning, "Having a great time in Tampa today w/ @GenOppInstitute! Awesome group of campus leaders! #GLATraining #LearnToLead[.]" [Heather Browning – Twitter, [6/6/16](#)]

**AFPF Was Training Generation Opportunity-Florida's Volunteers.** According to a tweet by Generation Opportunity-Florida, "Our volunteers in Tampa are getting ready to #Activate in the #Liberty Movement in today's GLA training! #grassroots[.]" [Generation Opportunity-Florida – Twitter, [6/4/16](#)]

## **GENOPP'S AGENDA WAS BAD FOR FLORIDIANS**

### **GenOpp Worked To End Social Security**

**Generation Opportunity Policy Director David Barnes: Millennials Need To Face The Fact That "Social Security Is An Unsustainable Relic Of A Bygone Era" That Can't Be Sustained Or Expanded.** According to an op-ed by Generation Opportunity policy director David Barnes for the Gazette, "This is a full-blown crisis. Doing nothing, per Republicans, is irresponsible. Vowing to expand the program, per Democrats, is delusional. Millennials have the most at stake in this debate. We have to face the fact that Social Security is an unsustainable relic of a bygone era that threatens to take us down with it." [David Barnes – Gazette, [8/4/16](#)]

**Generation Opportunity Began A Petition Campaign Against Social Security.** According to a Generation Opportunity petition, "Fix Social Security! Our generation deserves a brighter future. We want a path forward. Sign This Petition[.]" [GenOpp Petition, Accessed [8/16/16](#)]

## **ALEC And The State Policy Network**

### **THE KOCH BROTHERS HAVE A "DECADES-LONG CONNECTIONS" WITH ALEC**

**Center for Public Integrity: "The Koch Brothers Have Decades-Long Connections With ALEC," Which Gave Them An Award In 1994.** According to The Center for Public Integrity, "The Koch brothers have decades-long connections with ALEC, which gave the brothers the Adam Smith Free Enterprise Award in 1994." [The Center for Public Integrity, [1/31/2013](#)]

**Koch Industries Has Donated "An Untold Amount" To ALEC And Chaired ALEC's Corporate Board.** According to the Center for Media and Democracy, "Research from CMD and GreenPeace documents that the Koch foundations have given ALEC at least \$600,000 in the past decade or so, and Koch Industries has donated an untold amount. The Kochs also bailed out ALEC with a loan of nearly half a million dollars in the late 1990s. Koch Industries has also chaired ALEC's

corporate board and has had a seat on its board for over a decade. Plus, another subsidy unaccounted for by ALEC is the money corporations like Koch have spent on having the head of its lobbying arm involved in ALEC's leadership as well as whatever amount of time the company spends crafting ALEC 'model' legislation." [Center for Media and Democracy, [7/13/11](#)]

### **ALEC Has Received At Least \$1.5 Million From The Koch Network Since 1993**

**Between 1993 And 2014, Koch Connected Groups Gave Over \$1.5 Million To The American Legislative Exchange Council (ALEC).** According to Conservative Transparency, between 1993 and 2014, Koch connected groups gave at least \$1,573,898 to the American Legislative Exchange Council. This information is further detailed in the following table:

<b>Year</b>	<b>Donor</b>	<b>Recipient</b>	<b>Contribution</b>
2014	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$150,000
2014	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$130,640
2014	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$11,000
2014	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$70,000
2014	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$18,000
2014	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$25,000
2014	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$20,000
2014	DonorsTrust	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$300
2014	DonorsTrust	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$1,000
2014	DonorsTrust	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$5,000
2013	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$2,500
2013	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$40,000
2013	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$65,000
2012	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$71,100
2012	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$25,000
2012	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$17,500
2012	Claude R. Lambe Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$150,000
2011	Claude R. Lambe Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$150,000
2011	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$20,000
2010	Claude R. Lambe Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$100,000
2010	DonorsTrust	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$25,000
2009	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$75,858
2009	Donors Capital Fund	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$8,000
2002	Claude R. Lambe Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$30,000
2001	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$75,000
2000	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$85,000
1999	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$13,000
1998	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$70,000
1997	Claude R. Lambe Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$30,000
1997	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$30,000
1993	Claude R. Lambe Charitable Foundation	American Legislative Exchange Council	\$60,000
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$1,573,898</b>

[Conservative Transparency, Accessed [8/26/16](#)]

## **ALEC LAUNCHED THE MADISON GROUP IN 1986, WHICH WAS RENAMED TO THE STATE POLICY NETWORK IN 1992**

**State Policy Network “Originated In 1986 As The Madison Group” Before Changing Its Name In 1992.** According to State Policy Network’s website, “State Policy Network originated in 1986 as the Madison Group, an informal confederation of the state think tanks and their supporters named after the Madison Hotel in Washington, DC, where they first met. In 1992, SPN was established as an independent 501(c)(3) educational organization providing services to its members - the state-focused, free market think tanks and their national think tank partners. At that time, the goal was to encourage cooperation and collaboration among the fledgling state think tank movement, maintaining a basic schedule of meetings and providing advisory services as needed during its first five years of operations. The state policy research community rapidly grew and matured during the 1990s, SPN's Board of Directors realized the need for a stronger organization that would provide additional services. After extensive discussions, the existing Board took a bold and historic step in September 1998, dissolving itself and appointing a transitional Board to fulfill the broader role envisioned for the organization.” [SPN.org, Viewed [1/30/14](#)]

**The State Policy Network Was Previously Known As The Madison Group, Was Launched In 1986 By ALEC And Housed In The Chicago-Based Heartland Institute.** According to the National Committee for Responsible Philanthropy: “The think tanks are loosely affiliated through the Madison Group, launched by the American Legislative Exchange Council or ALEC (see story, pf 20) and housed in the Chicago-based Heartland Institute. Founded in 1986, the Madison Group acts as a communication link among its 79 members, which include not only state think tanks, but also conservative legal foundations and national groups like ALEC, Heritage Foundation and the National Rifle Association.” [National Committee for Responsible Philanthropy, Special Report: Burgeoning Conservative Think Tanks, [Spring 1991](#)]

## **ALEC AND SPN WERE SISTER ORGANIZATIONS THAT COORDINATED EXTENSIVELY BEHIND CLOSED DOORS DESPITE CLAIMS OF INDEPENDENCE**

**The Guardian: State Policy Network Was A “Sister Organization” of ALEC.** According to The Guardian: “One of its former executives was Ted Cruz, now US senator for Texas, who today is the keynote speaker at the national conference in Washington of SPN's sister organisation, the American Legislative Exchange Council (Alec).” [Guardian, [12/5/13](#)]

**SPN’s President Insisted The Think Tanks Were “Fiercely Independent” But Evidence Indicates That They Coordinate Extensively.** According to the New Yorker, “According to a new investigative report by the Center for Media and Democracy, a liberal watchdog group, however, the think tanks are less free actors than a coordinated collection of corporate front groups—branch stores, so to speak—funded and steered by cash from undisclosed conservative and corporate players. Although the think tanks have largely operated under the radar, the cumulative enterprise is impressively large, according to the report. In 2011, the network funneled seventy-nine million dollars into promoting conservative policies at the state level. Tracie Sharp, the president of the S.P.N., promptly dismissed the report as ‘baseless allegations.’ She told Politico, ‘There is no governing organization dictating what free market think tanks research or how they educate the public about good public policy.’ But notes provided to *The New Yorker* on what was said during the S.P.N.’s recent twenty-first-annual meeting raise doubts about Sharp’s insistence that each of the think tanks is, as she told me, ‘fiercely independent.’ The notes show that, behind closed doors, meeting with some eight hundred people from the affiliated state think tanks, Sharp compared the organization’s model to that of the giant global chain IKEA.” [New Yorker, [11/15/13](#)]

**State Policy Network Members’ Combined 2011 Fundraising Was Over \$83 Million And Included “Major” Koch Money.** According to the Huffington Post, “In 2011, the State Policy Network and its affiliates reported raising a combined \$83.2 million, according to the Center for Media and Democracy. While donors to the groups are not required to be disclosed, a 2010 document opened a window on some of them. They included the Donors Trust and the Donors Capital Fund, both secretive right-wing funding instruments, as well as Altria, AT&T, Comcast, GlaxoSmithKline, Kraft Foods, Microsoft, Reynolds American and Time Warner Cable. Multiple documents reviewed in the report also show that the Koch brothers, known for their extensive funding of conservative activist causes, are major funders of the State Policy Network and its affiliates through their linked foundations and Koch Industries. Many other wealthy conservatives have likewise pumped money into the network, including the DeVos family of Amway, the Coors brewing family, the Waltons of Walmart, and wealthy businessman (and North Carolina budget director) Art Pope.” [Huffington Post, [11/14/13](#)]

**State Policy Network Was An ALEC Member And Its Think Tanks Submitted Model Legislation For Approval At ALEC.** According to the Huffington Post, “The State Policy Network and many of its most active affiliates are members of ALEC, the secretive organization that brings corporations, conservative activists and state legislators together to write model state legislation. The network has also routinely sponsored ALEC's annual meetings. [...] The think tanks in the State Policy Network also write model legislation and introduce it at private ALEC meetings to be vetted and approved for broader dissemination to statehouses, according to the [Center for Media and Democracy] report.” [Huffington Post, [11/14/13](#)]

## **THE JAMES MADISON INSTITUTE HAD DEEP TIES TO THE MADISON GROUP AND STATE POLICY NETWORK**

**Orlando Weekly's Edward Ericson: “The Madison Institute Is Not A Non-Partisan, Non-Political Idea Mill, But A Sophisticated Mouthpiece For Five Of The State's Largest Businesses.”** According to an opinion by Edward Ericson Jr. for the Orlando Weekly, “But a look at the Madison Institute's funding sources, matched with the ideas promulgated in its research papers, and finally the bills proffered and laws passed by the Legislature, reveal a compelling pattern. In short, the Madison Institute is not a non-partisan, non-political idea mill, but a sophisticated mouthpiece for five of the state's largest businesses, including Florida's largest land owner. The institute is also part of a national network of right-wing public policy centers pushing legislation in every state. None of which should be particularly shocking, but for this: It's illegal.” [Edward Ericson Jr. – Orlando Weekly, [4/27/98](#)]

**Ericson: “The Institute Is Also Part Of A National Network Of Right-Wing Public Policy Centers Pushing Legislation In Every State.”** According to an opinion by Edward Ericson Jr. for the Orlando Weekly, “But a look at the Madison Institute's funding sources, matched with the ideas promulgated in its research papers, and finally the bills proffered and laws passed by the Legislature, reveal a compelling pattern. In short, the Madison Institute is not a non-partisan, non-political idea mill, but a sophisticated mouthpiece for five of the state's largest businesses, including Florida's largest land owner. The institute is also part of a national network of right-wing public policy centers pushing legislation in every state. None of which should be particularly shocking, but for this: It's illegal.” [Edward Ericson Jr. – Orlando Weekly, [4/27/98](#)]

**Ericson: Members Of The James Madison Institute's Board Had “Parallel Interests In Such Timeless Principles In Reduced Taxes On The Rich, Privatization Of Government Services And Weaker Land Regulation.”** According to an opinion by Edward Ericson Jr. for the Orlando Weekly, “Even while funding the institute, some donors lend executives to its board of directors. In 1995 that board included Hoyt Robinson Barnett, vice president of Publix Supermarkets; the late A.D. Davis, of the Winn-Dixie chain; and Jacob C. Belin, the former chairman and still a director of St. Joe. As representatives of some of Florida's most powerful businesses, these men have parallel interests in such timeless principles as reduced taxes on the rich, privatization of government services and weaker land regulation.” [Edward Ericson Jr. – Orlando Weekly, [4/27/98](#)]

- **Ericson: “As If By Some ‘Mystical Process,’ The Madison Institute's Advice Pushes Primarily For Those Things.”** According to an opinion by Edward Ericson Jr. in the Orlando Weekly, “As if by some ‘mystical process,’ the Madison Institute's advice pushes primarily for those things. But instead of Jacob Belin telling legislators what he wants, Randall G. Holcombe does it for him. Holcombe is chairman of the Madison Institute's Research Advisory Council and an economics professor at Florida State University. He is an ‘expert’ whose opinion on matters like taxation, presumed to be the result of pure scholarly inquiry, carries more weight than that of a mere rich guy. In effect, the think tanks allow some of Florida's, and America's, wealthiest special interests to cloak their policies in the garb of scientific reason, common sense and populism. And they get a tax write-off for doing it.” [Edward Ericson Jr. – Orlando Weekly, [4/27/98](#)]

**Ericson: Think Tanks Like JMI “Allow Some Of Florida's... Wealthiest Special Interests To Cloak Their Policies In The Garb Of Scientific Reason, Common Sense And Populism. And They Get A Tax Write-Off For Doing It.”**

According to an opinion by Edward Ericson Jr. in the Orlando Weekly, “As if by some ‘mystical process,’ the Madison Institute's advice pushes primarily for those things. But instead of Jacob Belin telling legislators what he wants, Randall G. Holcombe does it for him. Holcombe is chairman of the Madison Institute's Research Advisory Council and an economics professor at Florida State University. He is an ‘expert’ whose opinion on matters like taxation, presumed to be the result of pure scholarly inquiry, carries more weight than that of a mere rich guy. In effect, the think tanks allow some of Florida's, and America's, wealthiest special interests to cloak their policies in the garb of scientific reason, common sense and populism. And they get a tax write-off for doing it.” [Edward Ericson Jr. – Orlando Weekly, [4/27/98](#)]

## KOCH CONNECTED GROUPS DONATED OVER \$1.58 MILLION TO THE JAMES MADISON INSTITUTE

**Between 2005 And 2014, Koch Connected Groups Gave The James Madison Institute Over \$1.58 Million.** According to Conservative Transparency, between 2005 and 2014 Koch connected groups gave The James Madison Institute at least \$1,588,721. This information is further detailed in the following table:

Year	Donor	Recipient	Contribution
2014	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	James Madison Institute	\$40,000
2014	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$3,500
2014	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$25,000
2014	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$10,000
2014	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$1,000
2013	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$2,500
2013	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$25,000
2012	DonorsTrust	James Madison Institute	\$5,000
2012	DonorsTrust	James Madison Institute	\$1,000
2012	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	James Madison Institute	\$25,000
2012	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$37,500
2012	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$15,000
2012	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$20,000
2012	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$68,500
2012	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$37,500
2012	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$75,000
2012	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$50,000
2011	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	James Madison Institute	\$20,000
2011	DonorsTrust	James Madison Institute	\$12,742
2011	DonorsTrust	James Madison Institute	\$1,000
2011	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$10,000
2011	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$50,000
2011	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$30,000
2011	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$30,000
2011	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$30,000
2011	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$30,000
2010	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	James Madison Institute	\$7,500
2010	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$182,000
2010	DonorsTrust	James Madison Institute	\$1,000
2010	DonorsTrust	James Madison Institute	\$500
2009	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	James Madison Institute	\$9,667
2009	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$158,000
2008	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	James Madison Institute	\$39,462
2008	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$136,500
2008	DonorsTrust	James Madison Institute	\$500
2007	Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation	James Madison Institute	\$6,850
2007	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$135,000



2007	DonorsTrust	James Madison Institute	\$6,000
2006	DonorsTrust	James Madison Institute	\$500
2006	Cato Institute	James Madison Institute	\$100,000
2005	Donors Capital Fund	James Madison Institute	\$150,000
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$1,588,721</b>

[Conservative Transparency, Accessed [8/26/16](#)]

## JMI LEADERSHIP

### James Madison Institute's Research Advisory Board Was Deeply Interconnected With The Koch Network

*James M. Taylor – Heartland Institute*

**James M. Taylor, Senior Fellow Of Environmental Policy At The Heartland Institute, Served On The Research Advisory Council Of The James Madison Institute.** According to the James Madison Institute, James M. Taylor, J.D., Senior fellow of Environmental Policy, Heartland Institute was a member of JMI's Research Advisory Council. [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/2/15](#)]

*Bradley Hobbs – Institute For Humane Studies, Koch Associate Program*

**Bradley Hobbs, Professor Of Free Enterprise At Florida Gulf Coast University, Served On The Research Advisory Council Of The James Madison Institute.** According to the James Madison Institute, Dr. Bradley K. Hobbes, Professor of Free Enterprise, Florida Gulf Coast University, was a member of JMI's Research Advisory Council. [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/2/15](#)]

- **Hobbs “Has Written For The Foundation For Economic Education,” Written And Taught For “The Institute For Humane Studies, And Taught For The Koch Associate Program.** According to the James Madison Institute, “Bradley K. Hobbs is the BB&T Distinguished Professor of Free Enterprise at Florida Gulf Coast University. Professor Hobbs earned his undergraduate degree in history and his Ph.D. in economics from Florida State University (1991). His interests are wide in range encompassing economic history, the moral and philosophical foundations of free markets, property rights, economic freedom, and teaching methodologies. He has published in Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice, The Journal of Accounting and Finance Research, Journal of Real Estate Research, Laissez-Faire, Journal of Executive Education, Financial Practice and Education, and Research in Finance, among others. He has also has written for the Foundation for Economic Education, the Institute for Humane Studies and the Florida Council on Economic Education. Professor Hobbs has been active in leading undergraduate research and was recently recruited as the founding Faculty Advisor for a new undergraduate research journal, the Journal of Liberty and Society. He has been a member of the National Teaching Faculty for the Foundation for Teaching Economics since 2001, taught for the Institute for Humane Studies, The Koch Associate Program and is active in The Liberty Fund having participated in programs as a participant, Discussion Leader, and Director. He also serves on the Executive Board of the Association for Private Enterprise.” [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/20/15](#)]

*Barry Poulson – Americans For Prosperity*

**Barry Poulson Was “Associated With Americans For Prosperity” And Was “A Research Fellow Of The James Madison Institute.”** According to an opinion by economist Barry Poulson in the Tallahassee Democrat, “Economist Barry W. Poulson is a research fellow of the James Madison Institute, a nonpartisan policy center based in Tallahassee. He also is on the Colorado Commission on Taxation and is associated with Americans for Prosperity. Contact him at [poulson@colorado.edu](mailto:poulson@colorado.edu)” [Barry Poulson – Tallahassee Democrat, 3/6/08]

- **Poulson Was “An Advisor To The Task Force On Tax And Fiscal Policy Of The American Legislative Exchange Council” And Was An Expert With The Heartland Institute.** According to Barry Poulson's Expert Biography at the Heartland Institute, “He [Barry Poulson] is an Advisor to the Task Force on Tax and Fiscal Policy of the American Legislative Exchange Council and serves as a consultant on fiscal policy and fiscal constitutions to a number of state and national think tanks.” [Heartland Institute, [3/2/15](#)]

**Linda Raeder, Associate Professor Of Political Science At Palm Beach Atlantic University, Served On The Research Advisory Council Of The James Madison Institute.** According to the James Madison Institute, Dr. Linda Raeder, Associate Professor of Political Science, Palm Beach Atlantic University, was a member of JMI's Research Advisory Council. [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/2/15](#)]

- **Raeder Was Awarded “A Lambe Fellowship By The Institute For Humane Studies.”** According to the James Madison Institute, “As a conference participant in the United States and Germany, she has presented papers such as ‘Civil Society and the Renewal of American Culture,’ ‘The Nature of Civil Society,’ ‘The Psychological Presidency,’ ‘Liberalism and the Common Good’ and ‘The Rule of Law.’ She has been awarded numerous academic fellowships, including a Lambe Fellowship by the Institute for Humane Studies, a Weaver Fellowship by the Intercollegiate Studies Institute, an Earhart Foundation Fellowship, an Albright Fellowship by the University of Richmond and a Governor's Fellowship by the University of Virginia. She also serves as a peer reviewer for scholarly journals in her field.” [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/2/15](#)]

**Dino Falaschetti, Director Of Operations, Mercatus Center At George Mason University, Served On The Research Advisory Council Of The James Madison Institute.** According to the James Madison Institute, Dr. Dino Falaschetti, Director of Operations, Mercatus Center at George Mason University, was a member of JMI's Research Advisory Council. [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/2/15](#)]

**Keith Leslie, Development Associate At JMI, Was A Charles Koch Summer Fellow.** According to a biography from the James Madison Institute, “Keith Leslie is a Development Associate of The James Madison Institute. He graduated from Florida State University in 2012 with his B.S. in Economics, and is currently pursuing his Master's in Applied Economics. He is also a participant of the 2013 Charles Koch Summer Fellow Program, serving as a State-Based Fellow. Prior to joining the JMI staff, Keith participated in the Institute's internship program for two semesters. During his internship, Keith's writings were featured in newspapers in Tallahassee and Sarasota.” [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/4/15](#)]

**Randal O'Toole Wrote “Great Rail Disasters” Attacking Rail Transit For The James Madison Institute / Foundation For Florida's Future In 2004.** [Randal O'Toole- James Madison Institute / Foundation for Florida's Future, [2/17/04](#)]

- **Streetsblog USA: “The Kochs...Have Plenty Of Ties To Widely Quoted, Transit-Bashing Pundits Like Randall O'Toole, Wendell Cox, And Stanley Kurtz.”** According to Streetsblog USA, “The Kochs also have plenty of ties to widely quoted, transit-bashing pundits like Randall O'Toole, Wendell Cox, and Stanley Kurtz — people employed by organizations that receive Koch funding, like the Cato Institute and the Reason Foundation, and who spout the same talking points against walkability and smart growth.” [Streetsblog USA, [9/25/14](#)]
- **Streets Blog: “Cato Dispatches O'Toole To Political Squabbles Involving Rail Transit Around The Country, From Indianapolis To Honolulu.”** According to Streets Blog, “[Randal] O'Toole works for the Cato Institute, founded and funded by the Koch brothers. Cato dispatches O'Toole to political squabbles involving rail transit around the country, from Indianapolis to Honolulu. He's so rabidly anti-rail that after Hurricane Sandy, he suggested New York City should replace its subway system with a network of underground buses.” [Streets Blog, [2/26/15](#)]
- **Streets Blog: O'Toole Is “So Rabidly Anti-Rail That After Hurricane Sandy, He Suggested New York City Should Replace Its Subway System With A Network Of Underground Buses.”** According to Streets Blog, “[Randal] O'Toole works for the Cato Institute, founded and funded by the Koch brothers. Cato dispatches O'Toole to political squabbles involving rail transit around the country, from Indianapolis to Honolulu. He's so rabidly anti-rail that after

Hurricane Sandy, he suggested New York City should replace its subway system with a network of underground buses.” [Streets Blog, [2/26/15](#)]

*James Gwartney – Cato Institute*

**James Gwartney, Professor Of Economics At Florida State University Served On The Research Advisory Council Of The James Madison Institute.** According to the James Madison Institute, Dr. James Gwartney, Professor of Economics, Florida State University, was a member of JMI’s Research Advisory Council. [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/2/15](#)]

**JMI’s Longest Serving Staff Member, Susan Christian: “Dr. Marshall And James Gwartney Really Put Together The Skeleton Of JMI.”** According to JMI’s 2013 Annual Report, “With 17 years at The James Madison Institute, Susan Christian was the longest serving staff member, other than Dr. J. Stanley Marshall, who has been with the Institute since he founded it in 1987. Christian recognizes the effective roles of the many presidents and scholars she served under at JMI. “Dr. Marshall and James Gwartney really put together the skeleton of JMI,” said Christian. ‘And Dr. John Cooper put meat on the bones.’” [JMI Annual Report, [4/12/13](#)]

**Gwartney Was An Adjunct Scholar At Cato.** According to a bio on the Cato Institute website, “James D. Gwartney is professor of economics and policy sciences at Florida State University. He is an expert on such economic issues as taxation, labor policy, and the economic analysis of government. He is coauthor of What Everyone Should Know about Economics and Prosperity, Economics: Public and Private Choice, and Economic Freedom of the World.” [Cato Institute, Accessed [3/4/15](#)]

- **Gwartney Has Been A Primary Co-Author Of The Cato Institute’s And The Fraser Institute’s Economic Freedom Of The World Annual Report From 2001 Through 2014.** According to the Cato Institute’s Economic Freedom of the World page, “Potentially advantageous exchanges do not always occur. Their realization is dependent on the presence of sound money, rule of law, and security of property rights, among other factors. Economic Freedom of the World seeks to measure the consistency of the institutions and policies of various countries with voluntary exchange and the other dimensions of economic freedom. The report is copublished by the Cato Institute, the Fraser Institute in Canada and more than 70 think tanks around the world.” Gwartney is listed as the primary co-author in each year between 2001 and 2014. [Cato.org, Accessed [3/5/14](#)]
- **2009 Annual Report’s Acknowledgements: “Thanks Also Go To The Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation And The Searle Freedom Trust For Their Support.”** According to the Economic Freedom of the World 2009 Annual Report, “Thanks also go to the Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation and the Searle Freedom Trust for their support. Very special thanks go to Joshua Hall of Beloit College for his valuable assistance again with this year’s data revisions and updates. He would like to thank the Social Philosophy and Policy Center at Bowling Green State University for the support of its Visiting Scholar program during the summer of 2009. We are pleased to have Josh involved with the project.” [Economic Freedom of The World: 2009 Annual Report, [2009](#)]
- **The Koch-Funded “Fraser Institute” Is A Right-Wing Canadian Think-Tank.** According to the Guardian, “The case studies cited from ‘expert bodies’ include a Fraser Institute report entitled ‘Opportunities for First Nations Prosperity Through Oil and Gas Development.’ The right-wing think tank has been heavily funded by the American Koch brothers, who are one of the largest owners, purchasers and refiners of the Alberta tar sands.” [Guardian, [3/3/15](#)]
- **Gwartney Was The 2004 Recipient Of The Adam Smith Award From APEE “For His Contribution To The Advancement Of Free Market Ideals.”** According to the Florida State University Department of Economics Website, “In 2004 he [James Gwartney] was the recipient of the Adam Smith Award of the Association of Private Enterprise Education for his contribution to the advancement of free market ideals. He is the current President of the Southern Economic Association.” [Florida State University Department of Economics, Accessed [3/4/15](#)]

**Koch Industries’ Discovery Newsletter: “Do You Like The Idea Of Reducing Poverty And Improving Our World... If You Do” Read James Gwartney’s Book Common Sense Economics.** According to a Koch Industries Discovery Newsletter from January 2008, “Common Sense Economics: What everyone should know about wealth and prosperity by James Gwartney, Richard Stroup and Dwight Lee. Do you like the idea of reducing poverty and improving our world (two ideas that seem near and dear to most presidential candidates)? If you do, then Nobel Prizewinning economist Vernon Smith

has a suggestion: read this book. The authors, notes Smith, provide a simple and straightforward explanation of how economic freedom benefits us all.” [Koch Industries’ Discovery Newsletter, [January 2008](#)]

*Lora Holcombe – Koch-Created Association Of Private Enterprise Education*

**FSU Faculty Lora Holcombe Is “A Member Of The Association Of Private Enterprise Education (APEE), An Organization Created By Koch Family Foundations.”** According to the Gainesville Scene, “Lora Holcombe teaches ‘introduction to principles of macroeconomics,’” which is a required course for all business and economics majors. Holcombe is a member of the Association of Private Enterprise Education (APEE), an organization created by Koch Family Foundations.” [Gainesville Scene, [1/9/15](#)]

- **The Required Textbook For Holcombe’s Class Was Written By James Gwartney Of APEE And Cato, Richard Stroup, Of Cato And The Institute For Energy Research, And Russell Sobel, Of APEE And Cato.** According to the Gainesville Scene, “The required textbook for her introductory class, ‘Macroeconomics: Private and Public Choice,’ was written by authors with Koch ties. Among these authors is: James Gwartney, the president, vice president and executive board member of APEE and adjunct scholar at the Cato Institute, which was founded by Charles Koch; Richard Stroup, a fellow at the Cato Institute and the director of the Koch-founded Institute for Energy Research; Russell Sobel, executive board member of the Association of Private Enterprise Education and affiliate of the Cato Institute.” [Gainesville Scene, [1/9/15](#)]

**James Madison Institute Chairman And Former Board Member Of Citizens For A Sound Economy Said He Was Recruited To “Boost House Speaker Marco Rubio’s Crusade For Swapping Property Tax Bills With Higher Sales Taxes”**

**JMI Chairman Charlie Hilton Claimed He Was “Recruited” To “Boost House Speaker Marco Rubio’s Crusade For Swapping Property Tax Bills With Higher Sales Taxes.”** According to The News-Press, “Republican political campaign manager Brett Doster, under a newly minted electioneering organization organized those political-action groups and more like them, Floridians for Property Tax Reform. The source of money for that ‘grass-roots’ activity won’t be public record until financial reports are filed in mid-July. Anecdotally, some of the support has come from groups such as the Latin Builders Association. One of Doster’s co-chairs is Panhandle entrepreneur Charlie Hilton, founder of the conservative James Madison Institute, a longtime advocate of capping government growth. He said Doster recruited him to boost House Speaker Marco Rubio’s crusade for swapping property tax bills with higher sales taxes instead.” [News-Press, 5/29/07]

- **Hilton Said He Met With Rubio “Several Times” To Talk About The Tax Reform.** According to The News-Press, “‘That was something inspired by the Speaker and some leaders in the House who wanted some support,’ said [JMI Chairman Charlie] Hilton, who said he has met several times with Rubio to talk about the tax reform.” [News-Press, 5/29/07]
- **JMI Sent “Their Own Lobbyists To Tallahassee” And “Turned Out Members To Fill Chairs At Property Tax Hearings Across The State.”** According to The News-Press, “‘The James Madison Institute, FreedomWorks, and the Republican Liberty Caucus all have sent their own lobbyists to Tallahassee as well as turned out members to fill chairs at property tax hearings across the state.” [News-Press, 5/29/07]

**Charles Hilton Was A Board Member of Citizens for a Sound Economy.** [Citizens for a Sound Economy, [11/15/03](#)]

**Gov. Jeb Bush Met With JMI’s Founder About Property Rights Reform Around The Time State Rep. Marco Rubio’s House Select Committee Considered Taking Up Property Rights Legislation.** According to The News-Press, “A House committee run by Rep. Marco Rubio is considering amending Florida’s definitions of words such as ‘blighted’ and ‘slum’ to make it tougher to condemn private property. Such a move would go a long way to appease private property rights activists unsettled by this summer’s U.S. Supreme Court ruling that expanded government’s ability to condemn property for redevelopment. But it concerns planners who say the power is an important tool to address specific needs. The high court ruled the city of New London, Conn., could lawfully seize private property from residents who refused to sell and turn it over to private developers. Rubio’s Select Committee to Protect Private Property Rights meets Wednesday. Among its members are Reps. Jeff Kottkamp, R-Cape Coral; and Ralph Poppell, R-Vero Beach. Gov. Jeb Bush said Monday he will allow Rubio to take the lead. ‘I trust his judgment on this,’ Bush said. ‘He’s a really bright lawyer that I think will make some good



recommendations.’ Bush met Monday with Stan Marshall, founder of the James Madison Institute. The Tallahassee-based conservative think tank has made property rights a major focus since the June court ruling, and will gather its own experts later in the week to come up with recommendations for ‘safeguarding private property rights in Florida.’” [News-Press, 9/13/05]

- **Bush Allowed Rubio To “Take The Lead” On The Property Rights Reform Initiative And Said He “Trusted His Judgment.”** According to The News-Press, “Rubio's Select Committee to Protect Private Property Rights meets Wednesday. Among its members are Reps. Jeff Kottkamp, R-Cape Coral; and Ralph Poppell, R-Vero Beach. Gov. Jeb Bush said Monday he will allow Rubio to take the lead. ‘I trust his judgment on this,’ Bush said. ‘He's a really bright lawyer that I think will make some good recommendations.’” [News-Press, 9/13/05]

### **Koch Network Donor George W. Gibbs III Was A Board Member Of The James Madison Institute**

**Gibbs Was A Board Member Of The James Madison Institute.** According to a biography published by the James Madison Institute, George W. Gibbs III served on the Board of the James Madison Institute. [James Madison Institute, viewed [10/14/14](#)]

**George W. Gibbs III Contributed \$150,000 To Freedom Partners Action Fund.** According to an FEC filing from Freedom Partners Action Fund, George W. Gibbs, III contributed \$150,000 on July 2, 2014. [Freedom Partners Action Fund FEC Filing via FEC.gov, Accessed [2/27/15](#)]

**Gibbs Supports Several Koch-Connected Groups Including The Institute For Humane Studies, The Mercatus Center, And The Cato Institute.** According to a biography published by the James Madison Institute, “Over the years, George has supported several organizations that uphold his belief that the free market system must be maintained and that the government that ‘governs least governs best’. These organizations include Institute of Humane Studies, Mercatus, American Enterprise Institute, CATO and The James Madison Institute (where he is also a board member). In 2006, Atlantic Marine was sold to a private equity group which has allowed George time to become more involved in philanthropy. In 2008 George started the Gibbs Family Foundation which supports organizations that work toward free markets, smaller government and personal freedoms.” [James Madison Institute, viewed [10/14/14](#)]

**Gibbs Attended The February 2014 Koch Brothers Summit, Where He Was Scheduled To Meet With Chase Koch, Charles Koch’s Son.** According to Mother Jones, “Attendees of these summits are warned that the seminars, where the Kochs and their allies hatch strategies for electing Republicans and advancing conservative initiatives on the state and national levels, are strictly confidential; they are cautioned to keep a close eye on their meeting notes and materials. But last week, following the Kochs' first donor gathering of 2014, one attendee left behind a sensitive document at the Renaissance Esmeralda resort outside of Palm Springs, California, where the Kochs and their comrades had spent three days focused on winning the 2014 midterm elections and more. The document lists VIP donors—including John Schnatter, the founder of the Papa John's pizza chain—who were scheduled for one-on-one meetings with representatives of the political, corporate, and philanthropic wings of Kochworld. [...] Charles Koch's 36-year-old son, Chase, the president of Koch Fertilizer, was also scheduled to take part in a meeting with a donor named George Gibbs.” [Mother Jones, [02/05/14](#)]

### ***National Labor Relations Board Upheld Complaint That Gibbs III Directed Or Participated In Assaults Against Union Organizers***

**George W. Gibbs, III Was Vice President Of Gibbs Corporation.** According to the National Labor Relations Board’s decision in Gibbs Corp, 709 (Case 12-CA-001153), “During the afternoon of August 10, as the day shift ceased work, three organizers for the Union stationed themselves on Flagler Avenue outside the gate in order to distribute handbills. [...] While these organizers were distributing handbills to employees who were on foot or in automobiles, a group of persons came out of the shipyard. Within the group were George W. Gibbs III, vice president of Gibbs Corporation and manager of Southern; Rex Dorman, vice president of Gibbs Corporation and director of industrial relations for both Respondents; and supervisors named Deneen, Hartley, and Ingle. One or more of those persons told the organizers that the latter were on private property and directed them to get off. Polston went to a telephone and called a policeman who soon arrived. The events of the afternoon ended without violence although vulgar remarks were exchanged.” [NLRB Case 12-CA-001153 November 18, 1960, viewed 10/16/14]

**National Labor Relations Board Upheld Complaint That Gibbs III “Directed ... Assaults Or Otherwise Participated In Them” Against Men Passing Out Union Fliers.** According to the National Labor Relations Board’s decision in Gibbs



Corp, 709 (Case 12-CA-001153), “The Board has reviewed the rulings of the Trial Examiner made at the hearing and finds that no prejudicial error was committed. The rulings are hereby affirmed. The Board has considered the Intermediate Report, the exceptions and brief, and the entire record in the cases, and hereby adopts the findings,' conclusions, and recommendations 2 of the Trial Examiner, with the additions and modifications set forth below. As indicated in the Intermediate Report, the complaint allegations involving the assaults upon the union organizers on August 10 turns crucially upon proof that Respondents' officials or supervisors directed these assaults or otherwise participated in them. In sustaining this aspect of the complaint, the Trial Examiner relied both on: (1) circumstantial evidence tending to prove that Gibbs and/or Dorman knew of the plan of attack in advance and either instigated it or encouraged its effectuation, and (2) direct and other evidence provided by credible testimony establishing that they actively participated in acts of assault.” [NLRB Case 12-CA-001153 November 18, 1960, Viewed 10/16/14]

**Gibbs “Directed” Another Man To Hit A Union Organizer After The Man Hit The Organizer “With A Metal Object Attached To His Fist, Gibbs Also Did So With His Open Hand Or Arm.”** According to the National Labor Relations Board’s decision in Gibbs Corp, 709 (Case 12-CA-001153), “Gibbs and Dorman admitted being present at the assault and that they both returned to the plant that evening after telephone contact with each other because they had heard that there might be some trouble. Examination of the testimony of credited witnesses indicates that : (1) earlier that afternoon, and in Gibbs' presence, Dorman told three of the five union organizers subsequently assaulted, 'If you continue to come over here there's going to be trouble'; 3 (2) Dorman carried a blackjack that night; (3) one of the assaulted union organizers (McKinnon) was hit by a blackjack; (4) Gibbs and Dorman were in the group of about 15 men which included Wilson, the prime actor in the attack ; and (5 ) during the melee, Gibbs directed Wilson to 'get' Polston, and, after Wilson hit him with a metal object attached to his fist, Gibbs also did so with his open hand or arm.” [NLRB Case 12-CA-001153 November 18, 1960, Viewed 10/16/14]

**NLRB: “We Are Satisfied,” Of Gibbs’s “Participation In The Assaults Of August 10, 1959... This Conduct Was Directed To Discouraging Organizational Activity On Behalf Of The Union.”** According to the National Labor Relations Board’s decision in Gibbs Corp, 709 (Case 12-CA-001153), “We are satisfied, on the basis of all the foregoing evidence, of the Respondents' participation in the assaults of August 10, 1959. We are further convinced, as was the Trial Examiner, that this conduct was directed to discouraging organizational activity on behalf of the Union.<sup>4</sup> We conclude, accordingly, as did the Trial Examiner, that the Respondents thereby engaged in conduct in violation of Section 8(a)(1) of the Act.” [NLRB Case 12-CA-001153 November 18, 1960, Viewed 10/16/14]

**NLRB: “There Is No Doubt That Brutal Assaults And Batteries Occurred.”** According to the National Labor Relations Board’s decision in Gibbs Corp, 709 (Case 12-CA-001153), “The principal issue is whether, at 12:01 a.m , on August 11, 1959, at the intersection of public streets outside Southern's shipyard, when organizers for the Union were preparing to distribute handbills to workers leaving the shipyard, representatives of the Respondents led a group of individuals in assaults and batteries upon the organizers. There is no doubt that brutal assaults and batteries occurred. The question is whether the Respondents' representatives participated. The defense is that the organizers were attacked by a rival union group and that the representatives of the Respondent were present only during the latter stages of the attack and only for the purpose of stopping it.” [NLRB Case 12-CA-001153 November 18, 1960, Viewed 10/16/14]

**NLRB Documents Describe Attacks In Which One Organizer Was “Battered Severely,” Including Being Punched With Metal Knuckles, And Another Was Hit With A Blackjack.** According to the National Labor Relations Board’s decision in Gibbs Corp, 709 (Case 12-CA-001153), “George, a man of 65 years, was grabbed by someone who pinned his elbows to his sides. Someone else hit George on the hand with a blackjack and slapped his face. Meanwhile, McCarthy, a man of 45 years, 5 feet 11 inches in height and weighing 170 pounds, was battered to the ground when Bill Wilson, an employee of Gibbs Corporation who works on the day shift, rushed into McCarthy in the manner of a football player blocking another. Polston, Crawford, and McKinnon, observing events from Polston's automobile, got out and went into the street intersection. As Polston was saying that the organizers did not want trouble, Wilson, with metal knuckles on his fist, hit Polston a damaging blow to the face, knocking Polston to the ground Polston arose and someone else hit him. He tried to escape by running south on Flagler Avenue toward its intersection with Mary Street, which lies parallel with June Street about 150 feet distant. Some of the attackers followed him. When near Mary Street, Polston, a man of 44 years, 5 feet 8 inches in height, and weighing 225 pounds, decided that he could not escape. He stopped As he testified, he is 'too fat and short ... to run far.' Again Polston was battered severely.” [NLRB Case 12-CA-001153 November 18, 1960, Viewed 10/16/14]

**One Of The Organizers Was Knocked Unconscious.** According to the National Labor Relations Board’s decision in Gibbs Corp, 709 (Case 12-CA-001153), “As Crawford sought to reach Polston to get him into the auto, Wilson said to Crawford that Wilson had told 'you all not to come back over here or else there was going to be trouble.' Crawford replied

that 'we're in our rights and we'll be back,' whereupon Wilson hit him in the mouth and knocked him to the ground. As McKinnon started to pick up Crawford, McKinnon was hit with a blackjack. Crawford arose, was hit on the back of the neck with a blackjack, and lost consciousness.” [NLRB Case 12-CA-001153 November 18, 1960, Viewed 10/16/14]

**NLRB: Before Assault, Gibbs III Threatened Union Organizers.** According to the National Labor Relations Board’s decision in *Gibbs Corp*, 709 (Case 12-CA-001153), “The complaint alleges that Gibbs threatened the organizers if they should return to continue their organizational efforts, and the testimony of the General Counsel supports that allegation. On the other hand, the Respondents' testimony is to the contrary. In view of my credibility determinations below, I credit the testimony for the General Counsel C.” [NLRB Case 12-CA-001153 November 18, 1960, viewed 10/16/14]

**Gibbs’ And Other Respondents Defense: “This Entire Complaint Appears To Be Just A Typical Organizers Trick.”** According to the National Labor Relations Board’s decision in *Gibbs Corp*, 709 (Case 12-CA-001153), “In their brief, the Respondents assert: This entire Complaint appears to be just a typical organizers trick.” [NLRB Case 12-CA-001153 November 18, 1960, viewed 10/16/14]

**Court Of Appeals For Fifth Circuit Upheld NLRB’s Finding That Management Was Involved In The “Unprovoked Attack Made Upon The Union Men.”** According to *NLRB v Gibbs Corporation* 297 F.2d 649, “The Board found, with substantial supporting evidence, that there was an unprovoked attack made upon the Union men which was directed and participated in by supervisory personnel of the respondents [...] It is enough for our purpose to repeat that there is substantial evidence on the record as a whole to support the findings of fact, and this being so the Board's findings are not to be disturbed.” [US Court Of Appeals, Fifth Circuit’s Decision in *NLRB v. Gibbs Corporation*, [01/02/62](#)]

### **James Madison Institute Chairman of The Board Alan Bense**

**Allan Bense Was The Chairman Of The Board Of The James Madison Institute.** According to a biography published by the James Madison Institute, Allan Bense served as chairman of the board of the James Madison Institute. [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/2/15](#)]

- **Bense Also Served As A Board Member Of Jeb Bush’s Foundation For Florida’s Future.** According to a biography published by the James Madison Institute, Allan Bense served as a member of the Board for the Foundation for Florida’s Future. [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/2/15](#)]
- **Bense Also Served As A Member Of The Board Of Trustees Of Florida State University.** According to a biography published by the James Madison Institute, Allan Bense served on the Board of Trustees of Florida State University. [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/2/15](#)]

## **JAMES MADISON INSTITUTE’S TIES TO KOCH-FUNDED FLORIDA STATE UNIVERSITY**

### **Leadership Ties**

**JMI Senior Fellow Randall Holcombe Was A Professor Of Economics At Florida State University Since 1988.** According to Randall Holcombe’s CV via his website, “Florida State University, Tallahassee, Florida 32306 DeVoe Moore Professor of Economics, since 1996; Professor of Economics, 1988 to 1996. [...] Senior Fellow, The James Madison Institute, Tallahassee, Florida, 2004 to present, Chairman, Research Advisory Council, 1991 to 2004; Research Advisory Council Member, 1987 to 2004.” [RandallHolcombe.com, Accessed [3/4/15](#)]

**FSU Associate Teaching Professor Lora Holcombe “Worked As An Independent Contractor With The James Madison Institute, Specializing In Research On Various School Choice Issues” From 1994-1997.** According to a biography of Lora Holcombe on the FSU Department of Economics Website, “Dr. Holcombe began her teaching career at the University of Montevallo, a small liberal arts university located just south of Birmingham, AL. From Montevallo, she moved back to Auburn to teach for a few years before moving to Tallahassee to earn her Ph.D. She taught at FSU from 1988 - 1999 and then returned to teaching at FSU in the fall of 2006. From 1994-97, she worked as an independent contractor with the James Madison Institute, specializing in research on various school choice issues. Dr. Holcombe is published in various economics journals including the Journal of Institutional and Theoretical Economics, Public Finance Quarterly, and the

International Journal of Manpower. Her research interests are school choice and teaching effectiveness. She is a member of Association of Private Enterprise Education.” [FSU Department of Economics, Accessed [3/4/15](#)]

**Keith Leslie, Development Associate At JMI, Was An FSU Economics Graduate And Charles Koch Summer Fellow.** According to a biography from the James Madison Institute, “Keith Leslie is a Development Associate of The James Madison Institute. He graduated from Florida State University in 2012 with his B.S. in Economics, and is currently pursuing his Master’s in Applied Economics. He is also a participant of the 2013 Charles Koch Summer Fellow Program, serving as a State-Based Fellow. Prior to joining the JMI staff, Keith participated in the Institute’s internship program for two semesters. During his internship, Keith’s writings were featured in newspapers in Tallahassee and Sarasota.” [James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/4/15](#)]

**Andrea Castillo Was A JMI Intern And A FSU Economics Graduate.** According to an opinion by Andrea Castillo in the Gainesville Sun, “Andrea Castillo is an undergraduate majoring in economics at Florida State University. She is also an intern at The James Madison Institute, a non-partisan think tank based in Tallahassee.” [Andrea Castillo – Gainesville Sun, [5/27/11](#)]

**Jeb Bush Appointed J. Stanley Marshall, Founder Of JMI, To Be A Florida State University Trustee.** According to the Miami Herald, “Gov. Jeb Bush looked to the history of Florida State University and the University of Florida when he appointed 24 people Wednesday to serve on the schools' new boards of trustees. At UF, former President Marshall Criser will serve on the new policymaking board of the university he ran from 1984 to 1989. Cynthia O'Connell, the widow of former President Stephen O'Connell, will also serve on UF's board. Florida State's new board of trustees includes former state House of Representatives Speaker John Thrasher and J. Stanley Marshall, a former FSU president and founding chairman of the James Madison Institute, a conservative think tank. Former state university Regent Steven Uhlfelder will also serve as an FSU trustee.” [Miami Herald, 6/28/01]

### **The James Madison Institute Published Articles Defending The Koch Foundation Grant To FSU**

**JMI Development Director Francisco Gonzalez: “Private Philanthropy Under Attack At FSU.”** [Francisco Gonzalez – James Madison Institute, Accessed [3/4/15](#)]

**JMI Intern And FSU Economics Senior Andrea Castillo: Controversy Over Koch Funding Of FSU Is “Bizarre.”** According to an opinion by JMI Intern and Florida State University Economics Senior Andrea Castillo for the Gainesville Sun, “Bizarre: It's the word that I believe best describes brouhaha over the Charles G. Koch Charitable Foundation's controversial grant to Florida State University (FSU), where I'm an undergraduate majoring in economics. This controversy seems even more bizarre if you lean toward a free-market school of thought, as I do. That's the perspective from which I have viewed the publicity and unfair criticism that FSU and its Economics Department have endured in recent weeks.” [Gainesville Sun, [5/27/11](#)]

- **The Opinion Was Published On The James Madison Institute’s Website Under Headline “FSU, Koch, And A Student.”** According to the James Madison Institute website, “FSU, Koch, and a Student By Andrea Castillo, JMI Intern & Florida State University Senior Majoring in Economics Originally Printed in The Gainesville Sun as “FSU’s Bizarre Koch ‘Scandal’” on May 27, 2011.” [Andrea Castillo – James Madison Institute, [5/27/11](#)]

## **Citizens For A Sound Economy - Florida**

### **BACKGROUND**

**CSE Was Created In 1984 By David Koch And Richard Fink.** According to the New Yorker, “In 1984, David Koch and Richard Fink created yet another organization, and [President of FreedomWorks Matt] Kibbe joined them. The group, Citizens for a Sound Economy, seemed like a grassroots movement, but according to the Center for Public Integrity it was sponsored principally by the Kochs, who provided \$7.9 million between 1986 and 1993.” [New Yorker, [8/30/10](#)]

**CSE Was “Principally” Sponsored By The Kochs, Who Gave \$7.9 Million To The Group Between 1986 And 1993.**

According to the New Yorker, “The group, Citizens for a Sound Economy, seemed like a grassroots movement, but according to the Center for Public Integrity it was sponsored principally by the Kochs, who provided \$7.9 million between 1986 and 1993.” [New Yorker, [8/30/10](#)]

- **The Koch Brothers Were “Very Controlling” Of CSE.** According to the New Yorker, “Within a few years, the group had mobilized fifty paid field workers, in twenty-six states, to rally voters behind the Kochs’ agenda. David and Charles, according to one participant, were ‘very controlling, very top down. You can’t build an organization with them. They run it.’” [New Yorker, [8/30/10](#)]

**CSE Worked For Public Policy Changes That Would Result In “Lower Taxes” And “Less Government.** According to an archived page of the CSE website, “The members of CSE are fighting hard to restore America’s freedoms and the values of our Founding Fathers. We work for public policy change that will result in lower taxes, less government, and more freedom.” [CSE.org via Archive.org, [12/3/03](#)]

**CSE Was A National Grassroots Organization That Invested “Major Resources In Activist Recruitment And Education.”** According to a press release on the FreedomWorks website, “For years CSE has been building a national grassroots base for just such a moment. We have invested major resources in activist recruitment and education. Complementing our 50 paid staff in Washington, D.C., CSE now has more than 30 paid staff in key states working directly with activists in critical swing districts. Whether it is through the 39-city ‘Scrap the Code’ tour, Tax Club Forums, creating a national network of dozens of CSE clubs, attending thousands of political events and rallies, or distributing educational brochures and issue mailers, CSE has educated hundreds of thousands citizens about free-market ideas. CSE has recruited, trained, and sustained a ground force ready to fight for sound economic policy.” [FreedomWorks Press Release, [4/16/01](#)]

- **President Of FreedomWorks Matt Kibbe On CSE: “We Learned We Needed Boots On The Ground To Sell Ideas, Not Candidates.”** According to the New Yorker, “Its mission, Kibbe said, ‘was to take these heavy ideas and translate them for mass America. . . . We read the same literature Obama did about nonviolent revolutions—Saul Alinsky, Gandhi, Martin Luther King. We studied the idea of the Boston Tea Party as an example of nonviolent social change. We learned we needed boots on the ground to sell ideas, not candidates.’” [New Yorker, [8/30/10](#)]

**CSE Received “Substantial Funding” From Corporations Such As Phillip Morris, General Electric, And Johnson & Johnson.** According to the Associated Press, “The campaign to repeal the tax is being led by Citizens for a Sound Economy, a Washington, D.C.-based group that gets substantial funding from corporations such as Phillip Morris, General Electric and Johnson & Johnson. [Associated Press, 9/27/03]

- **Exxon Mobil And Koch Industries Were Among CSE’s Corporate Donors.** According to the National Journal, “A separate previously unreported Schedule B from Citizens for a Sound Economy Educational Fund lists a number of big corporate and foundation donations, but records David Koch as the largest funder. That document , from 2001, states that the David H. Koch Charitable Foundation provided the single largest contribution, \$2.35 million, while David Koch personally donated \$1 million, and Koch Industries chipped in another \$952,500, for a total of more than \$4 million. Corporate donations include \$750,000 from General Electric, \$275,250 from Exxon Mobil, \$255,000 from State Farm, \$100,000 from Philips Lighting, and \$350,036 from the law firm Wilmer, Culter, & Pickering, now known as WilmerHale.” [National Journal, [9/24/13](#)]

**CSE Worked “Closely With Big Tobacco.”** According to the New York Observer, “There’s plenty of evidence in the documents that Philip Morris and other tobacco companies have released in connection with the Minnesota lawsuit to support the view that C.S.E. works closely with Big Tobacco. The documents indicate that the industry understood in 1994 that ‘almost any organization other than a tobacco company’ had more credibility on political issues regarding health care or taxation on cigarettes.” [New York Observer, 4/10/00]

**“Clinton-Hating Billionaire” Richard Mellon Scaife Was Among CSE’s Funders.** According to the New York Observer, “Another C.S.E. funder, according to Internal Revenue Service records, is the Clinton-hating billionaire Richard Mellon Scaife.” [New York Observer, 4/10/00]

**CSE Was Chaired By President Bush's White House Counsel In 2000.** According to the New York Observer, "Founded by oilman David Koch, a conservative who has contributed to many Republican causes, it is chaired by C. Boyden Gray, President George Bush's White House Counsel." [New York Observer, 4/10/00]

### **The Florida Chapter Of Citizens For A Sound Economy Was Founded In 1998**

**Miami Herald: "Florida Citizens For A Sound Economy Is A 7 Month Old Chapter Of A National Nonprofit, Nonpartisan Organization That Was Founded In 1984 To Advocate Conservative Causes."** According to the Miami Herald, "Florida Citizens for a Sound Economy is a 7 month old chapter of a national nonprofit, nonpartisan organization that was founded in 1984 to advocate conservative causes." [Miami Herald, 11/10/98]

- **PolitiFact Ruled Charles Koch's Claim That His Political Engagement Only Began In The Past Decade Was False, Given His Funding For CSE.** According to PolitiFact in the Tampa Bay Times, "For example, Charles Koch and his brother David made several large financial commitments prior to 2004 to free-market oriented groups such as the Cato Institute, the Reason Foundation, the Mercatus Center and Citizens for a Sound Economy, which was the pre-2004 precursor of Americans for Prosperity and FreedomWorks." [PolitiFact - Tampa Bay Times, 4/3/14]

**Palm Beach Post Editorial: "CSE Wants To Portray Itself As Taxpayer-Friendly And Credible. But Halloween Has Come And Gone."** According to the Palm Beach Post, "CSE wants to portray itself as taxpayer-friendly and credible. But Halloween has come and gone. Last spring, CSE lobbied for a doubling of local phone rates; public outrage forced the Legislature to back off." [Palm Beach Post, 11/12/98]

**Palm Beach Post Editorial Page Editor Randy Schultz: To CSE And Other Outside Groups, "Butt Out. Get Lost. Take A Hike."** According to an opinion by Editorial Page editor Randy Schultz in the Palm Beach Post, "To any out-of-state groups that want to 'help' South Florida decide how to use water over the next 50 years, here is a simple request: Butt out. Get lost. Take a hike." [Randy Schultz - Palm Beach Post, 12/13/98]

### **CSE's Ties To Corporate Donors**

**CSE Fought A Plan By The Army Corps Of Engineers Which Would Have Caused Florida's "Three Biggest Sugar Enterprises...To Lose Thousands Of Acres Of Cane-Growing Land To Reclamation."** According to the Washington Post, "Derailing a multibillion-dollar federal plan to restore the Florida Everglades is just the kind of cause that suits Citizens for a Sound Economy, a conservative think tank that fights for smaller government. But soon after the group took on the Everglades project in 1998, the Washington-based nonprofit got an incentive that went beyond the purely philosophical. It received \$ 700,000 in contributions from Florida's three biggest sugar enterprises, which stand to lose thousands of acres of cane-growing land to reclamation if the Army Corps of Engineers plan goes into effect." [Washington Post, 1/29/00]

**October To December 1998: CSE Took Sugar Industry Contributions Of \$280,000 Each From US Sugar Corp And Florida Crystals Corp And \$140,000 From The Sugar Cane Growers Cooperative Of Florida.** According to the Washington Post, "CSE took in the sugar industry contributions--\$ 280,000 each from U.S. Sugar Corp. and Florida Crystals Corp., and \$ 140,000 from the Sugar Cane Growers Cooperative of Florida--from October to December 1998. That November, CSE Foundation issued a news release asserting that the Everglades project would cost \$ 120 per household in Florida and could result in the loss of 2,879 jobs. The foundation also released a poll concluding that the vast majority of Floridians did not support tax hikes to finance the project." [Washington Post, 1/29/00]

**November 1998: CSE Foundation "Issued A News Release Asserting That The Everglades Restoration Project Would Cost \$120 Per Household In Florida And Could Result In The Loss Of 2,879 Jobs."** According to the Washington Post, "CSE took in the sugar industry contributions--\$ 280,000 each from U.S. Sugar Corp. and Florida Crystals Corp., and \$ 140,000 from the Sugar Cane Growers Cooperative of Florida--from October to December 1998. That November, CSE Foundation issued a news release asserting that the Everglades project would cost \$ 120 per household in Florida and could result in the loss of 2,879 jobs. The foundation also released a poll concluding that the vast majority of Floridians did not support tax hikes to finance the project." [Washington Post, 1/29/00]

**"Sugar Industry Representatives Kept A Low Profile, Asserting Publicly That, In Principle, They Supported The Restoration Plan."** According to the Washington Post, "Meanwhile, sugar industry representatives kept a low profile,



asserting publicly that, in principle, they supported the restoration plan. The Florida legislature approved a revised version of it last year, but hurdles remain, including congressional funding. The companies said they did not renew their contributions to CSE in 1999 because CSE's outspoken criticism no longer reflected their position.” [Washington Post, 1/29/00]

### **CSE Florida Director Slade O'Brien Had Close Business, Familial, Political Ties to Jeb Bush**

*Slade O'Brien Was Nephew of State GOP Chairman Who Made Jeb Bush Governor and Was Business Partner of Finance Chairman of Bush's 1994 Campaign*

**CSE Florida Director Slade O'Brien Was A Nephew Of State GOP Chairman Tom Slade; O'Brien Formerly Worked For Blue Lake Corporate Center With Mark Guzzetta, Finance Chairman For Gov. Jeb Bush's Re-Election Campaign.** According to the Palm Beach Post, “So neither CSE's reputation nor its figuring is persuasive. But the director of CSE's Florida chapter is Slade O'Brien of Boca Raton, a nephew of state GOP Chairman Tom Slade. From December through April, Mr. O'Brien was director of government and public affairs for Blue Lake Corporate Center in Boca. One of the Blue Lake developers is Mark Guzzetta, finance chairman for Gov.-elect Jeb Bush's campaign. Mr. Bush was best man at Mr. Guzzetta's wedding.” [Palm Beach Post, 11/12/98]

- **Palm Beach Post: CSE Florida Director Slade O'Brien “Has Ties To Two Top Supporters Of Gov.-Elect Jeb Bush.”** According to the Palm Beach Post, “Slade O'Brien, director of the group's Boca Raton-based Florida chapter, rejected attempts to label his organization pro-business. ‘We are a consumer group,’ he said. He said it is getting involved in the Everglades because so many residents have expressed alarm about the plan. O'Brien refused to reveal the group's donors or how much the reports and poll cost. O'Brien has ties to two top supporters of Gov.-elect Jeb Bush: O'Brien is the nephew of state Republican Party Chairman Tom Slade, and until last spring, O'Brien worked for the Blue Lake Corporate Center in Boca Raton. Blue Lake's developers include Bush campaign finance chief Mark Guzzetta.” [Palm Beach Post, 11/12/98]

*Tom Slade, Slade O'Brien's Uncle, Was Often Credited With Almost Singlehandedly Making Jeb Bush Governor*

**Orlando Sentinel: Tom Slade's “Tenure Leading The State GOP Is Probably Best Remembered For The 1998 Victory Of Gov. Jeb Bush.”** According to the Orlando Sentinel, “Slade's tenure leading the state GOP is probably best remembered for the 1998 victory of Gov. Jeb Bush. But the period also included finding little-known candidates such as Frank Brogan and Bob Milligan and winning statewide races against better-known Democrats. Brogan had been the Martin County schools superintendent before defeating Democrat Doug Jamerson for education commissioner in 1994. Similarly, Milligan was a retired U.S. Marines general when he unseated longtime Comptroller Gerald Lewis.” [Orlando Sentinel, [10/20/14](#)]

**University Of South Florida St. Petersburg Political Scientist Darryl Paulson: “Jeb Bush... Could Not Be Possible Without Tom Slade.”** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “I can't think of anyone as instrumental in the development of the modern Republican Party as Tom Slade,” said retired University of South Florida St. Petersburg political scientist Darryl Paulson, who has studied the state party extensively. ‘Jeb Bush, in many respects, could not be possible without Tom Slade.’” [Tampa Bay Times, 10/21/14]

**Gov. Jeb Bush: Tom Slade “Was A Bold And Decisive Leader Who Inspired Others To Get On Board With The Causes And Campaigns He Was Passionate About.”** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “Mr. Slade ‘was a bold and decisive leader who inspired others to get on board with the causes and campaigns he was passionate about throughout his time in public office and in the political arena,’ former Gov. Jeb Bush said in an email. ‘And, if you found yourself on the opposite side of a campaign, he was a true force to be reckoned with politically! Tom also had a huge heart, a larger than life personality and a truly wonderful sense of humor. He was a blast to be around.’” [Tampa Bay Times, 10/21/14]

**Bush: “And, If You Found Yourself On The Opposite Side Of A Campaign,” Slade “Was A True Force To Be Reckoned With Politically.”** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “Mr. Slade ‘was a bold and decisive leader who inspired others to get on board with the causes and campaigns he was passionate about throughout his time in public office and in the political arena,’ former Gov. Jeb Bush said in an email. ‘And, if you found yourself on the opposite side of a campaign, he was a true force to be reckoned with politically! Tom also had a huge heart, a larger than life personality and a truly wonderful sense of humor. He was a blast to be around.’” [Tampa Bay Times, 10/21/14]

**Bush: Slade “Had A Huge Heart, A Larger Than Life Personality And A Truly Wonderful Sense Of Humor. He Was A Blast To Be Around.”** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “Mr. Slade ‘was a bold and decisive leader who inspired others to get on board with the causes and campaigns he was passionate about throughout his time in public office and in the political arena,’ former Gov. Jeb Bush said in an email. ‘And, if you found yourself on the opposite side of a campaign, he was a true force to be reckoned with politically! Tom also had a huge heart, a larger than life personality and a truly wonderful sense of humor. He was a blast to be around.’” [Tampa Bay Times, 10/21/14]

**State Republican Sen. Jack Latvala “Accused Slade... Of Trying To Derail A Possible” Challenge To Bush.**

According to the Florida Times-Union, “A Republican lawmaker says state GOP leader Tom Slade should consider stepping down for publicly accusing a lobbyist of selling access to Senate President Toni Jennings. Sen. Jack Latvala accused Slade, who has endorsed the gubernatorial candidacy of Jeb Bush in 1998, of trying to derail a possible run for the GOP nomination by Jennings.” [Florida Times-Union, 3/29/97]

**Latvala: “I’ve Never Seen” A Party Chair “Get Involved In Subverting The Potential Bids Of Much-More Qualified Candidates Than The Guy He’s Backing.”** According to the Florida Times-Union, “Sen. Jack Latvala accused Slade, who has endorsed the gubernatorial candidacy of Jeb Bush in 1998, of trying to derail a possible run for the GOP nomination by Jennings. ‘I have never seen a party chairman as overbearing and manipulative as Tom Slade,’ the Palm Harbor lawmaker said. ‘I’ve certainly never seen one get involved in subverting the potential bids of much-more qualified candidates than the guy he’s backing,’ Latvala said.” [Florida Times-Union, 3/29/97]

**Palm Beach Post: Tom Slade “Rarely Makes A Move Without Coordinating It With Bush’s Top Advisers.”**

According to the Palm Beach Post, “State party Chairman Tom Slade, who rarely makes a move without coordinating it with [Jeb] Bush’s top advisers, began publicly distancing himself from [Sandra] Mortham. At the same time, Mortham’s advisers were being discouraged from taking more aggressive action to defend her.” [Palm Beach Post, 1/18/98]

**O’Brien Came Under Ethical Scrutiny For Campaign Finance Issues**

**O’Brien Admitted To Taking Money From A Developer To “Skirt” Donation Limits To Whelchel While Working As Her Campaign Manager.** According to the Palm Beach Post, “A former campaign manager for Councilwoman Susan Whelchel has admitted he discussed taking money from a developer to skirt state limits on \$ 500-a-person donations, according to court documents. While working for Whelchel’s March 1997 election campaign, Slade O’Brien said he asked Lee Morris, a real-estate investor who wanted to build an eight-story luxury apartment building along State Road A1A in Boca Raton, for payments to Whelchel’s campaign that could be made directly to his consulting company, The Slade Group.” [Palm Beach Post, 4/29/99]

**O’Brien Also Admitted He “Acted As An Intermediary Between Council Members On Matters Of City Business... Which Could Be Construed As A Violation Of The Sunshine Law.”** According to the Palm Beach Post, “[Slade] O’Brien, [Councilwoman Susan] Whelchel’s nephew and a longtime lobbyist who has worked in political campaigns for three other city council members, also said in the deposition he acted as an intermediary between council members on matters of city business, including [Lee] Morris’ Mirasol building and the Blue Lake project, which could be construed as a violation of the Sunshine Law.” [Palm Beach Post, 4/29/99]

**Real-Estate Investor Lee Morris Said O’Brien “Asked Him To Funnel Money To Whelchel’s Campaign By Paying More Than \$10,000 To The Slade Group” So O’Brien “Would Not Need To Charge Whelchel For His Services.”**

According to the Palm Beach Post, “[Lee] Morris says O’Brien asked him to funnel money to [Councilwoman Susan] Whelchel’s campaign by paying more than \$ 10,000 to The Slade Group. That way, O’Brien would not need to charge Whelchel for his services, Morris said O’Brien told him.” [Palm Beach Post, 4/29/99]

**O’Brien Told Morris That The Arrangement Was “Certainly In The Gray Area,” But An Elections Supervisor Described It As “Very Clearly Against The Law.”** According to the Palm Beach Post, “[Attorney Cole] FitzGerald: ‘But that the money you might have received through Lee (Morris) or his companies would enable you to reduce the fee you would have had to charge her campaign?’ [Slade] O’Brien: ‘I believe I might have had that conversation. . . . Lee asked me if it was kosher, for lack of a better way of describing it, and my answer was that it was certainly in the gray area.’ Palm Beach County Elections Supervisor Theresa LePore said that this type of arrangement does not fall in any gray area: ‘That is clearly illegal. Any type of payment made to circumvent campaign contribution laws is very clearly against the law.’” [Palm Beach Post, 4/29/99]

**O'Brien Or His Attorney "Talked To Individual Council Members About What Other Council Members Thought."**

According to the Palm Beach Post, "Florida's Government in the Sunshine Law dictates how and when elected officials can meet to discuss official business. Elected officials are not allowed to meet or discuss any official business in private, and it is also illegal to use 'third party' communication, where council members talk through an intermediary. [Slade] O'Brien, though, admitted that he or his lawyer, Bob Eisen, talked to individual council members about what other council members thought of Blue Lake and Mirasol." [Palm Beach Post, 4/29/99]

- **Florida Law Dictates That "Elected Officials Are Not Allowed To Meet Or Discuss Any Official Business In Private, And It Is Also Illegal To...Talk Through An Intermediary."** According to the Palm Beach Post, "Florida's Government in the Sunshine Law dictates how and when elected officials can meet to discuss official business. Elected officials are not allowed to meet or discuss any official business in private, and it is also illegal to use 'third party' communication, where council members talk through an intermediary. [Slade] O'Brien, though, admitted that he or his lawyer, Bob Eisen, talked to individual council members about what other council members thought of Blue Lake and Mirasol." [Palm Beach Post, 4/29/99]

**CSE Employee Joyce Malone Traveled, Emailed, Campaigned With Jeb Bush For George W. Bush's Presidential Campaign**

**Joyce Malone Volunteered For Jeb Bush's 1994 Campaign.** According to the Apopka Chief, "She [Joyce Malone] has been active in grassroots politics for more than 20 years in Florida. Beginning in 1993 as a volunteer on the Jeb Bush campaign, she started down a path which led to working in almost every facet of the political arena. She is a veteran of many local, state and national campaigns." [Apopka Chief, [3/7/14](#) via archive.org]

**In 2000, Malone Worked For Citizens For A Sound Economy.** According to an email from Joyce Malone (JMalone@CSE.org) to Jeb Bush on January 17, 2000, "Jeb, Beginning next month, CSE will be will be presenting its' legislative agenda to our club members. We now have clubs in 11 different areas of the state. Average attendance is approximately 100 at each meeting. These members look to us to provide them with specific information about legislation that will be taken up during the upcoming legislative session and want to get involved by making phone calls and writing letters to the editor, etc." [Joyce Malone Email to Jeb Bush, 1/17/00]

**In 2014, Malone Worked As "The Director Of Grassroots And Special Events For The Florida Chapter Of Americans For Prosperity."** According to the Apopka Chief, "Malone is the director of Grassroots and Special Events for the Florida Chapter of Americans for Prosperity. She will be speaking on Americans for Prosperity." [Apopka Chief, [3/7/14](#) via archive.org]

*Malone Traveled With Jeb Bush To New Hampshire In 2000 to Campaign for George W. Bush*

**Jeb Bush "And 120 Supporters" Including John Thrasher Were Flown To New Hampshire By The George W. Bush Presidential Campaign Ahead Of The Presidential Primary In January 2000.** According to the Associated Press, "Florida Gov. Jeb Bush plans a short trip to New Hampshire this month to help Texas Gov. George Bush, his brother and Republican presidential candidate. The Bush campaign is chartering a jet to fly Florida's governor and 120 supporters north in mid-January to do door-to-door campaigning for the elder Bush brother in advance of the first-in-the-nation Feb. 1 primary. Other top Republican leaders from Florida will make the trip. Education Commissioner Tom Gallagher and House Speaker John Thrasher plan to be on the plane." [AP, 1/7/00]

**Malone Thanked Gov. Bush For "Allowing Me To Be A Part" Of A "Trip To N.H."** According to an email from Joyce Malone (JMalone@CSE.org) to Jeb Bush on January 17, 2000, "p.s. Trip to N.H. was great. Thanks for allowing me to be a part of it all." [Joyce Malone Email to Jeb Bush, 1/17/00]

**Gov. Bush Responded To Malone By Thanking Her And Saying He Would Have His "Communications Dude" "Get In Touch" With Her.** According to an email from Gov. Jeb Bush to Joyce Malone, "thanks Joyce. I will get Justin to get in touch with you. He is our communications dude. Jeb" [Jeb Bush Email to Joyce Malone, 1/17/00]

*Malone Offered Support for Bush's Agenda from CSE, Backed His Education Plan*

**Malone Told Gov. Jeb Bush “If You Will Let Me Know What Your Goals Are For This Session And Where We Can Provide Grassroots Support For Your Agenda,” CSE “Would Love To Help On Those Issues...”** According to an email from Joyce Malone (JMalone@CSE.org) to Jeb Bush on January 17, 2000, “If you will let me know what your goals are for this session and where we can provide grassroots support for your agenda, we would love to help on those issues that fit into our agenda of educating the public on economic issues that limit government, lower taxes and promote competition. We of course will continue to educate our members on our tort reform efforts. Also, competition in the education arena (thus support for your A+ Plan) will be another of our continued main areas of concern.” [Joyce Malone Email to Jeb Bush, 1/17/00]

**The Subject Of Malone’s Email Was “Legislative Agenda-CSE Wants To Support!!!”** [Joyce Malone Email to Jeb Bush, 1/17/00]

**Malone Promised Support For Gov. Bush’s A+ Education Plan As “Another Of Our Continued Main Areas Of Concern” For CSE.** According to an email from Joyce Malone (JMalone@CSE.org) to Jeb Bush on January 17, 2000, “If you will let me know what your goals are for this session and where we can provide grassroots support for your agenda, we would love to help on those issues that fit into our agenda of educating the public on economic issues that limit government, lower taxes and promote competition. We of course will continue to educate our members on our tort reform efforts. Also, competition in the education arena (thus support for your A+ Plan) will be another of our continued main areas of concern.” [Joyce Malone Email to Jeb Bush, 1/17/00]

**Malone Asked Gov. Bush To “Let Me Know Where Else” CSE “Can Help.”** According to an email from Joyce Malone (JMalone@CSE.org) to Jeb Bush on January 17, 2000, “Beginning next month, CSE will be presenting its legislative agenda to our club members. We now have clubs in 11 different areas of the state. Average attendance is approximately 100 at each meeting. These members look to us to provide them with specific information about legislation that will be taken up during the upcoming legislative session and want to get involved by making phone calls and writing letters to the editor, etc. [...] Let me know where else we can help. I need to get our legislative agenda and support information for that agenda out to our members as soon as possible.” [Joyce Malone Email to Jeb Bush, 1/17/00]

*Slade O’Brien And Bush Also Emailed About CSE Support for Bush’s Education Plan*

**Slade O’Brien Emailed Jeb Bush Regarding School Choice, Saying CSE Would “Like To Help You On This Issue.”** According to an email from Slade O’Brien to Gov. Jeb Bush on March 14, 2000, “Subject: Judges Ruling on School Choice. Governor Bush: Thought you might be interested in the following press release. CSE would very like [sic] to help you on this issue. All we need is some direction or a contact person in your office to work with, and we’ll be off and running. Sincerely, Slade O’Brien and Joyce Malone” [Slade O’Brien Email to Gov. Jeb Bush, 3/14/00]

**Bush Response To Slade O’Brien: “I Will Get Someone To Contact You. Thanks Slade.”** According to an email from Gov. Jeb Bush to Slade O’Brien on March 14, 2000, “I will get someone to contact you. Thanks Slade. Jeb” [Gov. Jeb Bush Email to Slade O’Brien, 3/14/00]

*Malone And Bush Exchanged Emails And Discussed Meeting After Closure of CSE Florida Offices*

**Malone Asked Gov. Bush To Meet In 2002 To Discuss CSE Closing Its Florida Offices.** According to an email from Joyce Malone to Jeb Bush on February 26, 2002, “Jeb, I just found out last week that CSE is closing its Florida Offices as of next week. I would really appreciate a 10 minute meeting with you to discuss what is happening. I will be in Tallahassee on Tuesday the 5th for the Feeney, James Madison fundraiser. Would you by any chance be able to spare 10 minutes on that day? If not, I will make myself available anytime next week that would work for you. Thank you, and keep up the good work. Joyce” [Joyce Malone Email to Jeb Bush, 2/26/02]

**Gov. Bush Said He Would “Check” On Meeting Her And “If Not, We Can Do Over The Phone.”** According to an email from Gov. Jeb Bush to Joyce Malone on February 26, 2002, “I will check. if not, we can do over the phone. Jeb Bush” [Jeb Bush Email to Joyce Malone, 2/26/02]

## **MULTIPLE CITIZENS FOR A SOUND ECONOMY STAFFERS WERE REGISTERED LOBBYISTS**

### **Joyce Malone**

**Joyce Malone Was A Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy In 2002.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, Joyce Malone was a registered lobbyist for Citizens for a Sound Economy in 2002. [flsenate.gov via archive.org, [4/10/02](#)]

**Malone Was A Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy In 2001.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, Joyce Malone was a registered lobbyist for Citizens for a Sound Economy in 2001. [flsenate.gov via archive.org, [01/03/02](#)]

**Malone Was A Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy In 2000.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, Joyce Malone was a registered lobbyist for Citizens for a Sound Economy in 2000. [leg.state.fl.us via archive.org, [8/15/00](#)]

### **Slade O'Brien**

**Slade O'Brien Was A Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy In 2002.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, William S. O'Brien was a registered lobbyist for Citizens for a Sound Economy in 2002. [flsenate.gov via archive.org, [4/10/02](#)]

**O'Brien Was A Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy In 2001.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, William S. O'Brien was a registered lobbyist for Citizens for a Sound Economy in 2001. [flsenate.gov via archive.org, [01/03/02](#)]

**O'Brien Was A Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy In 2000.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, William S. O'Brien was a registered lobbyist for Citizens for a Sound Economy in 2000. [leg.state.fl.us via archive.org, [8/15/00](#)]

### **Alan Florez Withdrew Registration To Lobby For Citizens For A Sound Economy, Changed Registration To Executive Office Of The Governor, Worked As Jeb Bush's Deputy Director Of Legislative Affairs And Special Assistant From 2001-2005**

**Alan Florez Was A Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy In 2001.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, Alan S. Florez was a registered lobbyist for Citizens for a Sound Economy in 2001. [flsenate.gov via archive.org, [01/03/02](#)]

- **July 2001: Florez's Registration With Citizens For A Sound Economy Was Withdrawn.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, Alan S. Florez's CSE lobbyist registration was withdrawn on 07/05/01. [flsenate.gov via archive.org, [01/03/02](#)]
- **2001: Florez Was Listed As A Registered Lobbyist For The Executive Office Of The Governor.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, Alan S. Florez was a registered lobbyist for the Executive Office of the Governor in 2001. [flsenate.gov via archive.org, [01/03/02](#)]
- **2001 To 2005: Florez Served As Gov. Jeb Bush's Deputy Director Of Legislative Affairs And As A Special Assistant.** According to a biography on the University of Central Florida's website, "Alan Florez, of Ormond Beach, is executive vice president of Brown & Brown of Florida, Inc. – Daytona Beach. Previously, Florez served as Governor Jeb Bush's deputy director of Legislative Affairs and also as his Special Assistant before pursuing his present career in commercial insurance sales. Florez was appointed to the UCF Board of Trustees in 2006 and then again in 2011. He received his Bachelor of Science degree from UCF in 1998." [UCF.edu, Accessed [3/9/15](#); Alan Florez LinkedIn, Accessed [3/9/15](#)]



**Florez Was A Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy In 2000.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, Alan S. Florez was a registered lobbyist for Citizens for a Sound Economy in 2000. [leg.state.fl.us via archive.org, [8/15/00](#)]

### **Carlos Muhletaler Was Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy, Worked As Regional Field Organizer For Koch-Controlled Groups Generation Opportunity, Americans For Prosperity**

**Carlos Muhletaler Was A Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy In 2001.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, Carlos M. Muhletaler was a registered lobbyist for Citizens for a Sound Economy in 2001. [flsenate.gov via archive.org, [01/03/02](#)]

- **2013 To Present: Muhletaler Served As Regional Field Coordinator For Americans For Prosperity.** According to Carlos Muhletaler's LinkedIn, Carlos Muhletaler served as Regional Field Coordinator for Americans for Prosperity from June 2013 – Present. [Carlos Muhletaler LinkedIn, Accessed [3/9/15](#)]
- **2012: Muhletaler Served As Regional Field Director For Generation Opportunity.** According to Carlos Muhletaler's LinkedIn, Carlos Muhletaler served as Regional Field Director for Generation Opportunity from May 2012 – December 2012. [Carlos Muhletaler LinkedIn, Accessed [3/9/15](#)]

**Muhletaler Was A Registered Lobbyist For Citizens For A Sound Economy In 2000.** According to the Florida Legislature's registered lobbyist report, Carlos M. Muhletaler was a registered lobbyist for Citizens for a Sound Economy in 2000. [leg.state.fl.us via archive.org, [8/15/00](#)]

## **Koch Attempts To Influence Florida Universities And Colleges**

### **THE KOCHS USE UNIVERSITY DONATIONS AS A PART OF A “FULLY INTEGRATED” POLITICAL STRATEGY**

**Charles And David Koch Have Considered “The Higher Educational Programs They Fund A ‘Fully Integrated’ Part Of A Massive Organizational Network Fighting To Enact Deregulatory Government Policies And Elect Conservative Political Candidates.”** According to Aljazeera America, “This increased funding in 2014 follows a recent Center for Public Integrity investigation that revealed the Koch brothers, Charles and David, consider the higher educational programs they fund a ‘fully integrated’ part of a massive organizational network fighting to enact deregulatory government policies and elect conservative political candidates.” [Aljazeera America, [12/15/15](#)]

**Time Headline: “How The Koch Brothers [Have Influenced] U.S. Colleges: They Gave \$23.4 Million In 2014 In A Bid To Influence Students.”** [Time, [12/15/15](#)]

- **Time: “Almost All Of The Higher Education Programs The Koch Foundations [Have Funded] Cleave To The Brothers’ Philosophy Of Promoting Free Markets And Laissez-Faire Capitalism In The United States.”** According to Time, “Almost all of the higher education programs the Koch foundations fund cleave to the brothers’ philosophy of promoting free markets and laissez-faire capitalism in the United States.” [Time, [12/15/15](#)]

**Center For Public Integrity: Kevin Gentry, “A Top Lieutenant” Of The Koch Network, Told Koch Confab Attendees That Political Success “Begins With Reaching Young Minds In College Lecture Halls.”** According to the Center for Public Integrity, “Last year, a top lieutenant of Charles and David Koch’s vast network of philanthropic institutions, laid bare the billionaire brothers’ strategy to evangelize their gospel of economic freedom. Political success, Kevin Gentry told a crowd of elite supporters attending the annual Koch confab in Dana Point, Calif., begins with reaching young minds in college lecture halls, thereby preparing bright, libertarian-leaning students to one day occupy the halls of political power.” [Center for Public Integrity, [10/30/15](#)]

**Center For Public Integrity’s Dave Levinthal: “When The Kochs Spend Money On Universities, Or Even High Schools, They Do It To Advance The Long-Term Objectives Of The Koch Political Network.”** According to KCUR,

“But, Dave Levinthal, at the Center for Public Integrity isn’t so sure. He’s studied Koch funding for years and says that when the Kochs spend money on universities, or even high schools, they do it to advance the long-term objectives of the Koch political network. ‘At every level that they can operate in, for all intents and purposes they are making investments that will build that next generation of Libertarian economic thinkers, and actors, business people and politicians,’ says Levinthal.” [KCUR.org, [12/17/14](#)]

## THE CHARLES KOCH FOUNDATION DONATED OVER \$7 MILLION TO FLORIDA UNIVERSITIES & COLLEGES

### Florida State University

*The Charles Koch Foundation Donated \$6.5 Million To FSU*

**In 2008, The Charles Koch Foundation “Signed A Memorandum Of Agreement With FSU In Which They Committed To A Proposed Budget Of \$6.5 Million Over A Period Of Six Years, With Most Of The Effort To Be Located In The Economics Department.”** According to the State University System of Florida, “We turn now to an agreement between Florida State's Department of Economics and the Charles G. Koch Foundation. In 2008, the foundation signed a memorandum of agreement with FSU in which they committed to a proposed budget of \$6.5 million over a period of six years, with most of the effort to be located in the economics department. The provisions called for the hiring of five professors and other staff; establishing a program for the Study of Political Economy and Free Enterprise (SPEFE) and a program for Excellence in Economic Education (EEE); and the development of educational programs for undergraduate students.” [State University System of Florida, [5/1/11](#)]

*The Charles Koch Foundation Exerted Direct Control Over Their Grant*

**The Charles Koch Foundation Had A Role In Hiring Decisions At Florida State In Exchange For A Big Grant.**

According to NPR, “Some faculty members at Florida State University say their school has sold out to a conservative group that dangled a big donation. Recently released details show the university gave the Charles Koch foundation a role in hiring decisions in exchange for a big grant.” [NPR, [5/13/11](#)]

- **The Grant Created A Special Advisory Board, Chosen By The Koch Foundation, That Has A Role In Choosing Faculty.** According to NPR, “But the grant created a special advisory board, chosen by the Koch Foundation, that has a role in choosing faculty. And that decision is leading to a world of controversy for the university.” [NPR, [5/13/11](#)]

*Koch Rejected Nearly 60% Of Faculty Suggestions During First Round Of Hiring*

**St. Petersburg Times: “During The First Round Of Hiring In 2009, Koch Rejected Nearly 60 Percent Of The Faculty’s Suggestions.”** According to St. Petersburg Times, “David W. Rasmussen, dean of the College of Social Sciences, defended the deal, initiated by an FSU graduate working for Koch. During the first round of hiring in 2009, Koch rejected nearly 60 percent of the faculty’s suggestions but ultimately agreed on two candidates. Although the deal was signed in 2008 with little public controversy, the issue revived last week when two FSU professors - one retired, one active - criticized the contract in the Tallahassee Democrat as an affront to academic freedom.” [St. Petersburg Times, 5/10/11]

**Tampa Tribune Columnist Joe O’Neill: “Whereas Most Donors...Are Limited In Influence, Koch Is Accorded Virtual Veto Power For Its \$250,000 Per Year. Too Little Money For Too Much Input. A Classic Lose-Lose.”**

According to an opinion by columnist Joe O’Neill in The Tampa Tribune, “Speaking of FSU’s call, the Koch deal candidly smacks of a sell-out. Whereas most donors, no matter how prestigious and how appreciated and how generous, are limited in influence, Koch is accorded virtual veto power for its \$250,000 per year. Too little money for too much input. A classic lose-lose.” [Joe O’Neill - The Tampa Tribune, 5/18/11]

**Author Of University Inc. Jennifer Washburn Called The Koch Deal With FSU “Truly Shocking” And Said It Was “An Egregious Example Of A Public University Being Willing To Sell Itself For Next To Nothing.”** According to St. Petersburg Times, “Jennifer Washburn, who has reviewed dozens of contracts between universities and donors, called the Koch agreement with FSU ‘truly shocking.’ Said Washburn, author of University Inc., a book on industry’s ties to academia:

“This is an egregious example of a public university being willing to sell itself for next to nothing.” [St. Petersburg Times, 5/10/11]

*Koch Wanted To “At Least Partially Control Which Faculty Members Florida State University Hired,” Offered Extra Money to Keep Favorite Faculty Members, Including Economics Chair Bruce Benson*

**CPI: The Charles Koch Foundation Wanted The Ability To “At Least Partially Control Which Faculty Members Florida State University Hired.”** According to The Center for Public Integrity, “Second, the Charles Koch Foundation would at least partially control which faculty members Florida State University hired. [...] At Florida State University, Benson noted in a November 2007 memorandum that the Charles Koch Foundation would not just ‘give us money to hire anyone we want and fund any graduate student that we choose. There are constraints.’ Benson later added in the memo: ‘Koch cannot tell a university who to hire, but they are going to try to make sure, through contractual terms and monitoring, that people hired are [to] be consistent with ‘donor Intent.’” [Center for Public Integrity, [9/12/14](#)]

**CPI: The Charles Koch Foundation Said That Florida State University Economics Department Chairman Bruce Benson “Must Stay On Another Three Years As Department Chairman—Even Though He Told His Wife He’d Step Down In 2009.”** According to The Center for Public Integrity, “And third, Bruce Benson, a prominent libertarian economic theorist and Florida State University economics department chairman, must stay on another three years as department chairman—even though he told his wife he’d step down in 2009 after a single three-year term.” [Center for Public Integrity, [9/12/14](#)]

**CPI: The Charles Koch Foundation Offered An Extra \$105,000 To Florida State To Keep Benson—A Self-Described “Libertarian Anarchist.”** According to The Center for Public Integrity, “The Charles Koch Foundation expressed a willingness to give Florida State an extra \$105,000 to keep Benson—a self-described ‘libertarian anarchist’ who asserts that every government function he’s studied ‘can be, has been, or is being produced better by the private sector’—in place.” [Center for Public Integrity, [9/12/14](#)]

**CPI: Bruce Benson Claimed That “While He Continued Serving As Florida State’s Economics Department Chairman Until 2012, Charles Koch Foundation Money Wasn’t A Factor.”** According to The Center for Public Integrity, “[Bruce] Benson also said that while he continued serving as Florida State’s economics department chairman until 2012, Charles Koch Foundation money wasn’t a factor. While the foundation initially discussed providing money to help fund Benson’s salary, ‘that idea was taken off the table very early in negotiations,’ he said. ‘I continued as chair because I felt I could still make a valuable contribution to the department.’” [Center for Public Integrity, [9/12/14](#)]

**Benson On Risk Of FSU Accepting Koch Foundation Funds: “We Cannot Expect Them To Be Willing To Give Us Free Reign...Can We Find Faculty Who Meet Our Own Standards But Who Are Also Acceptable To The Funding Sources?”** According to The Center for Public Integrity, “[Bruce] Benson also predicted entering into an agreement with the foundation carried some risk. ‘There clearly is a danger in this, of course. For instance, we might be tempted to lower our standards in order to hire people they like,’ Benson wrote, in advocating that the university not do so. ‘We cannot expect them to be willing to give us free reign to hire anyone we might want, however, so the question becomes, can we find faculty who meet our own standards but who are also acceptable to the funding sources?’” [Center for Public Integrity, [9/12/14](#)]

**New President Of Florida State University John Thrasher Was Asked To Admit That He Had Accepted Funding From Koch Industries At A Meeting With Student Protestors.** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “John Thrasher’s first official act Monday as president of Florida State University was to meet with his harshest critics, leaders of the left-leaning student organization Progress Coalition. Thrasher spent almost an hour beginning at 8 a.m. with the three dozen or so students, many of whom had protested on the front steps of the Westcott Building on Thursday while Thrasher was being confirmed by the Board of Governors in Boca Raton. The students presented Thrasher with a list of nine demands, asking him to admit that he had accepted funding from Koch Industries and that he ‘lied to students about his Koch funding on Sept. 15, 2014.’” [Tallahassee Democrat, [11/10/14](#)]

**Koch Campus Donations Contain Conditions That Are “Explicitly Ideological.”** According to the Free Expression Policy Project, “Most of the funding has gone to economics departments, and the conditions are explicitly ideological.” [Free Expression Policy Project, [11/13/14](#)]

*The Koch Syllabus: John Stossell, Ayn Rand, Climate Science Denialism, Libertarian Philosophy, And More Ayn Rand*

**Charles Koch Foundation Offered Florida State University’s Economics Department Millions Of Dollars With “Strings Attached” In 2007, Outlined In Previously Unpublished Documents Obtained By CPI.** According to The Center for Public Integrity, “In 2007, when the Charles Koch Foundation considered giving millions of dollars to Florida State University’s economics department, the offer came with strings attached. [...] Such details are contained in 16 pages of previously unpublished emails and memos obtained by the Center for Public Integrity.” [Center for Public Integrity, [9/12/14](#)]

**CPI: Koch Foundation Required The “Curriculum It Funded Must Align With The Libertarian, Deregulatory Economic Philosophy Of Charles Koch.”** According to The Center for Public Integrity, “First, the curriculum it funded must align with the libertarian, deregulatory economic philosophy of Charles Koch, the billionaire industrialist and Republican political bankroller.” [Center for Public Integrity, [9/12/14](#)]

**Koch’s Contract With Florida State University “Provides That The Programs Funded And Professors Hired Must ‘Advance And Expand’ Research And Teaching Related To ‘Free Enterprise.’”** According to the Free Expression

Policy Project, “Florida State’s ‘Memorandum of Understanding’ with Koch likewise provides that the programs funded and professors hired must ‘advance and expand’ research and teaching related to ‘free enterprise.’ The agreement specifies that the Foundation will have approval power over faculty appointments that it funds. If the Foundation disagrees with a proposed appointment, it can refuse to fund the position.” [Free Expression Policy Project, [11/13/14](#)]

- **The FSU Contract “Guaranteed Mandatory Reading Of Ayn Rand’s Writings In Some Courses.”** According to the Free Expression Policy Project, “Faculty at Florida State were upset in 2011 to discover that the grant also guaranteed mandatory reading of Ayn Rand’s writings in some courses.” [Free Expression Policy Project, [11/13/14](#)]

**Koch-Funded Economics Professors Are “Misrepresenting Climate Science, ‘A Field Well Outside Of Their Credentialed Expertise.’”** According to the Free Expression Policy Project, “A primary concern of Greenpeace is that the Koch funds are supporting professors and programs that are impeding attempts to stop or slow climate change. Greenpeace reports that Florida State’s economics department, heavily financed by Koch, appears to host professors who are misrepresenting climate science, ‘a field well outside of their credentialed expertise.’ Three of the four authors of a notorious economics textbook containing misinformation about climate science have ties to FSU.” [Free Expression Policy Project, [11/13/14](#)]

**A Summer Macroeconomics Class At FSU Was “Laden With Videos Of Anti-Government Crusader John Stossel.”** According to the Kentucky Center for Investigative Reporting, “Such concerns have been raised at other colleges accepting Koch Foundation money, most notably George Mason University and Florida State University. At FSU, which has received \$2.8 million from Koch, economics professors hired with foundation money must be ‘free markets’ advocates who see society through the Koch lens. A summer macroeconomics class at FSU was laden with videos of anti-government crusader John Stossel.” [KYCIR.org, [12/19/14](#)]

*FSU Faculty Ties To The Koch Network*

**Gainesville Scene: “Numerous Faculty Members In The FSU Economics Department Have Ties To Koch Organizations.”** According to the Gainesville Scene, “In fact, numerous faculty members in the FSU economics department have ties to Koch Organizations.” [Gainesville Scene, [1/9/15](#)]

**FSU Faculty Lora Holcombe Is A Member Of The Association Of Private Enterprise Education (APEE), An Organization Created By The Koch Family Foundations.** According to the Gainesville Scene, “Lora Holcombe teaches ‘introduction to principles of macroeconomics,’” which is a required course for all business and economics majors. Holcombe is a member of the Association of Private Enterprise Education (APEE), an organization created by Koch Family Foundations.” [Gainesville Scene, [1/9/15](#)]

- **The Required Textbook For Holcombe’s Class Was Written By James Gwartney Of APEE And Cato, Richard Stroup, Of Cato And The Institute For Energy Research, And Russell Sobel, Of APEE And Cato.** According to the Gainesville Scene, “The required textbook for her introductory class, ‘Macroeconomics: Private and Public Choice,’ was written by authors with Koch ties. Among these authors is: James Gwartney, the president, vice president and executive board member of APEE and adjunct scholar at the Cato Institute, which was founded by Charles Koch; Richard Stroup, a fellow at the Cato Institute and the director of the Koch-founded Institute for Energy Research; Russell Sobel, executive board member of the Association of Private Enterprise Education and affiliate of the Cato Institute.” [Gainesville Scene, [1/9/15](#)]

*The Kochs Attempted To Install Former Republican Senator John Thrasher As FSU President*

**While In The State Senate, FSU’s New President John Thrasher Supported A Law Allowing Universities To Hold “Closed-To-The-Public Meetings With Outside Donor Groups, Essentially Preventing Students From Knowing If Private Funding Is Influencing The Academic Integrity Of Their College.”** According to the Gainesville Scene, “The new president of FSU, John Thrasher, is a former state legislator whose campaign received more than \$2,000 from Koch Industries. While in the Florida Senate, Thrasher supported a recently passed law that now allows universities to closed-to-the-public meetings with outside donor groups, essentially preventing students from knowing if private funding is influencing the academic integrity of their college. This is especially dangerous because while the Koch/FSU agreement was made public, universities will not be obligated to disclose any such transactions that happen in the future.” [Gainesville Scene, [1/9/15](#)]



**FSU Made “Minor Changes” In Response To The Public Outcry Over The Koch Relationship.** According to the Gainesville Scene, “In response to public outcry, FSU administrators re-evaluated the school’s relationship with the Charles Koch Foundation. The new deal made only minor changes, limiting the number of Koch representatives on the advisory board to one and requiring that the board not hire new faculty, although after new hires are made the board can decide whether the Koch Foundation money will be used to pay his or her salary.” [Gainesville Scene, [1/9/15](#)]

**ALEC Named Thrasher Its Legislator Of The Year In 1998, But Thrasher Claimed He Stopped Attending ALEC Meetings In 2000 And Did Not Go Back Until 2009.** According to the Miami Herald, “Earlier in his political career, Thrasher was more eager to align with organizations affiliated with the Kochs. During the lead-up to his term as House Speaker, he attended American Legislative Exchange Council (ALEC) meetings where conservative lawmakers were encouraged to support legislation backed by interests including the Koch brothers. ALEC named Thrasher its legislator of the year in 1998. He said he stopped attending ALEC meetings when he left the House in 2000, and did not go back in 2009 when he won a special election for a Senate seat.” [Miami Herald, [9/21/14](#)]

**FSU President John Thrasher “Abruptly Canceled” A Meeting With Students “Who Believe FSU Sold Its Academic Integrity For Funding Of Some Economics Teaching Positions By The Conservative Koch Brothers.”** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “Florida State University President John Thrasher abruptly canceled a meeting Wednesday with students who believe FSU sold its academic integrity for funding of some economics teaching positions by the conservative Koch brothers.” [Tallahassee Democrat, [1/14/15](#)]

**New Florida State University President John Thrasher Denied Ever Receiving Koch Contributions.** According to PolitiFact, “[John] Thrasher became defensive when questioned about his ties to Charles and David Koch, the billionaire libertarian brothers who have spent freely on anti-regulation causes. At one point, a graduate student asked Thrasher about campaign contributions he had received from the brothers. The former lawmaker from St. Augustine denied receiving any. ‘I don’t have a relationship with the Koch brothers,’ Thrasher said. ‘You say I’ve got contributions from them? You go look at my contributions, I’ve never received any contributions from the Koch brothers.’” [PolitiFact, [11/19/14](#)]

**Koch Industries Has Made Four Donations Totaling \$3,000 To Thrasher In The Past Three Years; The Final Donation Came After The Board Of Trustees Had Voted For Thrasher’s FSU Presidency.** According to PolitiFact, “A trip to the Florida Division of Elections website showed that Koch Industries, based in Wichita, Kan., has made four contributions to Thrasher’s re-election campaign since 2012. The multinational group owns interests in manufacturing, energy, textiles, chemicals, paper, ranching, finance and investing, among other things. Current Florida campaign finance laws allow corporations to donate up to \$1,000 per election to a legislative candidate. Koch Industries has given Thrasher \$3,000 over the past three years. Two donations on Jan. 9, 2012, and Oct. 11, 2012, were \$500 apiece. Two were \$1,000 each, on Feb. 8, 2014, and Oct. 21, 2014. This final donation came after the forum in question, and after the Board of Trustees had voted for Thrasher.” [PolitiFact, [11/19/14](#)]

**PolitiFact: “Mostly False” That Thrasher Never Received Koch Donations.** According to PolitiFact, “Thrasher said he has ‘never received any contributions from the Koch brothers.’ Thrasher says he has never received money personally from the Koch Brothers, and as far as we can tell, that’s correct. However, he did receive four donations totaling \$3,000 from Koch Industries, a company they own. That’s what we’re checking, not whether he knows Charles and David Koch. [...] The statement contains an element of truth but ignores critical facts that would give a different impression. We rate it Mostly False.” [PolitiFact, [11/19/14](#)]

**Thrasher Was Chairman Of Gov. Rick Scott’s Re-Election Campaign And Koch Industries Contributed \$25,000 To Gov. Scott’s Political Committee.** According to the Miami Herald, “Koch Industries also donated \$25,000 to Gov. Rick Scott’s Let’s Get to Work political committee. Thrasher is chairman of Scott’s re-election campaign.” [Miami Herald, [9/21/14](#)]

### *Criticism And Protests*

**Independent Florida Alligator Editorial: “If The Koch Brothers Are Able To Run Roughshod Over The Interests And Values Of The FSU Student Community, It Seems Likely That They...Will Replicate This Strategy.”** According to an editorial by the Independent Florida Alligator, “At Other Universities if the Koch brothers are able to run roughshod over the interests and values of the FSU student community, it seems likely that they and other wealthy, politically inclined Americans will replicate this strategy at other universities. University administrators and faculty members should be evaluated

based on their qualifications and not on whether their political beliefs align with those of wealthy donors.” [Independent Florida Alligator, [8/27/14](#)]

**FSU Progress Coalition Op-Ed: In Florida The “Koch Cover-Up Bill” Blocks “All Public Access To Meetings Between Private Donors And Public University Foundations.”** According to an op-ed by Ralph Wilson of the FSU Progress Coalition for the Tallahassee Democrat, “One month after the exposure of the 2013 Koch contract, Thrasher chaired a Senate Rules Committee meeting at which students and faculty spoke out against the ‘Koch Cover-up Bill.’ This bill, now state law, blocks all public access to meetings between private donors and public university foundations. Predictably, HB 115 was sponsored by legislators who champion the Koch-funded organizations American Legislative Exchange Council (ALEC) and Americans for Prosperity.” [Ralph Wilson - Tallahassee Democrat, [8/27/14](#)]

- **FSU Progress Coalition Op-Ed: After Voting Support Of The Bill State Sen. John Thrasher Was “Fast-Tracked” As Florida State University’s Possible Next President By Its Presidential Search Advisory Committee.** According to an op-ed by Ralph Wilson of the FSU Progress Coalition for the Tallahassee Democrat, “The bill allows donors such as the Kochs to keep contracts with universities out of public view. As these universities are not required to disclose donor funding, they would have to rely on whistleblowers to speak up only after corrupt contracts have been signed. Despite hearing these concerns from student and faculty testimony, Thrasher voted in support of the bill. Seven short days after the bill passed, [state Sen. John] Thrasher was fast-tracked by Bense’s PSAC [Presidential Search Advisory Committee]. The corporate/political influence on Bense’s PSAC is blatant and unapologetic. Many members have direct connections to the controversial corporate-legislative partnership ALEC and Koch-funded institutes. In fact, ALEC/Koch affiliates have more representation on Bense’s PSAC than either faculty or students.” [Ralph Wilson - Tallahassee Democrat, [8/27/14](#)]

*FSU Students Strongly Opposed Appointment Of Former State Senator John Thrasher As President Of Florida State University*

**Student Group To Protest John Thrasher’s Presidency At Florida State University Because “A Thrasher Appointment Presidency Would Put FSU In The Hands Of...The Billionaire Libertarian Koch Brothers.”** According to the Miami Herald, “But the student group, known as the FSU Progress Coalition, is demanding the state Board of Governors reject Thrasher's appointment when it meets Wednesday in Boca Raton. The students say a Thrasher appointment presidency would put FSU in the hands of corporate interests and the billionaire libertarian Koch brothers. ‘John Thrasher is three-time Koch-funded American Legislative Exchange Council (ALEC) Legislator of the Year who has been cited twice for ethics violations, lied to students and faculty about his Koch funding, and supported legislation that defunds education in the state of Florida and supports the school-to-prison pipeline,’ the group wrote in a press release Monday. ‘He has no academic background and a legacy of supporting structural racism, homophobia and anti-environmental policies that point directly to his political ties with corporate industry as a whole and Koch in particular.’” [Miami Herald, [11/3/14](#)]

**New President Of Florida State University John Thrasher Was Asked To Admit That He Had Accepted Funding From Koch Industries At A Meeting With Student Protestors.** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “John Thrasher's first official act Monday as president of Florida State University was to meet with his harshest critics, leaders of the left-leaning student organization Progress Coalition. Thrasher spent almost an hour beginning at 8 a.m. with the three dozen or so students, many of whom had protested on the front steps of the Westcott Building on Thursday while Thrasher was being confirmed by the Board of Governors in Boca Raton. The students presented Thrasher with a list of nine demands, asking him to admit that he had accepted funding from Koch Industries and that he ‘lied to students about his Koch funding on Sept. 15, 2014.’” [Tallahassee Democrat, [11/10/14](#)]

*Faculty Criticism*

**Ray Bellamy, Head Of Surgery At The Tallahassee Campus Of FSU’S College Of Medicine: The Kochs “Want Their View Taught... And It Amounts To Propaganda, Rather Than Assisting Education.”** According to KCUR, “When the Koch Foundation donated to Florida State it installed a Koch-appointed board to scrutinize hiring, research funding, and some academic work. Ray Bellamy, head of Surgery [sic] at the Tallahassee campus of FSU’s College of Medicine, uncovered all this with his own open records request. ‘They want their view taught,’ says Bellamy. ‘And it amounts to propaganda, rather than assisting education.’” [KCUR.org, [12/17/14](#)]

**Part-Time FSU Instructor Financed A Full-Page Ad In The Tallahassee Democrat, “John Thrasher Should Not Be FSU’s Next President,” That Mentioned “Large Donations” From The Koch Brothers.** According to the Miami Herald, “Part-time FSU instructor Ray Bellamy financed a full-page ad in the Tallahassee Democrat newspaper titled ‘John Thrasher should not be FSU’s next president’ that mentioned, among many other gripes, ‘large donations’ from the Koch brothers.” [Miami Herald, [9/21/14](#)]

**President Of The American Association Of University Professors: “It Amounts To The Koch Brothers’ Foundation Basically Trying To Buy A Position On The Faculty. And That Certainly Is A Threat To Academic Freedom.”**

According to the Free Expression Policy Project, “Rudy Fichtenbaum, president of the American Association of University Professors, told National Public Radio: ‘it amounts to the Koch brothers’ foundation basically trying to buy a position on the faculty. And that certainly is a threat to academic freedom.’” [Free Expression Policy Project, [11/13/14](#)]

*Criticism From Florida State University Graduate Assistants United*

**PR Chair Of The United Faculty Of Florida For FSU-Graduate Assistants United, Lakey: Charles Koch Foundation “Still Has Veto Power Over Who Gets Hired” CKF Must Approve A Hire “To Get The Position Funded.”** According to an opinion by Lakey, the Public Relations Chair of the United Faculty of Florida- Florida State University-Graduate Assistants United, in the Tallahassee Democrat, “Faculty recommendations included a suspension of hiring under the agreement until the advisory board included two faculty members and worked by majority. The 2013 agreement includes two faculty members and one CKF [Charles Koch Foundation] member, and demands a unanimous vote. The 2013 contract says that the selection of professorship positions must go through normal university processes of hire but before the hire takes place the information on the candidate must be put past CKF, which is under no obligation ‘to provide funding’ to the selection. This means that CKF still has veto power over who gets hired in the department with its money. This means the department must put forward someone CKF approves in order to get the position funded.” [Lakey – Tallahassee Democrat, [1/10/15](#)]

**Lakey: The Koch Foundation Agreement Hires Faculty Into Tenure Track Positions, But Only Funds Them For “Exactly The Amount Of Time It Takes To Gain Tenure,” At Which Point FSU Must Fund Them.** According to an opinion by Lakey, the Public Relations Chair of the United Faculty of Florida- Florida State University-Graduate Assistants United, in the Tallahassee Democrat, “Of final concern, not to the Faculty Senate report, but to me, is this: The Charles Koch Foundation offers funding for five professor positions, but only funds these tenure-track positions for five to six years. That is exactly the amount of time it takes to gain tenure. At the time of tenure, CKF funding disappears and the 2013 agreement mandates that FSU agree ‘to assume full responsibility for the continued maintenance and funding of the Professorship Positions.’ In other words, the Charles Koch Foundation puts its people in and then the taxpayers are required to keep them. Five years of CKF funding to guarantee a lifetime taxpayer position.” [Lakey – Tallahassee Democrat, [1/10/15](#)]

**Tallahassee Democrat: Thrasher “Sees No Point In Sitting Down With The Progress Coalition After Reading” A Letter From A Graduate Teaching Assistant Known As “Lakey” In The Tallahassee Democrat.** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “Thrasher said he sees no point in sitting down with the Progress Coalition after reading a column in the Tallahassee Democrat on Sunday by a graduate teaching assistant known only as ‘Lakey.’ She wrote that the university’s agreement with the Charles Koch Foundation jeopardized academic freedom.” [Tallahassee Democrat, [1/14/15](#)]

**Lakey “Said Her Group Was Disappointed ‘That Student Interests And Concerns Are Being Relegated To A Place Below Those Of Private Donors.’”** According to the Tallahassee Democrat, “Lakey said her group was disappointed ‘that student interests and concerns are being relegated to a place below those of private donors.’ She said Thrasher had agreed in November to get back to the students but now wanted to meet only with some of them personally.” [Tallahassee Democrat, [1/14/15](#)]

*National Student Protests*

**Students On “Nearly 30 Campuses” Nationwide “Called For A Separation Of College And Corporation” In Protests “Spearheaded” By FSU Students That “Highlighted Financial Influence From The Koch Brothers.”** According to Inside Higher Ed, “Students on nearly 30 campuses around the country called for a separation of college and corporation in protests Monday. Although the events highlighted financial influence from the Koch brothers, organizers said the campaign is a response to a broader trend of corporate influence. The idea was spearheaded by students at Florida State University, where

past criticisms over the university's relationship with the Charles Koch Foundation are now intertwined with criticism of choice of a politician without an academic background for university president." [InsideHigherEd.com, 11/4/14]

- **The Goal Of "UnKoch My Campus" Was To "Increase The Number Of Campuses That Are Trying To Expose The Details Behind Koch Foundation Donations."** According to Inside Higher Ed, "For UnKoch My Campus, the goal is increase the number of campuses that are trying to expose the details behind Koch foundation donations to see if there's anything that blatantly threatens academic freedom, Lindsey Berger, one of the organizers, said. Berger helped author a report on the Koch brothers' influence on college campuses with another organizer, Connor Gibson. The third founder of UnKoch My Campus, Kalin Jordan, started a Koch Free Zone group to protest donations at Suffolk University." [Inside Higher Ed, [11/4/14](#)]
- **Michigan State University Students Filed A Request For Public Records With Ties Between The University And The Koch-Related Foundations.** According to Inside Higher Ed, "Students at Michigan State University asked for tips from students at George Mason University and Florida State on how to request public records about correspondence or contracts between the university and the Koch-related foundations. The group submitted the request Monday." [InsideHigherEd.com, [11/4/14](#)]
- **George Mason University Students Petitioned For Administrators To Release Information About The Kochs' Relationship With The School That They Have Not Been Able To Get Through Public Records.** According to Inside Higher Ed, "At George Mason University, the top university recipient of Koch donations, students are pushing the administration to release information they haven't been able to get through public records. George Mason President Angel Cabrera has said that the university never allows private donor sway over the hiring process, curriculum or anything that would threaten academic integrity. Samantha Parsons, a student who co-founded Transparent GMU, says students deserve proof. On Monday, Parsons and other students handed out fliers and collected signatures for their petition to administrators to release more information. 'People are becoming more and more aware, but there are certainly students who have no idea what's going on,' Parsons said. The Transparent GMU fliers compared the amount of money given since 2005 to Florida State and to George Mason, including through its foundation, the Mercatus Center and the Institute for Humane Studies. Parsons said the total far exceeds Florida State's donations. 'We're really questioning what \$48 million has bought them here at George Mason,' Parsons said." [InsideHigherEd.com, [11/4/14](#)]

**"UnKoch My Campus" Protests "Broke Out Across The Nation" At Nearly 30 Colleges In 2014.** According to Forbes, "UnKoch My Campus' Protests Spread Across Nation: 'UnKoch my campus,' demanded students at nearly 30 colleges on Monday. Protests broke out across the nation as part of a campaign calling for more transparency in what industrialists Charles and David Koch give to college campuses, and how much influence the billionaires wield in academic decisions." [Forbes, [11/4/14](#)]

### *National Criticism*

**LA Times Columnist Michael Hiltzik: The Kochs' Donation To FSU Is An Example Of Wealthy Donors Only "Interested In Advancing Their Own Notions Of How The World Works Or Should Work--In Ideology, Not Ideas."** According to an opinion by columnist Michael Hiltzik for the Los Angeles Times, "Wealthy donors today seldom have an interest in independent, objective academic study; they're interested in advancing their own notions of how the world works or should work--in ideology, not ideas. As we reported earlier this summer, examples of this trend have been proliferating in recent years. In 2007, the Charles Koch Foundation offered Florida State University millions of dollars to set up a libertarian hive in its economics department, according to documents recently disclosed by the Center for Public Integrity." [Michael Hiltzik - Los Angeles Times, [9/15/14](#)]

### **Florida Atlantic University**

**The Charles Koch Foundation Donated \$5,000 To Florida Atlantic University In 2013 For Educational Programs.** [Charles Koch Foundation IRS Form 990, 2013]

### **Florida Gulf Coast University**

*The Charles Koch Foundation Donated Over \$200,000 To Florida Gulf Coast To Buy A Professorship*



**Liberation News: Florida Gulf Coast University Received At Least \$200,000 From The Charles Koch Foundation Between 2009 And 2014, Which “Bought A Professorship That Oversees Donor-Created Courses, An Economics Major, Student Clubs And Other Programming.”** According to Liberation News, “The conference was sponsored by Students for Liberty at FGCU, a student organization created with the help of a donor agreement between FGCU, BB&T, and the Charles Koch Foundation. Between 2009 and 2014, FGCU received at least \$200,000 from Koch and \$600,000 from BB&T. The money bought a professorship that oversees donor-created courses, an economics major, student clubs and other programming.” [Liberation News, [4/3/16](#)]

**Florida Gulf Coast University Student Katie Arnett: The Kochs “Actually Hired A Teacher Here, Created The Economics Major, And Demanded That The ‘Moral Foundations Of Capitalism’ Be A Requirement For Economics Majors.”** According to Liberation News, “‘Koch actually hired a teacher here, created the Economics major, and demanded that the ‘Moral Foundations of Capitalism’ be a requirement for Economics majors,’ Katie Arnett, a Marine Science Major, told Liberation.” [Liberation News, [4/3/16](#)]

- **Arnett Said That Students “Are Funded By Koch To Complete” An Economics Major At Florida Gulf Coast University, “And Then Apply For An Internship At One Of Their Think Tanks.”** According to Liberation News, “‘Koch actually hired a teacher here, created the Economics major, and demanded that the ‘Moral Foundations of Capitalism’ be a requirement for Economics majors,’ Katie Arnett, a Marine Science Major, told Liberation. ‘A lot of students are funded by Koch to complete this major, take the course, and then apply at an internship in one of their think tanks.’” [Liberation News, [4/3/16](#)]

### **Florida Southern College**

**Florida Southern College Received \$600,000 From The Charles Koch Foundation From 2013 – 2014 For Educational Programs.** [Charles Koch Foundation IRS Form 990, 2013, 2014]

- **Florida Southern College Officials Have Not Disclosed The Purpose Of The Koch Foundation Grant But The School’s Center For Free Enterprise Is Led By Derek Yonai, Who Has George Mason Ties And Charles Koch’s Book “The Science Of Success” Is On Their Book Club Reading List.** According to the Center for Public Integrity, “School officials did not respond to questions. ‘The Science of Success’ by Charles Koch is on the book club reading list of the school's Center for Free Enterprise, which is led by Derek Yonai, who received his doctorate at George Mason University.” [Center for Public Integrity, [10/30/15](#)]

### **Jacksonville University**

**The Charles Koch Foundation Donated \$5,000 To Jacksonville University In 2013 For Educational Programs.** [Charles Koch Foundation IRS Form 990, 2012]

### **University of South Florida**

**The Charles Koch Foundation Donated \$7,500 To University Of South Florida From 2010 - 2011 For Educational Programs.** According to Charles Koch Foundation tax documents, the Charles Koch Foundation donated \$2,500 to University of South Florida in 2011 and \$5,000 in 2010 for educational programs. [Charles Koch Foundation IRS Form 990, 2011, 2010]



# THE KOCHS HAVE WORKED TO BOLSTER THEIR SELFISH POLICY INTERESTS AT THE EXPENSE OF FLORIDIANS

## The Koch Agenda To Privatize Medicare

### THE KOCH NETWORK SUPPORTED RYAN BUDGETS THAT WOULD VOUCHERIZE MEDICARE

#### Americans For Prosperity Backed Ryan's 2012 & 2013 Budgets That Would "Essentially End Medicare"

**2011: AFP Backed FY 2012 Ryan Budget, Which Replaced Medicare With A Premium Support Plan.** According to AFP's congressional scorecard for the 112th Congress, AFP took a "yes" position the House vote on House Budget Committee Chairman Paul Ryan's (R-WI) proposed budget resolution covering fiscal years 2012 to 2021 which included a proposal to replace Medicare with a premium support plan. According to the Congressional Research Service, "Under the new system, Medicare would pay a portion of the beneficiaries' premiums, i.e., provide 'premium support.' The payments would be adjusted for age, health status, and income and would be paid directly by the government to the insurance plan selected by the Medicare beneficiary. In addition, plans with healthier enrollees, would be required to help subsidize plans with less healthy enrollees." The vote was 2011 House vote 277. [AFP Scorecard for the 112th Congress, [2/1/13](#); CRS Report #R41767, [4/13/11](#)]

- **Wall Street Journal: Ryan Plan "Would Essentially End Medicare."** According to the Wall Street Journal, "Republicans will present this week a 2012 budget proposal that would cut more than \$4 trillion from federal spending projected over the next decade and transform the Medicare health program for the elderly, a move that will dramatically reshape the budget debate in Washington. [...] The plan would essentially end Medicare, which now pays most of the health-care bills for 48 million elderly and disabled Americans, as a program that directly pays those bills. Mr. Ryan and other conservatives say this is necessary because of the program's soaring costs." [Wall Street Journal, [4/4/11](#)]
- **Ryan's Budget Eliminated Traditional Medicare And Created A Medicare Exchange On Which Seniors Could Purchase Private Plans.** According to the Congressional Research Service, "Individuals who become eligible (based either on age or disability) for Medicare in 2022 and later years would not be able to enroll in the current Medicare program. Instead, they would be given the option of enrolling in a private insurance plan through a newly established Medicare exchange." [CRS Report #R41767, [4/13/11](#)]

**2012: AFP Backed FY 2013 Ryan Budget, Which Proposed Raising The Medicare Eligibility Age To 67 By 2034.** According to AFP's congressional scorecard for the 112th Congress, AFP took a "yes" position on the House vote on House Budget Committee Chairman Paul Ryan's (R-WI) proposed budget resolution covering fiscal years 2013 to 2022 which included a proposal to increase the Medicare eligibility age to 67 by 2034. According to the Congressional Research Service, "The budget proposal would gradually increase the Medicare eligibility age to 67. Beginning in 2023, the age of eligibility for Medicare would increase by two months each year until it reached 67 in 2034." The vote was 2012 House vote 151. [AFP Scorecard for the 112th Congress, [2/1/13](#); CRS Report #R42441, [3/29/12](#)]

- **CBPP: Increasing Medicare Eligibility Age Would Leave Many 65- And 66-Year-Olds Uninsured.** According to the Center on Budget and Policy Priorities, "This means 65- and 66-year-olds would have neither Medicare nor access to health insurance exchanges in which they could buy coverage at an affordable price and receive subsidies to help them secure coverage if their incomes are low. This change would put many more 65- and 66-year-olds who don't have employer coverage into the individual insurance market, where the premiums charged to people in this age group tend to be extremely high — thereby leaving many of them uninsured." [Center on Budget and Policy Priorities, [3/20/12](#)]
- **Raising The Medicare Eligibility Age To 67 Would Have Resulted In \$3.7 Billion In Increased Out-Of-Pocket Costs To Seniors Aged 65 And 66.** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, "In the aggregate, raising the age of eligibility to 67 in 2014 is projected to result in an estimated net increase of \$3.7 billion in out of -pocket costs for those ages 65 and 66 who would otherwise have been covered by Medicare. [Kaiser Family Foundation, [7/11](#)]

- **Costs To Employers Would Increase By \$4.5 Billion And Costs To States By \$700 Million.** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, “costs to employers are projected to increase by \$4.5 billion in 2014 and costs to states are expected to increase by \$0.7 billion.” [Kaiser Family Foundation, [7/11](#)]
- **Increasing The Medicare Eligibility Age Would Raise The Costs Of Healthcare Across The Economy.** According to the Center on Budget and Policy Priorities, “[R]aising Medicare’s eligibility age would not only fail to constrain health care costs across the economy; it would raise them. Medicare provides health coverage more cheaply than private health insurance plans because it has lower administrative costs and pays less to providers. Raising the Medicare age would shift costs to most of the 65- and 66-year olds who would lose Medicare coverage, to remaining Medicare beneficiaries, to employers that provide coverage for their retirees, and to states. These cost increases would, in total, more than offset the savings to the federal government.” [Center on Budget and Policy Priorities, [3/28/12](#)]

**Kaiser Family Foundation Study On Ryan Plan’s Effects for Medicare Beneficiaries Found That Florida Would Be Affected The Most By The Plan, With Additional Premiums Exceeding Over \$200 Per Month.**

**A Kaiser Family Foundation Study Was Based On Paul Ryan’s Plan.** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, “The analysis does not attempt to model any specific proposal, but is generally based on an approach included in House Budget Chairman Paul Ryan’s fiscal year 2013 budget plan, the proposal Chairman Ryan co-sponsored with Senator Ron Wyden of Oregon, and; in the plan put forward by former Senator Pete Domenici and Dr. Alice Rivlin. In the first two proposals, people who are at least 55 years old, including current beneficiaries, would be exempt from the new system. Republican presidential nominee Gov. Mitt Romney has supported a premium-support system along these lines.” [Kaiser Family Foundation, [9/30/12](#)]

- **The Kaiser Study Found That In Florida “At Least Nine In 10 Medicare Beneficiaries...Would Face Higher Premiums In Their Current Plan.”** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, “At least nine in 10 Medicare beneficiaries in Connecticut, Florida, Massachusetts and New Jersey would face higher premiums in their current plan. Many counties in those states have relatively high per-beneficiary Medicare spending, which would make it more costly to enroll in traditional Medicare rather than one of the low-bidding private plans in those counties. In contrast, in areas with relatively low Medicare per-capita spending, it could be more costly to enroll in a private plan.” [Kaiser Family Foundation, [9/30/12](#)]
- **Kaiser Found That Florida Would Be Affected The Most By The Ryan Plan, With Additional Premiums Exceeding Over \$200 Per Month.** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, “Premiums for traditional Medicare would vary widely across states and counties, a significant departure from the current program. On average, premiums for beneficiaries enrolled in traditional Medicare would increase by \$60 per month (\$720 per year), if a premium support system were fully implemented. In four states (AK, DE, HI and WY) plus the District of Columbia, premiums for traditional Medicare would not increase, but, for beneficiaries in six states (CA, FL, MI, NJ, NV and NY), average additional premiums for traditional Medicare would exceed \$100 per month, and in the case of Florida, would exceed \$200 per month.” [Kaiser Family Foundation, [October 2012](#)]
- **Kaiser Found That Medicare Beneficiaries In Miami-Dade County Would Pay The Highest Additional Premiums In The Country Under The Ryan Plan, At \$492 Per Month.** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, “For example, beneficiaries in several high-cost counties would pay significantly more to remain in traditional Medicare, including Miami-Dade County, FL (\$492 per month), Los Angeles County, CA (\$260 per month), Kings County (which includes Brooklyn), NY (\$232 per month), Wayne County (which includes Detroit), MI (\$211 per month), Orange County, CA (\$214 per month) and Riverside County, CA (\$161 per month).” [Kaiser Family Foundation, [October 2012](#)]
- **Kaiser Found That Beneficiaries In Palm Beach County Would Pay An Additional \$371 A Month In Premiums Under The Ryan Plan.** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, the “additional premium to remain in traditional Medicare (monthly)” for Palm-Beach County, FL would be \$371. [Kaiser Family Foundation, [October 2012](#)]
- **Kaiser Found That Beneficiaries In Broward County Would Pay An Additional \$405 A Month In Premiums Under The Ryan Plan.** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, the “additional premium to remain in traditional Medicare (monthly)” for Broward County, FL would be \$405. [Kaiser Family Foundation, [October 2012](#)]

- **Kaiser Found That Beneficiaries In Polk County Would Pay An Additional \$245 A Month In Premiums Under The Ryan Plan.** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, the “additional premium to remain in traditional Medicare (monthly)” for Polk County, FL would be \$245. [Kaiser Family Foundation, [October 2012](#)]
- **Kaiser Found That Beneficiaries In Volusia County Would Pay An Additional \$175 A Month In Premiums Under The Ryan Plan.** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, the “additional premium to remain in traditional Medicare (monthly)” for Volusia County, FL would be \$175. [Kaiser Family Foundation, [October 2012](#)]
- **Kaiser Found That Florida Would Be “At The Extreme,” With Over 77% Of Beneficiaries Subjected To Additional Premiums Over \$100 A Month Under The Ryan Plan.** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, “While more than one in four (27%) beneficiaries nationwide would be subject to additional premiums of \$100 or more per month, this ranges from less than 14 percent of beneficiaries in 29 states and the District of Columbia, to more than 45 percent in 5 states (CA, CT, FL, NJ, and NV; Exhibit 4). At the extreme, half or more of beneficiaries in Florida (77%), Nevada (50%), and New Jersey (57%) would be subject to additional premiums of \$100 or more per month, if they remained in the same plan.” [Kaiser Family Foundation, [October 2012](#)]
- **Kaiser Study: “In Florida, The Vast Majority Of Beneficiaries (89%) Would Be Subject To Additional Premiums Of \$50 Or More Per Month.”** According to the Kaiser Family Foundation, “In Florida, the vast majority of beneficiaries (89%) would be subject to additional premiums of \$50 or more per month, whereas in the District of Columbia, Delaware, and Alaska, less than 2 percent of beneficiaries would be subject to additional premiums of \$50 or more per month.” [Kaiser Family Foundation, [October 2012](#)]

## Privatizing Social Security

### GENERATION OPPORTUNITY CAMPAIGNED TO END SOCIAL SECURITY

#### GenOpp Circulated A Petition Against Social Security

**Generation Opportunity Began A Petition Campaign To “Fix Social Security.”** According to a Generation Opportunity petition, “Fix Social Security! Our generation deserves a brighter future. We want a path forward. Sign This Petition[.]” [GenOpp Petition, Accessed [8/16/16](#)]

- **Generation Opportunity Referred To Social Security As A “Bankrupt” Program That “Doesn’t Work For The 21st Century” And “Has Outlived Its Original Design.”** According to Generation Opportunity, “Social Security is going bankrupt and will bankrupt the country along with it. [...] Created in 1935, Social Security is outdated and doesn’t work for the 21st Century. It has outlived its original design. People are living and working longer today than 80 years ago, and have greater access to retirement savings tools.” [GenOpp Petition, Accessed [8/16/16](#)]
- **GenOpp: “Social Security Is Failing. The Government Takes 1/8th Of Our Wages For A Program We Don’t Need And Benefits We Don’t Expect.”** According to Generation Opportunity, “Social Security is failing. The government takes 1/8th of our wages for a program we don’t need and benefits we don’t expect.” [GenOpp, Accessed [8/24/16](#)]
- **GenOpp’s Petition Called On The “President And Those Elected To Congress To Acknowledge That Social Security Is Outdated And Unsustainable,” To “Advance Meaningful Structural Reform” Or At Least Give Young People “The Choice To Opt-Out.”** According to Generation Opportunity, “I hereby call on the President and those elected to Congress to acknowledge that Social Security is outdated and unsustainable, and to advance meaningful structural reform that gives my generation control over our own future. Without serious change, young people must be given the choice to opt-out.” [GenOpp Petition, Accessed [8/16/16](#)]

*GenOpp Florida Pushed The Petition On Twitter*

**GenOpp Florida: “Social Security Fun Fact: It Will Be BANKRUPT In 13 Years! Sign Our Petition Today To Fix It Or Let Us Out!”** According to a tweet from GenOppFL, #SocialSecurity Fun Fact: It will be BANKRUPT in 13 yrs! Sign our petition today to fix it or let us out!” [GenOppFL Twitter, [8/13/16](#)]

**GenOpp Florida Circulated Their Social Security Petition Saying, “Florida Millennials Deserve Better Than Social Security.”** According to a tweet from GenOppFL, “Florida #Millennials deserve better than Social Security. True story. <http://pllqt.it/Grtc6i>.” [GenOppFL Twitter, [8/12/16](#)]

### **GenOpp’s Anti-Social Security Campaign Has Included Extreme Rhetoric And Solutions**

#### *Use Of Violent Imagery*

**GenOpp Tweeted A Picture Of A Person With A Gun To Their Head In Reference To Social Security.** The following screenshot is of a GenOpp tweet featuring a person with a gun to their head as a visual for their messaging on Social Security:



[GenOpp – Twitter, [6/23/16](#)]

#### *Suggested Crowdfunding As A Replacement To Social Security*

**GenOpp: Since It’s Highly Unlikely Social Security Will Pan Out, Congress Should Pass The “Fix Crowding Act” To Eliminate Barriers To Investment And Open More Crowdfunding Opportunities As A Way To Save For Our Futures.** According to Generation Opportunity, “Since it is highly unlikely that today’s young Americans will ever see even penny’s worth of Social Security benefits, it is especially important for Millennials to have a financial plan in place that will provide alternative options for our retirement. Fortunately for young Americans, the Fix Crowding Act, which passed the House last week, seeks to eliminate barriers to investment opportunities by allowing more people to participate in crowdfunding opportunities. If the bill passes in the Senate, Millennials will get the opportunity to become investors without first having to meet the federal qualifications. By eliminating needless regulation that keeps Millennials out of the investment game, my generation will have more access to opportunities that will allow us to save for our futures.” [GenOpp, [7/14/16](#)]

#### *References To Social Security As An Outdated Scam*



**GenOpp: “Millennials Are Better At Saving Than Prior Gens. We Can Set Up Bank Accounts On A Phone. Social Security Is Outdated.”** According to a tweet from GenOpp, “#Millennials are better at saving than prior gens. We can set up bank accnts on a phone. #SocialSecurity is outdated p2a.co/isfIiXV.” [GenOpp, [7/28/16](#)]

**GenOpp Referred To Social Security As A Scam That We Will “Never Benefit From.”** According to a tweet from GenOpp, “#ItMayBeAScamIf you pay 1/8 of your wages into a fund that you’ll never benefit from. #SocialSecurity pic.twitter.com/xNuuXk0JNq.” [GenOpp – Twitter, [7/14/16](#)]

**GenOpp: “The LAST Thing Millennials Need Is Washington Doing Their Retirement Planning.”** According to a tweet from GenOpp, “The LAST thing #Millennials need is Washington doing their retirement planning. usat.ly/29RoW8t pic.twitter.com/qKvzawBzVs.” [GenOpp – Twitter, [7/14/16](#)]

### **GenOpp Florida Started Grassroots Organizing Against Social Security**

**GenOpp Announced An Orlando “Claim Our Future” Event Focused On Encouraging Millennials To Fight For Control Of Their Retirement Savings And Break Free From The “Outdated,” “Bankrupt” Social Security System.** According to Eventbrite, “Claim Our Future Orlando[.] Generation Opportunity[.] Thursday, September 22, 2016 from 7:00 PM to 10:00 PM (EDT)[.] Orlando, FL[.] Join Generation Opportunity to learn more about how we’re banding together to Claim Our Future. Young Americans know we are not going to benefit from Social Security. Our generation is paying the government to address a problem we’ve already solved. Millennials are saving for retirement 13 years earlier than previous generations, saving more, and have specific savings goals. We, not government, should be in control of our money, our savings, our retirement, and our financial futures. Social Security is outdated, going bankrupt, and doesn’t work for the 21st century.” [Eventbrite, Accessed [8/22/16](#)]

**GenOpp Announced A Tallahassee “Claim Your Piece Of The Pie And Our Future” Event Encouraging Millennials To Fight For Control Of Their Retirement Savings And Break Free From The “Outdated,” “Bankrupt” Social Security System.** According to Eventbrite, “Claim Your Piece of the Pie and Our Future Tallahassee[.] Generation Opportunity[.] Wednesday, September 14, 2016 from 7:00 PM to 10:00 PM (EDT)[.] Tallahassee, FL[.] Join Generation Opportunity to learn more about how we’re banding together to Claim Your Piece of the Pie and Our Future. Young Americans know we are not going to benefit from Social Security. Our generation is paying the government to address a problem we’ve already solved. Millennials are saving for retirement 13 years earlier than previous generations, saving more, and have specific savings goals. We, not government, should be in control of our money, our savings, our retirement, and our financial futures. Social Security is outdated, going bankrupt, and doesn’t work for the 21st century.” [Eventbrite, Accessed [8/23/16](#)]

**GenOpp FL Spoke At The James Madison Institute Conference And Pushed For Social Security Reform.** According to a tweet from GenOpp FL, “Our Deputy Dir @Jeb\_Morris is at the JMI Conference talking about @GenOpp and our push for #SocialSecurityReform! pic.twitter.com/3e5tooZXkM.” [GenOpp FL – Twitter, [8/19/16](#)]

**GenOpp FL Petitioned For Social Security Reform.** According to a tweet from GenOpp FL, “After the storm, we can find a rainbow. Great see our staff petitioning for #SocialSecurityReform pic.twitter.com/BxwBVkFHDz.” [GenOpp FL, [8/10/16](#)]

**GenOpp FL Announced That Their Florida Team Along With HQ Staff Petitioned For Social Security Reform.** According to a tweet from GenOpp FL, “Our FL team is out today with some HQ Staff petitioning for #SocialSecurityReform! What a stellar team! pic.twitter.com/NpEc6f8Kwz.” [GenOpp FL – Twitter, [8/2/16](#)]



**GenOpp FL Tabled For Social Security “Reform.”** According to a tweet from GenOpp FL, “Its a beautiful day in Florida to table for #liberty and #SocialSecurityReform pic.twitter.com/ivJmanZcVN.”



Follow

Its a beautiful day in Florida to table for #liberty and #SocialSecurityReform



[GenOpp FL – Twitter, [7/19/16](#)]

**Generation Opportunity Held A Social Event To Educate Millennials On The “Facts Of Social Security.”** According to a tweet from Generation Opportunity Florida Deputy State Director Jeb Morris, “@abaquerolima educating millennials on the facts of social security. #SourPolicy #SweetSolution @GenOppFL @GenOpp.” [Jeb Morris – Twitter, [7/8/16](#)]

### **GenOpp Has Begun To Hit Florida With An Anti-Social Security Op-Ed Campaign**

**Generation Opportunity Policy Director David Barnes Wrote For The Pensacola News Journal That Democrats And Republicans Are Actively Trying To Ruin Our Futures By Planning To Maintain Or Expand Social Security.**

According to an op-ed by Generation Opportunity policy director David Barnes for the Clarion-Ledger, “For the 25 percent of Florida’s population who are Millennials, politics probably looks pretty bleak this year. No wonder: Both parties are actively trying to ruin our futures. I’m talking about what Democrats and Republicans want to do with Social Security. No one should be surprised to learn this federal program is on the fast track to bankruptcy. That’s been well-known for more than a decade. [...] This is a full-blown crisis. Doing nothing, per Republicans, is irresponsible. Vowing to expand the program, per Democrats, is delusional.” [David Barnes - Pensacola News Journal, [8/9/16](#)]

**Generation Opportunity Policy Director David Barnes Tallahassee Democrat Headline: “Florida Millennials Deserve Better Than Social Security.”** [David Barnes - Tallahassee Democrat, [8/11/16](#)]

### **THE JAMES MADISON INSTITUTE REFERRED TO SOCIAL SECURITY AS A “BANKRUPT” “PONZI SCHEME” & ADVOCATED FOR PRIVATIZATION**

**JMI President Bob McClure: “Social Security Is An Unsustainable Ponzi Scheme That Eventually Will Collapse,” Just As Bernie Madoff’s Scheme Did.** According to an op-ed by JMI President Bob McClure for the Florida Sun Sentinel, “If you want to know what’s wrong with the Social Security system, ask the people who once invested their life savings with Bernie Madoff. That’s because Social Security is an unsustainable Ponzi scheme that eventually will collapse, just as Madoff’s scheme did.” [Bob McClure – Sun Sentinel, [9/5/10](#)]

- **McClure: Social Security Has Been “Bankrupt, And In The Process, It Is Bankrupting America.”** According to an op-ed by JMI President Bob McClure for the Florida Sun Sentinel, “Several factors are contributing to Social Security's unsustainable condition: One, the percentage of Americans paying into Social Security is shrinking. Two, the percentage of Americans drawing Social Security benefits is expanding - and will continue to grow as more and more members of the Baby Boom generation reach retirement age. Three, politicians from both parties have spent whatever perceived ‘funds’ were set aside to protect the program. In short, it is bankrupt, and in the process, it is bankrupting America.” [Bob McClure – Sun Sentinel, [9/5/10](#)]

#### **McClure: Younger Workers Should Have The Opportunity To Establish Private Retirement Savings Accounts.**

According to an op-ed by JMI President Bob McClure for the Florida Sun Sentinel, “Give younger workers the opportunity to establish true retirement savings plans. While it is important for policymakers to fulfill their promises to older Americans who have been assured that they can rely on Social Security, it is also important for policymakers to offer younger workers a new - and better - promise. Specifically, policymakers should give younger workers the opportunity to take a portion of the monies they are currently paying into Social Security and voluntarily divert it into a true personal retirement savings plan - the kind that has an actual account balance.” [Bob McClure – Sun Sentinel, [9/5/10](#)]

## **FLORIDIANS DEPEND ON SOCIAL SECURITY**

**AARP: “One In Five Florida Residents Receives Social Security.”** According to AARP, “The Social Security program not only provides monthly benefits to retired workers, but also to families when the worker retires, dies, or becomes disabled. In 2012, over 56 million Americans received Social Security benefits; of these, 4,004,631 lived in Florida. In 2012, one in five Florida residents received Social Security. While 70% of beneficiaries are retirees, 31% are not: 273,378 are widows and widowers; 537,803 are people with disabilities; 157,144 are spouses; and 252,950 are children.” [AARP, [2014](#)]

**AARP: Social Security Lifts 1.2 Million Floridian Retirees From Poverty Or About 46% Of The State’s Elderly Population.** According to AARP, “Social Security lifts 1.2 million Floridian retirees from poverty. About 44% of the nation’s older population would be living in poverty if they were not receiving Social Security. In Florida, 46% of the state’s 65+ population would have incomes below the poverty line if they did not receive Social Security.” [AARP, [2014](#)]

**AARP: Every \$1 In Social Security In Florida Has Generated \$2.10 In Economic Output For A Total Of \$107.8 Billion For Florida.** According to AARP, “In 2012, Florida residents received \$54.7 billion dollars from Social Security. Every \$1 dollar of Social Security received in Florida generates \$2.10 in economic output. Spending related to Social Security by beneficiaries, businesses and workers on goods and services generates \$107.8 billion in economic output for Florida.” [AARP, [2014](#)]

**AARP: Social Security’s \$54.7 Billion In Paid Benefits “Helped Florida Workers Find Or Keep 738,000 Jobs.”** According to AARP, “The report also reveals Social Security’s role in supporting Florida’s workforce. The \$54.7 billion paid in benefits helped Florida workers find or keep 738,000 jobs.” [AARP, [October 2013](#)]

**AARP: “Florida’s Workers Receive \$29.3 Billion In Salary, Wages And Other Compensation Thanks To The Ripple Effects Of Social Security” Generating “\$5.6 Billion In Local And State Tax Revenue For Florida.”** According to AARP, “And Florida’s workers receive \$29.3 billion in salary, wages and other compensation thanks to the ripple effects of Social Security in state economies. These additional earnings and business income, in turn, generate \$5.6 billion in local and state tax revenue for Florida.” [AARP, [October 2013](#)]

## **The Koch-Backed Campaign Against Florida’s Medicaid Expansion**

### **AFP SAID THEY “WON A CRUCIAL VICTORY” IN QUASHING MEDICAID EXPANSION IN FLORIDA**

**AFP President Tim Phillips: “Medicaid Expansion In Florida Was Just Decided. Our Side Won A Crucial Victory— They Did Not Expand Medicaid There. We’ve Spent A Lot Of Time, A Lot Of Money On That Effort.”** According to an interview AFP President Tim Phillips gave on Fox News’ Power Play with Chris Stirewalt, “STIREWALT: Now across the network, across this organization, we’re talking about a number approaching \$1 billion American dollars. Now, there was a

time in politics when spending \$1 billion would have been really astronomical, but that would still be like a sixth of the total spend for the 2016 cycle coming through. Your group and other groups as part of this network. That is a tremendous amount of money. Can it be raised and can it be spent and can it be spent fruitfully? PHILLIPS: It is a large amount of money to raise and it is a challenge to raise that, absolutely, so we're working hard to do that. It is important to note that a lot of that money is for issue battles happening right now. Medicaid expansion in Florida was just decided. Our side won a crucial victory—they did not expand Medicaid there.” [Fox News – *Power Play with Chris Stirewalt*, [6/15/15](#)]

### **AFP-FL Bragged They Were The “Leading Voice In Opposition For Expanding Medicaid”**

**AFP Press Release: AFP-Florida Is “The Leading Voice In Opposition For Expanding Medicaid Under Obamacare.”** According to a press release from AFP-Florida, “Americans for Prosperity-Florida (AFP-FL), the leading voice in opposition for expanding Medicaid under Obamacare, is launching a major grassroots and mail effort to educate Floridians about which state senators are supporting Medicaid expansion.” [AFP-Florida Press Release, [3/30/15](#)]

- **10 News: “As Support Grows For The Senate's Plan To Revamp Health Care, One Group Has Stood Firm In Their Opposition Against Expanding Medicaid -- Americans For Prosperity.”** According to 10 News’ website, “As support grows for the Senate's plan to revamp health care, one group has stood firm in their opposition against expanding Medicaid -- Americans for Prosperity. ‘It's going to just add 800,000 Floridians into an already broken system and we think that they deserve a much better program, much more quality access to care,’ said Andres Malave, who represents Americans for Prosperity.” [WTSP.com, [6/1/15](#)]

**AFP Florida State Director Chris Hudson: “Americans For Prosperity Has Been Watching Medicaid Expansions Unfold Across The Country, And We See The Results: Medicaid Expansion Doesn’t Work.”** According to wfsu.org, “‘Proponents think they can accept billions of dollars in federal deficit spending on their own terms, without having to acknowledge the heavy strings that come attached to federal funding,’ said Americans For Prosperity, Florida State Director Chris Hudson. ‘Americans for Prosperity has been watching Medicaid expansions unfold across the country, and we see the results: Medicaid expansion doesn’t work,’ he said in a written statement.” [wfsu.org, [3/10/15](#)]

**Hudson: Medicaid Expansion “Allows Washington To Exert Even More Control Over Sunshine State Affairs.”** According to an op-ed by AFP-Florida state director Chris Hudson for the Orlando Sentinel, “Floridians also need a budget that addresses major funding priorities like schools and roads, not one that allows Washington to exert even more control over Sunshine State affairs. Passing a budget without Medicaid expansion is a common-sense solution that does just that.” [Chris Hudson – Orlando Sentinel, [5/31/15](#)]

**Hudson: Expanding Medicaid Would Be An “Irresponsible” Gamble.** According to an op-ed by AFP-Florida state director Chris Hudson for the Orlando Sentinel, “The long-term costs of expansion are also deeply uncertain. Projections range anywhere from an additional \$3.7 billion in spending by 2022 all the way up to \$19.5 billion. That's quite a gamble that would be irresponsible to take.” [Chris Hudson – Orlando Sentinel, [5/31/15](#)]

- **Hudson: “Expansion Also Requires Trusting That The Federal Government Will Cover 90 Percent Of The Additional Costs.”** According to an op-ed by AFP-Florida state director Chris Hudson for the Orlando Sentinel, “Expansion also requires trusting that the federal government will cover 90 percent of the additional costs — which, as our state's recent fight with Washington over Low Income Pool funding shows, is anything but certain. In retaliation for not ceding to its demands, the Obama administration threatened to withhold more than \$1 billion in federal health-care funds next year. While the administration ultimately dropped its demands, expanding Medicaid would only increase the stakes should a future standoff arise.” [Chris Hudson – Orlando Sentinel, [5/31/15](#)]

**Hudson: Expanding Medicaid Does Not Meet “Short-Term Needs Of At Least 800,000 Low-Income Floridians.”** According to an op-ed by AFP-Florida state director Chris Hudson for the Orlando Sentinel, “It is imperative that any budget not expand Medicaid under the Affordable Care Act. For one, it doesn't meet the short-term needs of at least 800,000 low-income Floridians lacking quality health care. Sixty-three of our state's 67 counties already report medical-provider shortages, and 38 percent of physicians either do not accept or limit the number of new Medicaid patients they see. Putting an insurance card in people's hands won't help them if they don't have anywhere to go.” [Chris Hudson – Orlando Sentinel, [5/31/15](#)]



**AFP-Florida State Director Chris Hudson: Instead Of Medicaid Expansion, “Florida Should Pursue A Number Of Patient-Centered Reforms.”** According to an op-ed by AFP-Florida State Director Chris Hudson in the Pensacola News Journal, “After decades of failed reforms, this \$450 billion federal health care system remains woefully insufficient to address the health care needs of our state's poor. It is unaffordable, limits access to health care, and delivers poor results for patients. Florida House Speaker Steve Crisafulli and his House colleagues deserve much credit for their principled opposition to this plan, especially given the politically expedient alternative of allowing it to go through. But what should we do instead? Rather than the one-size-fits-all approach of the federal government, Florida should pursue a number of patient-centered reforms that have been proven to lower costs, increase access, and improve the overall quality of care.” [Chris Hudson – Pensacola News Journal, [4/4/15](#)]

### **AFP-FL Provided Cover And Support For Lawmakers Rejecting The Medicaid Expansion**

**AFP-Florida Canvassed Against “Republican Senators Who Supported Accepting Federal Medicaid Expansion Money.”** According to an editorial from the Tampa Bay Times, “This was a shotgun approach aimed at winning praise from the most conservative Republican voters and Americans for Prosperity. That is the Koch brothers' organization that has become more active in Tallahassee and canvassed some neighborhoods of Republican senators who supported accepting federal Medicaid expansion money.” [Editorial – Tampa Bay Times, [6/23/15](#)]

**AFP-FL “Praised Governor Rick Scott For His Budget Proposal To Cut Taxes And Expand School Choice, But Did Not Give Him A Pass For His Tacit Support Of Medicaid Expansion.”** According to a press release from AFP-FL, “Americans for Prosperity’s (AFP) Florida chapter praised Governor Rick Scott for his budget proposal to cut taxes and expand school choice, but did not give him a pass for his tacit support of Medicaid expansion.” [AFP-FL Press Release, [1/29/15](#)]

- **AFP-FL: “It Is Disappointing For The Governor To Show Any Kind Of Support For A Measure That Will Add Hundreds Of Thousands Of Able-Bodied Adults To The State’s Taxpayer-Funded Healthcare Program.”** According to a press release from AFP-FL, “AFP noted that, given his fiscally conservative record, it is disappointing for the Governor to show any kind of support for a measure that will add hundreds of thousands of able-bodied adults to the state’s taxpayer-funded healthcare program.” [AFP-FL Press Release, [1/29/15](#)]
- **AFP-FL State Director Chris Hudson: “There Is Nothing Conservative About Adding Hundreds Of Thousands Of Able-Bodied Adults To A Taxpayer-Funded Healthcare Program.”** According to a press release from AFP-FL, “Governor Scott has been a reliable supporter of many limited government policies, and we appreciate that he wants to lower taxes further in our state and improve educational outcomes for all children by expanding school choice measures,” explained Chris Hudson, Florida state director of Americans for Prosperity. “However, there is nothing conservative about adding hundreds of thousands of able-bodied adults to a taxpayer-funded healthcare program.” [AFP-FL Press Release, [1/29/15](#)]

**Hudson: “Governor Scott May Feel That He Is Doing The Responsible Thing For Over A Million Florida Residents Who Would Become Eligible Under The Plan. But...If He Accepts These Funds, He’ll Exacerbate The Existing Problems In The Healthcare System.”** According to a press release from AFP-FL, “Governor Scott has been a reliable supporter of many limited government policies, and we appreciate that he wants to lower taxes further in our state and improve educational outcomes for all children by expanding school choice measures,” explained Chris Hudson, Florida state director of Americans for Prosperity. [...] ‘By voicing support for the acceptance of federal funds, Governor Scott may feel that he is doing the responsible thing for over a million Florida residents who would become eligible under the plan. But he should know that, if he accepts these funds, he’ll exacerbate the existing problems in the healthcare system and leave Florida further beholden to the federal government’s healthcare mandates. We don’t need decisions about the health of Floridians being made from D.C.’ [AFP-FL Press Release, [1/29/15](#)]

**Hudson On Gov. Rick Scott Supporting Medicaid Expansion: “We Will Not Stand By While He Voices Support For A Measure That Would Inevitably Lead To Large Increases In Both State And Federal Spending, While Failing To Address The Underlying Problems.”** According to a press release from AFP-FL, “Governor Scott has been a reliable supporter of many limited government policies, and we appreciate that he wants to lower taxes further in our state and improve educational outcomes for all children by expanding school choice measures,” explained Chris Hudson, Florida state director of Americans for Prosperity. [...] ‘We will praise him for what he has done right, and we hope the Governor’s

increased focus on broad base tax cuts that benefit all Floridians is accompanied by a decreased emphasis on targeted tax breaks and industry incentives that only benefit a select few. However, we will not stand by while he voices support for a measure that would inevitably lead to large increases in both state and federal spending, while failing to address the underlying problems that make it so hard for our low-income residents to get the high quality healthcare they need and deserve. Governor, you've got this one wrong, and we hope you'll rethink it. Let's make our state better on all fronts, not cave to the Washington political leadership and beltway punditry.” [AFP-FL Press Release, [1/29/15](#)]

**AFP-FL State Director Chris Hudson: “Unfortunately...Some Senators Believe That Placing Healthy, Able-Bodied Floridians In An Inefficient, Government-Run Health Care Program Is What’s Best For Our Families.”** According to Florida Politics, “‘The Florida Senate has had time to come up with positive solutions to solve the state’s health care needs,’ said Chris Hudson, AFP’s Florida director. ‘Unfortunately up to this point some senators believe that placing healthy, able-bodied Floridians in an inefficient, government-run health care program is what’s best for our families. The Senate should be taking steps to reduce the overall cost of health care in the state’” [FloridaPolitics.com, [3/31/15](#)]

**AFP-Florida Asked For Support From Members To Go Door-To-Door Or Phone Bank “To Fight Medicaid Expansion.”** According to a post from AFP-Florida on Event Brite, “Be Part of the Solution! Come join the Central FL TEAM to make a real difference... We need your support to help us go door-to-door or phone bank to fight Medicaid expansion in our state! We will be walking throughout Central Florida. Snacks, food and refreshments will be provided. There will be 2 shifts 9am and 1pm. All are welcomed to help make a DIFFERENCE!” [AFP-Florida Post via Eventbrite.com, Accessed [5/15/15](#)]

**Hudson: “We Applaud The House Members Who Continue Opposing Medicaid Expansion In Florida And Insisting On Finding Alternative Solutions.”** According to an op-ed by AFP-Florida State Director Chris Hudson in the Pensacola News Journal, “We applaud the House members who continue opposing Medicaid expansion in Florida and insisting on finding alternative solutions. We encourage lawmakers from both sides of the aisle to find and pass those solutions – and to do what's right for our state.” [Chris Hudson – Pensacola News Journal, [4/4/15](#)]

*AFP Backed Their Efforts With A Massive Multimedia Campaign*

**AFP-Florida Press Release: “AFP Will Send Mailers To Floridians To Put Additional Pressure On Lawmakers In The Coming Weeks” To Not Expand The State’s Medicaid Program.** According to a press release from AFP-Florida, “Americans for Prosperity-Florida (AFP-FL), the state’s leading grassroots advocacy organization fighting for better access to care for all Floridians, responded today to the Senate Appropriations committee vote to expand the state Medicaid program. [...] The organization and its over 130,000 activists have been visiting Floridians by going door-to-door and phone banking to hold elected officials accountable in Tallahassee. AFP will send mailers to Floridians to put additional pressure on lawmakers in the coming weeks.” [AFP-Florida Press Release, [3/25/15](#)]

**AFP-Florida Released Its Third Radio Spot Against “Obama’s Medicaid Expansion,” Which Was Scheduled To Run On “More Than 60 Radio Stations Across The State” For About A Week.** According to Florida Politics, “Americans for Prosperity Florida, the statewide libertarian group backed by the conservative Koch Brothers, is once again warning about the push to expand Medicaid in Florida. On Tuesday, AFP-FL released the third ad its latest effort decrying ‘Obama’s Medicaid expansion.’ The new ad calls on Floridians to contact state senators to oppose the ‘bloated and inefficient,’ government-run program. [...] The 30-second radio spot will run on more than 60 radio stations across the state through the rest of the week.” [FloridaPolitics.com, [3/31/15](#)]

**AFP Announced It Would Send Mailers Out To Constituents Of 25 Senators, “Urging Them To Speak Out About The Move” To Expand Medicaid.** According to News 4 JAX, “The Florida Senate looks like it’s poised to pass a plan that would expand Medicaid in the state, which could help almost one million Floridians. But some conservatives are feeling heat from their own supporters. [...] Americans for Prosperity, which is funded by the billionaire Koch brothers, is sending out mailers to constituents of 25 senators, including the Senate president, urging them to speak out about the move.” [News4JAX.com, [3/31/15](#)]

- **AFP-Florida Caught “Flak In The Senate For Mailers Criticizing Lawmakers On The Chamber’s Healthcare Policies—Mainly Its Support Of Accepting Federal Medicaid Dollars.”** According to WFSU.org, “The limited-government and pro-business political action group, Americans For Prosperity is catching flak in the



Senate for mailers criticizing lawmakers on the chamber's healthcare policies—mainly its support of accepting federal Medicaid dollars.” [WFSU.org, [4/14/15](#)]

**AFP-FL Web Ad Against Medicaid Expansion: “Florida Senators Say...It Creates Money And Saves Job, But It Costs Billions And May Lead To Higher Taxes. However They Spin It, Medicaid Expansion Is Bad For Florida.”**

According to Florida Politics, “Florida Senators say it could solve the health crisis,’ the television commercial says. ‘But it could add millions to the system without adding any doctors. They promise it will help low-income Floridians but less than half of the doctors accept Medicaid. They claim it creates money and saves job, but it costs billions and may lead to higher taxes. However they spin it, Medicaid expansion is bad for Florida.” [FloridaPolitics.com, [4/17/15](#)]

- **AFP-Florida’s Web Ad Was Scheduled To “Appear On Internet Sites Statewide.”** According to Florida Politics, “The video will appear on Internet sites statewide, Americans for Prosperity-Florida Communications director Andres Malave told Florida Politics.” [FloridaPolitics.com, [4/17/15](#)]

**AFP-Florida Launched A Television Ad Against Medicaid Expansion In Florida That Was “Timed With The Start Of The Special Florida Legislative Session.”** According to the Miami Herald’s Naked Politics blog, “Americans for Prosperity, a conservative group backed by the industrialist Koch brothers, is continuing to campaign against Medicaid expansion under Obamacare in Florida. The group plans to launch a new television ad timed with the start of the special Florida legislative session, which begins Monday (a longer web version of the spot is below).” [Miami Herald, [5/29/15](#)]

**AFP-Florida “Released A Second Round Of ‘Accountability’ Mail To All 75 House And Senate Legislative Districts” With Representatives Who Voted Against Medicaid Expansion.** According to a post on the Americans for Prosperity website, “Americans for Prosperity-Florida (AFP-FL), the leading voice against Obamacare’s Medicaid expansion, released a second round of ‘accountability’ mail to all 75 House and Senate legislative districts who stood up against special interests to protect families and patients from more government-run health care.” [Americans for Prosperity, [9/1/15](#)]

- **AFP-Florida: The Representative’s Vote To Oppose Medicaid Expansion “Protected 800,000 Floridians From Being Dumped Into A Broken System.”** According to a post on the Americans for Prosperity website, the Representative’s “vote to OPPOSE MEDICAID EXPANSION: Protected 800,000 Floridians from being dumped into a broken system.” [Americans for Prosperity, Accessed [9/1/15](#)]
- **AFP-Florida: The Representative’s Vote To Oppose Medicaid Expansion “Prevented More Government Intrusion In Our Health Care.”** According to a post on the Americans for Prosperity website, the Representative’s “vote to OPPOSE MEDICAID EXPANSION: [...] Prevented more government intrusion in our health care.” [Americans for Prosperity, Accessed [9/1/15](#)]
- **AFP-Florida: The Representative’s Vote To Oppose Medicaid Expansion “Saved Taxpayers Over \$1 Billion.”** According to a post on the Americans for Prosperity website, the Representative’s “vote to OPPOSE MEDICAID EXPANSION: [...] Saved taxpayers over \$1 billion.” [Americans for Prosperity, Accessed [9/1/15](#)]

## **AFP’S EFFORTS WERE ALSO BACKED BY SEVERAL KOCH GROUPS...**

### **LIBRE Claimed The Medicaid Expansion Could Reduce The Quality Of Healthcare For Hispanic Floridians**

**Executive Director Of The LIBRE Initiative Daniel Garza: “Expanding Medicaid Could Ultimately Reduce The Quality Of Healthcare For People In Need In States Like Florida, Where A Large Portion Of The Population Is Hispanic.”** According to a press release from the LIBRE Initiative, “Daniel Garza, Executive Director of The LIBRE Initiative, released the following statement: [...] ‘Expanding Medicaid could ultimately reduce [sic] the quality of Healthcare for people in need in states like Florida, where a large portion of the population is Hispanic. It’s time for the administration to reassess its approach to ensure that the well-being and prosperity of every American is the top goal.’” [LIBRE Initiative Press Release, [5/7/15](#)]

- **Garza: The Obama Administration Needs To Stop Trying To Coerce States To Expand Medicaid And “Measuring Success By Growing The Number Of People Dependent On Government.”** According to a press

release from the LIBRE Initiative, “Daniel Garza, Executive Director of The LIBRE Initiative, released the following statement: “This administration needs to stop measuring success by growing the number of people dependent on government. Coercing states to expand Medicaid, an inefficient and unsustainable program with poor health outcomes, disregards state priorities and prevents them from exploring better and less costly ways to ensure quality healthcare for low-income families. Pushing more Americans into Medicaid puts taxpayers on the hook and appears to be causing a surge in costly emergency room visits nationwide, which ultimately threatens care for the neediest among us.” [LIBRE Initiative Press Release, [5/6/15](#)]

### **The James Madison Institute Claimed Medicaid Expansion Would Merely Subject People To More Problems**

**James Madison Institute Policy Brief: “Florida Should Not Expand Eligibility For Its Medicaid.”** According to a James Madison Institute policy brief, “All factors considered, Florida should not expand eligibility for its Medicaid program — especially not at a time when AHCA, the state agency that oversees the program, is deeply involved in implementing a managed care approach previously tested in a pilot project in five Florida counties.” [James Madison Institute, [March 2014](#)]

- **James Madison Institute: “Expanding Medicaid In Florida Is A Bad Idea.”** [James Madison Institute, [12/24/14](#)]

**James Madison Institute: “25 Reasons NOT To Take Federal Dollars To Expand Medicaid.”** [Sunshine State News, [6/4/15](#)]

**James Madison Institute: Florida Has Already Struggled To Fund Its Current Medicaid Program, Expansion Will Merely Subject People To More Problems.** According to a James Madison Institute policy brief, “As Florida debates whether to expand eligibility for Medicaid to persons with incomes up to 138 percent of the federal poverty level, it is important to remember that the state already struggles to fund its current Medicaid program without wreaking havoc on other important priorities ranging from education to public safety. As Medicaid’s costs explode, a rigid federal statute leaves states’ policymakers with few options to control costs other than by paying Medicaid providers less and less. In turn, these dismal reimbursements jeopardize the access of Medicaid patients to high-quality care. Some studies suggest that Medicaid patients receive care that is even worse than the care provided to patients with no insurance at all. Expansion will not fix the pervasive flaws of the Medicaid program; rather, it will merely subject more people to these problems.” [James Madison Institute, [March 2014](#)]

## **FLORIDA’S MEDICAID EXPANSION WOULD HAVE PROVIDED INSURANCE TO 1.1 MILLION FLORIDIANS & DELIVERED SUBSTANTIAL ECONOMIC & HEALTH BENEFITS**

**Turning Down Medicaid Expansion Denied Some 1.1 Million Floridians Access To Health Insurance They Could Have Otherwise Had Under Medicaid.** According to the Herald Tribune, “Florida is No. 1 again. But state officials may not be accepting many accolades for this latest distinction. Florida leads the nation in turning down Medicaid funding from the federal government, according to a new report from the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation and the Urban Institute. [...] It also means in 2016 some 1.1 million Floridians will go without health insurance who otherwise could be covered by Medicaid, the federal-state health care program for the poor and disabled.” [Herald Tribune, [8/15/14](#)]

- **Florida Would Lose Out On \$66.1 Billion In Federal Funding Over The Next Decade.** According to the Herald Tribune, “By refusing to expand Medicaid under the federal Affordable Care Act, Florida will lose out on \$66.1 billion in federal funding over the next decade. Florida even edges out Texas, which comes in at a close second with \$65.6 billion in lost federal funding.” [Herald Tribune, [8/15/14](#)]

**Florida Center For Fiscal And Economic Policy: Expanding Medicaid Coverage Would Create At Least 65,000 New Jobs In Florida.** According to the Florida Center for Fiscal and Economic Policy, “Because enrollment and match rates will change throughout the period, the economic impact will be different for each year. All other things being equal, however, 65,000 new jobs will be created, generating an additional \$2.7 billion in wages annually. (Under an alternative scenario in which

Medicaid enrollment is higher due to concerted state outreach efforts, the projected job creation increases to more than 81,000.” [Florida Center for Fiscal and Economic Policy, [January 2011](#)]

**Florida Center For Fiscal And Economic Policy: Expanding Medicaid Coverage Would Generate An Additional \$2.7 Billion In Annual Wages.** According to the Florida Center for Fiscal and Economic Policy, “Because enrollment and match rates will change throughout the period, the economic impact will be different for each year. All other things being equal, however, 65,000 new jobs will be created, generating an additional \$2.7 billion in wages annually.” [Florida Center for Fiscal and Economic Policy, [January 2011](#)]

**Expanding Medicaid In Florida Would Reduce The Depression Symptoms Of 70,000 People, Lead To 100,000 More Floridians Being In Better Health, And Save 900 Lives.** According to the South Florida Business Journal, “Expanding the Medicaid umbrella in the state in 2016 would increase the health of the population, the report said. Close to 70,000 additional people would experience reduced symptoms of depression, 100,000 more Floridians would be in better health, and the death toll in the state would decrease by 900.” [South Florida Business Journal, [6/4/15](#)]

**Medicaid Expansion Could Have Saved Florida \$1.3 Billion From 2013 To 2022.** According to Families USA, “When uninsured people go to the doctor or hospital for medical care, they often can’t pay for the full costs of that care. Care that isn’t covered by insurance or paid for by patients themselves is called uncompensated care. Right now, states and localities pay for about 30 percent of the cost of uncompensated care that is provided to the uninsured. By significantly reducing the number of Floridians without health insurance, the Medicaid expansion will, in turn, dramatically reduce the amount of uncompensated care in the state. That will reduce the state’s uncompensated care costs. A recent national study estimated that, for Florida, the Medicaid expansion could result in \$1.3 billion in savings in uncompensated care costs from 2013 to 2022.” [Families USA, [February 2013](#)]

## Koch Efforts To Privatize Florida Education

### KOCH GROUPS PUSHED FOR SCHOOL VOUCHERIZATION & PRIVATIZATION

#### AFP-FL Prioritized Expanding School Voucher Programs

**AFP-FL’s Priorities Included “Expanding School Choice And Eliminating ‘Burdensome Regulations And Licensing Laws At The State And Local Level.’”** According to the Miami Herald, “The group's other priorities include expanding school choice and eliminating ‘burdensome regulations and licensing laws at the state and local level.’” [Miami Herald, [1/15/15](#)]

**Tampa Bay Times: Americans For Prosperity Threw “Considerable Weight” Behind Expanding Florida’s “Controversial” School Voucher Program.** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “Nearly 200 schoolchildren greeted Senate President Don Gaetz last month when he visited a Catholic school in Pensacola to get a firsthand look at the impact of Florida's controversial school voucher program. [...] More powerful political forces are at work in Tallahassee. Those forces include the Florida Chamber of Commerce, Americans for Prosperity and influential think tanks like the conservative James Madison Institute and former Gov. Jeb Bush's Foundation for Florida's Future. All have thrown their considerable weight behind the expansion.” [Tampa Bay Times, [3/5/16](#)]

**AFP-FL Celebrated A Florida District Court Ruling Throwing Out The Florida Education Association’s Lawsuit Over The State’s Largest Private School Voucher Program On Jurisdictional Grounds.** According to Florida Politics, “Americans for Prosperity Florida, the government spending watchdog, says it ‘celebrates’ Tuesday’s appellate court decision on the state’s school vouchers program. ‘On a day that many students across our state return back to school, the (court) ruled in favor of 70,000 low-income Florida students and their families, as well as ruling in favor of our state constitution,’ said Skylar Zander, the group’s deputy director, in a statement. The 1st District Court of Appeal sided with a lower court to throw out the lawsuit filed by the Florida Education Association and others over the state’s largest private school voucher program. They had argued its method of funding private-school educations for more than 90,000 schoolchildren this year is unconstitutional. ‘The Florida teachers union has been trying to play political games with these low-income Floridians and take away their right and access to greater education options for years,’ Zander added. ‘This ruling helps tip the scale of justice back in favor of parents and students.’ The ruling, however, did not reach the merits of the case, but struck down the lawsuit on jurisdictional grounds, saying the plaintiffs didn’t have standing to bring the action.” [Florida Politics, [8/17/16](#)]

### **AFP Sent A Letter To Lawmakers Asking Them To Sponsor A Bill To Establish Publicly-Funded Education Savings Accounts For Use At Educational Institutions Other Than Public Elementary And Secondary Schools.**

According to a post on the Americans for Prosperity website, “State Director Erica Jedynak recently sent the following letter to lawmakers asking for their sponsorship of the legislation, Assembly Bill 1476[:] Dear Senator/Assemblyman/Assemblywoman, On behalf of Americans for Prosperity and our 103,000 grassroots citizen-activists across the state, I kindly request your sponsorship of Assembly Bill 1476, introduced by Asm. Michael Patrick Carroll, which ‘[p]rovides for establishment of publicly-funded education savings accounts for use at educational institutions other than public elementary and secondary schools.’” [Americans for Prosperity, [4/4/16](#)]

**AFP-Florida Announced It Would “Distribute Mailers To A Handful Of Legislators Thanking Them For Their Advocacy On Charter School Expansion.”** According to Florida Politics, “The pro-business political action committee Americans for Prosperity — Florida continues to make waves this Session as it prepares to distribute mailers to a handful of legislators thanking them for their advocacy on charter school expansion. [...] The pro-school choice mailers are seemingly another step in that direction. AFP will drop supportive mailers in the districts represented by Sens. Lizbeth Benacquisto, John Legg and Jeff Brandes as well as Reps. Dane Eagle, Frank Artiles, Bob Cortes and Manny Diaz. A representative example implores the recipient to ‘Call Senator Legg and thank him for standing up for Florida’s families!’” [Florida Politics, [4/6/15](#)]

### **LIBRE Has Held A “High Volume Of Events” Pushing Their School Choice Agenda**

#### **Wall Street Journal: “In Florida And Texas, LIBRE Has Rallied Latinos Around Promoting Charter Schools.”**

According to the Wall Street Journal, “In Florida and Texas, Libre has rallied Latinos around promoting charter schools.” [New York Times, [11/25/15](#)]

- **LIBRE-Florida Has Worked “To Bring School Vouchers, Tax-Credit Scholarship Programs, Personal Tax Credits And Deductions, Open Enrollment, Home Schooling, Charter Schools, Magnet Schools, Virtual Schools/Online Schooling, And Blending Learning” To The State.** According to LIBRE-Florida, “Primarily, we look to bring School Vouchers, Tax-Credit Scholarship Programs, Personal Tax Credits and Deductions, Open Enrollment, Home Schooling, Charter Schools, Magnet Schools, Virtual Schools/Online Schooling, and Blending Learning to our state as a growing list of educational options. Now, that's choice! We, the parents, the people, the taxpayers, need to take back our schools, and one of the most foundational ways is to empower [*sic*] ourselves with the right to choose the school of our choice for our children and those future students that will follow.” [LIBRE, [6/4/13](#)]

#### **BuzzFeed: “The High Volume Of Events” LIBRE Held In Florida Allowed Them To “Beat The Drum” On Their Issues, Like A “Conversation” On School Choice, Which Featured Experts Who Only Supported School Choice.**

According to BuzzFeed, “LIBRE has its biggest operation in Florida, with two full-time teams in Orlando and South Florida, made up of 12 staff members. The groups hold one or two events in Orlando and four a week in South Florida. The high volume of events allowing them to beat the drum on issues that matter to them in friendly confines. A recent panel conversation on school choice, for example, featured experts from around Florida — and all of them supported school choice.” [BuzzFeed, [3/12/15](#)]

**The LIBRE Institute Announced An Effort In Miami To “Raise Awareness Of School Choice Options.”** According to a post by The LIBRE Institute for The LIBRE Institute’s blog, “This week families and educators around the nation celebrate National School Choice Week, with more than 16,000 rallies and events across the country. The LIBRE Institute will join in these efforts to raise awareness of school choice options in cities like: Miami, Denver, Las Vegas, Milwaukee, Austin, and Arizona. The staff and volunteers of The LIBRE Institute will work to engage the Hispanic community with information on how opening the entire variety of educational options — from private schools, to online schools, to homeschooling and beyond — could mean a brighter future for their children.” [TheLIBREInstitute.org/blog, [1/25/16](#)]

### **James Madison Institute Threw “Considerable Weight” Behind Expanding School Vouchers**

**Tampa Bay Times: The James Madison Institute Has Thrown “Considerable Weight” Behind Expanding “Florida’s Controversial School Voucher Program.”** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “Nearly 200 schoolchildren greeted Senate President Don Gaetz last month when he visited a Catholic school in Pensacola to get a firsthand look at the impact of Florida's controversial school voucher program. [...] More powerful political forces are at work in Tallahassee.



Those forces include the Florida Chamber of Commerce, Americans for Prosperity and influential think tanks like the conservative James Madison Institute and former Gov. Jeb Bush's Foundation for Florida's Future. All have thrown their considerable weight behind the expansion.” [Tampa Bay Times, [3/5/16](#)]

**The James Madison Institute Promoted School Choice.** According to the James Madison Institute, “While it is appropriate for education reform efforts to give top priority to disadvantaged students, all K-12 students deserve an education that is tailored to fit them. For this reason, JMI supports universal choice in education so that every Florida child has access to the schools, courses, and educational programs that best meet their unique needs, interests, abilities, and learning styles.” [James Madison Institute, Accessed [8/16/16](#)]

## The Kochs’ Campaign Against Florida’s Environment

### THE KOCHS SELFISHLY FOUGHT SOLAR ENERGY IN FLORIDA

#### Americans For Prosperity Backed Consumers For Smart Solar, An Anti-Solar Coalition

**Americans For Prosperity Backed Consumers For Smart Solar, An Anti-Solar Coalition.** According to an Environment America press release, “The anti-solar coalition Consumers for Smart Solar, backed by AFP, Duke Energy, and others, has now put forward a competing ballot measure in Florida to undermine the rooftop solar amendment and is spreading misinformation about both measures.” [Environment America Press Release, [1/8/15](#)]

- **Americans For Prosperity Teamed Up With Duke Energy In Florida To Block Pro-Solar Policies.** According to an Environment America press release, “In Florida, where solar capacity is far beneath its potential, Koch-backed Americans for Prosperity and Duke Energy, the largest utility in the U.S., have teamed up to block pro-solar policies. Duke Energy spent heavily to help re-elect Gov. Rick Scott, who campaigned against a state renewable electricity standard. AFP has mobilized its members and waged an aggressive ad campaign against a ballot initiative to expand rooftop solar by allowing third-party sales of panels. Duke Energy has also contributed to that effort.” [Environment America Press Release, [1/8/15](#)]

**Environment America Press Release: “Through Its Front Group Americans For Prosperity And Funding To Other Like-Minded Entities, The Koch Brothers Have Attacked Solar Laws In Several States.”** According to an Environment America press release, “Through its front group Americans for Prosperity and funding to other like-minded entities, the Koch brothers have attacked solar laws in several states including Florida, Georgia, Kansas, North Carolina, Arizona, Minnesota, Ohio, South Carolina, and Washington state.” [Environment America Press Release, [1/8/15](#)]

**AFP-FL Communications Director Andrew Malave: “Solar Can Not Compete In A Free Market, It Relies On Government Mandates And Taxpayer-Funded Subsidies To Make It Feasible.”** According to the Saint Peters Blog, “Andrew Malave, communications director with Americans for Prosperity, told Florida Politics that his organization will be hosting a news conference on Tuesday to address the issue. ‘We should not favor one source of energy over the other in the constitution or anywhere else,’ he wrote in an email. ‘Solar can not compete in a free market, it relies on government mandates and taxpayer-funded subsidies to make it feasible.’” [SaintPetersBlog.com, [3/9/15](#)]

- **Conservatives For Energy Freedom Co-Founder Debbie Dooley: “AFP Frequently Mentions The Subsidies For Solar, But Fails To Bring Up The Fact Fossil Fuel And Nuclear Have Been Very Heavily Subsidized Since 1932.”** According to the Saint Peters Blog, “The drive to put a constitutional amendment on the ballot next year that would allow Floridians more choice about using solar power has enjoyed quick success, and furious pushback from their opponents. On Saturday, Conservatives for Energy Freedom, one of the groups pushing for a constitutional amendment in 2016 on solar, blasted the group Americans for Prosperity for what they claim are inaccurate talking points that the group has been issuing out. ‘AFP frequently mentions the subsidies for solar, but fails to bring up the fact fossil fuel and nuclear have been very heavily subsidized since 1932 and still are,’ says Debbie Dooley, Conservatives for Energy Freedom co-founder. ‘AFP doesn’t seem to have an issue with subsidies if it is in the financial interests of their major donors. For the record, I oppose ALL energy subsidies.’” [SaintPetersBlog.com, [3/9/15](#)]



**AFP-Florida Announced It Will Host A News Conference To Address Efforts To Put A Constitutional Amendment On The Ballot In 2016 That “Would Allow Floridians More Choice About Using Solar Power.”** According to the Saint Peters Blog, “The drive to put a constitutional amendment on the ballot next year that would allow Floridians more choice about using solar power has enjoyed quick success, and furious pushback from their opponents. [...] Andrew Malave, communications director with Americans for Prosperity, told Florida Politics that his organization will be hosting a news conference on Tuesday to address the issue.” [SaintPetersBlog.com, [3/9/15](#)]

**AFP-Florida Director Chris Hudson Spoke In Favor Of A Resolution Opposing Direct Solar Power Sales**

**Unanimously Approved By ALEC's Energy, Environment, And Agriculture Task Force.** According to the Heartland Institute, "America's most prominent group of conservative legislators has approved a model resolution opposing a market-share carve-out for direct solar power sales. [...] Legislators on ALEC's Energy, Environment, and Agriculture Task Force approved the resolution opposing direct solar sales by unanimous vote on July 24 at ALEC's 2015 Annual Meeting. The ALEC Board of Directors approved the resolution on September 4. [...] 'People should of course be free to put solar panels on their home, but they should not be forced to subsidize the choices of their neighbors,' [Americans for Prosperity Florida state director Chris] Hudson explained. 'American taxpayers and ratepayers deserve an energy policy that allows energy sources to compete on their merits — not on special favors. The fact that this resolution passed at ALEC shows state legislators are waking up to the problems of solar energy subsidies.'" [Heartland Institute, [12/3/15](#)]

**Proposed Ballot Initiative Would "Allow Business Or Property Owners To Produce Up To 2 Megawatts Of Solar Power And Sell That Power Directly To Others, Such As Tenants, Without Having To Go Through A Utility."**

According to the Tampa Bay Times, "If the proposed ballot measure passes, solar proponents argue it would open up Florida's solar energy market, which has largely stagnated for years. The measure would allow business or property owners to produce up to 2 megawatts of solar power and sell that power directly to others, such as tenants, without having to go through a utility." [Tampa Bay Times, [3/7/15](#)]

- **Tampa Bay Times: "Only Five States, Including Florida, Ban The Practice" Of Allowing Business Or Property Owners To Sell Solar Power Directly To Others.** According to the Tampa Bay Times, "Under state law, only utilities can sell electricity directly to consumers, though solar proponents argue that 36 states allow the practice. Only five states, including Florida, ban the practice." [Tampa Bay Times, [3/7/15](#)]

**AFP-Florida Sent An Email That Criticized The Solar Ballot Initiative As An Effort That Used Money, Government "And Taxpayers To Prop Up The Solar Industry."**

According to the Tampa Bay Times, "In a news release Saturday, Conservatives for Energy Freedom, part of a bi-partisan coalition leading the ballot petition, said inaccurate statements have been circulating in e-mails from Americans For Prosperity. The e-mail criticizes the ballot initiative as an effort about 'money, and using government and taxpayers to prop up the solar industry. The solar industry cannot survive without taxpayer funded subsidies and mandates.'" [Tampa Bay Times, [3/7/15](#)]

*AFP-Florida's Opposition To Solar Has Put Them At Odds With Even Tea Party Groups*

**Tea Party Groups Were Put "At Odds" With AFP After The Groups Formed A Coalition With Progressive Organizations In An Effort To Open Florida Up To The Solar Energy Industry.**

According to a transcript of NPR's All Things Considered, "Florida is one of several states where the Tea Party has embraced a new cause: solar energy. Tea Party groups are teaming up with progressive organizations to open up the solar energy industry. It's an unusual coalition and puts them at odds in some states with another conservative grassroots organization, the Koch brothers-backed Americans for Prosperity." [NPR All Things Considered, [2/24/15](#)]

**Floridians For Solar Choice Was Made Up Of "The Tea Party And Christian Coalition Conservatives As Well As Libertarians."**

According to the Tampa Bay Times, "The ballot initiative and the coalition, Floridians for Solar Choice, have forged a unique group that includes the tea party and Christian Coalition conservatives as well as Libertarians; liberal environmentalists such as the Southern Alliance, the Sierra Club and Greenpeace; Physicians for Social Responsibility; and the Florida Retail Federation." [Tampa Bay Times, [3/7/15](#)]

- **Tampa Bay Times: "Floridians For Solar Choice Has Brought Together Groups That Rarely — If Ever — Align."** According to the Tampa Bay Times, "But Floridians for Solar Choice has brought together groups that rarely — if ever — align, including clean-energy activists, the Christian Coalition of America, the tea party and the Libertarian Party." [Tampa Bay Times, [1/14/15](#)]

**Huffington Post: "Conservative Advocates In Florida Say AFP Has Been Emailing And Calling Supporters In The State To Try To Turn Them Against The Ballot Measure."**

According to the Huffington Post, "Conservative advocates

in Florida say AFP has been emailing and calling supporters in the state to try to turn them against the ballot measure.” [Huffington Post, [3/10/15](#)]

**AFP-Florida’s Email Said Floridians For Solar Choice Was “A Front Group For The Southern Alliance For Clean Energy,” And Asserted The Group Was Funded By Tom Steyer.** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “In addition, the e-mail asserts that the coalition, Floridians for Solar Choice, is merely ‘a front group for the Southern Alliance for Clean Energy (SACE)’ and that the environmental group is funded by liberal, California-based activist Tom Steyer.” [Tampa Bay Times, [3/7/15](#)]

- **Southern Alliance Executive Director “There Is No Tom Steyer Money Associated With This Effort At This Point.”** According to the Tampa Bay Times, “Steve Smith, executive director of the Southern Alliance, said his organization has never received money directly from Steyer and ‘there is no Tom Steyer money associated with this effort at this point.’” [Tampa Bay Times, [3/7/15](#)]

*AFP Hypocritically Attacked Energy Freedom With Arguments From The Oil And Gas Industry*

**AFP-FL Communications Director Andrew Malave: “Solar Can Not Compete In A Free Market, It Relies On Government Mandates And Taxpayer-Funded Subsidies To Make It Feasible.”** According to the Saint Peters Blog, “Andrew Malave, communications director with Americans for Prosperity, told Florida Politics that his organization will be hosting a news conference on Tuesday to address the issue. ‘We should not favor one source of energy over the other in the constitution or anywhere else,’ he wrote in an email. ‘Solar can not compete in a free market, it relies on government mandates and taxpayer-funded subsidies to make it feasible.’” [SaintPetersBlog.com, [3/9/15](#)]

**Malave Cited A Study That Found “Net Metering Shifted Millions Of Dollars Of Costs From Solar Users To Other Ratepayers.”** According to the Saint Peters Blog, “[AFP-FL Communications Director Andrew] Malave also cited a study by the Louisiana Public Service Commission last week that ‘found net metering shifted millions of dollars of costs from solar users to other ratepayers.’” [SaintPetersBlog.com, [3/9/15](#)]

**The Study Was Conducted By A Louisiana State University Economist “Who Has Done Work For Utility Companies And The Oil And Gas Industry.”** According to the Saint Peters Blog, “[AFP-FL Communications Director Andrew Malave] was referring to study by David Dismukes of Acadian Consulting that said that the state’s 50-percent tax credit for installing new solar panels was a boondoggle, costing the state at least \$89 million more than the benefits created. But that study has been strongly criticized by solar advocates for being biased. Dismukes is an LSU [Louisiana State University] economist who has done work for utility companies and the oil and gas industry.” [SaintPetersBlog.com, [3/9/15](#)]

## **60 Plus Association Endorsed Florida’s Anti-Solar, Smart Solar Amendment**

**60 Plus Association Endorsed Florida’s Smart Solar Amendment.** According to a blog post by Phil Ammann from Saint Peters Blog, “60 Plus Association, a major senior advocacy group with chapters in Florida and Alabama, announced on Thursday its endorsement of the Smart Solar Amendment, an initiative seeking inclusion on Florida’s 2016 November ballot. The group, which promotes free enterprise and less government in senior issues, is joining Consumers for Smart Solar — a bipartisan coalition of business, civic and faith leaders – to promote the campaign.” [Saint Peters Blog - Phil Ammann, [7/30/15](#)]

- **60 Plus Said The Smart Solar Amendment Provided Consumer Protections That “Directly Benefit Seniors.”** According to a blog post by Phil Ammann from Saint Peters Blog, “Supporters of Smart Solar say it guarantees essential consumer protections while ensuring increased access to the newest solar technology. 60 Plus says the Amendment – officially called the Rights of Electricity Consumers Regarding Solar Energy – provides consumer protections that directly benefit seniors.” [Saint Peters Blog - Phil Ammann, [7/30/15](#)]

**“Anti-Solar Interests” Are “Served” By Groups Such As TPA, The 60-Plus Association And The Edison Electric Institute, “Often On Behalf Of Electric Utilities.”** According to PV Tech, “Regular readers of PV Tech will have seen accusations before that anti-solar interests are being served both openly and covertly by groups with seemingly innocuous and unrelated titles, such as TPA, the 60-plus Association and the Edison Electric Institute, often on behalf of electric utilities.” [PV Tech, [8/26/15](#)]



**The Campaign In Favor Of Florida’s “Smart Solar” Amendment, Which Would Have Maintained A “Lock On Electricity Sales,” Received Over \$1 Million From The 60 Plus Association And \$100,000 From The National Black Chamber Of Commerce.** According to Rolling Stone, “Seeking to crack open Florida’s energy market at the ballot box, the Southern Alliance for Clean Energy (SACE) mounted a \$2 million campaign to qualify a “Solar Choice” amendment for the 2016 election. The constitutional amendment would have ended Florida’s rare lock on electricity sales; only Kentucky, Oklahoma and North Carolina have similar prohibitions. [...] But rather than campaign directly against the Solar Choice amendment – which polled at nearly 70 percent – the IOUs mounted a competing ballot initiative called the ‘Smart Solar’ amendment. Despite the name, their amendment doesn’t advance the cause of solar power. Quite the reverse: ‘It locks existing statute into the constitution,’ says a skeptical Republican Florida lawmaker. The Smart Solar amendment is financed, nakedly, by the state’s top investor-owned utilities, which ponied up \$4 million through December, more than half the campaign’s total haul. ‘We are proud of who supports our campaign,’ says spokeswoman Sarah Bascom. Other supporters include conservative pressure groups funded by fossil-fuel interests. 60 Plus – a seniors group that has received \$15 million from the Koch donor network – donated more than \$1 million. The National Black Chamber of Commerce (NBCC), a tiny organization with an oversize name, added \$100,000.” [Rolling Stone, [2/11/16](#)]

**60 Plus’ Anti Solar Campaign In Florida Comes After “The Organization Received Secret Funding In 2013 From Arizona’s Largest Utility–APS” To Run Ads Pushing Opposition To Home Solar.** According to Nation of Change, “Another contributor to the anti-solar campaign is the ‘60 Plus Association,’ which contributed \$100,000. [...] This is not the first time that 60 Plus has been deployed for this kind of operation, even though it is more widely known for peddling opposition to health care reform. This Koch-aligned operation received secret funding in 2013 from Arizona’s largest utility–APS—to run ads in another very sunny state, Arizona, pushing opposition to home solar.” [Nation of Change, [9/30/15](#)]

### **Even Conservative Activists Criticized Koch Groups For Their Hypocritical Campaign Of Deception**

*Conservatives For Energy Freedom Co-Founder Debbie Dooley: Americans For Prosperity “Threw Away Their Principles” To Oppose Solar*

**Conservatives For Energy Freedom Co-Founder Debbie Dooley: “AFP Frequently Mentions The Subsidies For Solar, But Fails To Bring Up The Fact Fossil Fuel And Nuclear Have Been Very Heavily Subsidized Since 1932.”** According to the Saint Peters Blog, “The drive to put a constitutional amendment on the ballot next year that would allow Floridians more choice about using solar power has enjoyed quick success, and furious pushback from their opponents. On Saturday, Conservatives for Energy Freedom, one of the groups pushing for a constitutional amendment in 2016 on solar, blasted the group Americans for Prosperity for what they claim are inaccurate talking points that the group has been issuing out. ‘AFP frequently mentions the subsidies for solar, but fails to bring up the fact fossil fuel and nuclear have been very heavily subsidized since 1932 and still are,’ says Debbie Dooley, Conservatives for Energy Freedom co-founder. ‘AFP doesn’t seem to have an issue with subsidies if it is in the financial interests of their major donors. For the record, I oppose ALL energy subsidies.’” [SaintPetersBlog.com, [3/9/15](#)]

**Dooley On AFP’s Solar Power Position: “You Don’t Throw Your Principles Out The Window To Benefit Your Corporate Benefactors.”** According to the Huffington Post, “[Conservatives For Energy Freedom Founder Debbie] Dooley accused the group [AFP] of kowtowing to its corporate benefactors rather than the will of the people, as the Koch brothers made much of their money off fossil fuels. ‘You don’t throw your principles out the window to benefit your corporate benefactors,’ she said.” [Huffington Post, [3/10/15](#)]

**Dooley: “AFP Is Supposed To Espouse Free-Market Principles, But They’re Trying To Prevent Floridians From Engaging In Commerce In A Free-Market Manner.”** According to the Huffington Post, “‘AFP is supposed to espouse free-market principles, but they’re trying to prevent Floridians from engaging in commerce in a free-market manner,’ [Conservatives For Energy Freedom Founder Debbie] Dooley told The Huffington Post. ‘They are resorting to outright lies.’” [Huffington Post, [3/10/15](#)]

**Dooley: “The Koch Brothers Are Trying To Throw Back Solar On A State-By-State Level ... They Understand That Solar Is Taking Off, And They’re Trying To Stop Competition.”** According to Next City, “In Florida, meanwhile, a group called Conservatives for Energy Freedom is gathering signatures for a ballot amendment that would allow residents to produce and sell solar energy directly to other consumers. Its founder, Debbie Dooley, is also cofounder of the Atlanta Tea Party, and one of 22 people who helped jumpstart the movement nationally in 2009. ‘I realized that I wanted to bring up a



group that was strictly conservatives advocating for solar and other forms of clean energy,' she says of her decision to bring alternative energy and free market advocacy together under the heading 'Green Tea.' Too many conservatives, she adds, 'have been brainwashed into thinking that only tree huggers and liberals care about the environment.' Neither group has advocated heavily, so far, on the issue of state mandates — and they're not exactly a natural fit. On an ideological level, Dooley explains, she believes in removing all mandates. But in the technical interest of allowing solar and wind to compete with coal and oil, she also reads between the lobbying lines. 'You have to look at it on a state-by-state basis,' she says, in response to my question on what she thinks of RPS. 'The Koch Brothers are trying to throw back solar on a state-by-state level ... They understand that solar is taking off, and they're trying to stop competition.'" [Next City, [1/14/15](#)]

**Dooley Said "She Has Already Been Attacked By Groups Aligned With The Billionaire Koch Brothers."** According to Fox News, "Debbie Dooley -- founder of the Atlanta Tea Party -- is leading the charge [...]. Dooley says she has already been attacked by groups aligned with the billionaire Koch brothers, who have huge interests in energy. 'I've been called a fake conservative, a front for the left,' Dooley told Fox News. 'If you Google my name, you'll see how laughable that is. I've been called many things, but I've never been called a tree hugger or a liberal.'" [Fox News, [1/16/15](#)]

*60 Plus Engaged In "A Campaign Of Deception" In Their Anti-Solar Efforts*

**Conservative Grassroots Activist Claimed 60 Plus Is Engaging In A Campaign Of Deception Because Their Donors Have Extensive Fossil Fuel Holdings And Prefer To Eliminate Competition From Other Energy Forms.** According to an article from Breitbart News, "Floridians for Solar Choice countered 60 Plus' response with an email rebuttle from conservative grassroots activist Debbie Dooley: It is not surprising to learn 60 Plus is joining the campaign of deception being led by government created monopolies. 60 Plus is funded by groups whose donors have extensive fossil fuel holdings that prefer not to have competition from other energy forms." [Breitbart News, [8/7/15](#)]

**60 Plus Strongly Opposed Regulation, But In Florida They Joined With Monopolies To Keep Regulations That Deny Floridians Choice In Who They Purchase Their Power From.** According to an article from Breitbart News, "60 Plus strongly opposes excessive EPA Regulation and rightly so. It is unfortunate that in Florida, they are joining with the monopolies to keep regulation in place that denies Floridians choice in who they purchase their power from and the right to engage in commerce with excess power generated on private property. They are joining with Florida Power and Light and others that appear to believe solar should be regulated under the guise of consumer protection. Consumers are not protected now with a PSC under the influence of utilities. Don't conservatives believe the ultimate consumer protection comes from free market choice? Principled conservatives work to remove regulations-not keep regulations in place." [Breitbart News, [8/7/15](#)]

## KOCH GROUPS RAILED AGAINST THE EPA CLEAN POWER PLAN

### Americans For Prosperity Influenced Legislative Efforts To "Prohibit State Funding For The EPA's Efforts To Fight Climate Change"

**AFP-FL Applauded Attorney General Bondi For Taking The Lead On "Challenging The Overreaching Carbon Rule On Existing Power Plants Crafted By Obama's Environmental Protection Agency."** According to a post on the Americans for Prosperity website, "Americans for Prosperity-Florida (AFP-FL), the leading grassroots advocate for shrinking the size of government and holding government official accountable, applauds Attorney General Pam Bondi for taking the lead on challenging the overreaching carbon rule on existing power plants crafted by Obama's Environmental Protection Agency. She is leading state attorneys general from around the country in response to the continuous onslaught of the ever changing and costly carbon rule sent down by unelected, unaccountable bureaucrats without input from elected officials from Congress. Her lawsuit is gaining momentum, being recently joined from attorneys general in other states." [Americans for Prosperity, [11/6/15](#)]

**Florida Legislators Introduced Americans For Prosperity Model Legislation "Seeking To Prohibit State Funding For The Environmental Protection Agency's Efforts To Fight Climate Change" Through Limits On Carbon Emissions.** According to Think Progress, "Lawmakers from at least four states have introduced model legislation from the right-wing group Americans for Prosperity (AFP) seeking to prohibit state funding for the Environmental Protection Agency's efforts to fight climate change. [...] Nearly identical resolutions have also been introduced in Florida, Virginia, and South Carolina in 2015. Each one says the proposed limits on carbon emissions from power plants 'will not measurably alter any

impacts of climate change,' 'conflicts with a literal reading of the law,' and would "effectively amount to a federal takeover of the electricity system of the United States." [Think Progress, [3/13/15](#)]

**Americans For Prosperity Florida State Director Chris Hudson Sun Sentinel Op-Ed Headline: "Florida State Lawmakers Should Fight EPA's Dangerous Economic Plan."** [Chris Hudson - Sun Sentinel, [1/3/15](#)]

- **Americans For Prosperity Florida State Director Chris Hudson: President Obama Has Said It Is Environmentally Necessary To Cut Florida's Greenhouse Gas Emissions By 38% By Passing The Clean Power Plan, But The "Exact Opposite Is True" And The "Regulation Will Have Essentially Zero Economic Benefits."** According to an op-ed by Americans for Prosperity Florida State Director Chris Hudson for the Sun Sentinel, "President Obama is finally trying to make good on his 2008 campaign promise to heal our warming planet and calm our rising seas. His administration will soon release a regulation that will force Florida to cut its greenhouse gas emissions by 38 percent — a move which the president has touted as environmentally and economically necessary. The exact opposite is true. Known as the 'Clean Power Plan,' this sweeping regulation will have essentially zero environmental benefits." [Chris Hudson - Sun Sentinel, [1/3/15](#)]
- **Hudson: Florida State Legislators Should Pass Legislation To "Prohibit The Use Of State Funds On Implementing This Regulation Until The EPA Proves It Has The Legal Authority To Act" To Try To Prevent Floridians From Funding This "Boondoggle."** According to an op-ed by Americans for Prosperity Florida State Director Chris Hudson for the Sun Sentinel, "Which is why Florida state legislators should pass legislation protecting our taxpayer money. Such a law would be quite simple: It would prohibit the use of state funds on implementing this regulation until the EPA proves it has the legal authority to act. Florida taxpayers shouldn't be funding this boondoggle until the courts have had their say." [Chris Hudson - Sun Sentinel, [1/3/15](#)]

### **The 60 Plus Association Dubbed The Clean Power Plan The "Cruel Power Plan"**

**The 60 Plus Association Advocated For Florida House Bill 849 To Give The State Legislature Power Over How To Respond To The Clean Power Plan.** According to the 60 Plus Association, "The 60 Plus Association, a nonpartisan senior's advocacy group with more than 800,000 senior supporters in Florida, called on the Florida House Energy and Utilities Subcommittee today to approve and advance House Bill 849, which has bipartisan support and is sponsored by Florida State Representative John Wood (R-41). The bill is expected to be heard in committee on Thursday, March 12th. 'House Bill 849 would give Florida's state legislature a vital role to play in determining how the state will ultimately respond to the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's so-called "Clean Power Plan",' said Jim Martin, the president of 60 Plus. [...] As elected representatives of the people, it is critical that the state legislature work to protect Floridians — especially those most vulnerable — by being active in the development and ultimate approval of the state's implementation plan. By advancing House Bill 849, the Florida House Energy and Utilities Subcommittee would take an important step in that direction." [60 Plus Association, [3/11/15](#)]

**The 60 Plus Association Dubbed The Clean Power Plan The "Cruel Power Plan."** According to the 60 Plus Association, "'For seniors, EPA's proposal is more aptly named the 'Cruel Power Plan.' EPA's proposal would be the costliest regulation ever promulgated by the agency, and seniors, especially those on a fixed-income, would be hit the hardest by the electricity rate increases that Florida will be subjected to under this federal mandate.'" [60 Plus Association, [3/11/15](#)]

**60 Plus Association Vice President Amy Noone Frederick: "President Obama And The EPA Are Championing Energy Policies That Will Disproportionately Affect Florida's Seniors And Do Little To Improve The Environment."** According to 60 Plus, "'We were honored to be joined by State Senator Greg Evers, State Representative Doug Broxson and State Representative Mike Hill to discuss the negative impact current and pending EPA regulations will have on Florida's seniors. President Obama and the EPA are championing energy policies that will disproportionately affect Florida's seniors and do little to improve the environment,' said Amy Noone Frederick." [PR Newswire, [10/8/14](#)]

### **The James Madison Institute Claimed Implementing The Clean Power Plan Would Be "Devastating For Consumers And Our Nation"**

**James Madison Institute Center For Property Rights Director Dan Peterson: The Clean Power Plan Is Nothing More Than A "Regulatory Workaround To The Cap And Trade Scheme" Which Would "Takeover Of Our Nation's**

**Electrical Power Grid Via Regulation, Something That Has Always Been Regulated By The States.”** According to an op-ed by James Madison Institute Center for Property Rights Director Dan Peterson for Florida Politics, “A recent example of such a decision is the Clean Power Plan (CPP). The CPP is a mandate from the Obama administration for electricity producing power plants to reduce CO2 emission by 30 percent by 2030. It is nothing more than the regulatory workaround to the Cap and Trade scheme, which failed to gain traction in Congress in 2010. In effect, it is a takeover of our nation’s electrical power grid via regulation, something that has always been regulated by the states.” [Dan Peterson - Florida Politics, [6/16/16](#)]

**Peterson: “Implementation Of The CPP Would Be Devastating For Consumers And Our Nation.”** According to an op-ed by James Madison Institute Center for Property Rights Director Dan Peterson for Florida Politics, “Implementation of the CPP would be devastating for consumers and our nation. The Environmental Protection Agency’s plans will force Florida and 46 other states to systematically limit the power plants that we rely on for our power and shift to other energy sources; ones that as yet remain as untested as they are unreliable. While the EPA’s estimates have repeatedly been shown to underestimate the cost of the Plan and exaggerate the benefits, an independent study has found that Florida’s electricity prices face an 11 percent average annual electricity price increase with a peak year electricity price increase of 15 percent.” [Dan Peterson - Florida Politics, [6/16/16](#)]

**Peterson: “It Comes As No Small Relief That A Bipartisan Coalition Of Attorneys General, Including Florida Attorney General Pam Bondi, Has Pushed Back Against Federal Overreach By Suing The EPA Over The CPP.”** According to an op-ed by James Madison Institute Center for Property Rights Director Dan Peterson for Florida Politics, “It comes as no small relief that a bipartisan coalition of Attorneys General, including Florida Attorney General Pam Bondi, has pushed back against Federal overreach by suing the EPA over the CPP, and have secured an unprecedented stay from the Supreme Court while working for a total overturn.” [Dan Peterson - Florida Politics, [6/16/16](#)]

**James Madison Institute Center For Property Rights Director Dan Peterson Claimed The Supreme Court Stay Of The Clean Power Plan Was A “Huge Gift.”** According to an op-ed by James Madison Institute Center for Property Rights Director Dan Peterson for Sunshine State News, “Recently, electricity ratepayers received a huge gift from the Supreme Court of the United States. The justices voted to issue a stay halting the implementation of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency’s Clean Power Plan (CPP).” [Dan Peterson - Sunshine State News, [2/19/16](#)]

- **Peterson Referred To The Supreme Court’s Action As Wise And Said Antonin Scalia’s Sudden Passing “Further Underscores The Importance Of The Judicial Role Of Checks And Balances With Respect To Questions Of Executive Overreach.”** According to an op-ed by James Madison Institute Center for Property Rights Director Dan Peterson for Sunshine State News, “The Supreme Court’s wise action to halt implementation has taken all regulation mandates and deadlines off the table — and fortunately for Florida’s electricity consumers, price increases and potential electricity shortages too. The sad and surprising passing of Justice Antonin Scalia further underscores the importance of the judicial role of checks and balances with respect to questions of executive overreach and agency rulemaking that runs counter to the prescribed role of our legislative branch.” [Dan Peterson - Sunshine State News, [2/19/16](#)]

### **The Clean Power Plan Would Prevent Thousands Of Premature Deaths And Provide Floridians Billions In Economic Benefits**

**NRDC: Implementing The Clean Power Plan And Decreasing The Impacts Of Climate Change Will Provide Floridians \$54 Billion In Benefits By 2030.** According to the NRDC, “The Clean Power Plan will reduce the nation’s carbon pollution from fossil-fueled power plants 32 percent below 2005 levels by 2030. [...] Florida faces large public health and economic costs from climate change. Some 1.6 million Florida residents live less than 1 meter above the local mean high water mark. Even a few inches of sea level rise can pose a major threat to areas in southeast Florida. By decreasing the impacts of climate change and reducing the burden of health costs associated with power plant pollution, altogether the EPA standards will provide benefits of up to \$54 billion in 2030.” [NRDC, [8/2015](#)]

- **NRDC: The Clean Power Plan Will “Prevent Up To 3,600 Premature Deaths.”** According to the NRDC, “By decreasing the impacts of climate change and reducing the burden of health costs associated with power plant pollution, altogether the EPA standards will provide benefits of up to \$54 billion in 2030. That includes preventing up to 3,600 premature deaths, 1,700 heart attacks, 90,000 asthma attacks, and 300,000 missed work and school days.” [NRDC, [8/2015](#)]

- **NRDC: The Benefits Of The CPP Far Outweigh Its Cost Of \$8.4 Billion By 2030.** According to the NRDC, “These benefits far outweigh the estimated national compliance costs of \$8.4 billion in 2030.” [NRDC, [8/2015](#)]
- **NRDC: “By 2030 The Average Household Will Save About \$85 A Year On Its Energy Bills” Due To The Clean Power Plan.** According to the NRDC, “As we curb carbon pollution, the nation will reap major health and environmental benefits, and by 2030 the average household will save about \$85 a year on its energy bills.” [NRDC, [8/2015](#)]

## **CSE-FLORIDA’S ANTI-ENVIRONMENTALISM AND GLOBAL WARMING DENIAL**

### **CSE Communications Director Questioned Whether Air Pollutants Caused Asthma**

**CSE Communications Director Brent Bahler Questioned Whether Air Pollutants Caused Asthma.** According to the Florida Times-Union, “The new standards would put 30 percent of America’s counties out of compliance, said Brent Bahler, director of communications for Washington based Citizens for a Sound Economy, which has mounted an ad campaign against the EPA plan. Being out of compliance could cause counties to lose federal aid for important highway, water and sewer projects, he said. Bahler said the EPA thus far has not provided scientific proof to back its claims that increased cases of asthma and other respiratory diseases in recent years are due to the levels of pollutants in the air.” [Florida Times-Union, 3/4/97]

**CSE-Florida Opposed “Big-Government Environmentalism Like The New Federal Air-Quality Rules” And “Agreements To Control Global Warming.”** According to the Miami Herald, “Florida Citizens for a Sound Economy is a 7-month-old chapter of a national nonprofit, nonpartisan organization that was founded in 1984 to advocate conservative causes. The group opposes what it calls ‘big-government environmentalism like the new federal air-quality rules and proposed agreements to control global warming. It also leads campaigns for sweeping revisions in the tax codes and advocates a privatization of Social Security.” [Miami Herald, 11/10/98]

### **CSE Ran Ads Claiming That The EPA Would Ban Backyard Barbeques And Fourth Of July Fireworks**

**CSE Ran Ads Suggesting The EPA’s Proposed Rules Limiting Chemicals And Soot In The Air Would Ban Backyard Barbeques And Fourth Of July Fireworks.** According to the Associated Press, “The proposal going through final review at the EPA and White House calls for further reducing the amount of ozone-causing chemicals in the air and for the first time regulating microscopic soot, much of which comes from burning. [...] But that doesn’t mean barbecues are protected, argues Wayne Brough, director of research for Citizens for a Sound Economy, a pro-business, smaller-government group that has run radio ads suggesting the EPA rule might lead to a ban on not only barbecues, but also fireworks on the Fourth of July.” [Associated Press, [5/31/97](#)]

- **Port St. Lucie News: “No Such Attack On Barbecuing Is Being Considered By The Environmental Protection Agency, Or By Any Other Federal Officials As Far As Anybody Can Determine.”** According to the Associated Press, “No such attack on barbecuing is being considered by the Environmental Protection Agency, or by any other federal officials as far as anybody can determine. The proposal going through final review at the EPA and White House calls for further reducing the amount of ozone-causing chemicals in the air and for the first time regulating microscopic soot, much of which comes from burning. But will millions of backyard chefs be unilaterally sent back into the kitchen to meet the federal air-quality standard? Senior EPA officials, health experts, and many state environmental control officials say no way. That would amount to committing political hara-kiri over a hibachi, they suggest. ‘EPA is not contemplating nor have we ever contemplated restrictions on the use of charcoal and gas grills,’ EPA Administrator Carol Browner wrote a congressman recently, suggesting any state or local attempt to curb barbecues would ‘defy common sense.’” [Associated Press, [5/31/97](#)]

### **Palm Beach Post Editorial: “CSE Started The False Rumor” That The EPA Would Ban Backyard Barbecues.**

According to an editorial by the Palm Beach Post, “CSE started the false rumor about the Environmental Protection Agency wanting to ban backyard barbecues.” [Editorial - Palm Beach Post, 11/12/98]

### **CSE and Global Warming Denialism**



**CSE “Has Questioned Whether Global Warming Exists.”** According to the St. Petersburg Times, “Citizens for a Sound Economy - which also has questioned whether global warming exists and blasted the EPA for setting tougher air quality standards - this month mailed out fliers branding the Everglades plan a costly boondoggle that ‘could turn South Florida’s water supply into undrinkable brine.’” [St. Petersburg Times, 11/23/98]

**CSE Florida Director Slade O’Brien Op-ed Headline: “Global Warming Not Proven.”** [Slade O’Brien - Press Journal, 6/6/99]

**O’Brien: EPA Conferences On Global Warming Meant “To Scare Floridians Into Believing That Catastrophic Human-Induced Global Warming Is Here.”** According to an opinion by CSE Florida Director Slade O’Brien in the Press Journal, “On May 26-27, the Environmental Protection Agency held two taxpayer-funded ‘conferences’ on global warming in Florida. While the EPA claimed that these conferences were intended ‘to provide information,’ they were really intended for another purpose - to scare Floridians into believing that catastrophic human-induced global warming is here and that only cutbacks in our use of fossil fuels, as called for by the Clinton-Gore administration, will prevent rising seas from destroying Florida.” [Slade O’Brien - Press Journal, 6/6/99]

**O’Brien: “There Is No Sound Science To Support The Hypothesis Of Human-Induced Global Warming, No Scientific Evidence To Back Up Assertions That It Is Causing A Rapid Rise In Sea Levels.”** According to an opinion by CSE Florida Director Slade O’Brien in the Press Journal, “Tragically, some may have been persuaded by this misguided theory. Tragic because it is pure bunk. There, is no sound science to support the hypothesis of human-induced global warming, no scientific evidence to back up assertions that it is causing a rapid rise in sea levels and not a shred of truth to claims that cutting back on the use of fossil fuels as called for by Kyoto will do anything to protect Floridians.” [Slade O’Brien - Press Journal, 6/6/99]

**O’Brien: “Advocates Of Human-Induced Global Warming Theories Have One Real Goal In Mind – The Control And Rationing Of Energy Use.”** According to an opinion by CSE Florida Director Slade O’Brien in the Press Journal, “Advocates of human-induced global warming theories have one real goal in mind - the control and rationing of energy use. As the EPA conferences highlighted, things like truth, objectivity and reason must not be allowed to stand in the way.” [Slade O’Brien - Press Journal, 6/6/99]

## **Tort Reform**

### **CITIZENS FOR A SOUND ECONOMY-FLORIDA EARMARKED \$460,000 FOR TORT REFORM IN 1998**

**Washington Post: “Jon L. Shebel, President And Chief Executive Of Associated Industries Of Florida...Credits CSE With Helping Enact The Broad Tort Reform Last Year That Was Business’s Top Priority In The State.”** According to the Washington Post, “The Everglades has been just one of CSE's Florida projects. Jon L. Shebel, president and chief executive of Associated Industries of Florida, representing 10,000 businesses, credits CSE with helping enact the broad tort reform last year that was business's top priority in the state.” [Washington Post, 1/29/00]

**Shebel: CSE “Made A Difference In Florida” Against “The Trial Lawyers, At Times CSE “Would Take TV, And We Would Take The Radio. They Have Access To Big Dollars That We Don’t Have Access To.”** According to the Washington Post, “‘They’ve made a difference in Florida,’ said [Jon] Shebel. ‘We had a major war going on with the trial lawyers. At times [CSE] would take the TV, and we would take the radio. They have access to big dollars that we don't have access to. . . . It's added a new dimension.’” [Washington Post, 1/29/00]

**CSE Documents Revealed \$460,000 “Mainly In Corporate Donations” Dedicated To The Florida Tort Reform Project.** According to the Washington Post, “According to CSE documents, at least \$ 460,000, mainly in corporate donations, was earmarked for the [tort reform] project in 1998. The funds included the Huizenga contributions, \$ 25,000 each from Hertz Corp. and DaimlerChrysler AG, and \$ 10,000 from Dollar Thrifty Automotive Group.” [Washington Post, 1/29/00]



**Shebel: Associated Industries Of Florida's "Political Department Orchestrated The Whole Thing... We Called CSE And Said Here's The Plan, Can You Do Something? They Did TV."** According to the Washington Post, "Our political department orchestrated the whole thing,' said Associated Industries' [Jon] Shebel. 'We called CSE and said here's the plan, can you do something? They did TV. We did radio, direct mail and all the analytical work.'" [Washington Post, 1/29/00]

## CSE'S LONG SUPPORT FOR TORT REFORM IN FLORIDA

### 1998

**CSE Organized A Call-In Campaign In Favor Of Tort Reform Legislation.** According to the Sun-Sentinel, "Legislation that would make it harder to file and win lawsuits and a 'Choose Life' license tag backed by abortion opponents are generating thousands of phone calls, faxes, letters and e-mail messages to Gov. Lawton Chiles [...] The legal changes, which limit product liability, negligence and personal injury lawsuits, were the most heavily lobbied issue of the session [...] Many of the calls and letters against the bill are coming from lawyers, their families and clients. An ally of the business community, Citizens for a Sound Economy, has organized a call-in network in support of the legislation." [Sun-Sentinel, 5/11/98]

**Florida Citizens Overwhelmingly Urged The Governor To Veto Tort Reform Legislation.** According to the Sun-Sentinel, "Legislation that would make it harder to file and win lawsuits and a 'Choose Life' license tag backed by abortion opponents are generating thousands of phone calls, faxes, letters and e-mail messages to Gov. Lawton Chiles [...] By the end of last week, some 11,534 people had urged Chiles to veto the civil-justice rewrite, while 3,251 supported it." [Sun-Sentinel, 5/11/98]

**St. Petersburg Times: Citizens For A Sound Economy Bought Ads "Supporting A Republican-Backed Plan To Limit Consumer Lawsuits - A Plan Vetoed By Democratic Gov. Lawton Chiles."** According to the St. Petersburg Times, "Citizens for a Sound Economy, a Washington-based group that fights for lower taxes and less government interference in business, recently purchased advertisements in Florida supporting a Republican-backed plan to limit consumer lawsuits - a plan vetoed by Democratic Gov. Lawton Chiles." [St. Petersburg Times, 6/1/98]

**Florida CSE Director Slade O'Brien Demanded An Apology From The Academy Of Trial Lawyers For "A Shamefully Dishonest Campaign Of Deception."** According to a press release from CSE-Florida, "Apology Demanded from Academy of Trial Lawyers: Statement by Slade O'Brien, Director Florida Citizens for a Sound Economy 'The Academy of Trial Lawyers, led by Executive Director Scott Carruthers, has embarked on a shamefully dishonest campaign of deception (see script which follows). The Trial Lawyers are faxing their membership, encouraging them to call the pro-civil justice reform 1-800-number of the Florida Citizens for a Sound Economy. They then tell their membership to lie to the operator about your position on the reform bill so that you can be patched through to the governors office and steal \$5 per call from CSE in the process. Hundreds of these dishonest calls have already been placed.'" [Press Release – CSE-FL via archive.org, [5/1/98](#)]

**O'Brien: "This Whole Tort Reform Bill Could Have Been Avoided If The Academy Of Trial Lawyers Just Had The Courage To Regulate Their Own Profession."** According to a press release from CSE-Florida, "You know the sad truth is this whole tort reform bill could have been avoided if the Academy of Trial Lawyers just had the courage to regulate their own profession. This action goes to prove how truly untrustworthy they really are. It is truly a shame that Floridians have to live with Trial Lawyers who claim they are there to protect them only to find out they will lie, cheat and steal to continue making money off of other peoples misery." [Press Release – CSE-FL via archive.org, [5/1/98](#)]

**O'Brien: "It Is Truly A Shame That Floridians Have To Live With Trial Lawyers Who Claim They Are There To Protect Them Only To Find Out They Will Lie, Cheat And Steal To Continue Making Money Off Of Other Peoples Misery."** According to a press release from CSE-Florida, "You know the sad truth is this whole tort reform bill could have been avoided if the Academy of Trial Lawyers just had the courage to regulate their own profession. This action goes to prove how truly untrustworthy they really are. It is truly a shame that Floridians have to live with Trial Lawyers who claim they are there to protect them only to find out they will lie, cheat and steal to continue making money off of other peoples misery." [Press Release – CSE-FL via archive.org, [5/1/98](#)]

**CSE Press Release Headline Following 1998 Election: "Lawsuit Abuse Was Issue on Minds of Florida Voters."** [CSE.org via archive.org, [11/4/98](#)]

### 1999

**CSE-Florida Press Release Headline: "Florida CSE Activists Say 'No' To Out-Of-Control Lawsuits: March 24-Florida CSE Asks Legislators For Civil Justice Reform."** [CSE.org via archive.org, [4/30/99](#)]

**CSE-Florida Press Release Headline: “Grassroots Hand Trial Lawyers Major Defeat: Florida CSE Champions Passage Of Lawsuit Reform.”** [CSE.org via archive.org, [3/23/99](#)]

## **2000**

**CSE Published “When Trial Lawyers Attack: Episode 1: The Voicemail Menace.”** According to a post on the CSE website, “When Trial Lawyers Attack by James T. Riley, Esq. Episode I: The Voicemail Menace” [CSE.org via archive.org, [4/13/00](#)]

**CSE Claimed A Lobbyist Informed A Senator That “He Would Run Devastating Television Commercials Against The Senator Unless He Removed Himself As A Co-Sponsor Of Trial-Lawyer Opposed Legislation.”** According to a post on the CSE website, “They just keep getting bolder and bolder and now they may have finally crossed that line. A lobbyist for the trial lawyers in Washington, DC, apparently threatened U.S. Senator Rod Grams that he would run devastating television commercials against the Senator unless he removed himself as a co-sponsor of trial-lawyer opposed legislation. But this time, the trial lawyers got caught red-handed. Not only did they provide tangible evidence in the form of a voice mail recording, they went on to send a fax detailing their proposed attack. The U.S. Justice Department is now investigating these allegations of trial-lawyer attempted blackmail against a sitting United States Senator.” [CSE.org via archive.org, [4/13/00](#)]

- **CSE Described The Lobbyist’s Threat To Run Ads Against The Senator As “Trial-Lawyer Attempted Blackmail” And Said The Lawyers “Crossed That Line.”** According to a post on the CSE website, “They just keep getting bolder and bolder and now they may have finally crossed that line. A lobbyist for the trial lawyers in Washington, DC, apparently threatened U.S. Senator Rod Grams that he would run devastating television commercials against the Senator unless he removed himself as a co-sponsor of trial-lawyer opposed legislation. But this time, the trial lawyers got caught red-handed. Not only did they provide tangible evidence in the form of a voice mail recording, they went on to send a fax detailing their proposed attack. The U.S. Justice Department is now investigating these allegations of trial-lawyer attempted blackmail against a sitting United States Senator.” [CSE.org via archive.org, [4/13/00](#)]

**Florida CSE Released The “2000 Florida CSE Civil Justice Reform Pledge” Which “155 Florida House And Senate Candidates” Signed.** According to a press release from CSE-Florida, “Armed with a new study showing remarkable savings to consumers as a result of tort reforms passed under Gov. George W. Bush in Texas, Florida Citizens for a Sound Economy will hold a press conference on Tuesday to release the names of Florida House and Senate candidates in Pinellas and Hillsborough Counties who have signed the 2000 Florida CSE Civil Justice Reform Pledge. To date, 155 Florida House and Senate candidates have signed CSE’s pledge and are committed to returning fairness and responsibility to Florida’s civil justice system.” [CSE-Florida Press Release via archive.org, [8/25/00](#)]

## **2001**

**CSE Called 2001 “The Year Of The Shark” In Reference To John Edwards And Trial Lawyers.** According to a post on the CSE website, “2001 may long be remembered as the year of the shark. No, I’m not talking about the carnivorous sort that has been terrifying swimmers along the Eastern shores of the United States. The shark I’m thinking of is trial lawyer-turned-Senator John Edwards of North Carolina.” [CSE.org via archive.org, [9/5/01](#)]

**CSE: “What’s Good For Trial Lawyers, However, Is Rarely Good For Consumers.”** According to a post on the CSE website, “What’s good for trial lawyers, however, is rarely good for consumers because they are the ones forced to pay for lawsuits through higher prices for everything from electronics, to insurance premiums, to doctors’ bills. The total cost of the Tort system in 2000 was estimated to be as high as \$200 billion, and worse, this lawsuit abuse harms regular citizens with real grievances by clogging the courts with these frivolous suits.” [CSE.org via archive.org, [9/5/01](#)]

## **2002**

**CSE Post Headline: “There’s Nothing Classy About Lawsuit Abuse.”** According to a post on the CSE Website, “There’s Nothing Classy About Lawsuit Abuse.” [CSE.org via archive.org, [4/23/02](#)]

**CSE: “The Abuses Of The Legal System Impose Costs On All Consumers While Crowding Out Cases With Legitimate Legal Grievances.”** According to a post on the CSE Website, “While lawsuits may hold the allure of a million-

dollar judgment, it is important to realize that the abuses of the legal system impose costs on all consumers while crowding out cases with legitimate legal grievances. A well functioning legal system is an important component of a free society. It offers an opportunity to resolve disputes, enforce contracts, and compensate victims for legitimate losses. Unfortunately, special interests have found ways to subvert our legal institutions for selfish gains. Without reforms that restore the legal system to its original purpose, the legal system will become a liability rather than strength of our free society.” [CSE.org via archive.org, [4/23/02](#)]

**CSE Called For “Abolishing Joint And Several Liability In Most Cases,” “Reforming Class-Action Rules,” And “A Higher Burden Of Proof For Punitive Damages.”** According to a post on the CSE website, “The following list includes a series of reforms aimed at improving out [sic] nation’s legal system Abolishing Joint and Several Liability In Most Cases. The current rules of law on joint and several liability are grossly unfair and inefficient. Requiring a person 1 percent at fault to pay an entire judgment creates higher insurance and product costs, and is destructive of property rights. [...] Reforming Class-Action Rules. The current use of Rule 23 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure has created a treasure-trove for plaintiffs’ class-action lawyers. The lawyers sometimes do not even need a client to collect millions from productive sectors of the economy. [...] Mandating a Higher Burden of Proof for Punitive Damages. Punitive damages are meant to punish defendants for engaging in harmful behavior. Just as in criminal cases, before a court can punish someone, it must satisfy a higher burden of proof. Creating a Presumptive Cap for Non-Economic/Pain-and-Suffering Damages. Pain-and-suffering damages are highly speculative and vary greatly from person to person. For these reasons, it is difficult, if not impossible for defendants to predict these costs and change their behavior accordingly.” [CSE.org via archive.org, [4/23/02](#)]

**CSE Offered Invitations To “The Third Annual Legal Reform Summit,” Which Was Held September 18-19, 2002.**

According to a post on the CSE website, “Citizens for a Sound Economy invites you to attend the third annual Legal Reform Summit which be held this year in Washington, D.C., September 18-19, 2002. The Legal Reform Summit will mark the importance of tort reform efforts in the making and will highlight the economic impact that America’s flawed legal system has imposed on businesses, health-care professionals, company shareholders, and consumers.” [CSE.org via archive.org, [8/21/02](#)]

## **2003**

**South Florida CSE Director John Hallman Participated In A Debate On Tort Reform Against The Former President Of The Florida Association Of Trial Lawyers Lance Block.** According to a press release from Citizens for a Sound Economy, “John Hallman, representing CSE, participated in a debate called Point/ Counterpoint at the Palm Beach Community College on Wednesday, Dec. 2nd. The issue was Tort Reform and the opposing side was represented by Lance Block of Searcy, Denney, et al. in West Palm Beach, a well-known firm of trial lawyers. Lance Block is also the past president of the Florida Association of Trial Lawyers.” [Press Release – Citizens for a Sound Economy via archive.org, [12/11/03](#)]

**CSE: Hallman “Cited Statistics And Examples Of The Reasons Tort Reform Encourage Free Markets And Results In A Less Costly Healthcare System.”** According to a press release from Citizens for a Sound Economy, “John’s preparation carried the day, as he cited statistics and examples of the reasons tort reform encourage free markets and results in a less costly healthcare system. John’s examples of the court system, overburdened with frivolous lawsuits, were well taken by the audience. They frustrated Mr. Block and forced him to result to emotional and one-sided arguments to defend the existing system. When Mr. Block began to attack CSE on an emotional level, John remained calm and defended the organization with facts and figures, not with emotional rationale. Many of the audience members agreed with John and challenged Mr. Block to defend the current system.” [Press Release – Citizens for a Sound Economy via archive.org, [12/11/03](#)]

**CSE: “Once Again, John Hallman And CSE Illustrate That Tort Reform Is A Winning Issue.”** According to a press release from Citizens for a Sound Economy, “Once again, John Hallman and CSE illustrate that Tort Reform is a winning issue!” [Press Release – Citizens for a Sound Economy via archive.org, [12/11/03](#)]

**CSE Listed “Lawsuit Abuse” As A Key Issue.** According to the Citizens for a Sound Economy Website, Lawsuit Abuse was a “Key Issue.” [CSE.org via archive.org, [2/23/03](#)]

**CSE: Our Grassroots Army Has Fought And Won Legal Reforms At The Federal Level And The State Level In Florida, Alabama, Texas, And Illinois.”** According to the Citizens for a Sound Economy Website, “We want to give back our legal system to honest, decent Americans. Our grassroots army has fought and won legal reforms at the federal level and the state level in Florida, Alabama, Texas, and Illinois. We educate citizens on how frivolous lawsuits affect them personally - impacting their pocketbooks, businesses, values and way of life. CSE activists are spearheading efforts to enact real tort reform

across the country. What you can do: Attend our town meetings on lawsuit abuse. And tell your elected officials that you want our legal system returned to decent, honest Americans with real grievances.” [CSE.org via archive.org, [2/23/03](#)]

## **KOCH-SPONSORED AMERICAN TORT REFORM ASSOCIATION BACKED MULTIPLE TORT REFORM PROJECTS**

### **Koch Industries Sponsored American Tort Reform Association As Early As 2004**

**Koch Industries Was A Member Of The American Tort Reform Association.** According to the American Tort Reform Association Website, Koch Industries was a listed member. [ATRA.org, Accessed [3/18/15](#)]

**2006: Koch Industries Was A Member Of The American Tort Reform Association.** According to the American Tort Reform Association Website via archive.org, Koch Industries was a listed member. [ATRA.org via archive.org, [11/29/06](#)]

**2004: Koch Industries Was A Member Of The American Tort Reform Association.** According to the American Tort Reform Association Website via archive.org, Koch Industries was a listed member. [ATRA.org via archive.org, [8/5/04](#)]

**2006: ATRA’s “Links To Other Civil Justice Reform Websites” Linked To Koch-Connected Sites, Including The Federalist Society, The Washington Legal Foundation, Citizens For A Sound Economy, And The Rand Institute.** According to the American Tort Reform Association website, “Links to Other Civil Justice Reform Websites Other Organizations With Information on Civil Justice Reform Contact these organizations for more information about liability reforms. [...] Citizens for a Sound Economy Conservative Grassroots Organization of Citizen Activists Fighting for Tort Reform. [...] The Federalist Society Conservative/Libertarian Organization of Attorneys Concerned About the Legal System. The Rand Institute for Civil Justice An Affiliated Think Tank of the RAND Corporation. [...] Washington Legal Foundation Defending and Promoting Free Enterprise and Individual Rights Through The Legal System.” [ATRA.org via archive.org, [10/9/04](#)]

**2006: Members Of The Lawsuit Abuse Reform Coalition Included ALEC, ATRA, Florida Justice Reform Institute, Kansas Chamber Of Commerce, National Association Of Chemical Distributors, National Federation Of Independent Business.** According to the website of the Lawsuit Abuse Reform Coalition, ALEC, ATRA, Florida Justice Reform Institute, the Kansas Chamber Of Commerce, the National Association Of Chemical Distributors, the National Federation Of Independent Business, the National Industrial Sand Association, and Small Business And Entrepreneurship Council were coalition members as of March 22, 2006. [lawsuitabusereform.org via archive.org, [3/22/06](#)]

- **American Tort Reform Association Served “As Executive Secretariat For LARC.”** According to LARC: “The American Tort Reform Association serves as the Executive Secretariat for LARC.” [lawsuitabusereform.org via archive.org, [10/1/2006](#)]

### **American Tort Reform Association Founded State Affiliate Group Florida Justice Reform Institute**

**ATRA 2006 990 Tax Document: “ATRA Accomplishes Its Legislative Agenda By Working With State Tort Reform Coalitions.”** According to the American Tort Reform Association’s 2006 990 form, “Description of Program Service One: To enhance the fairness, efficiency, and predictability of the tort reform system through public education and legislative enactments. ATRA accomplishes its legislative agenda by working with state tort reform coalitions. It is a clearing-house of information from approximately 40 state tort reform coalitions. Each fall, ATRA hosts a planning conference at which coalition leaders meet to discuss past successes and future strategies. ATRA also prepares educational materials which carry its message directly to the public. ATRA has developed a communications ‘tool-kit’ for use by local grassroots coalitions interested in fighting lawsuit abuse. Each June and December, ATRA publishes ‘The Tort Reform Record’ to record the accomplishments of the latest legislative year. It includes a two-page, state-by-state summary of the ATRA supported reforms enacted by the states since 1986.” [ATRA 990 via Citizen Audit, [2006](#)]

**2004: ATRA Named George Meros As A “Legal Reform Champion.”** According to the American Tort Reform Association’s website, “George N. Meros, Jr. has dedicated the greater part of his legal career to promoting common-sense reforms in the civil justice system. A partner with Gray Robinson P.A. in its Tallahassee office, George served as Special Counsel to Florida’s business community in passage of the 1999 Tort Reform Act, one of the most progressive reform



measures in the country. He remains the business community's lead counsel in constitutional challenges to the 1999 Act. George played a central role in passage of Florida's 2003 Medical Malpractice Act and the Worker's Compensation Reform Act. He also drafted the Personal Responsibility in Food Consumption Act that was introduced in the 108th Congress. A frequent guest lecturer and author on legal reform issues, George practices constitutional and regulatory law at the trial and appellate level. He is a graduate of the University of Virginia School of Law." [ATRA.org via archive.org, [8/5/04](#)]

- **2006: Meros, A Registered Lobbyist Representing ATRA, Spoke At A Meeting Of The Florida House Of Representatives' Justice Council In Favor Of Eliminating Joint And Several Liability.** According to records from the Florida House of Representatives, George Meros, Representing the American Tort Reform Association as a Registered Lobbyist, spoke at the February 22, 2006 meeting of the Justice Council as a proponent of repealing joint and several liability. [Florida House, [2/22/06](#)]
- **2006: Meros Lobbied To The Florida House Judiciary Committee In Favor Of HB 145.** According to records from the Florida House of Representatives, George Meros lobbied as a proponent of HB 145 at the January 25, 2006 meeting of the Judiciary Committee. [Florida House, [1/25/06](#)]

### **Florida Justice Reform Institute –State Affiliate of American Tort Reform Association**

**The Florida Justice Reform Institute Was A Listed Tort Reform Coalition Member And Ally Of ATRA.** According to American Tort Reform Association, State Tort Reform Coalitions and Allies included Florida Justice Reform Coalition. [ATRA.org, Accessed [3/18/15](#)]

### **2006: Astroturf “Grassroots” Group, Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse, Was Run By Former Citizens For A Sound Economy Staffers And Registered Lobbyists Slade O’Brien And Carlos Muhletaler**

**Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse Was An Organization “Dedicated To Challenging Those Who Abuse Our Legal System.”** According to the Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse website via archive.org, “Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse is a grassroots group dedicated to challenging those who abuse our legal system and educating the public about the costs and consequences of lawsuit abuse. We are actively supported by small businesspeople, consumers, taxpayers and anyone who is concerned about lawsuit abuse in Florida.” [Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse via archive.org, [6/17/06](#)]

**2006: Carlos Muhletaler Was Listed The Executive Director Of Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse, Inc.** According to Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse Inc.’s 990 tax forms, Carlos Muhletaler was the executive director of Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse Inc. [Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse Inc. 990 tax form via citizeinaudit.org, [2006](#)]

**2006: Slade O’Brien Was The Treasurer Of Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse, Inc.** According to Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse Inc.’s 990 tax forms, Slade O’Brien was the treasurer of Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse Inc. [Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse Inc. 990 tax form via citizeinaudit.org, [2006](#)]

- **Slade O’Brien Also Named As The Executive Director Of Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse In 2006.** According to a press release from Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse, “‘Floridians have a real problem with personal injury lawyers and people who see lawsuits and our courts as a way to get rich,’ said Slade O’Brien, executive director of FSLA. ‘This greed and lawsuit-happy mentality hurts all of us. FSLA is taking the fight against lawsuit abuse to communities across Florida to ensure that every citizen's voice is heard.’” [Florida Stop Lawsuit Abuse Press Release, [3/22/06](#)]

### **KOCH-TIED JAMES MADISON INSTITUTE SUPPORTED TORT REFORM, PROVIDED ACADEMIC SUPPORT FOR GOALS OF ATRA AND FJRI**

**James Madison Institute Director Of Public Policy Robert Sanchez: “What Worries Business Leaders Is That Despite The Efforts” Of Jeb Bush, “Action Has Stalled On Key Issues Related To Tort Reform.”** According to an opinion by Directory of Public Policy Robert Sanchez for the James Madison Institute, “In contrast, all four of Florida’s announced gubernatorial candidates have spent much of their adult lives in government service. Business leaders say the problem isn’t that any of them would be expected to be hostile to business; it’s just that they might lack [Jeb] Bush’s degree of

understanding and empathy. [...] What worries business leaders is that despite the efforts of a business-friendly governor, action has stalled on key issues related to tort reform.” [Robert Sanchez – James Madison Institute, [2006](#)]

**Sanchez: “South Florida Has Edged Higher On The List Of The Nation’s ‘Judicial Hellholes’ Where A Costly Combination Of Predatory Trial Lawyers, Runaway Juries, And Obliging Judges Often Results In Huge Verdicts Against Businesses.”** According to an opinion by Directory of Public Policy Robert Sanchez for the James Madison Institute, “What worries business leaders is that despite the efforts of a business-friendly governor, action has stalled on key issues related to tort reform. Meanwhile, South Florida has edged higher on the list of the nation’s ‘judicial hellholes,’ where a costly combination of predatory trial lawyers, runaway juries, and obliging judges often results in huge verdicts against businesses and professional practitioners.” [Robert Sanchez – James Madison Institute, [2006](#)]

**Sanchez: “With 2006 Being The Final Year In Office For A Governor Who... Understands These Issues, The Business Community” Approached The Legislative Session “With A New Sense Of Urgency As It Should.”**

According to an opinion by Directory of Public Policy Robert Sanchez for the James Madison Institute, “There’s no way to know whether it’s really ‘now or never’ for the Legislature to address these concerns. However, with 2006 being the final year in office for a Governor who obviously understands these issues, the business community is approaching the coming legislative session with a new sense of urgency— as it should.” [Robert Sanchez – James Madison Institute, [2006](#)]

**JMI Adjunct Fellow Jake Bebbler Opinion Headline: “Doctors Fleeing Florida’s Sue-Happy Lawyers.”** [Jake Bebbler – James Madison Institute, [2006](#)]

**Bebbler: Florida’s Civil Justice System Caused “Doctors To Leave The State,” Damaged “The Business Climate” And Imposed “A Steep ‘Tort Tax’ On Every Floridian.”** According to an opinion by Adjunct Fellow Jake Bebbler for the James Madison Institute, “The 2006 legislative session gives Florida lawmakers yet another chance to restore some sanity to a civil justice system that’s causing doctors to leave the state, damaging the business climate, and imposing a steep ‘tort tax’ on every Floridian.” [Jake Bebbler – James Madison Institute, [2006](#)]

**Bebbler: “Our Current Civil Litigation System Is Broken. Along With Being Patently Unfair, As The Practice Of ‘Joint And Several Liability’ Shows, It Is Also Too Costly.”** According to an opinion by Adjunct Fellow Jake Bebbler for the James Madison Institute, “Our current civil litigation system is broken. Along with being patently unfair, as the practice of ‘joint and several liability’ shows, it is also too costly.” [Jake Bebbler – James Madison Institute, [2006](#)]

**Bebbler Cited The Florida Justice Reform Institute And The American Tort Reform Association.** According to an opinion by Adjunct Fellow Jake Bebbler for the James Madison Institute, “According to the Florida Justice Reform Institute, the U.S. Chamber of Commerce, and the American Tort Reform Association, our legal system cost \$246 billion in 2003 alone, equaling \$845 for every man, woman and child. Small businesses pay \$88 billion each year to cover liability expenses. That is money that cannot be used to invest in better jobs and better wages or to pay for health care for their employees.” [Jake Bebbler – James Madison Institute, [2006](#)]

**Bebbler: “It Is Time For The Florida Legislature To Stand Up Against The Powerful Trial Lawyer Lobby...And Do What’s Right.”** According to an opinion by Adjunct Fellow Jake Bebbler for the James Madison Institute, “The compelling evidence continues to mount that we face a litigation crisis in Florida. It is time for the Florida Legislature to stand up against the powerful Trial Lawyer lobby and their surrogate ‘consumer’ groups and do what’s right. It is time to restore fairness to our civil court system.” [Jake Bebbler – James Madison Institute, [2006](#)]

**2006 Madison Policy Digest: “Victories For Proponents Of Limited Government And Personal Freedom” In This Legislative Session Included “Several Tort Reform Measures.”** According to the James Madison Institute’s Madison Policy Digest, “This legislative session featured several victories for proponents of limited government and personal freedom. [...] Meanwhile, other successes this session have included passage of Governor Bush’s ‘A-plus-plus Plan’ for education, repeal of the intangibles tax, and several tort reform measures – including repeal of the unfair doctrine of joint and several liability.” [Madison Policy Digest, [5/10/06](#)]

**JMI 2007 Winter Newsletter: “The Contributions Of JMI Members In 2006 Supported... Substantive Policy Victories In Education, Tort Reform, Taxes, And Property Rights.”** According to JMI’s Winter 2007 Newsletter, “Resolve to continue providing for a freer and more prosperous Florida and nation. The contributions of JMI members in 2006 supported: [...] substantive policy victories in education, tort reform, taxes and property rights.” [JMI Newsletter, Winter [2007](#)]

# THE KOCH'S MULTI-MILLION DOLLAR CAMPAIGN TO BUY FLORIDA LAWMAKERS

## With Their Eyes On Political Impact, The Kochs Established A Ground Network In Florida That Rivals The State's Republican Party

**Politico: The Koch Network's Staffing In Florida "Rivals That Of The Florida Republican Party And Its Local And Legislative Affiliates, According To Sources Familiar With Florida GOP Politics."** According to Politico, "The network's Sunshine State staffing rivals that of the Florida Republican Party and its local and legislative affiliates, according to sources familiar with Florida GOP politics, though the Republican Party presence in Florida and other key states will surge as the RNC ramps up its joint victory program with state party committees." [Politico, [12/30/15](#)]

- **AFP's Organization In Florida Rivalled The Size Of The Florida GOP.** According to the New York Times Magazine, "Where does the money go? Americans for Prosperity obviously spends a lot on television, but it also maintains offices in 35 states with 600 paid staff members. The group funds phone banks, big-ticket events and many other details like beer cozies and water bottles. Its biggest chapter is in Florida, where its 50 paid staff members work out of 10 offices and constitute a year-round organization that rivals that of the state Republican Party." [New York Times Magazine, [10/19/14](#)]

**As Of August 2016, The Koch Network Had 16 Field Offices And 165 Field Staff In Florida, Including Full-Time Workers, Part-Time Workers, And Contractors.** According to a post by The Hill national political reporter Jonathan Swan for The Hill's Ballot Box blog, "The Koch network has 16 field offices in Florida and 165 field staff, which includes full-time and part-time workers and contractors, according to a source familiar with the operation. About 105 of these Florida staff belong to AFP, and the rest are divided across the other Koch network groups, Concerned Veterans for America, Generation Opportunity and Libre." [TheHill.com/Blogs/Ballot-Box, [8/17/16](#)]

## THE KOCHS RAPID EXPANSION INTO FLORIDA AND OTHER SWING STATES SUGGESTED THEY ARE FOCUSED ON POLITICAL IMPACT

**Politico: The Network Has Expanded "In Key Swing States Like Colorado, Florida, Nevada, North Carolina, Ohio, Pennsylvania And Virginia — Suggesting That The Network Has Its Eye Not Just On Policy But Also On Political Impact."** According to Politico, "There's also been a buildup [by the Koch network] in key swing states like Colorado, Florida, Nevada, North Carolina, Ohio, Pennsylvania and Virginia — suggesting that the network has its eye not just on policy but also on political impact." [Politico, [12/30/15](#)]

- **Politico Reported That \$30 Million In Koch Network Ad Buys From Groups Including Freedom Partners Were Expected To Target The Senate Races In Florida, Nevada, Ohio, And Pennsylvania.** According to Politico, "Key groups in the Koch brothers' political network on Monday began reserving \$30 million in advertising buys in key Senate races in August and September, a network official tells POLITICO. The television and digital ad buys, from Freedom Partners Action Fund and other groups, are expected to target Democratic Senate candidates or boost Republican ones in Florida, Nevada, Ohio and Pennsylvania, the official said." [Politico, [5/17/16](#)]

**University Of Florida Associate Professor: "Republicans Appear To Have Benefited From A \$125 Million Dollar Investment In Voter Mobilization By Americans For Prosperity."** According to an opinion by Michael P. McDonald, an associate professor at the University of Florida, in the Huffington Post, "Republicans appear to have benefited from a \$125 million dollar investment in voter mobilization by Americans for Prosperity. Where in the past Republicans largely left their voters to their own devices to vote early if they wanted, this election Republicans are not going to concede the early vote to Democrats." [Michael P. McDonald – Huffington Post, [10/13/14](#)]

### MARCO RUBIO AND THE KOCH BROTHERS HAVE “NOTHING BUT NICE THINGS TO SAY” ABOUT EACH OTHER

#### Marco Rubio: “I Would Love To Win Support From The Koch Brothers In 2016”

Headline: “Marco Rubio: I Would Love To Win Support From The Koch Brothers In 2016.” [Washington Times, [4/23/15](#)]

- **Rubio On Koch Brothers: “I Would Love To Earn Their Support... I Think Generally We Are Clearly Aligned On Issues.”** According to The Washington Times, “On Thursday, Mr. Rubio said he wants the support of everyone and said he has ‘tremendous admiration for the Koch family.’ ‘I would love to earn their support,’ Mr. Rubio said, adding, ‘I think generally we are clearly aligned on issues.’” [Washington Times, [4/23/15](#)]

#### Rubio Said That He Had “Tremendous Admiration For The Koch Family”

**Sen. Marco Rubio Said He Had “Tremendous Admiration For The Koch Family.”** According to The Washington Times, “On Thursday, Mr. Rubio said he wants the support of everyone and said he has ‘tremendous admiration for the Koch family.’” [Washington Times, [4/23/15](#)]

#### Charles And David Koch Have Personally Complimented Marco Rubio’s Leadership

**Charles Koch “Wrapped Up” The Koch Conference By Thanking Rubio For “All He’s Doing To Try To Preserve And Enhance Our Free Society.”** According to The Nation, “Charles Koch wrapped up the evening by thanking ‘Marco’ for ‘all he’s doing to try to preserve and enhance our free society.’” [Nation, [9/4/14](#)]

**New York Daily News: An Insider Source Said That David Koch “Had Nothing But Nice Things To Say About Rubio,” And That They Agree On “Most Of The Substantial Issues.”** According to the New York Daily News, “Our insider notes the ‘interesting undertones’ when a political financier worth \$42 billion points out that a candidate might have done better with more money. We’re also told that Koch had nothing but nice things to say about Rubio, with whom he agrees on ‘most of the substantial issues.’” [New York Daily News, [10/7/15](#)]

#### Rubio Was “The Front-Runner” For 2016 Koch Presidential Money

**New York Daily News: “According To A Political Insider Who Ran Into David Koch At A Recent Event In Manhattan, Florida Sen. Rubio Is The Front-Runner” For The Kochs’ \$1 Billion Contribution.** According to the New York Daily News, “According to a political insider who ran into David Koch at a recent event in Manhattan, Florida Sen. Rubio is the front-runner for that dough now that Wisconsin Gov. Scott Walker is out of the race.” [New York Daily News, [10/7/15](#)]

**Reuters: Carly Fiorina And Sen. Marco Rubio Are Among The Candidates On The Koch Brothers’ “Short List Of Candidates” Who Are Being Considered As Recipients Of Their “\$1 Billion War Chest.”** According to Reuters, “She [Carly Fiorina] has now moved to the short list of candidates the Kochs may support with their reported \$1 billion war chest, the sources said. Florida Senator Marco Rubio is among those on the coveted list, the sources said.” [Reuters via Raw Story, [10/4/15](#)]

*Even Trump Said The Kochs Chose Rubio As Their Candidate*

**Donald Trump Tweeted That The Koch Brothers “Have Chosen Little Marco Rubio” To Support For The 2016 GOP Presidential Primary.** According to a tweet by Donald Trump, “While I hear the Koch brothers are in big financial trouble (oil), word is they have chosen little Marco Rubio, the lightweight from Florida” [Donald Trump – Twitter, [2/28/16](#)]



# THE KOCH NETWORK WAS HEAVILY INVESTED IN MARCO RUBIO'S 2016 PRESIDENTIAL RUN

## Marco Rubio Was A Koch Network Favorite

**SaintPetersBlog: Sen. Marco Rubio “Counts Among His Supporters Several People Tied To The Political Network Structured Around Billionaires Charles And David Koch.”** According to SaintPetersBlog, “[Sen. Marco] Rubio counts among his supporters several people tied to the political network structured around billionaires Charles and David Koch. In addition, he has been actively courting billionaire casino owner Sheldon Adelson, most recently at a meeting Monday in Washington.” [SaintPetersBlog, [3/6/15](#)]

**The Hill: Koch Donor Paul Singer “Held A Private Session” At The 2016 Palm Springs Koch Donor Retreat To Sell The Virtues Of Sen. Marco Rubio.** According to The Hill, “Another Rubio mega-donor, – New York hedge fund billionaire Paul Singer – had been making headway at convincing donors to join the Rubio camp, before the disappointing debate and New Hampshire primary. Singer, who has given \$2.5 million to Rubio’s super-PAC so far, held a private session at the Koch brothers’ donor retreat in Palm Springs earlier this month in a bid to sell Rubio’s virtues to other wealthy conservatives.” [The Hill, [2/12/16](#)]

**CNN: Koch Network Ally Art Pope Endorsed Marco Rubio For The GOP Presidential Primary.** According to CNN, “Florida Sen. Marco Rubio picked up another big-name donor in the presidential race on Thursday, this time one from North Carolina. Art Pope, a philanthropist and CEO of Variety Wholesalers, said he would support Rubio's campaign in the GOP primary and in the general election. [...] The businessman and former politician has invested millions in North Carolina politics and is an ally of the Koch Brothers' network of advocacy groups and foundations.” [CNN, [12/10/15](#)]

- **Pope: “I Think Sen. Marco Rubio Is Both The Most Qualified, Has The Best All-Around Experience, And I Agree With Him More So On The Issues Than All The Other Candidates.”** According to CNN, “‘I think Sen. Marco Rubio is both the most qualified, has the best all-around experience, and I agree with him more so on the issues than all the other candidates,’ Pope told CNN.” [CNN, [12/10/15](#)]
- **Pope On Rubio’s Election As Speaker Of The Florida House: “To Be Elected By Your Peers, Your Colleagues, Is A Good Indication Of Your Leadership.”** According to CNN, “Pope said Rubio's experience as speaker of the Florida House especially appealed to him. ‘To be elected by your peers, your colleagues, is a good indication of your leadership,’ Pope said, adding state speakers have a heavy set of policy responsibilities. ‘That is more experience than President (Barack) Obama had when he was a member of the Legislature in Illinois.’” [CNN, [12/10/15](#)]
- **CNN: Pope “Also Cited The Senator's Positions On National Security, Taxes, Immigration And Spending As Being Appealing.”** According to CNN, “Pope said Rubio's experience as speaker of the Florida House especially appealed to him. ‘To be elected by your peers, your colleagues, is a good indication of your leadership,’ Pope said, adding state speakers have a heavy set of policy responsibilities. ‘That is more experience than President (Barack) Obama had when he was a member of the Legislature in Illinois.’ He also cited the senator's positions on national security, taxes, immigration and spending as being appealing.” [CNN, [12/10/15](#)]

**Koch-Aligned Donors Art Pope And Randy Kendrick Each Donated \$250,000 To The Pro-Rubio Conservative Solutions PAC.** According to USA Today, “The founder of Oracle donated \$1 million to a pro-Rubio super PAC last month, newly filed election reports shows. That's on top of the \$3 million the tech magnate contributed to the group, Conservative Solutions PAC, last year. [...] Other donors to the pro-Rubio super PAC in January included North Carolina discount retailer Art Pope, Richard DeVos, of the Michigan-based Amway fortune, and Randy Kendrick, whose husband co-owns Major League Baseball's Arizona Diamondbacks. They donated \$250,000 each. The January contributors to the super PAC underscore Rubio's ability to straddle various lanes of the Republican donor class — ranging from a Silicon Valley tycoon who is one of the world's richest people to figures such as Pope and Kendrick, who are aligned with libertarian-leaning industrialists Charles and David Koch.” [USA Today, [2/20/16](#)]

## **American Future Fund Spent \$1.75 Million On Presidential Ad Buys Against Donald Trump In Florida, Indirectly Benefitting Marco Rubio**

**American Future Fund Launched A \$1.75 Million TV Buy Against Trump In Florida.** According to Politico, “While votes were still being counted on Super Tuesday, a prominent conservative group wasted no time laying the groundwork to defeat Donald Trump in a critical state: Florida. American Future Fund, an Iowa-based organization overseen by Republican strategist Nick Ryan, will launch a \$1.75 million TV buy against Trump in the state, which holds its primary on March 15. Ryan confirmed the move in an email.” [Politico, [3/1/16](#)]

**Donald Trump Called For The Retraction Of American Future Fund’s Ads And Accused Them Of Illegally Coordinating With Marco Rubio’s Campaign.** According to USA Today, “GOP presidential front-runner Donald Trump on Monday afternoon called for the retraction of ‘misleading’ ads about his now-closed real-estate investment school. ‘Donald J. Trump is requesting the immediate retraction of the ads created by American Future Fund, which clearly was unlawfully coordinated with lightweight Senator Marco Rubio on these misleading commercials,’ according to a statement issued by the campaign.” [USA Today, [3/1/16](#)]

## **Bill Koch Held A \$1,000 Per Couple Fundraiser For Rubio In Southern Florida**

**Bill And Bridget Koch Held A South Florida Fundraiser For Marco Rubio That Asked For \$1,000 Per Couple.** According to Florida Politics, “Big-money backers of Marco Rubio, including billionaires Norman Braman and Bill Koch, will host a pair of South Florida fundraisers next month to support the Republican presidential candidate. The events will be the final Rubio fundraisers held in the Miami area before the Feb. 1 Iowa caucuses. Both events are scheduled Jan. 10. The first, a minimum \$1,000 per couple afternoon reception, will be held at the home of Bridget and Bill Koch, 974 S. Ocean Blvd. in Palm Beach. Koch, founder of Oxbow Carbon, is probably better known for extended legal battles with his brothers, the conservative activists Charles and David Koch. According to the invitation, there’s a 4:30 p.m. VIP and photo reception, with a 5 p.m. general reception.” [Florida Politics, [12/23/15](#)]

## **THE KOCHS DEVOTED MILLIONS TO SUPPORT MARCO RUBIO’S SENATE BIDS**

### **Marco Rubio Received \$91,000 In Direct Contributions From The Kochs**

**Between 2009 And 2016, Koch Industries And The Koch Family Contributed At Least \$91,000 To Marco Rubio.** According to the FEC filings, between 2009 and 2016 Koch Industries and the Koch family contributed at least \$91,000 to Marco Rubio. This information is further detailed in the following table:

Contributor	Contributor Organization	Date	Target	Amount
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	07/20/2016	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$10,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	07/08/2016	Marco Rubio For President	-\$5,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	06/10/2015	Marco Rubio For President	\$5,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	01/27/2015	Reclaim America PAC	\$5,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	01/19/2015	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$5,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	01/14/2015	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$5,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	09/30/2014	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$5,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	07/21/2014	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$5,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	01/18/2014	Reclaim America PAC	\$5,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	02/27/2013	Reclaim America PAC	\$2,500
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	02/19/2013	Reclaim America PAC	\$2,500
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	02/16/2012	Reclaim America PAC	\$5,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	12/02/2011	Reclaim America PAC	\$2,500
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	10/25/2011	Reclaim America PAC	\$2,500
Koch, Elizabeth	N/A	10/28/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$2,400
Koch, Anna	Koch Industries	10/21/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$2,400
Koch, Bill	Oxbow	10/13/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$2,400

Koch, Charles	Koch Industries	10/01/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$500
Koch, Charles	Koch Industries	9/20/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$500
Koch, Chase	Koch Industries	9/10/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$2,400
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	6/17/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$5,000
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	4/26/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$4,000
Koch, Charles	Koch Industries	4/14/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$500
Koch, Julia	N/A	3/17/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$2,400
Koch, Julia	N/A	3/17/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$2,400
Koch, Charles	Koch Industries	3/17/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$2,400
Koch, Elizabeth	N/A	3/17/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$2,400
Koch, David	Koch Industries	3/17/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$2,400
Koch, David	Koch Industries	3/17/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$2,400
Koch Industries PAC	Koch Industries	03/01/2010	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$1,000
Koch, Charles	Koch Industries	12/04/2009	Marco Rubio For US Senate	\$500
<b>Total:</b>				<b>\$91,000</b>

[FEC, Accessed 8/19/16]

### **Individuals Affiliated With Koch Industries Collectively Have Been Sen. Marco Rubio's 10th Largest**

**Yahoo Finance: "Individuals Affiliated With" Koch Industries Collectively Were Sen. Marco Rubio's 10<sup>th</sup> Largest Donor Since He Won His Senate Seat In 2010, Donating \$37,200 Total.** According to Yahoo Finance, "That probably explains why Rubio's donor list to date includes many more corporate contributors than either Cruz's or Paul's. Here's a list of Rubio's top 10 donors since he first ran for the Senate in 2010, according to the nonprofit Center for Responsive Politics. Keep in mind that these are mostly contributions from individuals affiliated with each group, rather than single-sum donations from the group itself: [...] [10.] Koch Industries, the conglomerate run by conservative activist brothers Charles and David Koch: \$37,200. (Koch has donated \$17,000 to Sen. Paul since 2010.)" [Yahoo Finance, [4/13/15](#)]

### **The Koch Network Committed To Spending 7 Figures For Marco Rubio's 2016 Senate Race**

**Politico Reported That \$30 Million In Koch Network Ad Buys From Groups Including Freedom Partners Were Expected To Target The Senate Races In Florida, Nevada, Ohio, And Pennsylvania.** According to Politico, "Key groups in the Koch brothers' political network on Monday began reserving \$30 million in advertising buys in key Senate races in August and September, a network official tells POLITICO. The television and digital ad buys, from Freedom Partners Action Fund and other groups, are expected to target Democratic Senate candidates or boost Republican ones in Florida, Nevada, Ohio and Pennsylvania, the official said." [Politico, [5/17/16](#)]

**The Koch Network's Freedom Partners Reserved More Than \$2 Million In Florida TV Time For Senate Ad Buys.** According to Politico, "A prominent cog in the Koch brother's powerful conservative political network has reserved more than \$2 million in Florida TV time headed into November's general election. The time is being reserved for Florida's U.S. Senate race, which immediately drew closer national attention when Marco Rubio decided last month to seek re-election after his failed presidential bid. Rubio is in a Republican primary contest against Carlos Beruff, a wealthy Manatee County homebuilder, but national groups have lined up behind Rubio. [...] This cycle, Freedom Partners Action Fund has received a \$3 million check from both Charles Koch and the Charles G. Koch 1997 Trust, its two largest individual contributions. The group's Florida ads will start running Aug. 30, the day of Florida's primary, and run through Oct. 10. The biggest portion of the buy — nearly \$1 million — will focus on the Tampa media market, with another more than \$800,000 buy focused on the Orlando market and \$380,000 in Jacksonville. The reservation includes both broadcast and cable ad buys." [Politico, [7/8/16](#)]

### **The Koch Network Canceled A \$568,000 Rubio Ad Buy Reserved For Aug. 30 To Sept. 6**

**The Koch Network Canceled A \$568,000 Ad Buy Reserved For Aug. 30 To Sept. 6.** According to the Hill, "The powerful donor network helmed by billionaire brothers Charles and David Koch is canceling more than half a million dollars in Florida advertising designed to help Republican Marco Rubio in his Senate race, according to Koch network spokesman James Davis. The canceled reservation period is from Aug. 30 to Sept. 6 and was valued at \$568,000, he said. 'Rubio is running strong in Florida, so we are realigning our television spend to other areas for this week,' said Davis, when asked to explain the reasoning behind the decision. 'We will continue to monitor things and make adjustments as necessary.'" [The Hill, [8/17/16](#)]

# KOCH CONNECTED GROUPS SPENT MILLIONS AGAINST RUBIO'S OPPONENT PATRICK MURPHY

## Koch-Backed American Future Fund Spent \$1.5 Million On Ads Attacking Patrick Murphy

**American Future Fund Spent \$1.5 Million On A 30-Second Cable TV Ad Highlighting Rep. Patrick Murphy's Vote In Support Of The Export-Import Bank.** According to the Washington Post, "The American Future Fund, a 501(c)(4) nonprofit group with ties to GOP super donors Charles and David Koch, has spent \$1.5 million on a 30-second cable TV ad highlighting [Rep. Patrick] Murphy's vote in support of the Export-Import Bank. The ads, according to tracking data obtained by The Washington Post, target networks that attract a disproportionate share of Democratic viewers, including MSNBC, while eschewing GOP-heavy networks, such as Fox News Channel. Also arousing suspicions are the markets in which the ad is airing — Democratic strongholds like West Palm Beach and Gainesville are seeing the ad, while GOP-heavy areas like Fort Myers and Pensacola are not. The American Future Fund did not respond to emails seeking comment. [Washington Post, [7/26/16](#)]

- **American Future Fund Aired An Ad In Certain Florida Markets, Which Attacked Democratic U.S. Senate Candidate Patrick Murphy For Supporting The Export-Import Bank, And Urged Viewers To Call Him And Tell Him To Support A Bill To Stop "Supporting Corporate Welfare."** According to the Tampa Bay Times, "A dark-money conservative group with ties to the Koch brothers has launched an ad attacking Democratic U.S. Senate candidate Patrick Murphy for a vote supporting the Export-Import Bank. The ad from American Future Fund began airing this week on certain Florida markets. It urges viewers to call Murphy and tell him to support HR 5715 to 'stop supporting corporate welfare' and 'stop supporting state sponsors of terror.'" [Tampa Bay Times, [7/28/16](#)]
- **The Ad Buy Was Reported To Be \$1.5 Million And Targeted Networks Which Attracted A "Disproportionate Share Of Democratic Viewers."** According to the Tampa Bay Times, "Murphy campaign spokeswoman Galia Slayen called the ad 'just another misleading attack by Republicans to distract from Marco Rubio's record of skipping work and missing many important closed intelligence briefings.' The Washington Post reported the ad buy is worth \$1.5 million and is targeting 'networks that attract a disproportionate share of Democratic viewers, including MSNBC, while eschewing GOP-heavy networks, such as Fox News Channel.' 'Also arousing suspicions are the markets in which the ad is airing — Democratic strongholds like West Palm Beach and Gainesville are seeing the ad, while GOP-heavy areas like Fort Myers and Pensacola are not,' The Post reported." [Tampa Bay Times, [7/28/16](#)]

*American Future Fund Was Koch Backed*

**American Future Fund Received At Least \$77,637,409 From Koch Connected Groups.** According to Conservative Transparency, American Future Fund received at least \$77,637,409 from Koch connected groups. This information is further detailed in the following table:

Year	Donor	Recipient	Contribution
2013	Judicial Crisis Network	American Future Fund	\$750,000
2013	American Commitment	American Future Fund	\$65,000
2012	Center to Protect Patient Rights	American Future Fund	\$49,182,409
2012	Freedom Partners	American Future Fund	\$13,600,000
2011	Center to Protect Patient Rights	American Future Fund	\$1,075,000
2010	Center to Protect Patient Rights	American Future Fund	\$11,685,000
2009	Center to Protect Patient Rights	American Future Fund	\$1,280,000
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$77,637,409</b>

[Conservative Transparency, Accessed [8/10/16](#)]

## Koch-Connected US Chamber of Commerce Spent Over \$1.5 Attacking Patrick Murphy



**Politico: The U.S. Chamber Of Commerce “Reserved \$1.5 Million In Air Time, According To Publicly Available Ad Buy Data, To Attack Democrat Patrick Murphy.”** According to Politico, “The U.S. Chamber of Commerce has reserved \$1.5 million in air time, according to publicly available ad buy data, to attack Democrat Patrick Murphy starting Thursday, and the Senate Leadership Fund has reserved \$1.5 million to begin running ads in the Tampa and Orlando markets.” [Politico, [7/6/16](#)]

*U.S. Chamber Of Commerce Was Koch Backed*

**Between 2012 And 2014, Freedom Partners Gave The U.S. Chamber Of Commerce At Least \$5 Million.** According to Conservative Transparency, between 2012 and 2014 Freedom Partners gave the U.S. Chamber of Commerce at least \$5 million. This information is further detailed in the following table:

Year	Donor	Recipient	Contribution
2014	Freedom Partners	U.S. Chamber Of Commerce	\$2,000,000
2012	Freedom Partners	U.S. Chamber Of Commerce	\$2,000,000
2012	Freedom Partners	U.S. Chamber Of Commerce	\$1,000,000
<b>Total</b>			<b>\$5,000,000</b>

[Conservative Transparency, Accessed [8/22/16](#)]

### **The Koch Network Invested Over Six Figures In Independent Expenditures Against Patrick Murphy**

**From 2012 – 2013, Koch-Funded Americans For Prosperity And 60 Plus Spent Six Figures Against Patrick Murphy.** According to the FEC filings, from 2012 – 2013 Americans for Prosperity and 60 Plus spent at least six figures against Patrick Murphy. This information is further detailed in the following table:

Contributor Organization	Koch Connection	Year	Target	For/Against?	Source	Amount
Americans For Prosperity	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2013	Patrick Murphy (And Joe Garcia)	Against	<a href="#">Tampa Bay Times</a>	\$600,000
60 Plus	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2012	Patrick Murphy	Against	<a href="#">Center for Responsive Politics</a>	\$964

## **RUBIO RECEIVED STRONG SUPPORT FROM AFP**

### **AFP Referred To Marco Rubio As “A Strong Ally” When He Was A State House Speaker In 2008**

**AFP Florida Director Adam Guillette Called Then State House Speaker Marco Rubio “A Strong Ally” As Rubio Considered A Revenue And Spending Cap.** According to the St Petersburg Times Blogs, “House Speaker Marco Rubio is pursuing legislation similar to the revenue and spending cap considered this afternoon by the Taxation and Budget Reform Commission. ‘Speaker Rubio is a strong ally,’ said Adam Guillette, Florida director of Americans For Prosperity, a group that worked with TBRC Commissioner Mike Hogan. Guillette said he had planned to meet again with Rubio tomorrow but is putting it off until later in the week or next week.” [St. Petersburg Times Blogs, 2/11/08]

### **Marco Rubio Was A Proud Recipient Of A 100% Rating From AFP**

**Marco Rubio Released An Ad Spotlighting 100% Ratings From AFP.** According to The Hill, “Rubio’s latest campaign spot also touts glowing reviews he has received from a number of conservative organizations. It spotlights ‘100 percent’ rankings from the National Right to Life Committee, Americans for Prosperity and FreedomWorks. The ad also boasts about Rubio’s ‘98 percent’ from the American Conservative Union, his ‘97 percent’ from Club for Growth and his ‘96 percent’ from Heritage Action for America. Other plaudits include an ‘A’ rankings from the National Rifle Association and the National Taxpayers Union, as well as a ‘Taxpayer Superhero’ title from Citizens Against Government Waste.” [The Hill, [1/14/16](#)]

- **AFP Gave Marco Rubio A 98% Lifetime Score On Their Legislative Scorecard.** [Americans for Prosperity Scorecard, Accessed [9/2/16](#)]



- **AFP-FL State Director Slade O'Brien: "We Are Pleased To Announce Senator Rubio Is The Only US Senator To Receive A Lifetime Rating Of A+."** According to the Tampa Bay Times Blog, The Buzz, "'The AFP Scorecard is the best way for our activists to keep a close eye on Washington, and confront them when they don't vote responsibly,' said AFP-FL State Director Slade O'Brien. 'We are pleased to announce Senator Rubio is the only US Senator to receive a lifetime rating of A+.'" [Tampa Bay Times' Buzz, 2/25/13]

### **AFP President Tim Phillips: "We Care A Lot About Marco Rubio"**

**Americans For Prosperity President Tim Phillips: "We Care A Lot About Marco Rubio."** According to Politico, "THE PLAYBOOK INTERVIEW: Tim Phillips (@TimPhillipsAFP), President of Americans for Prosperity [...] --Key states for AFP in 2016. 'Pennsylvania with [Pat] Toomey, [Rob] Portman in Ohio and Ron Johnson in Wisconsin. Those are three difficult places — Pennsylvania and Wisconsin — especially. Nevada, we're deeply involved there, Florida. We haven't made a firm decision how to be involved [in Florida with] expressed advocacy, or sticking to education. We care a lot about Marco Rubio.'" [Politico, [8/5/16](#)]

## **MARCO RUBIO ATTENDED KOCH EVENTS**

### **Marco Rubio Attended Multiple Koch Donor Conferences**

**Politico: Sen. Marco Rubio Was "Invited To The Kochs' Summer Conference."** According to Politico, "Sen. Marco Rubio, Sen. Rand Paul and Sen. Ted Cruz debated at the Koch network's winter seminar in January, and Wisconsin Gov. Scott Walker made a separate appearance. Those were the candidates who appeared to have a chance at the Koch blessing, and attendees said Rubio seemed to win that round. But those four — plus Jeb [Bush] — will be invited to the Kochs' summer conference, the aide said." [Politico, [4/21/15](#)]

**In January 2015 Sen. Marco Rubio Attended The Koch Brothers' Winter Conference.** According to Mother Jones, "For months, there has been speculation about which GOP 2016 hopeful will win the backing of the billionaire brothers and their donor network, but the former Florida governor has been conspicuously absent from the conversation. In January, Sens. Ted Cruz (R-Texas), Rand Paul (R-Ky.), and Marco Rubio (R-Fla.), as well as Wisconsin Gov. Scott Walker, attended the winter conference organized by the conservative brothers in California, but [Jeb] Bush did not make an appearance." [Mother Jones, [6/22/15](#)]

- **An Informal Straw Poll Of Donors At The Koch Conference Conducted By Frank Luntz Placed Sen. Marco Rubio Ahead Of The Other Invited Candidates.** According to Politico, "In an informal straw poll of some conference donors, Sen. Marco Rubio of Florida came out ahead of four other would-be GOP presidential candidates who had been invited, according to an attendee familiar with the results. The poll was conducted by Frank Luntz, a veteran GOP pollster, during a break-out session of the conference, which wrapped up Tuesday after a long weekend of presentations and discussions at the Ritz-Carlton in Rancho Mirage, Calif." [Politico, [1/28/15](#)]

**Sen. Marco Rubio Attended The Koch Brothers' 2014 Summer Conference.** Marco Rubio According to the Nation, "Charles and David Koch wrapped up their annual summer seminar on June 16 in Dana Point, California, at the St. Regis Monarch Bay resort—a fitting location for two men whose combined net worth is more than \$100 billion, according to the Bloomberg Billionaires Index. The highly secretive mega-donor conference, called 'American Courage: Our Commitment to a Free Society,' featured a who's who of Republican political elites. According to conference documents obtained through a source who was in attendance, Representatives Tom Cotton (AR), Cory Gardner (CO) and Jim Jordan (OH) were present, as were Senators Mitch McConnell (KY) and Marco Rubio (FL)." [The Nation, [6/17/14](#)]

### **Marco Rubio Was A High Profile Speaker At AFP's Yearly Summits**

**Sen. Marco Rubio Was Announced As A Speaker Of AFP's 2016 "Defending The American Dream Summit" In Orlando.** According to the Americans for Prosperity, "Americans for Prosperity is announcing that former presidential contender, Florida Sen. Marco Rubio, is the latest big name speaker to be added to this year's Defending the American Dream Summit, the premier gathering of liberty-minded activists from around the country. Sen. Rubio joins a lineup which already features Wisconsin Gov. Scott Walker, former presidential contender Carly Fiorina, Iowa Sen. Joni Ernst, Georgia Sen. David

Perdue, British Conservative politician Daniel Hannan, and a host of other leaders in the liberty movement. [...] AFP's 10th Annual Defending the American Dream Summit will be held on Sept. 2-3 at the Orange County Convention Center in Orlando, Florida. Over one thousand activists from across the country are expected to attend, including more than a dozen activists from the Garden State." [Americans for Prosperity, [7/26/16](#)]

**AFP Announced That Florida Senator Marco Rubio Will Address Attendees Of The Group's 2015 Defending The American Dream Summit.** According to a press release from Americans for Prosperity, "Rubio and Jordan join a lineup that includes Ohio Senator Rob Portman, Texas Senator Ted Cruz, Texas Governor Rick Perry, former Florida Governor Jeb Bush, and FCC Commissioner Ajit Pai. The Defending the American Dream Summit will be held on August 21 and 22 at the Greater Columbus Convention Center." [AFP Press Release, [7/13/15](#)]

**New York Times: Sen. Marco Rubio "Has Been A Frequent Speaker At American For Prosperity Summit Meetings" Including "A High-Profile And Carefully Chosen Speaking Slot" At 2014's Summer Seminar.** According to the New York Times, "Another prospective presidential candidate who has been popping up at Koch events in recent years is Mr. Rubio. He delivered the closing speech at last year's summer seminar — a high-profile and carefully chosen speaking slot — and has been a frequent speaker at American for Prosperity summit meetings." [New York Times, [1/20/15](#)]

**Sen. Marco Rubio Was The Keynote Speaker Of AFP Foundation's 2013 "Defending The American Dream Summit" In Orlando.** According to the Orlando Sentinel, "Republican U.S. Sens. Marco Rubio of Florida, Ted Cruz of Texas and Ron Johnson of Wisconsin are among headline speakers announced for the 'Defending the American Dream Summit' conference the conservative action group Americans for Prosperity Foundation plans for Orlando in late August." [Orlando Sentinel, 7/29/14]

### **Rubio Attended A LIBRE Town Hall**

**Associated Press: The LIBRE Initiative Was Scheduled To Host A Town Hall Meeting In Boulder City, NV On October 10 At 12:30 PM With Sen. Marco Rubio.** According to the Associated Press, "Republican presidential candidate Marco Rubio is returning to Nevada next month. [...] He'll then head to a rally in Boulder City at 10:30 a.m. Saturday, Oct. 10, and attend a town hall meeting hosted by the LIBRE Initiative at 12:30 p.m. the same day." [Associated Press, [9/27/15](#)]

### **Rubio Spoke At Concerned Veterans For America Town Halls, Summits, And Events**

**Concerned Veterans For America Announced A "Veterans And Military Town Hall" Event With Marco Rubio In South Carolina And Iowa.** According to a Concerned Veterans for America press release, "Concerned Veterans for America (CVA) has announced three new 'Veterans and Military Town Hall' events as part of its 'Defend and Reform' Policy Series. Former Hewlett-Packard CEO Carly Fiorina, retired neurosurgeon Ben Carson and Senator Marco Rubio (R-Fla.) will headline the following events: Tuesday, December 1: Carly Fiorina, Charleston, SC; Saturday, December 5: Ben Carson, Waterloo, IA; Thursday, December 10: Senator Marco Rubio, Des Moines, IA." [Concerned Veterans for America, [11/20/15](#)]

**Senator Marco Rubio Spoke At CVA's Veterans And Military Town Hall Series.** According to the Washington Post, "This coming Monday, Sen. Rand Paul (R-Ky.) will share a stage with a man who wanted to join him in the Senate -- and was stymied by supporters of Paul's father. The younger Paul will be the second speaker in Concerned Veterans for America's 'Veterans and Military Town Hall' series, which the conservative advocacy group launched last month with Sen. Marco Rubio (R-Fla.). Pete Hegseth, CVA's CEO, is a veteran of the wars in Iraq and Afghanistan who returned to become an advocate for continuing America's involvement there." [Washington Post, [7/23/15](#)]

**Sens. John McCain And Marco Rubio And Former Speaker Newt Gingrich Will Headline CVA's "Fixing Veterans Health Care Summit."** According to a press release from Concerned Veterans for America, "Today, Concerned Veterans for America (CVA) announced the addition of Senators John McCain (R-AZ) and Marco Rubio (R-FL) as well as former Speaker of the House Newt Gingrich to the growing list of prominent lawmakers and policy experts set to headline the Fixing Veterans Health Care Summit and react to the findings of CVA's bipartisan Taskforce report which will be released at the event on Feb. 26 in Washington, D.C." [Concerned Veterans for America Press Release, [2/11/15](#)]

**Sen. Marco Rubio Spoke At A CVA Event About "The Importance Of American Leadership In The Global Arena" Which Was "In Line With The Principles Espoused By CVA's Strength And Security Project."** According to press release, "On September 17, 2014, Senator Marco Rubio (R-FL) spoke on the importance of maintaining American strength as

a deterrent to aggression and violence around the world. In line with the principles espoused by CVA's Strength and Security Project, Sen. Rubio spoke about the importance of American leadership in the global arena. As put by the Senator on the uniqueness of America's role abroad: "The world needs American Strength just as much as our people and our economy do. No other nation can deter global conflict by its presence alone. No other nation can offer the security and benevolence that America can. No other nation can be trusted to defend peace and advance liberty." [CVA Press Release, [9/17/14](#)]

**Concerned Veterans For America Had A Lobbying Meeting With Marco Rubio.** According to a retweet from Concerned Veterans for America Vice President of Legislative and Political Action Dan Caldwell, "Had a great first meeting this morning with Sen. @marcorubio @ConcernedVets #VOTH2016 pic.twitter.com/nWIZpwvMCR." [Dan Caldwell – Twitter, [6/8/16](#)]

### **Rubio Spoke At The James Madison Institute**

**JMI Held A Luncheon With Then-House Speaker Designate Marco Rubio In March 2006.** According to the Spring 2006 James Madison Institute Newsletter, "JMI members and guests gathered at the Pensacola Cultural Center on March 3 to hear from House Speaker Designate Marco hear from House Speaker Designate Marco Rubio as he discussed the upcoming legislative session and his views on the critical issues facing Florida." [James Madison Institute Newsletter via archive.org, [April 2006](#)]

**Sen. Marco Rubio Spoke At The James Madison Institute's Co-Sponsored CPAC Regional Event In 2011.** According to a post on The James Madison Institute's website, "The James Madison Institute will co-sponsor the first ever Conservative Political Action Conference (CPAC) regional event: CPAC Florida 2011 on September 23, 2011 in Orlando. For more information, visit the CPAC Florida website—nine Presidential candidates are confirmed to speak and other confirmed guest speakers include Grover Norquist, Marco Rubio, Rick Scott, Allen West, and JMI's own Bob McClure!" [Post via JamesMadison.org, [2011](#)]

**In 2013, Rubio Delivered A Televised Greeting To The James Madison Institute's 25th Anniversary Gala.** According to the Tampa Bay Times' The Buzz blog, "If Ayn Rand were alive and living in Florida, she would have paid \$125 for a ticket and attended The James Madison Institute's 25th anniversary gala Wednesday night. Most of the state's conservative heavyweights were there: Gov. Rick Scott, Agriculture Commissioner Adam Putnam, Chief Financial Officer Jeff Atwater, House Speaker Will Weatherford. U.S. Sen. Marco Rubio delivered a televised greeting to the institute." [Buzz via TampaBay.com, [3/14/13](#)]

- **Rubio Said In Greeting "We Encourage (JMI) To Continue To Be A Source Of Ideas And Inspiration, Not Just In Florida, But Hopefully That Will Spread Across The Country."** According to the Tampa Bay Times' The Buzz blog, "Marco Rubio: 'Most of the innovation in this country is happening at the state level. I know that first hand from having served there... Whether it's curriculum reform or school accountability, regulatory and tax reform. So we encourage (JMI) to continue to be a source of ideas and inspiration, not just in Florida, but hopefully that will spread across the country.'" [Buzz via TampaBay.com, [3/14/13](#)]

**Rubio Visited The James Madison Institute's Headquarters In 2013.** According to the James Madison Institute's flickr album titled, "Sen. Marco Rubio visits JMI Headquarters," the Senator visited the James Madison Institute's headquarters in Tallahassee on August 12, 2013. [James Madison Institute Album via Flickr.com, [8/12/13](#)]

- **At The James Madison Institute's Headquarters, Rubio Spoke About The Patient Protection And Affordable Care Act.** According to an opinion by J. Robert McClure, the president and CEO of The James Madison Institute, in Newsmax, "As U.S. Sen. Marco Rubio pointed out during a recent talk at The James Madison Institute's Tallahassee headquarters, because of this the PPACA [Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act] will also cause serious ripple effects throughout the U.S. economy. For one thing, it'll mean that consumers will have less money to spend on other things – dining out, movies, dry cleaning, transportation, housing, etc. These ripple effects will be among the PPACA's many unintended consequences." [J. Robert McClure – Newsmax, [8/29/13](#)]

## **REVOLVING DOOR BETWEEN THE KOCH NETWORK AND RUBIO'S STAFF**

**Politico: The Koch Brothers’ “Top Political Adviser,” “Trusted Member Of Their Inner Circle,” And President Of Freedom Partners Marc Short Joined The Rubio Campaign As A Senior Adviser.** According to Politico, “Marc Short, the Koch brothers’ top political adviser in Washington and a trusted member of their inner circle for five years, is making a surprise move to the Marco Rubio campaign as a senior adviser as the Republican establishment ramps up efforts to stop Donald Trump. Short — president of Freedom Partners, the Kochs’ umbrella political organization — will join the campaign in about a week and brings deep connections to the donor and grass-roots worlds.” [Politico, [2/23/16](#)]

**Former LIBRE Initiative Consultant Javi Correoso Worked As An Advisor On Sen. Marco Rubio’s 2016 Presidential Campaign.** According to Florida Politics, “PERSONNEL NOTE – UBER HIRES EX-MARCO RUBIO ADVISER, GROWING FLORIDA TEAM via Patricia Mazzei of the Miami Herald – The company has hired Javi Correoso as its public affairs manager for the state ... fresh off Rubio’s presidential campaign, where he worked as the Florida and national Hispanic engagement adviser. [...] He was previously a spokesman for the 2014 statewide campaign against a constitutional amendment to legalize medical marijuana, and he consulted on U.S. House and Senate races for the LIBRE Initiative, a conservative Hispanic nonprofit backed by the billionaire Koch brothers. Before that, Correoso was a senior aide to then-U.S. Rep. David Rivera, and executive director of the Miami-Dade Republican Party.” [Florida Politics, [4/12/16](#)]

**The Koch-Controlled LIBRE Initiative’s National Strategic Director Jose Mallea Was Sen. Rubio’s Former Campaign Manager.** According to The Nation, “Rubio was introduced by César Grajales, the South Florida field director for the LIBRE initiative, a Koch-funded campaign to attract Latino voters to the GOP. Rubio’s former campaign manager, Jose Mallea, is the group’s national strategic director.” [The Nation, [9/4/14](#)]

## **RUBIO CONSISTENTLY FOUGHT FOR THE KOCHS’ POLICY AGENDA**

### **Marco Rubio Pushed For Koch Approved Tax Policies**

*Koch Brothers Have A History Of Pushing For Tax Policies That Help Their Bottom Line*

**In At Least Five Votes, AFP Opposed Raising Taxes On The Wealthy.** According to AFP’s congressional scorecards for the 111th and 112th Congresses, AFP took a position against raising taxes on high-income earners at least five times: 2012 Senate vote 184, 2012 Senate vote 251, 2010 Senate vote 258, 2010 Senate vote 259 and 2010 House vote 604. [AFP Scorecard for the 112th Congress, [2/1/13](#); AFP Scorecard for the 111th Congress, [1/10/11](#)]

**David Koch’s 1980 Libertarian Ticket Proposed Halving Capital Gains Tax Rate.** According to Clark For President White Paper On Taxing And Spending Reduction, Page 10, “This proposal will also cut the capital gains tax in half, a major step toward capital formation and economic growth. When the capital gains tax was increased a few years ago, receipts from the tax actually declined. People made fewer investments in areas subject to capital gains taxation. When the rate was later cut, tax receipts increased, and the U.S. savings rate went up. The rate reduction had a very positive impact on personal savings and investment, producing greater capital formation and economic growth.” [Clark For President White Paper On Taxing And Spending Reduction, Page 10, [1980](#)]

*Rubio Fought To Slash Tax Bills For The Wealthiest In The Country*

**Washington Post: Marco Rubio’s Tax Plan Zeroed Out Taxes On Capital Gains And Dividends In What Was Probably The Single Most Helpful Tax Change To The Wealthiest Households.** According to the Washington Post, “This post focuses on problem No. 2: making the tax code more regressive. In this regard, Sen. Marco Rubio takes the cake. If you were thinking: ‘what tax change could I implement that would be most helpful to the wealthiest households?’ you’d quickly come to the same conclusion as Rubio: zero out taxes on capital gains and dividends. That’s because taxation on these forms of income, currently taxed at a top rate of 23.8 percent, is highly concentrated: according to the Tax Policy Center, 79 percent of the tax take from this asset-based income comes from the top 1 percent, 5 percent from the bottom 90 percent.” [Washington Post, [11/5/15](#)]

**PBS: Rubio Signed A Tax Proposal That “Would Slash Federal Tax Bills For Many Of The Wealthiest In The Country.”** According to PBS, “Florida Sen. Rubio wrote a book in December outlining proposals to help low-income and middle-class families. In February he signed on to a sweeping tax proposal that does not cut top rates as much as Bush’s plan but does eliminate taxes on investment income. That would slash federal tax bills for many of the wealthiest in the country.” [PBS, [9/13/15](#)]



## **Rubio Followed The Koch Brothers In Denying Climate Change**

*The Koch Brothers Invested In Climate Change Denial Efforts To Protect Their Profits*

**The Kochs Gave At Least \$79 Million To Groups That Denied Climate Change.** According to Greenpeace, “The Koch brothers continue to finance campaigns to make Americans doubt the seriousness of global warming, increasingly hiding money through nonprofits like DonorsTrust and Donors Capital Fund. [...] Now the shroud of secrecy has thankfully been lifted, revealing the \$79 million that he and his brother Charles have quietly funneled to climate-denial front groups that are working to delay policies and regulations aimed at stopping global warming, most of which are part of the State Policy Network.” [Greenpeace, Accessed [10/8/15](#)]

**Koch Industries Has Been Against Efforts To Combat Climate Change Because Their Earnings Could Be Negatively Affected By These Policies.** According to NPR, “Climate change policy could negatively affect Koch Industries’ earnings — the University of Massachusetts Amherst’s Political Economy Research Institute found that Koch Industries ranked among the top 30 companies for CO2 emissions in the United States in 2011. Last year, Koch Industries was the top spender for oil and gas lobbying, according to data from the Center for Responsive Politics: It spent \$13.7 million.” [NPR, [8/11/15](#)]

*Marco Rubio Claimed Carbon Emissions Weren’t Changing The Climate But Even If They Were There’s Nothing We Can Do*

**Huffington Post: Marco Rubio “Said Both That Carbon Emissions Aren’t Changing The Climate, But Also That Even If There Were A Problem, Nothing Could Be Done To Affect It Anyway.”** According to the Huffington Post, “To recap, in response to a legitimate concern about climate impacts in the state he represents, made by a Republican mayor who has endorsed him, Rubio said both that carbon emissions aren’t changing the climate, but also that even if there were a problem, nothing could be done to affect it anyway.” [Huffington Post, [8/15/16](#)]

## **Rubio Joined The Kochs In Fighting EPA And Their Clean Power Plan Efforts**

*The Kochs Fought Against The EPA Its Regulations*

**CBS News Headline: “Koch Industries: Behind The Fight To Gut The EPA”** [CBS News, [2/8/11](#)]

**The Koch Brothers And Their Network Of Free-Market Front Groups Have Fought To Prevent States From Implementing The CPP.** According to the Energy and Policy Institute, “Since the plan will bring about a cleaner economy many fossil fuel corporations and the Koch Brothers’ network of ‘free-market’ front groups are fighting to prevent states from implementing the CPP.” [Energy and Policy Institute, [July 2015](#)]

*Rubio Supported Undermining The EPA’s Clean Power Plan Efforts*

**Marco Rubio Cosponsored Legislation To Block The EPA’s Clean Power Plan And Remarked That He “Hoped To Put A Stop To The CPP Once And For All.”** According to a press release from Marco Rubio, “Following the release of the Environmental Protection Agency’s (EPA) final Clean Power Plan (CPP), U.S. Senator Marco Rubio (R-FL) today co-sponsored two Congressional Review Act (CRA) resolutions aimed at protecting Florida families from higher energy taxes that will result in higher electricity bills. ‘We need policies that are good for our natural environment, but also good for our economy,’ said Rubio. ‘The Obama Administration’s Clean Power Plan would devastate our economy and increase the cost of living for millions of American families already struggling with high bills and expenses. In Florida alone, these irresponsible regulations could raise individual electric bills significantly.’ ‘I’m proud to join this bipartisan effort that attempts to stop yet another EPA overreach from threatening the economic security of Floridians,’ Rubio added. ‘Eventually, I hope we can put a stop to the CPP once and for all.’” [Marco Rubio Press Release, [10/27/16](#)]

## **Rubio, Like The Kochs Opposes Raising The Minimum Wage**

*The Koch Brothers Have Fought Against The Minimum Wage And Raising It*



### **As The Libertarian Candidate For Vice President, David Koch Advocated For Abolishing The Minimum Wage.**

According to Vice News, “Both David and Charles were heavily influenced by Friedrich von Hayek's free-market bible *The Road to Serfdom*, and further by the work of Robert LeFevre, an advocate for the abolition of government. David ran as the Libertarian Party's vice presidential candidate in 1980, spending \$2 million on the campaign. Among the party's goals were the abolition of various federal law enforcement and regulatory agencies, including the CIA, the SEC, and the Department of Energy. The party also wanted to eliminate Social Security, minimum wage laws, gun control laws, and income taxes—positions the Koch brothers still hold, to varying degrees.” [Vice News, [2/5/15](#)]

**Charles Koch Called The Minimum Wage “An Obstacle To Prosperity.”** According to Forbes, “Now, as Obama renews calls on Congress to boost the \$7.25 federal minimum wage, elder brother Charles Koch is calling it an obstacle to prosperity. On Wednesday, the Charles Koch Foundation wrapped up a four-week media blitz in Wichita, Kansas, home base of Koch Industries, America's second largest private company. This ad buy included a 60-second TV spot touting the U.S. as a one-time world leader in ‘economic freedom’ that has lost its way.” [Forbes, [8/8/13](#)]

### *Marco Rubio Admitted That People Can't Live Off The Minimum Wage But Still Opposed Raising It*

**Marco Rubio Admitted People Can't Live Off Jobs That Only Pay \$10 Or \$11 An Hour But Still Opposed Raising The Minimum Wage.** According to MSNBC, “Florida Sen. Marco Rubio admitted that people can't live off jobs that pay only \$10 or \$11 per hour on Wednesday. But the Republican presidential hopeful opposes raising the minimum wage. At a campaign event in New Hampshire, the Florida senator argued, ‘I have the full confidence that the American private sector, made up of the most innovative and productive people on this planet, won't just create millions of jobs. They will create millions of jobs that pay more. Because even the jobs that are being created now don't pay enough. You can't live on \$10 an hour. You can't live on \$11 an hour.’ And since the current federal minimum wage is \$7.25 per hour, Rubio obviously believes Americans can't live on the current federal minimum wage, either.” [MSNBC, [10/15/15](#)]

### **Rubio Worked With The Kochs To Kill The Export-Import Bank**

#### *Koch Industries Told Lawmakers To Oppose Reauthorizing The Export-Import Bank*

**The Hill: “Koch Industries Told Lawmakers To Oppose Reauthorizing The Export-Import Bank In A Letter Sent To Congress.”** According to The Hill, “Koch Industries told lawmakers to oppose reauthorizing the Export-Import Bank in a letter sent to Congress on Tuesday and obtained by The Hill. Philip Ellender, president of government and public affairs at Koch Companies Public Sector, wrote in the letter that ‘the Ex-Im bank is yet another example of the government intervening in the market to pick winners and losers.’” [The Hill, [3/3/15](#)]

#### *Marco Rubio Has Persistently Worked To Kill The Export-Import Bank*

**Senator Marco Rubio Filed An Amendment To Kill Off The Federal Export-Import Bank.** According to The Washington Times, “Sen. Marco Rubio and a conservative ally filed an amendment Wednesday to affirmatively kill off the federal Export-Import Bank, even as supporters of the lapsed agency plotted to revive it as part of debate on a must-pass highway bill. Mr. Rubio, a Florida Republican who is running for president, and Sen. Mike Lee, Utah Republican, are among outspoken opponents of the agency, which financed the sale of U.S. goods overseas for 81 years before Congress allowed its charter to expire June 30.” [Washington Times, [7/23/15](#)]

**Sen. Marco Rubio Participated In A Conference Call Hosted By AFP In Which They “Made The Case Against Reauthorizing The Export-Import Bank.”** According to The Washington Times, “In a conference call hosted by the Koch-funded Americans For Prosperity, Mr. Rubio was asked about a report in USA Today in which Charles Koch said that he and his brother David, who run the sprawling Koch industries, are open to supporting Mr. Rubio in the presidential race. [...] The comments came toward the end of a conference call in which Mr. Rubio and leaders of AFP made the case against reauthorizing the Export-Import bank.” [Washington Times, [4/23/15](#)]

**AFP: Senator Marco Rubio Made “The Case For Ending The Export-Import Bank” And Credited AFP For “The Emergence Of The Issue.”** According to an AFP web post, “Senator Marco Rubio addressed hundreds of Americans for Prosperity volunteers in Manchester last week, making the case for ending the Export-Import Bank and attributing the emergence of the issue to the group's year-long efforts.” [AmericansForProsperity.org/article, [6/29/15](#)]

## **Rubio And The Kochs Both Opposed Debt Assistance For Puerto Rico**

*Koch Groups Have Lobbied Against The Puerto Rico “Bailout”*

**60 Plus Took Out A Full Page Ad In Politico Against A \$64 Billion Bailout For Puerto Rico And Called Chapter 9 A “Bad Deal For Seniors” And A “Bad Deal For U.S. Taxpayers.”** According to Caribbean Business, “The 60 Plus Association, a U.S. mainland-based right-leaning organization representing more than 7.2 million seniors, recently launched a campaign urging the U.S. Congress to reject a \$164 billion bailout for Puerto Rico. It took out a full page advertisement in Politico that calls Chapter 9 a ‘bad deal for seniors’ and a ‘bad deal for U.S. taxpayers.’ The advertisement goes on to further state that extending Chapter 9 for Puerto Rico would ‘unfairly change the rules in the middle of the game for millions of senior citizens and other pensioners and investors who have their life savings on the line.’” [Caribbean Business, [5/11/15](#)]

**National Hispanic Foundation For The Arts, Advocacy Specialist Gretchen Sierra-Zorita: The Hispanic Leadership Fund, “Which Has Received Koch Funding Through One Of Their Intermediary Organizations, Joined The Fray” In October By Comparing Puerto Rico’s Governor Garcia Padilla To Fidel Castro.** According to an opinion by public policy, outreach and advocacy specialist for the National Hispanic Foundation for the Arts, Gretchen Sierra-Zorita for Fox News Latino, “In October a San Juan court ruled in favor of Doral on the tax dispute. The government filed an appeal. The Hispanic Leadership Fund, which has received Koch funding through one of their intermediary organizations, joined the fray, comparing Garcia Padilla to Cuba’s [Fidel] Castro.” [Gretchen Sierra-Zorita – Fox News Latino, [12/2/14](#)]

*Rubio Opposed Puerto Rican Bankruptcy Lifeline*

**Politico: “Marco Rubio Opposes Bankruptcy Lifeline For Struggling Puerto Rico.”** [Politico, [9/4/15](#)]

**Marco Rubio Florida Today Op-Ed: “Helping Puerto Rico Without A Bailout.”** [Marco Rubio – Florida Today, [8/23/16](#)]

## **Marco Rubio And The Kochs Opposed Net Neutrality**

*The Koch Group American Commitment Fueled The Majority Of Anti-Net Neutrality Action*

**The Koch Brother’s American Commitment Were Single-Handedly Responsible For 56.5 Percent Of All Anti-Net Neutrality Comments Filed With The Federal Communications Commission.** According to the Sunlight Foundation, “The organization that appears to be behind a majority of the recent anti-net neutrality comments filed with the Federal Communications Commission is affiliated with the Koch brothers’ network. Sunlight’s latest analysis of recent comments on the FCC’s controversial proposed Internet regulations found that, unlike in an earlier round, most of them were opposed to net neutrality – and that ‘the form-letter initiatives of a single organization, American Commitment, are single-handedly responsible for 56.5 percent of the comments in this round.’” [Sunlight Foundation, [12/16/14](#)]

*Marco Rubio Voiced Strong Opposition To Net Neutrality*

**Sen. Marco Rubio Spoke At A Lunch Hosted By AFP, Where He “Voiced Strong Opposition To ‘Net Neutrality’ Laws.”** According to The Washington Post’s Post Politics blog, “Later in the day, [Sen. Marco] Rubio spoke at lunch hosted by Americans for Prosperity, a conservative group backed by the billionaire industrialist Koch brothers. There, he voiced strong opposition to ‘net neutrality’ laws, which Republican politicians generally oppose.” [Post Politics via WashingtonPost.com, [5/1/15](#)]

**2011: Sen. Rubio Voted With The AFP Position To Support A “Congressional Review Act Motion Of Disapproval Of FCC’s Net Neutrality Regulations.”** According to AFP’s 2011-2012 Scorecard, Senator Marco Rubio supported the AFP position by voting yes on Senate Vote #200, S. J. Res. 6, a “Congressional Review Act motion of disapproval of FCC’s net neutrality regulations.” [AFP Scorecard, Accessed [8/16/16](#)]

## **Marco Rubio And The Kochs Support Privatizing The VA**

### *The Koch Brothers' Veteran Front Group CVA Has Pushed To Privatize The VA*

**CNN: CVA Promotes Privatizing The VA.** According to CNN, “Discussing the need for reforms improving access to care at the Department of Veterans Affairs, Sanders said that a group funded by the Koch brothers is promoting the privatization of the agency. An organization called Concerned Veterans for America is sanctioned by the influential conservative siblings, Sanders said. [...] Sanders is correct in describing the group’s Koch lineage and its intent. Our verdict is true.” [CNN, [2/5/16](#)]

**CVA Recommended Converting The Current “VHA Integrated Health Care System” Into A Government-Chartered Non-Profit Corporation.** According to a press release from Concerned Veterans for America, “The Veterans Independence Act would make four key reforms to the delivery of veterans health care: 1. Separate the VHA’s payor and provider functions and convert the current VHA integrated health care system into a government-chartered [sic] nonprofit corporation.” [Concerned Veterans For America Press Release, [2/26/15](#)]

### *Marco Rubio Supported CVA’s Privatization Agenda*

**CNN: Sen. Marco Rubio Supported CVA’s Proposed Reforms To “Subsidize Private Insurance To Veterans And Transform Its Healthcare Department Into A Nonprofit Corporation Instead Of A Government Agency.”** According to CNN, “A task force organized by Concerned Veterans for America said the VA should begin offering subsidized private insurance to veterans and transform its healthcare department into a nonprofit corporation instead of a government agency. The move comes in response to the scandal involving healthcare delays and data manipulation at VA facilities first reported by CNN. Sen. Marco Rubio, R-Florida, supported the proposed reforms, saying VA healthcare could improve by adopting the competition and flexibility of private healthcare.” [CNN, [2/26/15](#)]

- **Concerned Veterans For America CEO Pete Hegseth: “CVA Applauds Sen. Marco Rubio For Boldly Advocating For Major And Substantial Reforms To The VA” Despite Attacks From “Partisan Political Organizations Like The DNC” Who Are Fighting To Preserve The Status Quo.** According to a press release from Concerned Veterans for America CEO Pete Hegseth, “CVA applauds Sen. Marco Rubio for boldly advocating for major and substantial reforms to the VA. In particular, his proposal to offer health care choice to all veterans who use the VA and to increase accountability for bad employees at the VA are two major reforms that Concerned Veterans for America has long advocated for. We are very encouraged to see national policy makers like Sen. Rubio stand up for real reform at the Department of Veterans Affairs which unfortunately still failing to deliver timely benefits and health care to our nation’s veterans. Not surprisingly, the defenders of the status quo at the VA are attacking and continuing to misrepresent not only Senator Rubio’s proposals but other national policymakers’ proposals as well along with CVA’s Veterans Independence Act – which is CVA’s comprehensive plan to fix veterans’ health care. By misrepresenting these proposals as a complete privatization of the VA, elected officials like Rep. Ruben Gallego (who it should be noted represents thousands of veterans who are forced to rely on the troubled Phoenix VA hospital for health care) and partisan political organizations like the DNC are fighting to preserve a system that has proven unable to properly serve hundreds of thousands our nation’s veterans – often to the detriment of their health and overall well-being.” [Concerned Veterans for America Press Release, [12/10/15](#)]

### **Rubio Follows Koch Talking Points On Immigration**

#### *The Koch Brothers' LIBRE Initiative Opposed DAPA And DACA*

**LIBRE National Spokesperson Rachel Campos-Duffy: Obama’s Executive Order And DACA Was An “Illegal Move” And The “Executive Order For DACA Caused An Influx Of Tens Of Thousands Of Children From Central America.”** According to a CNN interview transcript with Rachel Campos-Duffy, CAMPOS-DUFFY: “The president’s executive order, another illegal move that he made this last summer, and executive order for DACA caused an influx of tens of thousands of children from Central America, and it freaked people out. That’s what happened.” [CNN Transcript, [11/9/14](#); CNN Transcript, [11/9/14](#)]

**LIBRE Initiative Executive Director Daniel Garza Attacked Obama’s Executive Order As “Pandering” and “Dangerous.”** According to Garza: “Immigration policies should be market driven, not politically motivated. The foundation of individual liberty is rule of law, not what is politically expedient. More importantly, federal immigration reform must be

hammered out by those elected by the people to be our voice in Congress, not the act of one person. It is pandering, it is dangerous, and it is not the American way.” [FoxNews Latino, [6/12/12](#)]

**Garza Said “The Problem With” The Deferred Action For Parental Accountability (DAPA) Program “Is That It Doesn't Honor Our System Of A Republic.”** According to Latin Post, “The Deferred Action for Parental Accountability (DAPA) program, which was announced by Obama in November 2014 but not yet implemented, also has its concerns from the organization. ‘The problem with [DAPA] is that it doesn't honor our system of a republic,’ said Garza. ‘We elected our congressmen and our senators, and, as a president, you have to execute the law based on the consent and will of and approvals of Congress, and when you don't do that, you circumvent the process and put us in a position we're at now where a court may rescind or eliminate DACA or DAPA and then expose all these folks that signed on in good faith.’” [Latin Post, [4/28/15](#)]

**Labor And Civil Rights “Icon” Dolores Huerta Said Marco Rubio “Speaks Out Of Both Sides Of His Mouth” On Immigration And “Is Following A Talking Point” By The LIBRE Initiative.** According to the Latin Post, “Regarded as ‘one of America’s great labor and civil rights icons,’ Dolores Huerta has dedicated her life to advocating labor and civil rights, and her work continues as the Latino electorate brave the 2016 presidential election season. [...] ‘I think that he (Rubio) is a person we cannot trust because I think he’s an opportunist and he’s going to say what he needs to say just to get himself elected,’ Huerta said. ‘He speaks out of both sides of his mouth because first he said he was for immigration reform and then he didn’t support President Obama’s executive order, which would have brought tremendous amount of relief to many working people.’ Huerta said Rubio is also following a talking point by Libre Initiative, a right-leaning organization that has received funding from the Koch brothers.” [Latin Post, [6/9/15](#)]

**CNN: Marco Rubio Said “He Would End Parts Of President Barack Obama’s Deferred Action Program For Undocumented Immigrants On His First Day In Office.”** According to CNN, “Marco Rubio suggested Thursday that he would end parts of President Barack Obama’s deferred action program for undocumented immigrants on his first day in office, an apparent break from previous statements and inviting attacks from more hardline rivals.” [CNN, [2/18/16](#)]

## **The Kochs Spent Over \$3.4 Million On Florida Congressional Races Since 2010**

### **KOCH INDUSTRIES PAC DIRECTLY CONTRIBUTED AT LEAST \$231,000 TO FLORIDA CONGRESSIONAL RACES SINCE THE 2010 CYCLE**

#### **Direct Contributions**

**Between 2009 And 2016, Koch Industries Contributed At Least \$231,000 To Florida Congressional Candidates.**

According to the FEC filings, between 2009 and 2016 Koch Industries contributed at least \$231,000 to Florida congressional candidates. This information is further detailed in the following table:

<b>Candidate</b>	<b>Target</b>	<b>Contributor</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Amount</b>
Adam Hasner	Adam Hasner For US House	Koch Industries PAC	09/30/2012	\$2,500
Adam Hasner	Adam Hasner For US House	Koch Industries PAC	06/29/2012	\$5,000
Adam Hasner	Adam Hasner For US House	Koch Industries PAC	03/31/2012	\$2,500
Allen Boyd	Boyd For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	06/24/2009	\$2,500
Allen Boyd	Boyd For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	05/27/2009	\$1,500
Ander Crenshaw	Crenshaw For Congress Campaign	Koch Industries PAC	06/29/2015	\$1,000
Ander Crenshaw	Crenshaw For Congress Campaign	Koch Industries PAC	12/14/2011	\$1,000
Bill Posey	Friends Of Bill Posey	Koch Industries PAC	05/31/2016	\$2,500
Carlos Curbelo	Carlos Curbelo Congress	Koch Industries PAC	06/29/2015	\$2,500
Carlos Curbelo	Carlos Curbelo Congress	Koch Industries PAC	03/31/2015	\$3,000
Carlos Curbelo	Carlos Curbelo Congress	Koch Industries PAC	03/25/2015	\$2,000
Carlos Curbelo	Carlos Curbelo Congress	Koch Industries PAC	09/23/2014	\$5,000
Cliff Stearns	Friends Of Cliff Stearns	Koch Industries PAC	02/06/2012	\$2,500
Cliff Stearns	Friends Of Cliff Stearns	Koch Industries PAC	12/19/2011	\$2,500
Connie Mack	Friends Of Connie Mack	Koch Industries PAC	03/23/2012	\$5,000
Connie Mack	Friends Of Connie Mack	Koch Industries PAC	06/22/2011	\$2,500
Connie Mack	Friends Of Connie Mack	Koch Industries PAC	02/17/2011	\$2,500
Connie Mack	Friends Of Connie Mack	Koch Industries PAC	07/09/2010	\$2,500
Connie Mack	Friends Of Connie Mack	Koch Industries PAC	10/21/2009	\$1,000
Connie Mack	Friends Of Connie Mack	Koch Industries PAC	05/28/2009	\$1,000
Daniel Webster	Daniel Webster For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	05/02/2014	\$2,500
Daniel Webster	Daniel Webster For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	11/16/2013	\$2,500
David Jolly	Friends of David Jolly	Koch Industries PAC	06/22/2013	\$2,500



David Rivera	David Rivera For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	09/22/2010	\$5,000
David Rivera	David Rivera For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	08/10/2010	\$2,500
David Rivera	David Rivera For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	06/28/2010	\$2,500
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	4/23/2015	\$5,000
Dennis Ross	Tax Payers Incensed By Government Excess	Koch Industries PAC	09/30/2014	\$2,500
Dennis Ross	Tax Payers Incensed By Government Excess	Koch Industries PAC	05/07/2014	\$2,500
Dennis Ross	Taxpayers Incensed By Government Excess	Koch Industries PAC	12/09/2013	\$2,500
Dennis Ross	Taxpayers Incensed By Government Excess	Koch Industries PAC	07/16/2013	\$2,500
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	06/25/2016	\$2,500
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	03/31/2014	\$1,500
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	02/11/2014	\$1,000
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	12/30/2013	\$4,500
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	11/07/2013	\$1,000
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	06/15/2013	\$2,000
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	10/21/2012	\$5,000
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	06/19/2012	\$500
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	12/08/2011	\$2,000
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	06/20/2011	\$500
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	05/12/2011	\$1,000
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	04/11/2011	\$1,000
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	08/25/2010	\$1,000
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	06/01/2010	\$1,000
Dennis Ross	Friends Of Dennis Ross	Koch Industries PAC	03/31/2010	\$2,500
Ileana Ros-Lehtinen	Ros-Lehtinen For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	05/23/2012	\$1,000
Ileana Ros-Lehtinen	Ros-Lehtinen For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	03/28/2012	\$2,500
John Mica	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	09/30/2012	\$5,000
John Mica	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	03/31/2012	\$2,500
John Mica	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	12/19/2011	\$2,500
John Mica	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	10/18/2010	\$1,500
John Mica	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	06/11/2010	\$1,000
Lincoln Diaz-Balart	Lincoln Diaz-Balart For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	06/03/2009	\$2,500
Mario Diaz-Balart	Mario Diaz-Balart For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	12/13/2011	\$2,500
Rich Nugent	Friends Of Rich Nugent	Koch Industries PAC	06/27/2013	\$7,500
Rich Nugent	Friends Of Rich Nugent	Koch Industries PAC	07/31/2012	\$1,500
Rich Nugent	Friends Of Rich Nugent	Koch Industries PAC	06/28/2012	\$1,000
Rich Nugent	Friends Of Rich Nugent	Koch Industries PAC	06/15/2012	\$1,000
Rich Nugent	Friends Of Rich Nugent	Koch Industries PAC	03/28/2012	\$2,000
Rich Nugent	Friends Of Rich Nugent	Koch Industries PAC	12/02/2011	\$1,000
Rich Nugent	Friends Of Rich Nugent	Koch Industries PAC	10/03/2011	\$1,000
Rich Nugent	Friends Of Rich Nugent	Koch Industries PAC	10/04/2010	\$2,500
Ron DeSantis	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	05/06/2015	\$5,000
Ron DeSantis	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	03/25/2015	\$5,000
Ron DeSantis	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	09/30/2014	\$2,000
Ron DeSantis	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	02/25/2014	\$1,000
Ron DeSantis	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	09/30/2013	\$4,000
Ron DeSantis	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	06/30/2013	\$1,000
Ron DeSantis	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	03/31/2013	\$2,000
Ron DeSantis	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	09/30/2012	\$5,000
Ron DeSantis	Ron DeSantis For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	08/27/2012	\$5,000
Sandy Adams	Sandy Adams For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	09/30/2010	\$5,000
Steve Southerland	Southerland For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	05/28/2013	\$5,000
Steve Southerland	Southerland For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	04/29/2013	\$5,000
Steve Southerland	Southerland For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	05/24/2012	\$1,000

Steve Southerland	Southerland For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	04/26/2012	\$1,000
Steve Southerland	Southerland For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	03/23/2012	\$1,000
Steve Southerland	Southerland For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	02/16/2012	\$1,000
Steve Southerland	Southerland For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	12/30/2011	\$1,500
Steve Southerland	Southerland For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	06/29/2011	\$2,000
Steve Southerland	Southerland For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	04/22/2011	\$2,500
Ted Yoho	Ted Yoho For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	03/02/2016	\$1,000
Ted Yoho	Ted Yoho For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	10/07/2015	\$2,500
Ted Yoho	Ted Yoho For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	09/24/2014	\$1,500
Ted Yoho	Ted Yoho For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	06/30/2014	\$1,000
Ted Yoho	Ted Yoho For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	05/07/2014	\$5,000
Tom Rooney	Tom Rooney For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	02/19/2010	\$1,000
Tom Rooney	Tom Rooney For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	06/09/2009	\$1,500
Tom Rooney	Tom Rooney For Congress	Koch Industries PAC	05/19/2009	\$1,000
Trey Radel	Friends Of Trey Radel	Koch Industries PAC	05/10/2013	\$1,000
Trey Radel	Friends Of Trey Radel	Koch Industries PAC	03/31/2013	\$2,000
Trey Radel	Friends Of Trey Radel	Koch Industries PAC	09/19/2012	\$5,000
Trey Radel	Friends Of Trey Radel	Koch Industries PAC	08/13/2012	\$5,000
<b>Total:</b>				<b>\$231,000</b>

[FEC, Accessed 8/19/16]

## KOCH GROUPS HAVE SPENT OVER \$3 MILLION ON FLORIDA CONGRESSIONAL RACES SINCE 2010

### Independent Expenditures

**Between 2009 And 2016, Koch-Backed Groups Contributed At Least \$3.2 Million To Florida Congressional Candidates.** According to the FEC filings, between 2009 and 2016 Koch backed groups including Americans for Prosperity, LIBRE, and 60 Plus Association contributed at least \$3.2 million to Florida congressional candidates. This information is further detailed in the following table:

Candidate	For/Against	Contributor Organization	Koch Connection	Year	Source	Amount
Alan Grayson & Joe Garcia	Against	Americans For Prosperity	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2014	<a href="#">The Hill</a>	\$400,000
Patrick Murphy & Joe Garcia	Against	Americans For Prosperity	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2013	<a href="#">Tampa Bay Times</a>	\$600,000
Joe Garcia	Against	LIBRE	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2014	<a href="#">Politico</a>	\$700,000
Joe Garcia (9 State Ad Buy)	Against	Americans For Prosperity	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2012	<a href="#">Americans for Prosperity</a>	Seven Figures
Steve Southerland	For	Americans For Prosperity	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2014	<a href="#">Politico</a>	\$160,000
Steve Southerland (Multi-State Buy)	For	Americans For Prosperity	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2014	<a href="#">Americans for Prosperity</a>	Six Figures
Steve Southerland	For	60 Plus Association	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2014	<a href="#">Center for Responsive Politics</a>	\$1,583
Connie Mack	For	60 Plus Association	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2012	<a href="#">Center for Responsive Politics</a>	\$22,851
Alan Grayson	Against	60 Plus Association	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2010	<a href="#">Center for Responsive</a>	\$438,098

					<a href="#">Politics</a>	
Suzanne Kosmas	Against	60 Plus Association	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2010	<a href="#">Center for Responsive Politics</a>	\$438,098
Allen Boyd	Against	60 Plus Association	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2010	<a href="#">Center for Responsive Politics</a>	\$371,873
Ron Klein	Against	60 Plus Association	<a href="#">Koch Funded</a>	2010	<a href="#">Center for Responsive Politics</a>	\$14,679

## Rick Scott

### KOCH FINANCIAL SUPPORT FOR RICK SCOTT

#### The Kochs Personally Contributed At Least \$42,000 In Direct Contributions To Rick Scott

**In 2014, Koch Industries And The Koch Family Contributed At Least \$42,000 To Rick Scott.** According to the FEC filings, from 2014 Koch Industries and the Koch family contributed at least \$42,000 to Rick Scott. This information is further detailed in the following table:

Contributor	Contributor Organization	Date	Target	Amount
Koch, Chase	Koch Industries	09/15/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, Anna	N/A	09/15/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, Charles	Koch Industries	09/15/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, Elizabeth	N/A	09/15/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, David	Koch Industries	09/15/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, Julia	N/A	09/15/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, Chase	Koch Industries	08/20/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, Anna	N/A	08/20/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, Charles	Koch Industries	08/20/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, Elizabeth	N/A	08/20/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, Julia	Koch Industries	08/20/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch, David	Koch Industries	05/09/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch Industries	Koch Industries	10/22/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
Koch Industries	Koch Industries	01/31/2014	Rick Scott	\$3,000
<b>Total:</b>				<b>\$42,000</b>

[Florida Department of State Campaign Finance Database, Accessed 8/19/16]

#### Rick Scott Also Benefitted From David Koch's \$250,000 Donation To The Florida Republican Party

**David Koch Donated \$250,000 To Florida Republicans Between August 23 And October 30 Of 2014.** According to the Miami Herald, "Among the largest contributors to the Republicans between Aug. 23 and Oct. 30 was \$1.5 million spent by Sheldon Adelson, a Las Vegas casino operator who has also financed much of the opposition to the Amendment 2 medical marijuana efforts. [...] Everglades Foundation chairman Paul Tudor Jones gave the Republican Party \$250,000, for example. Meanwhile, oil and gas billionaire David Koch gave 250,000 to Republicans." [Miami Herald, [11/1/14](#)]

### AFP MOBILIZED SUPPORT FOR RICK SCOTT & HIS POLICY AGENDA

**AFP "Has Been Walking Neighborhoods" For Gov. Rick Scott.** According to The Washington Post, "Americans for Prosperity, funded by the billionaire Koch brothers, has been walking neighborhoods for [Gov. Rick] Scott." [Washington Post, [8/25/14](#)]

**AFP President Tim Phillips: Gov. Rick Scott's Leadership Has Led "To Impressive Job Creation, Better Education And A Balanced Budget, All Without Raising Taxes."** According to the Gainesville Sun, "AFP is welcoming Scott with open arms. 'Since taking office two years ago, (Scott) has fought hard for the principles of economic freedom,' AFP Foundation President Tim Phillips said in a statement announcing the governor's appearance. Scott's leadership has led 'to impressive job creation, better education and a balanced budget, all without raising taxes,' Phillips said." [Gainesville Sun, 8/29/13]

**AFP President Tim Phillips On AFP Helping Scott Get Re-Elected: "We're Going To Use That Field Effort, Like We're Already Doing, To Educate Folks On His Record. And It's A Pretty Good One."** According to the Tampa Bay Times Blog, The Buzz, "Gov. Rick Scott is getting some help from Americans for Prosperity, which has begun phone banking and canvassing across Florida. The door-hangers pictured here are an example. 'We're going to use that field effort, like we're already doing, to educate folks on his record. And it's a pretty good one,' AFP President Tim Phillips said in an interview near the group's headquarters in Arlington, Va. AFP, which gets funding from the Koch brothers, has 10 field offices across Florida." [Tampa Bay Times' Buzz, 6/30/14]

**Americans For Prosperity Helped Organize Rallies To Support Governor Scott's Agenda.** According to the St. Petersburg Times, "Businessman Charles Koch co-founded the Cato Institute in 1977. He and his brother, David, run the nation's largest privately held company, Koch Industries. David Koch established Americans for Prosperity, a tea party organization that has helped organize rallies in support of Scott's agenda. The free-market, small-government philosophy of Cato infuses many of Scott's public remarks. He has backed up his dislike of a prescription drug monitoring program that some say is crucial to helping solve the state's prescription drug abuse epidemic by saying he believes it is government invading the privacy of individuals. He has made it clear he believes the state must end what he calls 'job-killing regulations' and make Florida the most business-friendly state in the nation." [St. Petersburg Times, 3/21/11]

### **The Koch Network Praised Rick Scott's Policies...**

*AFP Praised Rick Scott For Backing Off Medicaid Expansion And Supporting Tax Cuts*

**AFP-Florida Praised Gov. Rick Scott For Backing Off His Support Of Medicaid Expansion.** According to the Miami Herald, "Republican Gov. Rick Scott backed off his support of Medicaid expansion Monday, triggering a political backlash and giving the Florida House ammunition in its ongoing budget battle with the Senate. [...] Scott stopped short of specifically saying he opposed Medicaid expansion in his statement on Monday. Still, his words were quickly described as a 'flip-flop' (Talking Points Memo); 'walking back' (National Journal); 'disgraceful Obamacare reversal' (Salon) and 'change in course' (by The Associated Press, which reported it first). The statement won praise from Americans for Prosperity Florida, an influential conservative group that opposes Medicaid expansion." [Miami Herald, [4/6/15](#)]

**AFP-Florida "Praised Scott's Actions" And Said Lawmakers Should Have Provided More Tax Cuts.** According to the Herald-Tribune, "Americans for Prosperity, the conservative advocacy group founded by the Koch brothers, praised Scott's actions, saying lawmakers should have used more of the budget to provide closer to \$700 million in tax cuts that Scott wanted rather than the \$400 million that was approved." [Herald-Tribune, [6/23/15](#)]

*60 Plus Credited Rick Scott With Ending "Medicare Raids" And "Improving The Quality Of Life" For Florida Retirees*

**60 Plus Thanked Rick Scott For "Confronting President Obama To End The Medicare Raids" To Pay For Obamacare.** According to 60 Plus, "With Congressional hearings each month uncovering more and more the extent to which Obamacare is being funded with raids on Medicare, Florida Governor Rick Scott has earned the support and appreciation of seniors everywhere by confronting President Obama to end the Medicare raids. [...] Governor Scott's commitment and courage to defending Medicare was lauded by 60 Plus Chairman Jim Martin, leader of the nation's largest conservative seniors organization and the acknowledged alternative to the liberal AARP." [60 Plus, [2/27/16](#)]

**60 Plus Credited Rick Scott For Lowering The Cost-Of-Living And Improving The Quality Of Life For Florida Retirees.** According to 60 Plus, "Governor Scott has lowered the cost-of-living and improved the quality of life for retirees who live in the Sunshine State, and we can't afford to go back." [60 Plus, [8/8/14](#)]

## ...and Attacked His Opponents

*60 Plus Attacked Charlie Crist For His Support Of The Affordable Care Act*

**60 Plus: “Charlie Crist Thinks Florida Seniors Losing Their Doctors Is ‘Great.’”** [60 Plus, [3/12/14](#)]

- **60 Plus: Charlie Crist Thinks That Florida Seniors Losing Their Doctors Under Medicare Advantage Is Great. “You Know What Florida Seniors Think Is Great? A Governor Not Named Charlie Crist.”** According to 60 Plus, “By his own words, Charlie Crist thinks that seniors losing their doctors under Medicare Advantage, which was slashed by \$300 billion to fund Obamacare, is ‘great.’ He thinks 300,000 Floridians having their health plans canceled by Florida Blue due to Obamacare is just fine. You know what Florida seniors think is great? A Governor not named Charlie Crist.” [60 Plus, [3/12/14](#)]

**60 Plus Called Charlie Crist “A ‘Clear And Present Danger’ To Florida” Because Of His Support Of The Affordable Care Act And “Flip-Flopping”** According to 60 Plus, “Charlie Crist remains a ‘clear and present danger’ to Florida seniors if he again comes anywhere near the Governor’s mansion. He’s proven himself a shameless opportunist willing to switch teams and switch positions to keep his name in the spotlight and his face on TV. He doesn’t know the facts about the devastation that Obamacare is causing Florida seniors and he can’t tell the truth about his own flip-flopping positions on the issues.” [60 Plus, [8/8/14](#)]

*Americans For Prosperity Accused Crist Of Wanting To Make Floridians Pay Higher Utility Bills*

**Americans For Prosperity, “Charlie Crist Wants You To Have Higher Utility Bills.”** [Americans for Prosperity, [4/17/14](#)]

- **Americans For Prosperity Claimed Crist’s Push For Florida To Get Twenty Percent Of Its Energy From Solar Would “Cost Florida Families.”** Americans For Prosperity Claimed Crist’s According to an Americans for Prosperity press release, “Yep, you heard us right. [*sic*] former Governor Charlie Crist headlined a solar-industry rally last week in Tallahassee where he proclaimed that as Governor he would push a requirement that twenty percent of Florida’s electricity come from renewable energy resources. What he didn’t mention in his pro-solar speech was how much his scheme would cost Florida’s families.” [Americans for Prosperity, [4/17/14](#)]

## AFP-FL Argued For Scott’s Consideration For Vice President

**AFP-FL Director Chris Hudson Said Gov. Rick Scott Would Be Good At The Job Of Vice President.** According to WJHG, “As he gets closer to the nomination, Trump himself has suggested Florida Governor Rick Scott could be in the running to be his Vice Presidential running mate. [...] The group Americans for Prosperity tangled with Scott over corporate subsidies this past seen and won, killing one of the governor’s top priorities. That battle aside, State Director Chris Hudson says Scott would be good at the VP job. ‘We think the Governor has done a pretty dynamic job of creating a pro jobs climate here in Florida,’ Hudson said.” [WJHG, [5/4/16](#)]

## **RICK SCOTT ATTENDED HIGH PROFILE KOCH EVENTS**

**Scott Attended A “Secretive Policy Retreat” In Colorado Hosted By Charles And David Koch.** According to the Miami Herald, “Gov. Rick Scott acknowledged Tuesday what his staff had refused to disclose: He flew to Colorado over the weekend to attend a secretive policy retreat hosted by powerful conservative donors Charles and David Koch. ‘It was very interesting,’ Scott said. ‘They wanted basically to know what am I doing in Florida.’ Scott said he gave an overview of his agenda since taking office in January: education and Medicaid reform, tax breaks for businesses, drug-testing welfare recipients and overhauling the public employee pension system. The billionaire Koch brothers are widely influential in national politics and helped spur the tea party movement through groups like Americans for Prosperity.” [Miami Herald, 6/28/11]

- **Scott’s Aide Initially Refused To Confirm Or Deny Scott’s Attendance At The Koch’s’ Event.** According to the Palm Beach Post, “Florida Gov. Rick Scott attended an invitation-only meeting hosted by conservative billionaire GOP donors David and Charles Koch outside Vail, Colo., the governor’s staff confirmed Tuesday. The meeting, reportedly scheduled from Sunday through today, hasn’t been on Scott’s official schedule this week and his



spokesman Lane Wright refused Monday to confirm or deny whether the first-term Republican made or planned to make an appearance, saying he would not ‘speculate as to what he has done, or will do, on his personal time.’” [Palm Beach Post, 6/29/11]

**Scott Confirmed Attending The Koch's' Meeting After The Event Despite His Public Schedule Showing Nothing On That Date.** According to the Palm Beach Post, "Wright confirmed Scott's attendance only after Scott, in Washington, D.C. on Tuesday, told The St. Petersburg Times he had attended the Koch meeting. Wright still refused to say when Scott went to Colorado, although Scott's public schedule showed events much of Monday and Tuesday in Florida and Washington, D.C., but nothing on Sunday until staff and call time at the governor's mansion at 8 p.m. 'I told anybody who asked me,' Scott told The Times. 'It was very interesting. They wanted to know basically ... what am I doing in Florida.'" [Palm Beach Post, 6/29/11]

**Gov. Rick Scott Spoke At AFP's "Defending The Dream Summit" In 2013.** According to the Tampa Bay Times Blog, The Buzz, "Gov. Rick Scott has been added as a speaker for Americans for Prosperity's 'Defending the American Dream Summit' in Orlando later this month. The lineup includes Govs. Rick Perry, Bobby Jindal, Sens. Marco Rubio, Ted Cruz, Ron Johnson as well as Michelle Malkin and Fox News' Greg Gutfeld." [Tampa Bay Times' Buzz, 2/25/13]

## Attorney General Pam Bondi

### KOCH INDUSTRIES CONTRIBUTED \$6,000 TO ATTORNEY GENERAL PAM BONDI'S 2014 RACE

**Koch Industries Contributed \$6,000 To Support Pam Bondi In Her 2014 Attorney General Race.** According to the Florida Department of State Campaign Finance Database, Koch Industries contributed \$6,000 to support Pam Bondi in her 2014 attorney general race; \$3,000 on April 30, 2014 and another \$3,000 on October 21, 2014. [Florida Department of State Campaign Finance Database, Accessed 8/19/16]

## Florida Legislature

### THE KOCHS SPENT OVER \$100,000 ON FLORIDA STATE HOUSE & SENATE RACES SINCE 2012

**Between 2012 And 2016, Koch Industries Contributed At Least \$105,000 To Florida State House And Senate Candidates.** According to the FEC filings, between 2012 and 2016 Koch Industries contributed at least \$105,000 to Florida State House and Senate candidates. This information is further detailed in the following table:

Contributor	Date	Target	Office	Amount
Koch Industries	1/11/2016	Albritton, Ben	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/8/2015	Artiles, Frank Anthony	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/22/2012	Bean, Aaron	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Bean, Aaron	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	10/12/2012	Benacquisto, Lizbeth	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Benacquisto, Lizbeth	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	1/11/2016	Beshears, Halsey	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/29/2012	Beshears, Halsey	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	10/8/2012	Bogdanoff, Ellyn	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	8/9/2012	Bogdanoff, Ellyn	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	12/8/2015	Boyd, Jim	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/16/2015	Bradley, Rob	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	2/7/2014	Brandes,	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/29/2014	Brandes, Jeff	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/5/2012	Brandes, Jeff	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	12/3/2015	Brodeur, Jason	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/8/2015	Caldwell, Matt	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/10/2012	Coley, Marti	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/6/2012	Coley, Marti	State House	\$500

Koch Industries	12/17/2015	Corcoran, Richard	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	2/27/2014	Corcoran, Richard	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/7/2015	Cortes, Bob	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/22/2014	Crisafulli, Steve	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	2/18/2014	Crisafulli, Steve	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/8/2012	Crisafulli, Steve	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	12/7/2015	Cummings, Travis	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/1/2012	Dean, Charles S.	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	12/13/2015	Diaz, Jose Felix	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/7/2015	Diaz, Manny	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/12/2012	Dorworth, Chris	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/6/2012	Dorworth, Chris	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	12/2/2015	Drake, Brad	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	2/5/2014	Drake, Brad	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/10/2012	Drake, Brad	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/11/2016	Eagle, Dane	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/23/2014	Eisnagle, Eric	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	8/21/2014	Eisnagle, Eric	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/10/2012	Farkas, Frank	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/11/2016	Flores, Anitere	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/4/2012	Flores, Anitere	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	8/9/2012	Ford, C.V.	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	8/26/2014	Fresen, Erik	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	2/3/2014	Fresen, Erik	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/9/2012	Fresen, Erik	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/2/2012	Fresen, Erik	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	5/11/2012	Garcia, Rene	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	10/8/2012	Gardiner, Andy	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	1/8/2012	Gardiner, Andy	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	12/3/2015	Goodson, Tom	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	8/9/2012	Goodson, Tom	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/11/2016	Grant, James	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/11/2016	Grimsley, Denise	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/24/2012	Grimsley, Denise	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	1/10/2012	Grimsley, Denise	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	10/28/2014	Hager, Bill	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/11/2016	Hays, Alan	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/14/2015	Hill, Mike	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Holder, Doug	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	9/16/2014	Hudson, Matt	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/11/2016	Hutson, Travis	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/12/2012	Hutson, Travis	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	12/7/2015	Ingoglia, Blaise	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/31/2015	Ingram, Clay	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	2/19/2014	Ingram, Clay	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/8/2015	La Rosa, Mike	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/30/2014	La Rosa, Mike	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/16/2015	Latvala, Chris	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	9/22/2014	Latvala, Jack	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/22/2012	Latvala, Jack	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	8/6/2012	Latvala, Jack	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	2/5/2014	Lee, Tom	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/11/2012	Lee, Tom	State Senate	\$500

Koch Industries	8/9/2012	Lee, Tom	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	8/6/2012	Legg, John	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	10/10/2012	McKeel, Seth	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	McKeel, Seth	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	4/23/2012	Montford, Bill	State Senate	(\$500)
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Montford, Bill	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	8/9/2012	Moraitis, George	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	8/5/2016	Negron, Joe	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/22/2014	Negron, Joe	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	2/5/2014	Negron, Joe	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/4/2012	Negron, Joe	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Negron, Joe	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	12/8/2015	Nunez, Jeanette M.	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/8/2012	Nunez, Jeanette M.	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Nunez, Jeanette M.	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Oelrich, Stephen M.	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	12/14/2015	Oliva, Jose	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	2/13/2014	Oliva, Jose	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Patronis, Jimmy	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/15/2016	Perry, Keith	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/9/2012	Perry, Keith	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	4/17/2013	Perry, Warren	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/8/2015	Peters, Kathleen	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	2/28/2014	Peters, Kathleen	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/4/2015	Pigman, Cary	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/3/2015	Plakon, Scott	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	3/3/2014	Plakon, Scott	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/14/2015	Raburn, Jake	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/1/2015	Raschein, Holly	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/12/2012	Raulerson, Dan	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	12/7/2015	Raulerson, Daniel D.	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	9/22/2014	Ray, Lake	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	8/26/2014	Ray, Lake	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/24/2012	Ray, Lake	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/5/2012	Ray, Lake	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	12/7/2015	Renner, Paul	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/8/2015	Rodrigues, Ray	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/5/2012	Rooney, Pat	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	8/13/2012	Rooney, Pat	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	2/14/2014	Rooney, Patrick	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	12/4/2015	Rooney, Patrick J.	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/24/2012	Schenck, Robert	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	8/9/2012	Schenck, Robert	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	10/29/2014	Simmons, David	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	11/30/2015	Spano, Ross	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/11/2016	Sprowls, Chris	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	8/29/2014	Sprowls, Chris	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	3/3/2014	Sprowls, Chris	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/7/2016	Stargel, Kelli	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/11/2016	Stone, Charlie	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/11/2012	Thrasher, John	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Thrasher, John	State Senate	\$500
Koch Industries	12/15/2015	Trujillo, Carlos	State House	\$1,000

Koch Industries	12/4/2015	Trumbull, Jay	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	10/30/2014	Trumbull, Jay	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	8/18/2014	Trumbull, Jay	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Van Zant, Charles	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	12/2/2015	Van Zant, Katherine	State House	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Weatherford, Will	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	10/12/2012	Wood, John	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Wood, John	State House	\$500
Koch Industries	12/2/2015	Young, Dana	State Senate	\$1,000
Koch Industries	1/9/2012	Young, Dana	State House	\$500
<b>Total:</b>				<b>\$105,000</b>

[Florida Department of State Campaign Finance Database, Accessed 8/19/16]

## Florida Republican Party

### THE KOCHS DONATED AT LEAST \$290,000 TO THE FLORIDA REPUBLICAN PARTY SINCE 2012

**David Koch Donated \$250,000 To Florida Republicans Between August 23 And October 30.** According to the Miami Herald, “Among the largest contributors to the Republicans between Aug. 23 and Oct. 30 was \$1.5 million spent by Sheldon Adelson, a Las Vegas casino operator who has also financed much of the opposition to the Amendment 2 medical marijuana efforts. [...] Everglades Foundation chairman Paul Tudor Jones gave the Republican Party \$250,000, for example. Meanwhile, oil and gas billionaire David Koch gave 250,000 to Republicans.” [Miami Herald, [11/1/14](#)]

**Koch Industries Contributed \$40,000 To The Republican Party Of Florida In 2012.** According to the Florida Department of State Campaign Finance Database, Koch Industries contributed \$20,000 to the Republican Party of Florida on January 11, 2012 and an additional \$20,000 on January 12, 2012. [Florida Department of State Campaign Finance Database, Accessed 8/19/16]